1				Page 1155
	IN THE WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE	1	EXAMINATION INDEX	rage 1133
	HOUSE OF DELEGATES	2		
			BY MS. KAUFFMAN	1158
2	JUDICIARY COMMITTEE	3	BY DELEGATE ISNER	1275
3			BY DELEGATE MILLER	1279
4	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	4	BY DELEGATE BYRD	1298
5	IN RE:	l _	BY MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY	1305
		5	BY DELEGATE SUMMERS	1320
6	House Judiciary Committee Proceeding		BY DELEGATE SOBONYA	1324
7	Regarding the Impeachment of West Virginia	6	BY DELEGATE HARSHBARGER	1339
8	Supreme Court Justices Pursuant to	7	BY DELEGATE CAPITO BY DELEGATE LANE	1343 1345
		'	BY DELEGATE PUSHKIN	1358
9	House Resolution 201 Passed During the	8	BY DELEGATE ZATEZALO	1380
10	Second Extended Session of 2018.		BY DELEGATE HOLLEN	1385
11	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	9	BY DELEGATE OVERINGTON	1395
12			BY DELEGATE FOSTER	1410
		10	BY DELEGATE FAST	1419
13	VOLUME V		BY MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER	1447
14		11	BY CHAIRMAN SHOTT	1482
15	Hearing held on July 26, 2018, before the House		RE BY MS. KAUFFMAN	1502
	Judiciary Committee of the West Virginia Legislature.	12	RE BY DELEGATE MILLER	1512
16	oudificary committee of the west virginia Legislature.		RE BY DELEGATE SOBONYA	1523
17		13	RE BY DELEGATE HARSHBARGER	1528
18		l	RE BY DELEGATE LANE	1537
19		14	RE BY DELEGATE PUSHKIN	1547
		1.5	RE BY DELEGATE OVERINGTON	1552
20		15	RE BY DELEGATE FAST	1555
21	REALTIME REPORTERS, LLC	16	RE BY DELEGATE CAPITO RE BY CHAIRMAN SHOTT	1564 1565
	TERESA S. EVANS, RMR, CRR	17	VE DI CHATKAMA SHOII	1302
22		18		
22	713 Lee Street	19		
	Charleston, WV 25301	20		
23	(304) 344-8463	21		
	realtimereporters.net	22		
١	rearetmereporecis.nee	23		
24		24		
	Page 1154			Dogo 1156
1	APPEARANCES:	1	PROCEEDINGS	Page 1156
2				
	APPEARING FOR THE HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE:	2	CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Good morning	g. We'll
3	We called the Comment of the Comment	3	call this meeting on the judiciary to order. I'll a	isk
4	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire			
1	Brian Casto, Esquire	4	the clerk to take the roll to ascertain the prese	nce of
5	Robert E. Akers, Esquire	5	a quorum.	
	Charles Roskovenski, Esquire	_	•	
6		6	(The clerk took the roll and	
7 8	HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS:	7	ascertained all present.)	
°	John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair		CHAIRMAN SHOTT: By the skin of	
9	Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair	8	LHAIRWAN SHULL BY THE SKIN OF	
		_	Of It and the Office 11. By the skill of	our
	Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair	_		
10	Mark White, Clerk	9	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A	couple of
	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd	9		couple of
10 11	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro	9 10	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A cquick announcements. As you have learned	couple of from the memo
11	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito	9 10 11	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A c quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoena	couple of from the memo ed a
	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro	9 10 11	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A cquick announcements. As you have learned	couple of from the memo ed a
11	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster	9 10 11 12	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoenable witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked
11 12 13	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger	9 10 11 12 13	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked
11 12	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen	9 10 11 12 13	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoenable witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked
11 12 13 14	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner	9 10 11 12 13	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoenable witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. Some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her
11 12 13	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger	9 10 11 12 13 14 15	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked given her on the
11 12 13 14	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rescheduling to the country we had requested this week.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of
11 12 13 14	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rescheduling to the country we had requested this week.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of
11 12 13 14	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoenat witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of
11 12 13 14 15 16	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of its, we will
11 12 13 14 15	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday.	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of its, we will
11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A council quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday. We should have a full day today.	couple of from the memored a She's asked a given her on the sult of uts, we will
11 12 13 14 15 16	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday.	couple of from the memored a She's asked a given her on the sult of uts, we will
11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A council quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday. We should have a full day today. If fact, we'll probably go into the evening hours,	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of ats, we will and
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday. We should have a full day today. If fact, we'll probably go into the evening hours, we've arranged to have dinner brought in son	couple of from the memore ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of ats, we will n and netime
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya Amy Summers Mark Zatezalo	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A council quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday. We should have a full day today. If fact, we'll probably go into the evening hours,	couple of from the memored a She's asked e given her on the sult of ats, we will n and netime
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya Amy Summers Mark Zatezalo ALSO PRESENT:	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A control quick announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday. We should have a full day today. If fact, we'll probably go into the evening hours, we've arranged to have dinner brought in son	couple of from the memored a She's asked a given her on the sult of ats, we will n and netime t most of
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya Amy Summers Mark Zatezalo	9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	teeth, we have a quorum. Good morning. A couck announcements. As you have learned that staff counsel sent out, we had subpoend witness, Mrs. Loughry, to appear tomorrow. So for some time to obtain an attorney and we've that time. We also have a rescheduling need tour we had requested this week. So as a rest those two things and some other development not be meeting on Saturday. We should have a full day today. If fact, we'll probably go into the evening hours, we've arranged to have dinner brought in some between 5:00 and 5:30. Hopefully we can ge	couple of from the memo ed a She's asked e given her on the sult of ats, we will and netime t most of relatively

1 Saturday.

- 2 Counsel, are you ready to proceed?
- 3 MS. KAUFFMAN: Yes.
- 4 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: If you would, please,
- 5 call your first witness.
- 6 MS. KAUFFMAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 7 The House Committee on the Judiciary calls Steve
- 8 Canterbury.
- 9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Mr. Canterbury, if you
- 10 would, please rise and raise your right hand.
- 11 (The witness was sworn.)
- 12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you, please be
- 13 seated.
- 14 One caution, Mr. Canterbury, before you
- 15 begin. I had the opportunity to review the transcript
- 16 of your testimony before the Judicial Investigation
- 17 Commission.
- 18 It's clear to me that the -- the
- 19 breadth and depth of your knowledge far exceeds mine
- 20 and that in some instances, you got kind of carried
- 21 away. So I'd ask you in the interest of your time and
- 22 our time, if you would please just focus on the
- 23 question that's asked, provide your best answer, and if
- 24 counsel or those who ask the question wish to get
 - Page 1158
- 1 further information, I'm sure they'll follow up.
- 2 Counsel?
- 3 MS. KAUFFMAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 4 STEVEN CANTURBY
- 5 was called as a witness by the Committee on the
- 6 Judiciary, and having been first duly sworn, testified
- 7 as follows:
- 8 EXAMINATION
- 9 BY MS. KAUFFMAN:
- 10 Q. Mr. Canterbury, for the record, could you
- 11 please state your full name?
- 12 A. Steven Dane Canterbury.
- 13 Q. Mr. Canterbury, it is my understanding, if
- 14 I -- I believe that you began working for the Supreme
- 15 Court of Appeals of West Virginia in 2005. Is that
- 16 correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And did your employment end with the Supreme
- 19 Court I may now just call it "the Court" on January
- 20 4 of 2017?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. During that time period between 2005 and
- 23 2017, what position or positions did you hold at the
- 24 Court?

- Page 1159

 A. Administrative Director of the Courts of West
- 2 Virginia.
- 3 Q. That was the only position you held, and you
- 4 held it the entire time?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Could you please to the best of your
- 7 ability just describe to the Committee what your
- 8 duties were as the Administrative Director?
- 9 A. To follow the directives of the Court, to
- 10 administer the various necessities for the judges
- 11 throughout the state at every level, to institute
- 12 programs as directed by the Court, to answer to the
- 13 Court, as well as to the individual five justices.
- 14 Q. How many employees answered to you, if you 15 recall?
- 16 A. Well, at the -- at the Administrative Office,
- 17 there were roughly 90 to 100. The administration of
- 18 the various judges, they answered directly to the
- 19 magistrates or the family court judges or the judge --
- 20 the circuit judges, although I had some influence over
- 21 their futures.
- 22 Q. Okay. I believe I just stated this, but I
- 23 wanted to make that -- make clear. As part of your
- 24 job, did you work directly with the justices of the

unuana Caunt of Annaala2

- 1 Supreme Court of Appeals?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I would like, if we could, to
- 4 go ahead and turn to an issue regarding State vehicles,
- 5 and I want to ask you first just a few general
- 6 questions. It is my understanding that at some point
- 7 during the -- your time with the Court, that there were
- 8 questions that were raised regarding justices' use of
- 9 State vehicles. Is that accurate?
- 10 A. Yes.

14

24

- 11 Q. Do you recall when and it could be by year,
- 12 if you know, or if you could give me an approximation -
- 13 when that issue first came up?
 - A. Late winter or spring of 2016.
- 15 Q. And at that time again just to the best of
- 16 your recollection what -- what precipitated the --
- 17 the issues regarding the State vehicles?
- 8 A. There was a lot of publicity regarding the
- 19 State's cars generally, and Justice Davis asked about
- 20 our cars, about how many we had, how they were used,
- 21 how that worked.
- 22 Q. And was that something that you were in
- 23 charge of or had some responsibility of?
 - A. I was in charge of the person who was in

Page 1161

- 1 charge of it. That was Arthur Angus, who was Director
- $\,2\,$ of Security. He also was in charge of the cars.
- 3 Q. Let me -- and I understand you said that the
- 4 issues began being raised in 2016. At that time, did
- 5 the Court have a policy and I'll begin with a written
- 6 policy on justices' use of State-owned vehicles?
- 7 A. No written policy. The policy was simply to
- 8 follow the forms that had to be filled out through
- 9 Mr. Angus.
- 10 Q. I believe that the Committee has had an
- 11 opportunity to see that. And it's called an intranet
- 12 form. Does that sound correct?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Prior to 2016 and I understand you said
- 15 that's when questions began to be raised if you could
- 16 just give the Committee some idea as to how checking
- 17 out of vehicles by justices worked between the 2005
- 18 when you began with the Court and 2016 time period.
- 19 A. If a justice needed a car, he or she would go
- 20 to the office of Mr. Angus and would ask for a car and
- 21 ask for the key. And at that time, he would usually --
- 22 I don't know if he always did that. He would ask where
- 23 they were going and what the business purpose was.
- 24 He would reserve the car or he'd hand
- Page 1162

- 1 them the keys.
- 2 Q. With respect to the -- that process, were you
- 3 made aware between the 2005 and up until the time the
- 4 issues were raised in 2016 of any issues that
- 5 Mr. Angus had with respect to the justices, any
- 6 justices, checking out a State-owned vehicle?
- 7 A. I don't think I heard anything specifically
- 8 from Mr. Angus before 2016.
- 9 Q. So in 2016, I understand that you have
- 10 indicated that Justice Davis began to ask some
- 11 questions, and I'll get to that in just a minute.
- 12 But if I could please first ask you to
- 13 refer to the first Legislative Audit Report.
- 14 And I did not mention this earlier. On
- 15 -- on the desk in front of you, you should have a light
- 16 notebook with exhibits, and then also you should have
- 17 three Legislative Auditor Reports, and they are
- 18 numbered in the top right-hand corner 1, 2 and 3.
- 19 So if you could please refer to the
- 20 first -- the No. 1 audit report on page 3 that mentions
- 21 formal approval that was given regarding a car for
- 22 Justice Ketchum. Do you recall that occurring?
- 23 A. When you say "that occurring," that he was
- 24 able to take the car for commuting purposes?

- 1 Q. Yes. sir.
- 2 A. Yes, I -- I know what happened with that
- 3 and --
- 4 Q. Do -- if you can, and if we -- if you could
- 5 just go back to the 2012 time period when that
- 6 occurred. What happened at that time with respect to
- 7 that vehicle?
- 8 A. Justice Ketchum, at the end of an
- 9 administrative conference, asked if he could use the
- 10 2007 Buick the silver Buick, as we always called it -
- 11 to commute, and the Court said he could.
- 12 Q. Before that time, to your knowledge, had any
- 13 other justices used a State vehicle generally for
- 14 commuting purposes?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Since that time in 2012 when Justice Ketchum
- 17 began using that vehicle, were you aware of any other
- 18 justices, our current justices now, that ever used a
- 19 vehicle, generally speaking, for commuting purposes?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. With respect to the keys, I believe you might
- 22 have mentioned this, but Mr. Angus had keys to the
- 23 cars. Is that correct?
- 24 A. He did.

- 1 Q. Did you have any keys to any of the cars as 2 well?
- 3 A. Yes. I had keys to two of the Buicks.
- 4 Q. Okay. And were you aware ever -- have you
- 5 ever been made aware that any of the justices, current
- 6 justices, ever had keys to any of the cars, their own 7 set of keys?
- 8 A. I only know through testimony here. I didn't
- 9 know before I heard during this -- in the last six
- 10 months or so. I didn't know when I worked there.
- 11 Q. Okay, thank you. If you could, please, still
- 12 refer to Report No. 1, now at page 41.
- 13 A. Okay.
- 14 Q. It is my understanding that beginning on page
- 15 41 -- this is a memo from Mr. Brandfass to you, I
- 16 believe. Is that correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. If you could, please just tell the Committee
- 19 how the -- the reason that this memo was prepared.
- 20 A. Well, there was a bit of consternation back
- 21 and forth between Justice Davis and Justice Loughry.
- 22 The other justices also were concerned. I thought we
- 23 needed a legal opinion so that we would be able to
- 24 understand what the issues were about use of the car,

Page 1168

Page 1165

1

- 1 what the Code said, and -- and any tax consequences.
- 2 Q. And is that the reason you asked
- 3 Mr. Brandfass to prepare this memo?
- A. Yes. 4
- Q. And if you could, please refer now to page 5
- 6 47. I believe that is the last page of the memo. And
- 7 if you could, please, under "Possible Consequences of
- 8 Improper Use of State Vehicles," if you could please
- 9 just read to the Committee what Mr. Brandfass indicated
- 10 as possible consequences.
- 11 A. "Use of a State vehicle in a manner that
- 12 contravenes the provisions of an applicable West
- 13 Virginia legislative rule, or an Internal Revenue
- 14 Service (IRS) regulation, could result in a
- 15 determination that untaxed wages were accrued that must
- 16 be reported to the IRS.
- 17 Contravention of the relevant
- provisions of the Code of Judicial Conduct could result
- in the filing of an ethical violation complaint with
- the Judicial Investigation Commission."
- 21 Q. Thank you. Did you - or if you know, did
- 22 anyone else ever provide a copy of this memo to the
- 23 justices in 2016?
- 24 A. Yes, I believe it was provided at the first

A. Yes.

- 2 Q. If you could, please just provide the
- 3 Committee with your recollection as to what Justice
- 4 Davis was requesting of you on August 2nd, 2016.
- A. She wanted more specific information about
- 6 how the Court cars were being assigned, how they were
- 7 being used, if there were any kind of IRS issues. She
- 8 was concerned that perhaps there was some use of the
- 9 vehicles that wasn't appropriate, and -- and she wanted
- 10 it on the administrative conference agenda.
- 11 And it's a follow-up of her earlier
- 12 questioning from several months earlier.
- Q. And her request was that these -- this items 13
- 14 -- or these items be placed on the -- on the agenda for
- 15 the upcoming administrative conference; is that
- 16 correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. Now I am going to ask you if you could,
- 19 please, turn to the back of that notebook to Exhibit
- 20 No. -- what should be marked as Exhibit 37. And if you
- 21 could, just please take a moment to --
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 Q. -- to look over that and familiarize or
- 24 refamiliarize yourself with that.

Page 1166

- 1 administrative conference in the fall of two thousand
- 2 -- early September 2016.
- Q. Do you recall any conversations during any
- 4 administrative conferences about this particular memo?
- 5 A. I really don't recall anything specifically
- 6 about the memo.
- Q. Okay. Other than the justices, if you 7
- 8 recall, was anyone else at the Court provided with a
- 9 copy of this -- of Mr. Brandfass' memo dated July 21,
- 10 2016?
- A. I don't recall if anyone else was provided 11
- 12 with it. It would have perhaps been provided to a few
- 13 people, but I can't say with certainty.
- 14 Q. Okay, thank you. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now
- 15 going to ask you to look in the white notebook, the
- 16 exhibit notebook. If you could please look at Exhibit
- 17 No. 2, which is hopefully at Tab No. 2.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Could you please take a moment to review that
- 20 document and familiarize yourself with it?
- 21 A. Okay.
- 22 Q. Mr. Canterbury, this appears to be a memo
- 23 from Justice Davis to you dated August 2, 2016. Do you
- 24 recall receiving this memo from Justice Davis?

- 1 A. Yes, I remember this.
- 2 Q. If -- it appears that - with respect to
- 3 Exhibit No. 37 this is an e-mail communication from
- 4 Justice Loughry to you dated August 10, 2016. Is that
- 5 correct?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. So that would have been approximately eight
- 8 days after Justice Davis sent her August 2nd e-mail.
- 9 Is that accurate?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. If you could, to the best of your ability,
- 12 please just summarize and provide to the Committee what
- 13 your understanding of what Justice Loughry was asking
- 14 of you in this e-mail communication on August 10, 2016.
- A. He asked about dinners that were held at
- 16 Justice Davis' home when the judicial conference
- 17 judges, circuit judges, were in Charleston at their
- 18 conference, as well as about a cocktail party that she
- 19 had and dinner that she had in Wyoming when the chief
- 20 justices of the nation had gathered in Jackson for
- 21 their annual meeting.
- 22 Q. Did Justice Loughry ask that this be -- these
- 23 items be placed on the agenda or discussed at the
- 24 upcoming administrative conference?

1165-1168

Page 1169

- A. I don't recall if he asked that specifically, 1
- 2 but they certainly were discussed at the -- in the 3 conference.
- Q. And I'll get to that in just a moment. Now, 4
- 5 if I could -- and I'm just trying to go in time. If I
- 6 could now please refer you back -- or I'm sorry, refer
- 7 you to Exhibit No. 38 --
- 8 A. I -- there's 38.
- Q. And if you could, please take a moment to 10 review that document as well and refamiliarize yourself 11 with it.
- 12 A. Okay.
- Q. Thank you. Let me ask you first: Do you 13
- 14 recall drafting this memo to the justices?
- 15 A. I do now, yes.
- 16 Q. And if you could -- again, I understand
- 17 you've just had a moment to look at it. If you could
- just tell the Committee the reason for this memo and
- what you were trying to relay to the justices in this August 19, 2016 memo. 20
- 21 A. Justice Loughry had asked that I look into
- 22 the gatherings at Justice Davis' home and any other
- 23 Court employee's home where employees of the Court had
- 24 gathered.

Page 1170

- I had asked employees to my house on
- 2 several occasions after about 2:30 for late lunch, and
- 3 to talk about, generally, some Court Administrative
- 4 Office business and then to enjoy themselves with the
- 5 paths at my house and basically hang out.
- 6 So that's in the memo. The other thing
- 7 in the memo is a breakdown of all of the gatherings at
- 8 Justice Davis' house. There were several, as noted in
- 9 the exhibit, at her house. Only one had any of the
- 10 food paid for by the Court.
- 11 He was very -- Justice Loughry was very
- 12 interested in his, I think, mistaken belief that all of
- 13 these had been funded by the Court. They had not.
- 14 One had been partially funded, and I
- detail the funding in the memo. As well as one other,
- 16 there was transportation provided at the Court expense,
- 17 buses run from the hotel to her residence.
- 18 There was one other gathering that was
- 19 an appreciation dinner for employees. It was not the
- 20 usual. Which was just circuit judges and some -- a
- couple of people from the Court staff. 21
- Q. And also on the last page I believe it's
- 23 page 3 if you could, please, tell the -- the
- 24 Committee what -- what you did with respect to the

1 inquiry regarding a dinner in Jackson, Wyoming.

- A. Oh, that's right. Somehow that page got
- 3 stuck. The -- he demanded that I get in touch and get
- 4 a letter from the president of the National Center for
- 5 State Courts, Mary McQueen, saying explicitly whether
- 6 or not any of the National Center money had paid for
- 7 any part of the dinner at her house in Jackson.
- 8 Not a penny was paid for by anybody but
- 9 Justice Davis, and that was clarified in the letter
- 10 from Mary McQueen.
- 11 The other thing was that -- I had
- 12 forgotten, that that year -- usually the first --
- 13 I think the only time my entire time there we had the
- 14 administrative conference at the end of August instead
- 15 of the beginning of September.
- 16 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now going to ask you to 17 refer back, please, to Exhibit No. 3 in the notebook.
- 18 A. Yes, I remember this memorandum.
- 19 Q. And that was going to be my first guestion.
- 20 It appears to be a memorandum from Justice Davis to
- 21 Mr. Angus and Mr. Gundy and copies to other justices.
- 22 Do you recall seeing -- being made aware of it or
- 23 seeing it during that time period in August of 2016?
- 24 A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. Did you speak with either Mr. Angus or
- 2 Mr. Gundy with respect to this memo?
- 3 A. I don't think I did.
- Q. Now I'll ask you to please refer to Exhibit
- 5 No. 4. And if you could, please, just take a moment to
- 6 refamiliarize yourself with this memorandum.
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. Thank you. The Exhibit No. 4 appears to be a
- 9 memorandum from Justice Davis to you dated August 25,
- 10 2016. Do you recall receiving this memo?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. If you could, please just tell the Committee
- 13 what you recall about the request that was made or
- 14 requests that were made in this memo.
- A. She wanted to know specifically where some of
- 16 the car -- cars went with Justice Loughry, what the
- 17 purpose was, what's the destination. There were a lot
- 18 of blanks when she had reviewed what she had gotten
- previously. And she was asking that this specific
- 20 information be provided.
- 21 She also wanted to know why there had
- 22 been no destinations listed. She wanted to know if
- 23 there were Court events on those days. She wanted to
- 24 know if there were any other kinds of meetings, any

Page 1176

Page 1173

- 1 other kind of Court business.
- 2 And she wanted to know if, in some of
- 3 those dates, was the Court not in recess.
- 4 Q. And now I'm going to ask you to please refer
- 5 to Exhibit No. 5. It appears to also be a memorandum
- 6 from Justice Davis to you about five days later, on
- 7 August 30, 2016. And if you could, once you've had an
- 8 opportunity to review that, just summarize for the
- 9 Committee what Justice Davis was requesting in that 10 memo.
- 11 A. She said that she had gotten some
- 12 information, but there was still a great deal of -- of
- 13 information that was not provided, trips from -- by
- 14 Justice Loughry in the State car.
- 15 Q. And finally, I think at least for now, if you
- 16 could please now just refer to Exhibit No. 6.
- 17 A. Okay.
- 18 Q. And take a moment to review that memorandum.
- 19 A. Okay.
- 20 Q. Thank you. Do you recall receiving a copy of
- 21 this memo in the August 2016 time frame?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And if you could, please, just summarize to
- 24 the Committee what Justice Loughry's position was at

- 1 policy, that it should be comprehensive.
- 2 He points out that he -- you know,
- 3 using the car did not just have to be for Court
- 4 business; it could be to go speak to high school civics
- 5 classes, legal education programs, graduation
- 6 ceremonies, etc.
- 7 And he also points out that I would not
- 8 know his schedule, and nor would others, outside of his
- 9 office.
- 10 Q. And Mr. Canterbury, now that we've gone
- 11 through those various memos, it is my understanding
- 12 from the dates of those memos that those memos were all
- 13 going back and forth between the justices and yourself
- 14 and perhaps Mr. Angus and Mr. Gundy, at least some of
- 15 them, during the August 2016 time frame. Is that
- 16 correct?
- 17 A. Yes, uh-huh.
- 18 Q. If you -- and I think you mentioned this
- 19 earlier. At some point, was there an administrative
- 20 conference either at the end of August of 2016 or the
- 21 following month in September of 2016 where some of
- 22 these issues that were mentioned in these memos that we
- 23 have just recently discussed were actually discussed at
- 24 the conference?

Page 1174

1 that time.

- 2 A. There are a lot of issues he raises in this
- 3 memorandum. He says that the issue was raised by
- 4 Justice Davis as a distraction from her use of State
- 5 money for a party at -- as he calls it, at her house.
- 6 That it was a fishing expedition.
- 7 And that it was also to distract from
- 8 payments to a contractor named Mark Starcher and for
- 9 the depletion, as he characterizes it, of the -- he
- 10 says 26 million. And he said that there had been a
- 11 number of requests for explanation.
- 12 And frankly, erroneously, he says that
- 13 they had never been responded to.
- 14 He goes on to -- to say that Justice
- 15 Davis had used the car on numerous times, including, he
- 16 says, to go to a -- political events.
- 17 He points out that there were a number
- 18 of occasions where there was no destination for my use
- 19 of the car.
- 20 And a few indicate -- blanks for
- 21 Justice Benjamin's use of the car, as well as Justice
- 22 Workman's.
- 23 It's -- he discusses that there's no
- 24 written policy. That if there's gonna be a written

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Do you specifically recall whether or not
- 3 that conference occurred in August or September?
- 4 A. I don't. But I read here that it said August
- 5 29th. And it did kind of tickle a memory that we were
- 6 off to the races a little early that year.
- 7 Q. Okay. If you could, please let's just begin
- 8 with the conference. And again, I understand you don't
- 9 recall the specific date. Could you please tell the
- 10 Committee whether or not the use of State cars -- and
- 11 we'll just take them issue by issue.
- 12 -- if the use of State cars, using State
- 13 cars, was discussed amongst the justices at that
- 14 conference.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. What do you recall about those discussions?
- 17 A. It was a pretty -- well, it was a -- an
- 18 emotional discussion. The final conclusion was that --
- 19 as I recall, it was a 3 to 2 vote, that justices were
- 20 not to be asked why they were taking cars. The
- 21 presumption was if they decided that they needed a car,
- 22 it must be for appropriate purposes.
- 23 Q. You have just mentioned you recall that being
- 24 a 3 to 2 vote. Do you recall which justices voted for

Page 1180

Page 1177

- 1 not requiring a destination?
- 2 A. Justices Workman, Ketchum and Loughry.
- 3 Q. And with respect to the two justices that
- 4 voted that a destination should be listed, which
- 5 justices were those?
- 6 A. Justices Davis and Benjamin.
- 7 Q. At some point, the Committee, I believe, has
- 8 received testimony that you may have instructed either
- 9 Mr. Angus or Mr. Gundy I don't recall, so I don't
- 10 want to say for certain that a destination was not
- 11 required or that a justice did not have to give a
- 12 destination when they made a reservation for a State-
- 13 owned vehicle.
- 14 Is that correct?
- 15 A. That is correct.
- 16 Q. Does that come as a result of the conference 17 you just described for the Committee?
- 18 A. Yes, it was right afterwards. I literally
- 19 walked out the door. Right outside the hall of the
- 20 justices' chambers is Art Angus' office. I went in -
- 21 they both happened to be there and I told them that.
- 22 Q. Okay. With respect to some of the questions
- 23 about the vehicle use that may have not required
- 24 destinations -- or did not include destinations before

- 4 (1 ((1 0)))
- 1 that the Court was providing a dinner at Justice Davis'
- 2 home.
- 3 He also felt that -- that it was
- 4 inappropriate, I guess, that the Court had paid any
- 5 money for that dinner.
- 6 The response was that it had also been
- 7 in the agenda of the -- of the conference. It was
- 8 listed on that, I think, Monday, the first day -- or
- 9 Tuesday, the first day of the conference, and it was
- 10 clear that it was part of the official business of the
- 11 -- of the Court.
- 12 And it was also pointed out that had
- 13 they not been going to dinner there that they would
- 14 have been paid a per diem for that dinner, which, of
- 15 course, they didn't receive because they got a dinner
- 16 without having to pay for it out of their pockets at
- 17 Justice Davis' house.
- 18 Q. There were some other questions raised in the
- 19 various memos we've already discussed here this
- 20 morning, including payments to a contractor. I believe
- 21 you have indicated his name was Mark Starcher.
- 22 Do you recall any conversations about
- 23 that during the administrative conference?
- 24 A. Yes, I do.

Page 1178

- 1 that meeting occurred, the -- the questions Justice
- 2 Davis had asked before, were those addressed during
- 3 that administrative conference?
- 4 A. Yes. There was a lot of discussion about
- 5 where he -- he was taking the cars, and he said that it
- ${\bf 6}\,$ was all Court business or something to that effect. He
- 7 said that nothing was inappropriate.
- 8 Q. Now let me ask you with respect to the -- the
- 9 dinners -- and I think they've been characterized as
- 10 different things, but the dinners and the request for
- 11 information about who paid for different dinners.
- 12 A. Yeah.
- 13 Q. Was that discussed at the administrative
- 14 conference?
- 15 A. Yes, it was.
- 16 Q. If you could, please summarize and tell the
- 17 Committee your recollection of those conversations --
- 18 of that conversation, rather.
- 19 A. The main point that I remember was that
- 20 Justice Loughry really thought that the main point of
- 21 impropriety was that there were invitations that were
- 22 given to the just -- judges, that said that they were
- 23 invited to a dinner at Justice Davis' home, and he said
- 24 that because the Court paid for it, it should have said

- 1 Q. If you could please summarize those -- that 2 conversation for the Committee.
- 3 A. Justices Workman and Loughry just thought
- 4 that there was something inappropriate about the
- 5 payments over an 11-year period to a contractor, a
- 6 technology contractor.
- 7 And since Mark Starcher's name has been
- 8 muddied so often in these various discussions, I will
- 9 point out that Mark Starcher is an extraordinary person
- 10 who does extraordinary work, and the Court was not the
- 11 only State contractor of Mr. Starcher through the
- 12 years.
- 13 The State Police, West Liberty. I had
- 14 gotten to know him when I was at the Regional Jail
- 15 Authority. He did wonderful work.
- 16 So naturally, I defended his work, said
- 17 he was a scanning expert. In fact, he has a company
- 18 named Scanmark, and that was what our preoccupation had
- 19 been, with the creation of the computer system that
- 20 took all of that written material and turned it into a
- 21 electronic platform.

- 22 That he had earned his money and that
- 23 it was not inappropriate.
 - Q. Was there any -- was Mr. Starcher still

Page 1181

1 performing work for the -- the Court at the time that

2 conference was going on, or had he already completed

3 his contract?

4 A. Well, he had stopped working in around June

- 5 of 2016 because the original issue was brought up,
- 6 frankly, in November of 2015. There was a lot of
- 7 discussion about it then. And so I let him know that,
- 8 for whatever reason, that the Court had -- had become
- 9 extremely agitated -- a few members of the Court had
- 10 become agitated about his work.
- 11 And however, he was still contracted to
- 12 do work with a couple -- at least one federal grant,
- 3 perhaps two, and he was finishing that up.
- 14 He also was involved with doing
- 15 e-filing, scanning in a few circuits, and I thought it
- 16 was wise to let him finish that up. It was all done,
- 17 as I recall, by around June of 2016. Perhaps July;
- 18 perhaps May. But around then.
- 19 Q. Thank you. There was also mention, I
- 20 believe, in Exhibit No. 6, which was the memorandum
- 21 from Justice Loughry to the four justices, Ketchum,
- 22 Workman, Benjamin and Lough -- and Benjamin --
- 23 Just to the three, rather.
- 24 -- about the -- as he states, the

Page 1182

- 1 depletion of the Court's so-called rainy day fund in 2 the amount of \$26,000,000.
- 3 Do you recall any conversations about
- 4 that allegation during this administrative conference
- 5 that we've just been talking about?
- 6 A. Yes. I, once again, attempted to explain
- 7 that it was a mischaracterization to call it a
- 8 depletion, and I once again pointed out that every
- 9 single penny was accounted for, that every penny had
- 10 gone through proper channels, and that --
- 11 I reminded them, yet again, that this
- 12 had been a point of some contention with a couple of
- 13 the legislat -- leaders in the Senate, primarily,
- 14 several years earlier.
- 15 I don't know that I ever got through to
- 16 a couple of them. I don't think I communicated very
- 17 well about that, to be perfectly honest. But I did
- 18 try.
- 19 Ultimately, it resulted in a memorandum
- 20 that you've probably seen a couple of months later,
- 21 as we went back and forth with conversation, with
- 22 Justice Workman especially.
- 23 Q. Thank you, and we do have that and we'll get
- 24 to that in just a little bit. I do appreciate that.

- A. I'm sorry if I got the cart ahead of the
- 2 horse.

1

- 3 Q. No, that's fine, we will make it there. Do
- 4 you recall -- I know we've been over a couple of
- 5 issues. Do you recall any other issues that were
- 6 discussed during that administrative conference that
- 7 may have occurred near the -- the end of August 2016 or
- 8 perhaps in September 2016?
- 9 A. There was a -- some routine business. I
- 10 don't really recall -- I mean, I could have my memory
- 11 tickled if you're thinking of something in specifically
- 12 -- in specifics, but I can't remember right now.
- 13 Q. Thank you. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now going to
- 14 turn to a new topic, and that is the topic of home
- 15 office policies or lack thereof. So if -- so that
- 16 we're prepared, that's the new topic I'm going to move
- 17 to.
- 18 Let me ask you first: During your time
- 19 with the Court from 2005 through 2017, do you remember
- 20 any written policy that the Court had regarding
- 21 allowing the Supreme Court justices to have a home
- 22 office?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Did the justices -- during the time period

- 1 that you were with the Court, did they have some type
- 2 of computer equipment that they would take home, as you
- 3 recall?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. What type of equipment do you recall
- 6 generally being provided to the justices to -- for
- 7 their homes?
- 8 A. Each justice had a computer. When I first
- 9 got there, they tended to be desktops. But as laptops
- 10 got to be better, I guess, they tended to switch to
- 11 laptops. So a few had laptops; a few had desktops.
- 12 Only one had a printer, as I recall, before Justice
- 13 Loughry, and that was Justice Ketchum.
- 14 There was no policy about that. I
- 15 think that it's -- this has been a topic of some
- 16 scholarship. But as so often happens, technology
- 17 outpaced policy, and it had just -- I think that -- I'd
- 18 heard that in the 1990s, they had fax machines, and fax
- 19 machines then developed into people having computers to
- 20 stay in touch.
- 21 There's been some question and
- 22 consternation about why the Court would provide
- 23 computers. I don't know that people are quite
- 24 understanding of the security that's necessary, and to

Page 1185

- 1 have a secure system.
- 2 And that's why the security people, the
- 3 -- the IT Division, wanted them to have these dedicated4 computers.
- 5 Q. Other than the computers and printers,
- 6 before, let's say, 2013, were you aware of any other
- 7 type of equipment that any justice took to his or her
- 8 home for a home office?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Okay. At some point after Justice Loughry
- 11 was elected, did you have a conversation with him about
- 12 a home office?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Do you recall him -- let me back up now and
- 15 ask just about any furniture that might have been moved
- 16 from the -- the Capitol to Justice Loughry's home. Do
- 17 you recall having any type of conversation with Justice
- 18 Loughry about moving any furniture, be it a couch or a
- 19 desk --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. -- to his home? And which piece of furniture
- 22 do you recall having a conversation about?
- 23 A. The couch.
- 24 Q. If you could, please tell the Committee what

- Q. During your time with the Court, did you at
- 2 some point become aware that Justice Loughry had a desk
- 3 that had been moved from the Capitol to his home?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Did you find out at a later time after your
- 6 employment with the Court ended?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Also at some point after your employment
- 9 ended, did you become aware or were -- did you read a
- 10 statement that had been issued by a Ms. Jennifer Bundy
- 11 from the Supreme Court about the Supreme Court's -- and
- 12 I will paraphrase here, but the Supreme Court's
- 13 longstanding policy or practice, rather of
- 14 providing the justices an opportunity to establish a
- 15 home office?
- 16 A. Yes, I read that. It puzzled me.
- 17 Q. Did -- were you aware of any such policy or
- 18 long-standing policy during your years with the Court?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. There has been mention made at some point -
- 21 and I can't say where just right now but that Justice
- 22 Workman may also have a chair at her home. Do you have
- 23 any knowledge of that?
- 24 A. No.

Page 1186

Page 1188

- 1 you recall about that conversation.
- A. Justice Loughry told me that he thought that
- 3 he would take that couch home for his home office, and
- 4 my reaction was -- frankly, was, "What?" But I said,
- 5 "Okav."
- 6 And I always wanted to try to serve
- 7 these guys, so I said, "You want me to help you arrange
- 8 for its moving?" And he said he would take care of it.
- 9 Q. The couch that you are referring to -- there
- 10 has been mention of two different couches. One has
- 11 been referred to as Justice Albright's couch. Is that
- 12 the couch you are referring to?
- 13 A. That's the couch.
- 14 Q. Did you, in the end, have any involvement in
- 15 moving that couch from the Capitol to Justice Loughry's
- 16 home?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. In fact, have you ever been personally
- 19 yourself to Justice Loughry's home?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Okay. Did Justice Loughry ever mention to
- 22 you any plans or any talk about moving a desk to his
- 23 home?
- 24 A. No.

- 1 Q. So other than the -- the computer equipment,
- 2 including printers perhaps for two of the justices and
- 3 the couch, is that the only information you had about
- 4 Supreme Court equipment going to the homes of the
- 5 justices?
- 6 A. Yes, that's it.
- 7 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'd like to now move to a new
- 8 topic, and the new topic is going to deal with office
- 9 renovations.
- 10 A. Okay.

- Q. Let me ask first: Generally speaking, if you
- 12 know, did justices, during your time with the Court,
- 13 have an understanding or direct knowledge, rather --
- 14 let's say direct knowledge, of the amount, the cost to
- 15 the renovations to their respective offices?
- 16 A. To their own offices, yes.
- 17 Q. They did.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. We have received some information that
- 20 renovations began occurring, I believe, perhaps even
- 21 before the year 2010. Does that seem correct to you?
- 22 A. I --
- 23 Q. And it would not have been to the justices'
- 24 office themselves. I --

Page 1189

1 A. Correct. It began in 2008 with the counsel's 2 office.

3 Q. If you could, just please try to give the

4 Committee an overview of the -- the renovation project.

5 And I understand you just indicated it began in 2008.

6 If you could provide to the Committee just an overview

7 of the areas where the renovations occurred, beginning

8 in 2008.

A. Yes. In 2008, the decision was made to gut 10 the counsel's office, the chief counsel's offices.

11 That's where the writ clerks and a few of the personal

12 law clerks, and at that time, something called a per

13 curiam clerk had offices.

We actually had to move them to another 14 15 location for several months. That project was bid out

16 and Neighborgall Construction won the bid. And I don't

remember exactly, but it was approximately a half a

18 million or so dollars.

19 The Court was very pleased not only

with the work of Neighborgall; they were very pleased

21 with the fact that the project manager and the people

22 they had on the job were very considerate of the -- the

23 people directly beneath them, i.e., the justices.

24 That's the same end of the building.

Page 1190

And so when we decided that we would do

2 further work and completely gut out and reroute and 3 rebuild the clerk's offices, we did so by change order.

4 It's important to note that the Court

5 did not follow the purchasing procedure. In fact, we

6 didn't even have to bid out the original contract. But

7 it seemed unwise to me not to bid out the first

8 construction.

9 That project then went on for a while,

10 and at that time, we started to do one justice's office

11 at a time, beginning with Justice Benjamin's office,

12 which was in great need of repair, having had virtually

13 nothing done to it since the building was built.

14 Slowly over the years, there was his

15 office, then Justice Workman's, Justice Ketchum's.

16 Justice McHugh wanted absolutely nothing done to his.

17 As he said, "I'm a short-termer, I don't need this

18 done." So we held off.

19 And then Justice Loughry just really

20 was insistent that his be next, and so Justice Davis

21 said, "That's fine, let him go next."

And then it -- it ended in '14 with

23 Justice Davis' office. During that time, there was

24 also some work done in the hallway of the first floor

1 on the East Wing, just essentially cleaning the marble

2 and putting in different LED lights.

3 Since we had to take the fixtures down

4 anyway, we thought we'd put in LEDs.

5 Q. With respect to the bid process, I understand

6 that the -- from what your -- you just stated, that the

7 Supreme Court did not have to bid out that original

8 renovation work --

9 A. Uh-huh.

10 Q. -- but the Court chose to do so. Do you

11 recall if Neighborgall was the lowest bidder?

A. Yes. 12

13 Q. Okav. Do you recall how many bids were

14 received at that time?

15 A. No.

16 Q. Okay.

A. But there was -- there were a couple. Work 17

18 was pretty slow in 2008, and I think there was a lot of

19 interest.

20 Q. Did -- and this is a general question. I

21 know you just went through several years of renovations

22 in different areas. Did Neighborgall do the --

23 primarily most of those renovations, or were there

24 other contractors?

Page 1192

A. Again, Neighborgall, to the Court, was pretty

2 much the project manager, and the people they had on

3 the job. The project manager moved to another

4 construction company, so Justice Davis' office was not

5 done by Neighborgall; it was done by -- I can't

6 remember their name now.

7 I've got a total mental -- an absolute

8 blank. It begins with a G. I can't remember it. You

9 probably have the information there.

10 Q. I may. That's fine. But was that --

A. Yes. 11

12 Q. -- where the project manager had moved to --

A. Had moved to, yes. 13

14 Q. -- from Neighborgall.

15 A. Right. We did continue with the same

16 architects, Silling Associates.

17 Q. You have just mentioned Silling & Associates,

18 and I'm going to go off topic just a little bit, but I

19 just wanted to confirm. The Committee has received a

20 -- an Affidavit from an employee of the Court, Kim

21 Ellis. Do you know Ms. Ellis?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. It is my understanding that Ms. Ellis was

24 actually employed by Silling Associates before she came

1 to the Court. Is that correct?

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. Justice Workman and I and a few others were
- 5 so impressed with her work that we wanted her hired,
- 6 and Justice Workman was especially interested in making
- 7 that happen, and she was one of the -- one of the
- 8 stars, frankly, of the Administrative Office.
- 9 Q. Okay. Mr. Canterbury, I'd now like to focus 10 on -- on the renovations to Justice Loughry's office.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Justice Loughry has previously indicated I
- 13 believe perhaps in an interview or in print that he
- 14 had very little input in the renovations in his office.
- 15 Let me ask you first: Do you agree with that
- 16 statement?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. How involved, in your opinion -- well, let me
- 19 back up. Were you involved in Justice Loughry -- the
- 20 renovations to Justice Loughry's office?
- 21 A. Well, somewhat. I mean, Kim Ellis was the
- 22 project manager. I delegated a lot in my job; it was a
- 23 pretty big job. But I was probably a little more
- 24 involved, at Justice Loughry's insistence, on a few
 - Page 1194

- 1 specific items.
- 2 Q. How, if you -- if you feel that you can, can
- 3 you please tell the Committee, in your opinion, how
- 4 actually involved Justice Loughry was in the
- 5 renovations to his office?
- 6 A. Daily. A couple of times daily, he would
- 7 check in and ask questions and be very specific about
- 8 his displeasure about some things. Sometimes
- 9 remarkable minutia. He wrote I don't know how many
- 10 e-mails scores, perhaps hundreds of e-mails and
- 11 they were all around the clock.
- 12 If you look at the e-mails, I think
- 13 you'll find a few of them are midnight or 1:00 in the
- 14 morning.
- 15 He was very involved, and he was more
- 16 involved than any other justice, by a long shot.
- 17 Q. Any other justice that you've ever worked 18 with during your tender -- tenure with the Court?
- 19 A. That's right.
- 20 Q. If you know, was Justice Loughry aware of the
- 21 renovation cost and I'm gonna confine this to the
- 22 renovation costs to his office?
- 23 A. Yes. He received a direct e-mail that was
- 24 copied to me from the -- either Neighborgall or

- Page 1195
 1 Silling. I'm not sure who provided the e-mail. But it
- 2 cited exactly what the estimate was, what the costs
- 3 would be.
- 4 Q. There has been discussions and talk about a
- 5 wood medallion that is in the floor of Justice
- 6 Loughry's office. Are you aware of that wood 7 medallion?
- 8 A. Oh, yes.
- 9 Q. Could you please tell the Committee how that
- 10 idea came about?
- 11 A. Justice Loughry wanted it. He put it in a
- 12 rendering that he sketched. Pretty good artist,
- 13 actually. He sketched out exactly how he wanted his
- 14 office to look, and he had the medallion there on the
- 15 floor. He'd seen something like that somewhere, and he
- 16 thought it was cool, and he wanted it on his floor.
- 17 Q. And with respect to the counties that are in
- 18 that medallion in the -- the state map, are all of the
- 19 counties distinct?
- 20 A. Yes, they are. I --
- 21 Q. Whose idea was that?
- 22 A. It was his idea, but he wanted me to
- 23 actualize it. I spent a long time looking through
- 24 those woods. We have counties that border six other
- 24 those woods. We have counties that border six other

Page 1
1 counties, and if you changed the wood in one, you'd

- 2 have to change the other.
- 3 I spent a long time -- that's why
- 4 I said more than the other offices, I got involved.
- 5 And that's what I was thinking of.
- 6 I'm the one who had to figure out where
- 7 the woods went. He was -- it was one of the few times
- 8 he actually said something nice to me in an e-mail. He
- 9 said I'd done a pretty good job, but that he disagreed
- 10 with a couple of the wood choices.
- 11 And I don't know if it was in the
- 12 e-mail or if it was in a conversation, but he decided
- 13 he wanted Tucker County to be in the same blue pearl
- 14 granite I'll never forget that term that he had on
- 15 his little bathroom floor that he had redone.
- So the blue pearl granite was provided
- 17 cut and put into the slot for the Tucker County.
- 18 Q. What type -- if you recall, what types of 19 wood were used in that medallion?
- 20 A. I don't re -- I mean, you know, there were --
- 21 there were various versions of oak, walnut. There were
- 22 a couple of woods that were kind of different. Some
- 23 sort of some -- maybe African black wood or something.
- 24 There were -- just different shades of wood.

Page 1197

- 1 Because this company was out of
- 2 Wisconsin, as I recall, and they specialized in these
- 3 kinds of projects, so they had the woods that they knew
- 4 they could cut precisely, but also would be in high
- 5 contrast to the other woods to be able to make the
- 6 seal, the symbol, the map, whatever.
- 7 Q. Now I want to ask you about a couch that was 8 located in Justice Loughry's office.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. It has been referred to in -- in many
- 11 instances as a \$32,000 couch. Are you familiar with
- 12 that couch?
- 13 A. Yes, I am.
- 14 Q. Did you ever personally discuss the cost of
- 15 that couch with Justice Loughry?
- 16 A. Yes, I did.
- 17 Q. Can you please tell the Committee about that
- 18 conversation? Or conversations, if there were more
- 19 than one.
- 20 A. It was a brief conversation. It was the only
- 21 thing I had to do with the couch, really. The project
- 22 manager dealt with that. But I noticed as the document
- 23 came across my desk that it was \$32,000. Well, that
- 24 seemed extreme to me, so I went up to find him.
 - Page 1198
 - He was in the -- I just happened to
- 2 catch him in the hall, and I said, "This -- this couch
- 3 is \$32,000. Do you want me to go through with this?"
- 4 And I remember pretty specifically -
- 5 and now in hindsight, it seems to be prophetic but he
- 6 said, "Yes." And essentially said, "And if it ever
- 7 becomes public, I'll just blame it on you. You're the
- 8 administrator."
- 9 Q. And do you recall any other part of that10 conversation, or was that the end of the conversation?
- 11 A. I don't recall anything else. That kind of
- 12 was it. He chuckled.
- 13 His humor is interesting. It's kind of
- 14 a insults humor, for lack of better words. He tends to
- 15 go that route and has this interesting self-satisfied
- 16 chuckle when he's finished. So that's -- that kind of
- 17 is your -- pretty much told me, "Make it so."
- 18 So I sent it on through.
- 19 Q. And I'm now going to -- going to move off
- 20 topic just a little bit. But with respect to the --
- 21 the full price of that couch being approximately
- 22 \$32,000 --
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. -- I believe there has been some discussion -

- 1 and I'm not sure if I've read that or heard that on the
- 2 news about different spending limits that different
- 3 persons or justices may have had at the Court. Are you
- 4 aware of any spending limits that were imposed at any
- 5 time?
- A. Yes. There was a spending limit on me and on
- 7 the Chief Justice for individual items. However, once
- 8 the Court had said that they wanted something done like
- 9 construction or -- and there was even a document
- 10 about technology.
- 11 -- that it was not necessary for me to
- 12 have to go to them with everything that came in that
- 13 project because the project, obviously, was gonna have
- 14 some costs that exceeded that.
- 15 That once they approved, that that was
- 16 my go ahead to be able to -- to carry those out things
- 17 and to submit those invoices for payment.
 - The technology issue had become so, I
- 19 guess, problematic in the early part of the 21st
- 20 Century, before I got there, there was a memorandum to
- 21 that effect.
- 22 With the construction, they approved
- 23 various constructions, and I then made it so. I made
- 24 sure that those things happened.

- So there would not have been a limit on
- 2 this. This would have been a part of his office
- 3 renovation, and everything would have been under that 4 heading.
- 5 Q. As I understand it, the office renovations,
- 6 the original quote for the office renovations, did that
- 7 generally include furnishings --
 - A. No.
- 9 Q. -- or no? Okay.
- 10 A. No furniture was included in that. I will
- 11 point out about the couch: I had zero to do with the
- 12 couch except for asking him that question. I know that
- 13 he wanted a couch that was specifically large enough to
- 14 fill a certain space. That made the couch get more
- 15 expensive.
- But he, his wife and his secretary, as
- 17 I recall, went to the couch shop Carpet Gallery, I
- 18 think and they picked out the fabric. And the fabric
- 19 was the main cost of that couch.
- 20 Q. What -- if you -- if you know, why was that 21 fabric so much more expensive than --
- 22 A. It was blue suede, and that was a couch not
- 23 designed, I suspect, to be a leather-covered couch.
- 24 Suede comes in hides, not in rolls. It's not like a

Page 1201

1 wool blend. And you have to cut it and you have to2 seam it, and it gets really expensive.

- 3 Q. Other than the one conversation that you have
- 4 just told the Committee about in the hallway in which5 you mentioned the price of the couch to Justice
- 6 Loughry, do you recall any other conversations that you
- 7 had with Justice Loughry about the -- the price of the 8 couch?
- 9 A. No. That was the one and only moment I had 10 with the couch.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 A. I've never even sat on the couch.
- 13 Q. Okay. Mr. Canterbury, I'd like to now move
- 14 to another topic regarding framing --
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. -- and costs associated with framing. Let me
- 17 ask you first: During your time with the Court, was
- 18 there a policy regarding framing?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. How, if a -- if a justice -- and I'm going to
- 21 limit this line of questioning now just to justices.
- 22 But if a justice wanted to have something framed, what
- 23 would a justice do, generally speaking, to have
- 24 something framed?

Page 1202

16

- A. Ask me to take care of it, typically, and I
- 2 would either take care of it because they specifically
- 3 wanted my input, or I would give it to the project
- 4 manager to take care of.
- 5 Q. Over the time -- over your time, rather, with 6 the Court, did all of the justices that you've worked 7 with through the years request framing?
- A. Hmm. Not all. I don't recall Justices
- 9 Albright, Starcher or Maynard ever asking for anything
- 10 to be framed. I don't know that Justice Davis ever
- 11 asked for anything to be framed.
- 12 I could be wrong, but I don't recall
- 13 it. Justice Benjamin had a few things framed. Justice
- 14 Loughry had a lot framed. Justice McHugh did
- 15 absolutely nothing in that regard.
- 16 Justice McHugh is one of the purest
- 17 people I've ever met. I don't think he noticed the
- 18 furniture in his office, to be perfectly honest.
- 19 And I think that -- but Justice Loughry
- 20 wanted a lot of things framed.
- 21 Q. Let's talk about that for a moment now. If
- 22 you could, to the best of your ability or recollection,
- 23 go through to let us -- tell the Committee what types
- 24 of things Justice Loughry asked you to have framed.

1 A. Well, he had myriad things framed. I'll try

- 2 to recall. They were all framed at The Art Store. So
- 3 they will have records, I suspect. But -- and I know
- 4 that some of those records have been sought by other
- 5 groups.

6 He had the swearing-in -- the big

7 panoramic swearing-in photograph framed, as I recall.

8 But he had some more idiosyncratic

9 things framed. He had a page of uncut \$2.00 bills that

10 was his. He wanted that framed.

11 He had some articles that were about

12 his son and the commercial -- his son won a Telly, good

13 actor. He wanted those framed. They were framed.

14 He had a poster of the front of his

15 book; he wanted that framed.

He liked having these presentation

17 frames. He had his first written opinion framed. And

18 those were expensive, because he wanted this gilt

19 frame, and he wanted them to have the title page, the

20 syllabus point page and the signature page. Those are

21 three cutouts. And he wanted fillets in those, and

22 that added to the cost.

23 Excuse me. And he also did the same

24 thing for Justice Workman. He wanted that to be framed

1 for some primary or essential case of hers, and so he

2 did that and gave her, I guess, a gift of that frame.

3 He also had that done for at least one

4 - and maybe two, I don't really recall - of his law

5 clerks. Those were the most expensive frames he did.

6 He also had framed a -- an etching of

7 the building in which he was married. I never saw that

8 on the wall of the Court anywhere.

9 And he had -- at the bottom of the

10 stairs, when they had gotten married, there was

11 apparently an Asian woman who did these little quick

12 very colorful watercolors of their -- the new last name

13 of the happy couple, and she had a little business at

4 the bottom of the steps.

15 They got one of those - it was a long

16 thing - and he wanted that framed. I also never saw

7 that again at the office.

There could have been other things, but

19 I don't know exactly the costs, but the framing total 20 had to be in the \$10,000 to \$12,000 --

21 Q. You had mentioned - I wanted to just make

22 sure I didn't miss anything - at least two items that23 you recall having framed that you don't recall seeing

24 in Justice Loughry's office; is that correct?

Page 1205

1

1 A. At least two, right.

2 Q. And if you could again - just so I'm -- make 3 sure that I'm clear - what are those two items that you 4 don't recall seeing in his office?

A. The etching of the large old beautiful 5 6 government building where he was married in England, I 7 believe, and then that rendering of his name in watercolors, very colorful.

Q. The other frames that were not given away --9 10 I understand that you said some might have been given 11 to law clerks and one may have been given to Justice 12 Workman.

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. Excluding those, the other items you recall 15 having framed for Justice Loughry, do you recall seeing 16 those in Justice Loughry's office?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Do you recall where on the wall those were?

19 A. Two were on the wall that was to the side of 20 the couch, and the others were above the couch. And I 21 -- I never went into his office after two thousand --22 around May of 2014, so I'm not 100 percent sure exactly

23 how they're placed, but I'm pretty sure that's where

24 they were.

Page 1206

Q. Mr. Canterbury, you -- you just mentioned 2 that time period of May of 2014, so I'm going to go 3 ahead and transition there, if that's okay. Let me 4 begin by asking you if you could, please, describe your 5 working relationship with Justice Loughry between the 6 time he became a justice in 2013 and May of 2014.

7 A. The transformation in Justice Loughry's 8 character from being a law clerk to a justice was, in a 9 word, extraordinary. It was awkward interacting with 10 him pretty early, because fairly early in the -- after 11 he was elected, he told me something that just --12 I don't know where that came from, but 13 he said that he knew that when he was Justice Maynard's 14 law clerk that I had advised Justice Maynard to fire 15 him. 16 Well, I never had. Never -- I've never

17 advised anybody to fire anybody I recall. But I certainly did not. I said, "No, I think -- I know that 19 didn't happen. I don't know what Justice Maynard told 20 you."

21 But the only thing I suggested to

22 Justice Maynard was that he might not want to write

23 that note of praise for the back of Justice Loughry's

24 book.

I said, you know, "Spike, you're gonna

2 have a lot of friends in that book, and you maybe don't 3 want to write that piece."

4 And I'll never forget what Justice

5 Maynard said. In his style, he said, "Well, I'd rather

6 write the piece on the back of the book than be one of

7 the subjects in the book."

8 I said, "Okay." He wrote -- he wrote 9 the piece. I have never understood where he was coming 10 from on that.

11 And then there were occasional times 12 when he would just be rather difficult. It's hard to 13 describe, just a tone of difficulty. But I was pledged 14 to serve him. I respect the office as much as any Boy 15 Scout could respect anything. And I did everything I

16 could to serve him.

17 It truly soured, though, and it got 18 very un -- difficult in May of 2014. In May of 2014,

19 before an administrative conference, he said that he --

20 he wanted my resignation, which surprised me to no end.

21 And -- and everyone else in the room

22 was surprised. And he said that he felt that I had

23 disrespected him; that he had learned that I had told

24 some judges that he was young and that he would learn

Page 1208

1 more about drug court as time went on.

I don't remember saying that. And I 3 said as much then, and I did not resign. But from that

4 moment on, he wouldn't speak to me. And in fact, would

5 sometimes refer to me in third person while I was in

6 the room in administrative conference.

7 And if there were people around, he 8 might say hello. He would send e-mails to me and want

9 work done and -- I don't think you'll ever find an

10 e-mail that was unanswered by me, and I took care of

11 everything he wanted. I kept thinking I could bring

12 him around.

13 And I did inquire of some judges if 14 they knew what the heck he was talking about, and 15 nobody knew what he was talking about. They all 16 referred back to Justice Ketchum saying -- he's the

17 only one they ever heard refer to his age, because he'd

18 say, "Here comes the boy justice" in Justice Ketchum's

19 style. If you know him, you'll understand that.

20 So I honestly have no idea what he was 21 talking about, and I have really searched my -- my

22 heart, my head, to try to figure out what that was. I

23 never understood it.

24 Q. I believe you mentioned this earlier, and I

7

- 1 do want to just confirm. After that -- that issue or
- 2 that incident in May of 2014, did you ever go back in
- 3 Justice Loughry's office for any reason --
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. -- that you recall?
- 6 A. No, no, I was not invited. I mean, he
- 7 literally would not -- he talked to others and talked
- 8 right through me. It was as if I didn't exist.
- 9 Q. During administrative conferences from that
- 10 time period forward May of 2014 forward did Justice
- 11 Loughry speak to you directly in any of the
- 12 administrative conferences?
- 13 A. I don't recall that he did. He tended to
- 14 talk at -- to the room, if he needed to address
- 15 something that I'd brought up. But he wouldn't address
- 16 me. And in fact, would sometimes refer to me in third
- 17 person.
- He may have said some things to me, but
- 19 it was not typical. And I kept trying to win him over.
- 20 I kept thinking that I could. But I failed.
- 21 Somebody asked if I had any preparation
- 22 for that kind of treatment, and I said, "Well, I went
- 23 to junior high like everybody else," because that's the
- 24 only thing that I could compare it to.

Page 1210

- 1 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Mr. Canterbury, you're
- 2 getting beyond the question now.
- 3 MR. CANTERBURY: I'm sorry.
- 4 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: You've -- Counsel,
- 5 next question.
- 6 MS. KAUFFMAN: Sure.
- 7 Q. Mr. Canterbury, you had mentioned per curiam
- 8 clerks earlier in your testimony, and I'd like to go
- 9 back to that. Was there at some point during your time
- 10 with the Court a change with respect to the types of
- 11 clerks the justices had?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. If you could, please explain the -- the
- 14 change. Let's just start with the change and then
- 15 we'll go to the reason for the change next.
- 16 A. Yes, there had been two per curiam clerks and
- 17 two personal clerks. They changed to eliminate the per
- 18 curiam distinction and add four personal clerks.
- 19 Q. Do you recall approximately -- and I'll take
- 20 whatever you have, if you recall by year, or any time
- 21 period in which that change occurred?
- 22 A. Yes, it happened in 2013 within the first
- 23 half of the year.
- 24 Q. Do you recall what the reason was that

1 precipitated the change from two per curiam and two

- 2 personal to four personal clerks?
- 3 A. Justice Loughry introduced the subject and
- 4 wanted the per curiam distinction changed.
- 5 Q. Did he give a reason for why he wanted the 6 per curiam distinction changed?
 - A. The per curiam clerks were hired by the
- 8 Court; the personal clerks were hired by the individual
- 9 justice. He wanted to have control over hiring all
- 10 four of his individual clerks instead of having two of
- 11 them having to have the approval of the justices.
- 12 Every justice at that time inherited
- 13 two per curiam clerks. He had inherited two.
- 14 Q. And just so I'm clear on that, when a justice
- 15 would -- would come on, that justice inherited their
- 16 two per curiams; is that correct?
- 17 A. Correct.
- 18 Q. And was that change made?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Do you recall, was that a vote of the Court
- 21 at that time?
- 22 A. Yes.

24

- 23 Q. Do you happen to recall what that vote was?
 - A. No. You'd have to look at the administrative

- 1 conference minutes. I don't recall.
 - Q. Okay. I apologize, I'm now bouncing around.
 - When you'll say something, it makes me think of anotherquestion.
 - 5 A. That's fine.
 - 6 Q. We have spoken at length here about
 - 7 administrative conferences. Can you tell the
 - 8 Committee, generally speaking, during your time with
 - 9 the Court how administrative conferences were
 - 10 scheduled, how often they would generally occur, if
 - 11 there was any type of set schedule with administrative
 - 12 conferences?
 - 13 A. No, there was not. It is up to the Chief
 - 14 Justice. Some scheduled more; some less.
 - 15 Q. Were they generally every month, every other
 - 16 month, or any type of pattern in that regard, or no?
 - 17 A. No.
 - 18 Q. No, okay. At some point during some of these
 - 19 conferences, it is -- there has been, I believe, some
 - 20 discussion or talk about lunches that were provided to
 - 21 some justices and perhaps Court personnel during some
 - 22 of those conferences or on certain days that the Court
 - 23 was there.
 - 24 Do you have any knowledge as to the

Page 1213

- 1 lunch issue?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Let's begin with, if you recall, when did the

4 lunches begin?

- 5 A. It was either 2011 or 2012. It had been a
- 6 long and hard day. They still had an administrative
- 7 conference to do, work. They were wanting to get the
- 8 day finished. They said, "Let's just order lunch and
- 9 have the administrative conference during lunch."

10 Q. Okay. And after -- after that one time, did 11 that become a pattern or a practice at the Court?

- 12 A. Well, it wasn't every administrative
- 13 conference, but it happened with some frequency, and
- 14 then there were lunches when I wasn't around that they
- 15 had for their opinion conferences and other gatherings
- 16 when they were there without me.
- 17 Q. Okay. And if -- and I'm not going to ask you
- 18 with respect to any specific conference, but -- or any
- 19 specific lunch. But in any of the lunches in which you
- 20 were involved, how many people were involved in those
- 21 lunches? If you can, just give an average.
- 22 A. Twelve.
- 23 Q. Who -- what types of --
- 24 A. Fourteen. I just thought of two others.

1 but in administrative conferences, she didn't.

- 2 Q. Do you know how those lunches were paid for?
- 3 A. Yes. They were paid for by the Court.
- 4 Q. Was it a P-card used, a purchasing card?
- 5 A. Yes, that's -- sure, a P-card was used.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. Right. The runner would use a P-card, and
- 8 all of their names were listed. Everyone who got a
- 9 lunch has to be listed for the Auditor to go through10 payment.
- 11 Q. Did -- were you ever questioned about that,

12 about what names needed to be included?

- 13 A. Justice Loughry was surprised when he learned
- 14 that all names were included. It was about another
- 15 matter. He was concerned that we were having lunches
- 16 for people we were training for UJA and people who came
- 17 in from around the state for probation meetings.
 - 8 And to keep them there, we'd provide
- 19 lunches, and he said, "You don't even know who's eating
- 20 those lunches."
- 21 And I said, "Au contraire. Everybody's
- 22 name has to be listed or it doesn't go through the
- 23 Auditor's office."
- 24 He said, "Well, does that include our

Page 1214

Q. Who -- what positions -- or who were those 142 people?

- A. The justices would get them for themselves:
- 4 their assistants; for a while, for both security
- 5 people. Ultimately, I think Arthur Angus didn't want
- 6 lunch anymore. And ultimately, Justice Davis chose not
- 7 to get lunches anymore and I was -- I got lunches at
- 8 times until about 2015, and then I was excluded.
- 9 Q. And do you -- was there ever any discussion
- 10 as to why you were excluded from the lunches beginning

11 in two thous -- the 2015 time period?

- 12 A. '15 or '16, somewhere in there. I -- no,
- 13 just I was never -- when they ordered lunch, they
- 14 didn't call me.
- 15 Q. Were you actually in there in the
- 16 administrative conferences with them when they were

17 eating the lunches?

- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. But you weren't given lunch.
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Was everyone else in the room given lunch?
- 22 A. Yeah -- well, except Justice Davis would
- 23 bring her own lunch in '16 and '15. She stopped having
- 24 many if any lunches. I don't know about the others

1 lunches?"

2 And I said, "Well, sure, of course."

3 Q. Okay. And was that -- did he indicate

4 whether or not he was aware of that before that time?

- 5 A. I got the distinct impression he had no idea
- 6 until that moment.
- 7 Q. Okay. At the time your employment with the
- 8 Court ended in January of 2017, do you know -- and this
- 9 would have been through the end of 2016. Do you know
- 10 if those lunches were still occurring?
 - 1 A. They occurred through '16. After that, I
- 12 can't say --
- 13 Q. Okav.
- 14 A. -- except what I've read in the paper.
- 15 Q. Okay. Do you recall any -- and I'm not going
- 16 to ask for an exhaustive list. But if you could, if
- 17 you recall any of the restaurants where these lunches
- 18 came from, if you could please tell the Committee.
- 19 A. I may get this name wrong, but it's the South
- 20 Hills Market & Cafe, I think is what it's called.
- 21 SoHo's. I think they also got some lunches from
- 22 Panera's. But they liked South Hills. That seemed to
- 23 be the go-to place.
- 24 Q. Was there ever any discussion as to the --

- 1 the costs of those meals in your presence?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'm going to back up now.
- 4 You had indicated or testified, rather that you had
- 5 a conversation with Justice Loughry about that \$32,000
- 6 couch, just about the price of it and --
- 7 A. Right.
- 8 Q. -- on one occasion. Do you recall throughout
- 9 your time with the Court ever having a similar
- 10 conversation perhaps not about a couch but about
- 11 any other purchase that -- that caused you any concern?
- 12
- 13 Q. And if you could, please tell the Committee
- 14 about that.
- A. Justice Davis' chair, I said it was an 15
- 16 awfully expensive chair. And then the next year -- and
- 17 those are the last -- I think the very last thing that
- 18 was done was actually in 2015, but those -- those rugs,
- 19 they were very expensive as well.
- 20 Q. Those --
- A. And I said they were very expensive, the 21
- 22 Edward Fields rugs.
- 23 Q. In Justice Davis' office?
- 24 A. Yes, I'm sorry, in Justice Davis' offices,
- Page 1218

- 1 yes.
- 2 Q. Other than those conversations, do you recall
- 3 any other conversations that you've had with any
- 4 justice about -- about prices for specific items?
- A. Well, the floor in Justice Workman's office, 5
- 6 we had a discussion about that.
- Q. If you could, please tell the Committee about 7
- 8 that discussion, at least what you recall.
- A. Just that it was an extremely expensive
- 10 floor. But she said that since she was doing so little
- 11 else in the office she was just essentially going to
- 12 get some repainting and she was leaving the wainscoting
- 13 that was there that she inherited that she felt it
- 14 was all right.
- 15 Q. Do you happen to recall the -- the price for
- 16 that floor?
- 17 A. No, I don't. You can look it up. It's all
- 18 -- everything is available.
- Q. Right. Mr. Canterbury, I'd like to now move 19
- 20 to talking about reimbursement expenses for out-of-town
- 21 travel for justices.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And let me ask you just -- just generally, if
- 24 you could let the Committee know, if a justice had made

- Page 1219 1 a decision that he or she was going to go to some type
- 2 of conference that was out of state, how did -- did
- 3 they have to request approval, or what was the process
- 4 for getting a justice approved for such travel and then
- 5 reimbursed for such travel?
- A. Well, they approved themselves. They're the
- 7 -- they're the boss; they're in charge. There was no
- 8 vote of the Court or anything. If a justice wanted to
- 9 go somewhere, he or she went somewhere. As far as the
- 10 cost, well, as much as possible, justices, I guess,
- 11 generally would have direct payment from the Court for
- 12 airfare and even hotels.
- 13 But often, of course, the hotels,
- 14 especially, wouldn't take such direct approval. They
- 15 would use their credit card and then they would get
- 16 reimbursed.
- 17 Q. Just to back up, with respect to any
- 18 conferences that a justice would decide that he or she
- 19 may -- may want to go to, did you indicate that that
- 20 was just something that a justice would decide on his
- 21 or her own; that was not require -- additional Court
- 22 approval was not required?
- 23 A. Yes. I mean, I didn't even know sometimes
- 24 when a justice would go to a certain conference or

- 1 another meeting.
 - Q. Okay. And -- if you'll give me one moment.
- 3 Mr. Canterbury, there has been in some prior
- 4 Legislative Audit Reports some discussion about
- 5 Justice Loughry's use of vehicles and then use of
- 6 rental vehicles when --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. -- he had gone to out-of-state conferences.
- 9 Let me ask you first just generally: Did -- at the
- 10 time those were occurring, were you aware that that was
- 11 happening?
- 12 A. Generally, yes. Not the specifics.
- 13 Q. Okay. And was it uncommon for justices to
- 14 get or rent vehicles when they were out of state
- 15 attending conferences?
- 16 A. Not uncommon. They didn't all do so, but it
- 17 wasn't uncommon.
- 18 Q. Okay. When the reimbursements for the cars,
- 19 the rental cars -- and let's just focus now on the
- 20 rental cars.
- 21 A. Uh-huh.
- 22 Q. When the reimbursement requests were made for
- 23 the rental cars, were those reviewed by anyone before
- 24 they were paid?

Page 1224

Page 1221

- 1 A. Well, they'd go through the Fiscal Division
- 2 who would review them, I suppose. That was what they
- 3 were supposed to do. But then they would be paid. And
- 4 anything that a justice submitted pretty much was paid5 without question.
- Q. I've seen a note of a individual named Sue7 Racer-Troy. Would that have been --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. -- her division?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Are you aware of one way or the other of
- 12 whether or not any of the -- the current Supreme Court
- 13 justices would use rental cars and take personal trips
- 14 while they were perhaps at a conference?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. If you could, please tell the Committee about 17 what you know.
- 18 A. Well, what I know is that Justice Loughry
- 19 would take additional time or would skip parts of the
- 20 conference and go to, I guess, personal trips. I don't
- 21 know where he went except in one occasion, I know he
- 22 went to the Lincoln, Nebraska Capitol in a conference
- 23 that was held in Omaha.
- 24 I believe that he also went to parts of
- Page 1222
- 1 Yellowstone when the conference was in Jackson,
- 2 Wyoming. Otherwise, what I know is only what's been 3 reported.
- 4 Q. Let's go back to the -- the Nebraska trip.
- 5 How -- how did you become aware of that, that Justice
- 6 Loughry would have taken the rental car to the State
- 7 Capitol there?
- 8 A. Well, I saw him leaving when the conference
- 9 had just ended. He was on his way out in the car. And
- 10 then later when we were talking about actually security
- 11 at the -- at the Capitol, I pointed out that, you know,
- 12 when he went to Nebraska, didn't he go to the Capitol
- 13 and see that they had no security whatsoever, you could
- 4 go in any of the doors, and he said, "Yes."
- 15 So that's how I know what when he left
- 16 that day and got on that interstate I just happened
- 17 to be driving behind him that he was on his way to
- 18 Lincoln. I didn't have a rental car in Omaha, so --
- 19 Q. Did you attend the same conference?
- 20 A. Yes, yes.
- 21 Q. You had indicated just previously that you
- 22 believe there were times that Justice Loughry didn't go
- 23 to the entire conference? How -- how do you have that
- 24 type of information?

- 1 A. In Asheville, North Carolina, there was a
 - 2 conference, and he had gotten special permission to be
 - 3 able to stay through till Friday night. The conference
 - 4 ended Friday mid day, and it was -- it was a difficult
 - 5 discussion with the manager of the hotel, because the
 - 6 rates only applied through Thursday, the special deal.
 - 7 He got, though, that deal to go through
 - 8 Friday. On Friday, I went to every event of the
 - 9 conference, as did Menis Ketchum. We couldn't find
 - 10 Justice Loughry anywhere.
 - 11 Q. And what -- if you can, just please elaborate
 - 12 on the -- you indicated that it was a little bit
 - 13 difficult. What did you have to do with respect to
 - 14 Justice Loughry's room or for his accommodations at
 - 15 that -- in North Carolina at that time?
 - 16 A. Well, the assistant -- I always made a point
 - 17 when I attended conferences with the justices of
 - 18 telling the assistant manager at the desk that if there
 - 19 was anything that came up that they needed any kind of
 - 20 additional help or whatever with the justices, just let
 - 21 me know and I would make it hap -- try to make it work
 - 22 out.
 - 23 And I got involved in the discussion
 - 24 when they called and said that he wanted this special

ige 1222

- 1 rate, and I then called the State Court Administrator
- 2 of North Carolina to see if he could assist, and
- 3 through all of these efforts, Justice Loughry got the
- 4 special rate.
- 5 I don't know that Justice Loughry was
- 6 even aware that any of that happened behind the scenes.
- 7 Q. Okay. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now going to move
- 8 to your use of the rental cars, and I just have a
- 9 question about that. It is my understanding that when
- 10 you would go on trips such as this and -- and have
- 11 rental cars --
- 12 A. Uh-huh.
- 13 Q. -- do I understand correctly that you would,
- 14 when you returned, prorate your use of the car? If
- 15 there had been any type of what you believed to be
- 16 personal use, you would prorate that upon your return;
- 17 is that correct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. To your knowledge, did any of the
- 20 current justices ever do any -- any type of similar
- 21 proration for any of their out-of-state trips?
- 22 A. No
- 23 Q. Do you have any information about whether or

Page 1225

- 1 and let's now focus just on Justice Loughry so that I
- 2 can be clear about my questions.
- 3 -- whether or not Justice Loughry's
- 4 family, any family member, attended these out-of-state
- 5 conferences with him?
- 6 A. Yes, his wife and son.
- 7 Q. Was that generally the case?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Do you know whether or not there was ever --
- 10 whether the Court paid ever -- ever made any payment
- 11 for any expenses related to Justice Loughry's daughter
- 12 -- or I'm sorry, son or wife, for any -- with respect
- 13 to any of those trips?
- 14 A. Not that I'm aware of.
- 15 Q. Do you recall ever having a conversation with
- 16 Justice Loughry about that, though, about whether or
- 17 not the -- his spouse should be allowed to go with him?
- 18 A. Sure. It was encouraged by the National
- 19 Center for State Courts for spouses -- they even have a
- 20 special spouse organization. So it was encouraged. I
- 21 likely -- I don't remember the conversation, but I
- 22 likely said, "This is encouraged, and there are special
- 23 spouse events and even children's events."
- 24 Q. Okay. Do you recall ever having a
- Page 1226

 1 conversation similar to that in which Justice Loughry
- 2 indicated whether or not he felt that he should have to
- 3 pay for his wife to attend the conferences?
- 4 A. Justice Loughry once told me that he felt
- 5 that he was akin -- you know, as one of the people who
- 6 was head of the Judicial Branch, and he said, "Our
- 7 spouses should be considered a lot like the First Lady
- 8 of the Governor, and the First Lady of the Governor
- 9 gets things paid for by this state, so why shouldn't
- 10 the spouses of the justices?"
- 11 And I said, "Well, it just doesn't work
- 12 like that. You know, see if the justices will agree
- 13 with that."
- 14 But he never brought it up in my
- 15 presence with the others.
- 16 Q. Okay. Mr. Canterbury, as part of your duties
- 17 and -- as the Administrative Director, did you have any
- 18 involvement in the management of the -- the P-cards
- 19 that were used by the Court employees?
- 20 A. Not specifically. I never had a P-card
- 21 myself. It was done through the Fiscal Division, and
- 22 they had a person or two who was the specialist for the
- 23 P-cards.
- 24 Q. And just to be clear again, is that

- 1 Ms. Troy's area --
 - 2 A. Right. That's Sue --
 - 3 Q. -- or department?
 - 4 A. -- Racer-Troy's area.
 - 5 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now going to ask that you
 - 6 please refer to the report labeled No. 3 in the
 - 7 right-hand corner, please. Prior to today, have you
 - 8 ever reviewed this report for any reason?
 - 9 A. I have seen this report.
 - 10 Q. Appendix C, which begins on page 13, I
 - 11 believe, of this report, appears to be a memorandum
 - 12 from you to all of the justices. Is that correct?
 - 13 A. Yes.
 - 14 Q. I believe earlier in your testimony, you
 - 15 mentioned a memorandum. Is this the memorandum that
 - 16 you were referring to earlier?
 - 17 A. That's it.
 - 18 Q. Okay. Did you prepare this memo?
 - 19 A. Yes.
 - 20 Q. If you can, please tell the Committee what
 - 21 prompted you to prepare this particular memorandum.
 - 22 A. Justice Workman asked me to prepare it. She
 - 23 wanted it to be in general terms.
 - 24 Q. And what did she -- I believe you state --

- 1 and let me just read this. In the last sentence in
- 2 Paragraph 1, it states, "In brief, she wants to know
- 3 where the money went." Is that correct?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 Q. And what money did she want to -- was she
- 6 asking about?
- 7 A. She was alarmed that the -- that what she
- 8 termed "the rainy day fund" which is a term I never
- 9 used at the end of 2011, which was roughly
- 10 \$29,000,000, had been reduced by 2014 to some \$300,000.
- 11 Or maybe it was -- '15, excuse me, 2015, to about
- 12 \$300,000.
- 13 Q. I believe that you state in the first
- 14 sentence in Paragraph No. 3 that Sue Troy's files would
- 15 -- will or do account for where all of that money was
- 16 spent. Is that correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Did you personally look through all of
- 19 Ms. Troy's electronic files to confirm that, or were
- 20 you just told that by Ms. Troy?
- 21 A. Told that by Ms. Troy. I didn't go through
- 22 all the files.
- 23 Q. Okay. But Ms. Troy has indicated to you that
- 24 her documentation would show where all of that money

- 1 went?
- 2 A. Yes. This memo was prepared with her 3 assistance.
- 4 Q. Okay. In the second paragraph of this memo, 5 you do mention a Constitutional amendment and some 6 anger that had led to discussions among legislators
- 7 about a Constitutional amendment.
- 8 Can you please just describe that and 9 why you indicated -- included this in the memo to the 10 justices back in 2016?
- 11 A. Well, Senators Prezioso and Unger were just12 livid about the huge amount of carryover money in 2011,
- 13 and it was a topic that frequently came up, about the
- 14 threat of a Constitutional amendment, ironic that that
- 15 seems now.
- 16 The -- they wanted to make sure that we
- 17 didn't create a problem there. And so the general
- 18 thought was that we should bring down this carryover
- 19 amount. And we did.
- 20 Q. And when you say "they" --
- 21 A. The justices.
- 22 Q. Okay. Were there discussions amongst the
- 23 justices in which you were present in which the
- 24 possibility of a Constitutional amendment in relation

- Page 1231

 1 upset there was such a huge rollover amount, that there
- 2 was just this excess funds that were in the Court. And
- 3 they wanted to know why and what the point was, and I
- 4 did my best to explain it.
- 5 Q. And after that occurred in -- in 2011, that
- 6 presentation in the Senate in 2011, what -- please
- 7 describe for the Committee any conversations that you
- 8 were a part of with the justices, discussing that
- 9 possibility of a Constitutional amendment and what 10 should be done with that \$28,000,000 or \$29,000,000.
- 11 A. Well, they approved the budget in June. We
- 12 always were putting the budgets together roughly 16
- 13 months before they were actualized. And so there was
- 14 obvious discussion about making sure that -- that
- 15 certain Senators were not gonna be so unhappy as to
- 16 pursue this. Generally.
- 17 I don't remember anything more specific
- 18 other than generally just "Don't let it happen."
 - Q. Don't let what happen?
- 20 A. Oh. The amendment turn into a bill and be
- 21 presented to the people. They did not want that to
- 22 happen.

19

- 23 Q. When you say "they did not want" --
- A. The justices did not want that to happen.

Page 1230

- 1 to this surplus funds or this amount -- this
- 2 \$29,000,000 was discussed?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. If you can, please tell the Committee about
- 5 those conversations. And first, let me ask you: Did
- 6 they occur -- did all of the conversations, you recall,
- 7 occur in administrative conferences, or at different 8 times?
- 9 A. Both.
- 10 Q. Okay. Let's start, if -- if you can, with
- 11 the earliest conversations that you recall having with
- 12 the justices about this Constitutional amendment and
- 13 this \$29,000,000. Or 28, whatever the --
- 14 A. Right. The -- well, it was a topic that came
- 15 up with some frequency generally, but it came to a head
- 16 when there was this rather difficult presentation to
- 17 the Senate Finance Committee, and -- in 2011.
- 18 Q. And who did that presentation in 2011, if you 19 recall?
- 20 A. I don't recall if it was a justice, but I was
- 21 involved in the discussion.
- 22 Q. And you indicate that it was a difficult
- 23 presentation. What happened that made it difficult?
- 24 A. Well, a couple of the Senators were just very

2 2011 time period - was that all of the justices, or do

Q. At the time - I think we're talking about the

- 3 you recall any of the justices not having that same4 opinion?
- 5 A. Well, I think they all had the opinion they
- 6 didn't want the -- they didn't want the amendment.
- 7 Some justices paid keener attention to budgetary
- 8 discussions than others. But I think they all were of
- 9 a mind they did not want that to happen, the amendment
- 10 to be passed by the legislature.
- 11 Q. At some point during those discussions, was
- 12 the topic of this excess money, the -- what has -- some
- 13 people have termed surplus funds or the rainy day
- 14 funds, the \$28,000,000 or \$29,000,000, was it
- 15 discussed?
- 16 A. Was it discussed about -- I'm sorry, I didn't
- 17 quite --
- 18 Q. I'm sorry, my question might not have been
- 19 clear. Was it discussed in the context of what -- what
- 20 the Court would do with that money?
- 21 A. No, they didn't -- it was pretty clear why we
- 22 had that surplus. It was because we had been
- 23 optimistic -- well, I had been optimistic, frankly,
- 24 that we would be further along with the building of the

Page 1233

1 unified magistrate system referred to as UJA, and we 2 simply weren't far enough in time to spend down a lot 2

3 of that money.

4 So it was pretty clear that over the

5 next few years, certain moneys would be spent, because

6 they had approved the UJA, and they had approved,

7 ultimately, e-filing -- but at that time there was no

8 discussion of e-filing. It was about UJA.

9 And then there was also the knowledge

10 that we would be digesting any kind of raise that 11 happened, and they were very hopeful that there would

12 be a raise for the judges, justices, etc., and they --

13 they knew that that would be absorbed by that surplus,

14 as it was.

15 They also discussed giving money back

16 to the general revenue fund, which was done as well.

17 Q. And that was done; is that correct?

18 A. Yes, one time, \$2,000,000. And a few years

19 later, \$4,000,000. So \$6,000,000 of it was just given

20 back to general revenue.

21 Q. Okay. With respect to -- and we'll stay on

22 page -- the first page of your memo, on page 13. I

23 believe in the -- the third paragraph, you note that

24 the Court had approved each of the appropriation

1 budget cuts?

Do you recall that ever being requested 3 of the Court?

A. No. I only remember them requesting that

5 some money be given back to the general revenue fund.

Q. Do you recall who made that request?

A. I do not.

8 Q. Okay.

7

9 A. It was someone in the Executive Branch. I'm

10 not sure who it was.

11 Q. With respect to this money -- and I

12 understand you indicated that you worked with Sue Troy

13 on this and that she does have all the documentation.

14 Did some of this money, the \$28,000,000

15 or \$29,000,000, was some of it spent on the

16 renovations --

A. Oh, yes. 17

18 Q. -- to --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And I didn't ask this before, so I'm -- now I

21 am going to back up. Could you please tell the -- the

22 Committee about the Capitol Building Commission first,

23 and any involvement that you might have had in the

24 Capitol Building Commission over the years?

1 requests with the understanding of the major issues.

2 And then you note "and expenditures,"

3 but "the major issues that the Court was facing." What

4 did you mean? What type of major issues did you

5 believe the Court was facing when the Court was

6 approving the appropriation requests?

7 A. Well, there was the threat of the

8 Constitutional amendment; that was an issue. But there

9 was also the issues of -- of mandated drug courts and

10 the computer system. Those kinds of things.

But I think I was focusing in that on 11

12 the Constitutional amendment.

13 Q. I believe that also in that same paragraph,

14 in Paragraph 3 on page 1 of your memo, you do mention

15 that during this same time, that the State was facing

16 greater and greater shortages. Is that correct?

17 A. Correct. Yes, ves.

18 Q. And the Court was aware of that.

19 A. Yes. And I think that's one reason why the

20 Senate was so livid.

21 Q. Was there -- I'm sorry. At any time during

22 this period, are you aware that the Executive Branch

23 ever made any type of request - either oral or in

24 writing - for the Supreme Court to make some type of

Page 1236 A. Yes, I was the person appointed by the Court

2 to the Capitol Building Commission. I was a nonvoting

3 member.

4 Q. How long were you on that Commission?

5 A. Gosh, years and years. I don't even remember

6 when it started, but I was on it at least eight, ten

7 years. I don't know. A long time.

Q. And what -- what does the Capitol Building

9 Commission do, if you could just let the Committee know 10 generally?

11 A. It reviews any changes that are proposed by

12 any person involved with government to the Capitol

13 campus to make sure that they're in keeping with the

14 Cass Gilbert vision and other historical, you know,

15 niceties of the -- of the campus.

16 There is an Office of Historical

17 Protection run by Doctor Pierce. Everything had to be

18 reviewed by her, and then there were recommendations

19 made to the Capitol Building Commission.

20 I was kind of known as a fierce member

21 of the Capitol Building Commission.

22 Q. Let me ask you this with respect to the

23 renovations that were done by the Supreme Court - I

24 think you've indicated they began in 2008 and may have

Page 1237

- 1 gone through 2014 or '15 did those renovations have
- 2 to be approved by the Capitol Building Commission, any 3 of those?
- 4 A. Most all of them were in private space. And
- 5 the private space is not under their purview. The
- 6 lights and the -- and the cleaning of the marble in the
- 7 hallway and the first floor, there was a discussion
- 8 with the Capitol Building Commission about that and
- 9 with Doctor Pierce.
- 10 And I guess the lobby of the -- the
- 11 lobby and the bathrooms -- the lobby of -- I'm sorry,
- 12 the lobby of the -- the Clerk's Office and the
- 13 bathrooms, there was discussion with them about that.
- 14 Q. But not the -- the actual offices --
- 15 A. No, they don't have any authority over
- 16 private offices.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. I mean, if the Governor and his office or any
- 19 legislature in their private office want to make it
- 20 look a certain way, they can make it look any way they
- 21 want.
- 22 Q. Okay. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now going to ask
- 23 you to stay, please, on Report No. 3, but please refer
- 24 back to page 1 of Report No. 3. And if you could,
 - Page 1238
- 1 please, certainly feel free to read the first paragraph
- 2 as well, but I'm going to ask you a question about the
- 3 second paragraph, if you could please take a moment to
- 4 review the second paragraph.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Mr. Canterbury, it's my understanding from
- 7 the -- I believe in the second sentence of that
- 8 paragraph, the second paragraph, that Justice -- that
- 9 Chief Justice Workman in the May of 2018 Post Audit
- 10 Subcommittee meeting indicated -- or responded that she
- 11 nor any of the justice -- justices had discussed the
- 12 need to spend the balance down to avoid sponsorship of
- 13 the Constitutional amendment.
- 14 Do you agree or disagree with that
- 15 statement?
- 16 A. I disagree.
- 17 I agree she said it, but I disagree
- 18 with what she said.
- 19 Q. I'm sorry, my question wasn't clear.
- 20 A. I thought that's what you meant.
- 21 Q. Yes. And for what reason do you disagree
- 22 with the statement made by Justice Workman?
- 23 A. It was a frequent topic of conversation,
- 24 about the Constitutional amendment, and it was pretty

- 1 well known that we were not requesting enough money to
- 2 keep up a \$29,000,000 rollover amount from one budget
- 3 year to the next.
- 4 And so I don't know how she missed the
- 5 conversation, but I will note that she didn't write a
- 6 memo in response when I sent the memo out. And she
- 7 didn't hesitate to correct me when I was wrong.
- 8 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'd now like to move back to
- 9 some of the duties that you had as the Administrative
- 10 Director. Did -- as part of your duties, were you in
- 11 charge of personnel decisions such as sometimes hiring
- 12 or keeping on or letting go of certain employees?
 - A. While I was there, the process was this:
- 14 Anyone who was hired to a permanent position in the
- 15 Court Administrative Office or the other offices at the
- 16 Capitol had to be approved with a vote of at least
- 17 three of the justices.
- 18 However, when I arrived in 2005 and
- 19 until I left, the firing was on me and me alone. The
- 20 justices wanted distance. They did not want to be
- 21 involved in the firing. I, of course, would notify
- 22 them when somebody was fired, but it was on me to do
- 23 that.
- 24 Oh, and one last thing: The hiring of

- 1 temporary personnel did not go through the Court. That
- 2 was on me.
- 3 Q. During your time with the Court and during
- 4 your employment, were you ever asked by any justice to
- 5 hire specific employees?
- 6 A. Yes, I was.
- 7 Q. If you could, please tell the Committee which
- 8 -- if there were more than one, which justice made such
- 9 request of you?
- 10 A. Only Justice Workman ever asked me to hire
- 11 anyone.
- 12 Q. Do you recall the number of times that
- 13 Justice Workman would request that you hire someone?
- 14 A. Yes, there were four. Although one of those
- 15 has an asterisk, because I'd already talked to that
- 16 person and had decided I wanted to hire her without
- 17 Justice Workman even knowing I'd had that conversation.
- 18 That was just a happy coincidence.
- 19 Q. And with respect to that -- I think you've
- 20 just indicated there were four. Were those all four
- 21 the request for them to be permanent employees of the
- 22 Court or contract employees?
- 23 A. Three were permanent; one was contract.
- 24 Q. When these requests were made by Justice

- 1 Workman, how did you respond? Just generally, and then
- 2 we can get into the four instances. But typically,
- 3 what was your response?
- 4 A. "Yes, ma'am."
- 5 Q. Okay. Let's -- let's begin with the contract
- 6 employee. I believe you indicated there was only one 7 contract employee.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. If you could, please, tell the -- the
- 10 Committee about the request that was made and the --
- 11 the employee that you then later retained.
- 12 A. It was John Pritt, was the contracted person.
- 13 She said that he was a technical whiz, that he had
- 14 worked for her as a volunteer setting up her website
- 15 during the campaign, as I recall, and she felt that he
- 16 would be of great assistance to the Court.
- 17 Q. And do you recall any other conversations
- 18 that you had with Justice Workman about that -- that
- 19 hire before he was hired on?
- 20 A. Before he was hired?
- 21 Q. Yes, yes.
- A. No, I don't recall anything else with her.
- 23 Q. Did you hire him as a contract employee?
- 24 A. He was contracted, yes, he was.

Page 1242

Page 12 Q. And where -- where did Mr. Pritt work? What

2 type of work did he do, in what department?

- 3 A. Initially, he was in the technology division
- 4 working with Scott Harvey. Scott came to me after a
- 5 few months and said he -- "His expertise does not fit
- 6 with what we are doing here. We don't really need
- 7 him."
-
- 8 So I said, "Well, try him" -- he had a
- 9 couple of suggestions, that maybe he could try him in a
- 10 few other places.
- 11 I said, "Let's try that and get back to
- 12 me."
- 13 He got back to me and said, "It's not
- 14 working out."
- 15 So I went to Justice Workman and said
- 16 so, and she said that she thought that I should try to
- 17 figure out a way to make it work. At that point, Scott
- 18 Harvey had an idea that since OASIS was starting, that
- 19 perhaps Sue Troy could use him as the OASIS person --
- 20 Q. And --
- 21 A. -- to the meetings -- the initial meetings of
- 22 OASIS. And he did that for a while. And then
- 23 Mr. Pritt quit.
- 24 Q. Do you have any recollection as to the amount

Page 1243 1 of money that Mr. Pritt was paid during his time with 2 the Court?

- 3 A. I have a general recollection that in that
- 4 year and a half or so, he received around 160 some
- 5 thousand dollars.
- 6 Q. Now I would like to move to the -- the
- 7 requests that were made of you with respect to the
- 8 permanent employees. I --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. It's my understanding from your testimony
- 11 that there were three such requests?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Okay. If you could, just go -- let's begin
- 14 with the first one that you recall. What is the -- who
- 15 was the first person for -- as a permanent employee,
- 16 that Justice Workman requested that you hire?
- 17 A. It was Dee Hill as a receptionist and as a
- 18 person who would be kind of a fill-in for secretarial
- 19 duties as needed.
- 20 Q. Were you looking for a receptionist and
- 21 secretary -- secretary at that time?
- 22 A. No. But we did need a person somewhere else
- 23 so we moved one of the -- the person that Dee filled
- 24 in, we moved that person to the other job.

Page 1244

1 Q. And what job was Ms. Hill given?

- 2 A. Kind of the -- I think we called her "the
- 3 floater." She filled in when the receptionist would
- 4 take breaks, and would then also do other jobs as came
- 5 up, kind of being the administrative assistants'
- 6 assistant for things.
- 7 Q. And was Ms. Hill qualified for those jobs?
- 8 A. Yes, absolutely. And she's a wonderful
- 9 person.

10 Q. Was Ms. Hill still employed at the Court when

- 11 -- when your employment ended in 2017?
- 12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Now if we could move to the next person that

- 14 you recall being requested to hire.
- 15 A. I don't remember her first name, but her last
- 16 name is Miller, and she also was an administrative
- 17 assistant. And at that time, the -- there had been a
- 18 request by the Director of Judicial Education for some
- 19 assistance beyond what she had, and so when she asked
- 20 me to find a place for her, that was the place that
- 21 seemed to make sense.
- 22 And I will point out the Court approved
- 23 all of these. All of the hires were approved by the
- 24 Court.

- 1 Q. By the Court as a whole.
- 2 A. The entire Court, yes.
- Q. Okay. And again, I'm sorry; I may have just 3
- 4 missed this. Did you indicate that Ms. Miller was
- 5 hired as an administrative assistant?
- 6 A. Yes. In the division of -- of judicial 7 education. And she was supremely qualified --
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. -- and she did a great job.
- Q. Was there -- I'm sorry, that was the second. 10
- Who -- who is the third person that you recall the
- request being made to hire?
- A. That one was always kind of an interesting 13
- 14 little private joke. And this may be the first time
- 15 that Justice Workman learns of this. But I had a
 - relationship with Janie Moore that stretched back to my
- 17 days at the regional jails.
- 18 She was the first magistrate to be the
- guinea pig on the remote arraignment. And I had had a
- 20 marvelous relationship with her.
- 21 I knew that the Director of Magistrate
- 22 Services was not working out, and I called her and
- 23 asked her if she would do that job. She said that she
- 24 would have to finish the campaign. She was working as
 - Page 1246
- 1 a campaign person for Justice Workman, and -- then
- 2 Candidate Workman.
- 3 And if it was still open, that she
- 4 would be interested. It was, and I hired her. But
- 5 Justice Workman had also asked me to hire her. Janie
- 6 Moore knows more about magistrate courts than anybody
- 7 in the world. She is extraordinarily good, and I would
- 8 not want any of this to be considered a slight of her,
- 9 because she is simply amazing.
- 10 Q. And you had actually approached Ms. Moore 11 before --
- A. Right. But I didn't bother to share that 12
- 13 with Justice Workman when she talked to me. I figured
- 14 that if she didn't ask, I wasn't telling.
- 15 Q. And --
- Now she knows. 16
- 17 Q. At any time during your employment with the
- 18 Court, did you speak with Justice Workman about your
- 19 plans to -- or your belief that an employee not one
- 20 that you've already previously mentioned but that an
- 21 employee might need to be terminated?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And if you could, please tell the Committee
- 24 what Justice Workman's response was to your discussion

Page 1247 1 about your belief someone needed to be terminated.

- 2 A. Her -- her response -- this was before she
- 3 actually had -- it was after her election but before
- 4 she had gone into office. And I knew that this
- 5 employee had a relationship with her, and so I told her
- 6 that I was thinking of -- of firing her because she
- 7 just wasn't getting the job done.
- 8 And she wasn't showing up as much as
- 9 she should, and she exhausted many sick days and
- 10 others, annual days.
- 11 And Justice Workman was not pleased at
- 12 that thought she liked her very much and she said
- 13 that -- you know, as I recall, she said, you know, "New
- 14 justices frequently look for new administrators." So
- 15 it was a bit of a threat.
- 16 And I said, "If you feel that strongly
- 17 about her, we'll keep trying to make her work out and
- we'll keep trying to use the positive approach that
- 19 I've used all along."
- 20 And that was always my approach to
- 21 employees that were failing, was to try to get them to
- 22 do better. I don't want to get too far off topic here,
- 23 but that was it.
- 24 Q. I appreciate that. Any other employees that

- 1 we have not already discussed that Justice Workman
- 2 requested that you hire at the Court?
- 3 A. I'm not recalling any. Those were the ones I 4 recall.
- 5 Q. With respect -- and we have been discussing
- 6 Justice Workman at this point. Let me now ask you a
- 7 question: Did Justice Workman ever make requests of
- 8 you that were not work-related?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. If you could, please tell the -- the
- 11 Committee members about those types of requests that
- 12 were made of you on personal matters.
- 13 A. Well, they were personal things having to do
- 14 with her -- her family. And I did my best for her, and
- 15 mistakenly, I thought that we had a friendship. I
- 16 guess I played the fool on that.
- 17 But I don't feel comfortable getting
- 18 into the details of what those personal things were.
- 19 As angry as I am with her right now, I'll take those
- 20 things to my grave.
- 21 Q. When you say "personal," you -- do you mean
- 22 actually personal that had nothing to do with the
- 23 Court?
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 1249

- 1 Q. Were they requests that made -- that were
- 2 made during work hours at the Court or after work 3 hours?
- A. Both. You know, I -- she would call me in 4
- 5 the evenings and -- but often, she'd call me in the
- 6 evenings for work things, so you know --
- I was on the clock 24 hours a day. We 7
- 8 had early-rising justices; we had late justices, and I
- 9 was ready to answer the phone at 6:00 with some and at
- 10 2:00 in the morning with others.
- 11 Q. I believe you mentioned this earlier, and I
- 12 want to just confirm. With respect to the request to
- 13 -- for hiring individuals, did you indicate that
- 14 Justice Workman was the only person that you recall
- 15 making such requests?
- 16 A. Yes. I don't recall anybody else asking to
- 17 hire anybody. There was one contractor asked by one
- 18 justice, but no other hires.
- 19 Q. You just mentioned that, and let me follow up
- 20 on that just a little bit. With respect to the
- 21 contractors that might have performed work during
- 22 renovations such as interior designers or --
- 23 A. Oh, well, that's true, yeah.
- Q. Were those special requests or -- let's not 24

- 1 prices were -- were as good if -- they were
 - 2 competitive, so it seemed to make sense.
 - 3 Q. With respect -- I understand you indicated
 - 4 that early on, back in the 2008 or whatever that time
 - 5 period was when the renovations began --
 - A. Yes.
 - 7 Q. -- that that was put out to bid. Were any
 - 8 other -- while you were with the Court, were any other
 - 9 contracts like that with respect to -- let's begin with
 - 10 renovations. Any other type of renovations, were they
 - 11 ever put out to bid?
 - 12 A. No. After the initial bid, that was it.
 - 13 Q. And what about any other contracts, let's
 - 14 say, for IT, technology type things, were any of those
 - 15 ever put out to bid?
 - 16 A. The initial UJA software provider was a
 - 17 competitive -- it wasn't a bid. It was a request for
 - 18 projects. But it was a -- it was a competitive request
 - 19 for projects.
 - 20 We also bid out at least once -
 - 21 probably twice the -- the drug screening people,
 - 22 urinalysis folks. The Court spends a fortune on that,
 - 23 and I thought we could maybe get a better price. Turns
 - 24 out that the vendor we had won each time.

Page 1250

Page 1252

1 call them requests. 2

- -- by the actual justices as well?
- A. I had forgotten that Justice Workman was very 3
- 4 keen on our using Designs by Fisher for her cabinet
- 5 work and also when there was a renovation to create a
- 6 little kitchenette to the side of the -- the conference
- 7 room, that she wanted him to -- to get that work.
- And he's very good, so it didn't seem
- 9 to be a problem. And so we -- I followed that. She
- 10 did make that request. I'd totally forgotten about 11 that. I'm sorry.
- 12 Q. No, that's fine. And I have the same
- 13 question with respect to other justices. During the
- 14 course of the renovation, I understand that there was a
- 15 general contractor often, Neighborgall. But were there
- 16 other contractors that were hired --
- 17 A. Subs, yeah.
- 18 Q. Okay. Were any of those re -- at the request
- 19 of a specific justice for his or her office?
- 20 A. Justice Ketchum had specific requests for the
- 21 people who did his wainscoting and his flooring. He
- 22 had -- they were from the Huntington area. He's very
- 23 jingoistic about Huntington, and he wanted them hired.
- 24 And so they were contracted. Their

- Q. Okay. Any other bids that you recall during
- 2 your time with the Court that were any type of project
- 3 or renovation that was put out to bid that we haven't
- 4 already discussed here this morning?
- 5 A. I can't think of any. I'm -- I just -- there
- 6 may have been, but I don't recall.
- 7 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'm now going to ask for you
- 8 to please refer to Report No. 2.
- 9 A. Okav.
- 10 Q. And if you could, please, refer to page 27 of 11 that report.
- CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Counsel, before you 12
- 13 get into your question, let me just ask the witness if
- he needs a break. We've been going over a little two
- 15 hours. Do you need a --
- 16 MR. CANTERBURY: I'm good until lunch
- 17 probably.
- 18 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Okay.
- 19 MR. CANTERBURY: But thank you very
- 20 much. I appreciate that.
- 21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Okay.
- 22 BY MS. KAUFFMAN:
- Q. Mr. Canterbury, if you could please take a 23
- 24 moment to review the letter that is contained on page

Page 1253

1 27 of Report No. 2.

- 2 A. Yes, I've seen this.
- 3 Q. That was going to be my next question. Let
- 4 me ask you first: In the first sentence of the -- the
- 5 third paragraph of this letter that appears to be
- 6 written by Ms. Sue Racer-Troy, she states that she told
- 7 you the -- that the use of a State car or vehicle by
- 8 Justice Ketchum would be a taxable fringe benefit if it
- 9 was used for commuting, and she indicates that you told
- 10 her that it was none of her business.
- 11 Do you recall that conversation
- 12 occurring?
- 13 A. No. I've answered that in a memorandum too
- 14 that you -- I don't know if it's attached to this
- 15 report or not, but I've answered that to the
- 16 Legislative Post Audit. It could have occurred.
- 17 There was so much discussion about cars
- 18 and taxes going back and forth, I can't say she did not
- 19 ask that. But I can guarantee I didn't say "It's none
- 20 of your business." I had a very pleasant relationship
- 21 with her.
- 22 And I don't think I've ever told
- 23 anybody it's none of their business in my entire life,
- 24 so I don't -- it's not my phrasing. I did not say

Page 1254

- 1 that.
- Q. Do you recall speaking with Ms. Racer-Troy3 about the taxable fringe benefit issues for use of4 State cars?
- 5 A. Generally, I think after the memorandum from
- 6 --from Kirk that I requested -- so that's why it also
- 7 makes little sense that I would have said "None of your
- 8 business." Obviously, I had -- I had requested a legal
- 9 opinion on it, for goodness sakes.
- So I don't know where that comes from.
- 11 But the -- I don't remember any details of that
- 12 discussion one way or the other.
- 13 But no doubt, she could have said
- 14 something to me. I just absolutely strongly deny that
- 15 I would have ever told her it was none of her business.
- 16 Q. If you could please now refer to, in the 17 notebook, Exhibit No. 14.
- 18 A. Uh-huh.
- 19 Q. And specifically, I would like to ask you
- 20 questions about the -- the last page of this letter
- 21 that appears to be from Ms. Sue Racer-Troy, No. 6. If
- 22 you could just take a moment to -- to review that.
- 23 A. I don't think I've seen this before.
- 24 Okay.

- 1 Q. First let me ask you: Did you have an
- 2 employee at the time you were the administrator named
- 3 Connie Toney?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Do you have any information at all as to
- 6 whether or not Ms. Toney was afforded use of a State-
- 7 owned vehicle for commuting purposes to and from the
- 8 Capitol?
- 9 A. No. But I think I might be able to explain
- 10 the confusion.
- 11 Q. Okay. If you could, please.
- 12 A. I hired her son as an intern, and those --
- 13 that year, the interns were measuring accessibilities
- 14 to court functions in various counties. They were in
- 15 State cars. There were four of them, and they were in
- 16 State -- they had State cars to drive to the various
- 17 counties.
- 18 I think that a couple of times, he had
- 19 the State car in southern counties. They lived, I
- 20 think, in Logan County. I'm not even sure it's Logan.
- 21 A southern county, that's all I can tell you. And he
- 22 probably brought her to work one day or a couple of
- 23 days maybe when he had the car.
- 24 Because he had the use of the car

Page 1256

1 because he was going from county to county, along with

- 2 a couple of others, to measure and to determine
- 3 accessibility. That report was a very good report too.
- 4 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I now want to turn your
- 5 attention to your termination that occurred in January
- 6 of 2017. I have a few questions about that. I want to
- 7 make sure first that we have the date correct. Was it
- 8 January 4 --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. -- 2017?
- 11 A. Yes, it was January 4. I heard the
- 12 confusion. January 1st was a Sunday; January 2nd was
- 13 the holiday; January 3rd, I was in Huntington dealing
- 14 with some matters with the new family court function,
- 15 so the first time they could get to me was January 4th.
- 16 Q. So January 3rd was -- was a work day but you 17 were not in the office. You were elsewhere working.
- 18 A. I was in the office in the morning, but then
- 19 I went to Huntington. I don't know if they were
- 20 seeking me on the 3rd or not.
- 21 Q. How did you become aware on January 4th that 22 your employment was being terminated?
- 23 A. At about 10:00 or so in the morning, I was
- 24 asked to come up to the Court. That was not an unusual

07/26/2018
Page 1259

1 occurrence, these spontaneous requests. I went up. I

2 didn't expect what I learned. I went into the off --

3 into the conference room.

4

I could tell that there was a problem,

5 because there was emotion on everyone's faces. Chief

6 Justice Loughry said, "You're being terminated from

7 your will and pleasure position."

8 He said, "Do you want to be terminated

9 or would you rather be -- be allowed to resign?"

10 I said, "No, I'd -- I'd be terminated."

11 I said, "I wouldn't qualify for unemployment benefits

12 if I were resigning," and I said, "I" -- I would

13 probably need those. Justice Walker then said that I

14 was wrong, that people who quit got unemployment

15 benefits all the time.

16 It was one of the two cross moments I

17 had in the room. I said, "Well, when you've been

18 around longer than a few days, you'll learn that the

19 Court never allowed people who quit to get any kind of

20 unemployment benefits."

21 I then, frankly, humbled myself and

22 practically begged them to keep me on. I said, "I'm

23 about -- I'm the -- I'm the president-elect of the --

24 of the Conference of State Court Administrators. I'm

Page 1258

1 on the National Center Board and I'm gonna be vice

2 chairman. I'm gonna be chairman of the Justice Center

3 of the Council of State Governments. In those

4 positions on the boards already, I've helped bring

5 money back to the State, significant money. I'll be

6 able to do that. Would you please just give me a year

7 and a half to be able to do more of that?"

They said, no, they wanted me gone,

9 they wanted me gone. I also asked if I could have a

10 few days, because I had a lot of my furniture and my

11 stuff in the office, a lot. Eleven and a half years,

12 you build up a lot. And I said -- and they said, "No."

By the end of the day -- he said, "No."

14 By the end of the day, I was to be gone.

15 And Justice Workman said, "You've --

16 you've had a good run, now get along, get along." And

7 she did that (indicating), which I found to be kind of

18 demeaning. And I guess that's why I broke bad at that

19 point.

That's when I said, "Well, every cloud

21 has a silver lining. At least I will not have to work

22 for a simulacrum of a chief like you."

23 And he said, "What did you call me?"

24 And I said, "Well, I described you as a

1 simulacrum."

2 He said, "What's that word? What's it

3 mean?"

4 And I said, "Look it up."

5 And I'm literally getting my things and

6 getting up and he said, "How do you spell it?"

I found that to be puzzling, and I

8 said, "Well, figure that out yourself" - or something

9 like that - "I'm not gonna spell it for you," and I

10 left.

7

11 I see a lot of puzzled expressions

12 about what simulacrum means. "Simulacrum" means an

13 elaborate fraud. It seemed the best word to describe

14 him at the time.

15 Q. Let me --

16 A. I was angry.

17 Q. Let me -- let me ask you, before you --

18 before you left the conference room -- did you indicate

19 that this meeting occurred in the conference room?

20 A. Yes, it did.

21 Q. Were all five justices present?

22 A. Yes, they were.

23 Q. Other than Justice Loughry -- and you have

24 indicated that when you first walked in -- is he the

Page 1260

1 first person that spoke to you?

A. Yes, he was. Well, actually, Menis Ketchum

3 was in the hall and he just shook his head and he said,

4 "I hate this, I hate this." And I thought, "This is a

5 problem."

6 But I still didn't think I was gonna be

7 fired. And with your leave, I'll explain why. But I

8 won't if it's off subject.

9 Q. No, if you could.

10 A. Well, I'd worked very intensely with Justice

11 Walker on her transition. In fact, she thought I did

12 such a good job, she wrote me a lovely Thank You note.

13 But I'd heard through the grapevine

14 that Justice Workman had turned strongly against me and

15 that Justice Loughry clearly hadn't liked me in years,

16 and so I thought it might come to a vote.

And I said to her on the last Friday of

18 the year, "Are you -- I hate to put you on the spot,

19 but you're about to be on the spot. It looks like you

20 would be the third vote if -- if I'm gonna be

21 terminated."

17

22 I said, "Are you -- are you gonna vote

23 to -- to terminate me?"

24 And she said, "Well, I'd have to work

Page 1261

- 1 with you for some months before I could make that 2 decision."
- The reason that was so important to me
- 4 is because I had already drafted a resignation, because
- 5 I knew that if I did not resign before the end of the
- 6 year, I would use or lose annual days that totaled
- 7 \$15-18,000, and so I wanted to try to keep that money.
- 8 And I would -- if she'd just told me
- 9 the truth, that she was gonna vote with them, I would
- 10 have resigned and I would have not lost that money.
- 11 And so I thought, well, I mean, she
- 12 wrote me a nice Thank You card, I mean, I'd take her at
- 13 her word, you know. So within a week of receiving the
- 14 Thank You card, she voted to fire me.
- 15 Q. And you -- I want -- just want to make sure
- 16 that we're clear about that, "she" --
- 17 A. Oh, Justice Walker.
- 18 Q. Justice Walker.
- 19 A. Justice Walker.
- 20 Q. And now let me ask you about back in the
- 21 conference. I understand that Justice Ketchum spoke to
- 22 you in the hallway and then when you went in, Justice
- 23 Loughry, was he the first justice --
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 1262

- 1 Q. -- to speak?
- 2 A. Yes. After we all sat down, he was the first
- 3 person to say a word to me.
- 4 Q. Was there anyone else in the conference room
- 5 other than yourself and the five justices?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Okay. After Justice Loughry indicated your
- 8 position -- that you were being terminated, do you
- 9 recall any of the other justices -- other than Justice
- 10 Workman that you've indicated that she asked you to
- 11 leave. Anybody else, any other justices, make any
- 12 comments to you --
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. -- whatsoever?
- 15 A. And what I said about Justice Walker, what
- 16 I've already said that she said about unemployment,
- 17 blah, blah, blah.
- 18 No. Neither Justice Davis nor Justice
- 19 Ketchum said a word. I think they'd had an argument
- 20 for the previous hour and they'd probably expended all
- 21 of their -- because they voted to -- for me to stay.
- 22 Q. You have indicated the vote and who voted for
- 23 and against your termination. How did you become aware
- 24 of that?

- A. Well, by their faces, actually I -- I knew
- 2 it. But I think later, Justice Ketchum told me
- 3 perhaps. I don't remember, frankly. One of the
- 4 justices told me. It would have been either Justice
- 5 Davis or Justice Ketchum.
- 6 I haven't spoken to any of the others
- 7 since that day.
- 8 Q. Well, that was another question I was going
- 9 to ask you. I think you just answered it. Since the
- 10 date you left the Court in January of 2017, you have
- 11 not spoken to Justice Loughry?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. And the same with respect to Justice Workman?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. And finally, with respect to Justice Walker,
- 16 have you spoken with her since that date?
- 17 A. No, I have not.
- 18 Q. Let me ask you this: With respect to Justice
- 19 Davis, have you spoken with her since the time you left
- 20 the Court?
- 21 A. Yes, I have.
- 22 Q. On how -- is that a frequent occurrence or an
- 23 infrequent occurrence?
- 24 A. You know, frequent, I guess, you know. Every

- 1 couple of weeks or so. Sometimes more often; sometimes
- 2 less.
- 3 Q. With respect to Justice Ketchum, was that the
- 4 same? Did you speak with him after January 4, 2017?
- 5 A. Well, there was -- he was very hopeful that
- 6 I'd be able to get another job in government, and he
- 7 was talking to me a lot about that in January and
- 8 February of 2017.
- 9 Then I didn't talk to him again until
- 10 about December of 2017. And the last time I spoke with
- 11 him was probably February of -- of this year, and I
- 12 haven't talked to him since. And it was just a couple
- 13 of conversations probably three between December
- 14 '17 and February '18.
- 15 Q. Other than the one comment that you made with
- 16 respect to Justice Loughry as you were leaving the
- 17 conference that day, do you recall making any threats
- 18 to any of the justices or to the Court in general as --
- 19 while you were in the conference room or while you were
- 20 leaving the conference room?
- 21 A. I never threatened them. I did -- the word
- 22 got around the Capitol I'd been fired and the press was
- 23 calling. But I didn't -- I had talk to time to Phil
- 24 Kabler for a moment, but I was under the gun to move my

Page 1265

1 stuff. I mean, I bro -- things were broken.

2 And I knew that if I let someone else

- 3 -- it would just be a mess, and I didn't have time to
- 4 talk to them. And I remember saying something like "I
- 5 don't know whether to go to the press and tell them
- 6 everything I know or just sail off into the sunset."
- 7 And I guess I decided to sail off into
- 8 the sunset, for a long time.
- 9 Q. At some -- at some point after you left that
- 10 day, if you could, please, just generally describe to
- 11 the -- to the Committee how you got your belongings and
- 12 left the building that day.
- 13 A. Well, I -- I had been fired, so therefore the
- 14 policy of the Court was always that the security people
- 15 would watch your every step, and so I -- my every step
- 16 was watched by Jess -- Jess Gundy and Arthur Angus.
- 17 I asked if I could keep or pay for my
- 18 12-year-old Nokia cell phone. That was denied.
- 19 I asked if I could transfer the data on
- 20 it. That was denied.
- 21 I asked if I could have the phone
- 22 number, which I had had since the Regional Jail
- 23 Authority. It was my number. That was denied. They
- 24 took the phone.

Page 1266

- 1 The computer was, of course,
- 2 immediately disabled. And then I started packing
- 3 furiously, and they -- and my assistants were finding
- 4 boxes and old newspapers and anything that I could pack
- 5 things in, and -- and I went through files with Arthur
- 6 looking at -- over my shoulder.
- 7 I mean, it's not like he reviewed each
- 8 file, but I would say, "Well, this file is my Christmas
- 9 card list, that's mine. This file should stay for my
- 10 successor," etc. So I left most of the files. There
- 11 were very -- relatively few files that I took.
- 12 The -- and it was clear that it was
- 13 physically impossible for me to drive the 30 minutes to
- 14 my house in my car and back and get more stuff and
- 15 back. I wouldn't have been able to finish. And so
- 16 Arthur said, "We'll use the vans." Arthur was in
- 17 charge of the cars.
- 18 I don't know if he got permission of
- 19 the Court. I have no idea. Just suddenly we were
- 20 putting things in vans as well.
- 21 So there were two vans and my car that
- 22 made the first trip, and then the next trip, we filled
- 23 my car literally to the brim and I was able to cram
- 24 some things in there where, unfortunately, I cracked a

- 1 very nice lamp. But that's neither here nor there.
- 2 Q. And if you recall, how -- how long during the
- 3 day, how long did that take before you made the final
- 4 trip?
- 5 A. All day. We didn't get finished until about
- 6 8:00 or 9:00 o'clock, I guess. I was very sore the
- 7 next couple of days from just moving so hard and so
- 8 fast.
- 9 Q. The --
- 10 A. It was -- it was pandemonious.
- 11 Q. The request that you made regarding your cell
- 12 phone that you have indicated about whether or not you
- 13 could --
- 14 A. Uh-huh.
- 15 Q. -- your request to keep the number and such,
- 16 to whom did you make those requests?
- 17 A. I asked Arthur to ask Justice Loughry, the
- 18 Chief Justice, and he said, "No," and all the things I
- 19 told you were through him.
- 20 Q. He said, "No" --
- 21 A. Chief Justice Loughry through -- I don't
- 22 remember if was Jess Gundy or Arthur Angus. Through
- 23 one of them.
- 24 Q. Okay. Could you please tell the Committee --

Page 1268

- 1 now I'm really going to bounce around. I apologize.
- 2 Could you please tell the Committee how many Cass
- 3 Gilbert desks the Supreme Court had while you were
- 4 there?

- A. Well, I think five. I think originally there
- 6 were six. There's been a lot of discussion about that.
- 7 I don't know that anybody has the exact data but -- or
- 8 information about this. There are some letters back
- 9 and forth between the Chief Justice at the time and
- 10 Cass Gilbert's architectural office.
 - But I think there was one for the clerk
- 12 and one for each of the justices. Now, when you say
- 13 "desks," what you mean are the executive desks.
- 14 Q. Yes, sir.
- 15 A. There were also secretary desks. And what
- 16 I'm not remembering exactly is if the secretary in
- 17 Justice Ketchum's office had a secretary's desk or if
- 18 she had one of the executive desks, and I honestly just
- 19 -- I'd have to measure it. They look so much alike.
- 20 It's -- the secretary desks are smaller
- 21 versions, and there are some other details that are
- 22 different, but you know, at a glance, they look a lot
- 23 alike. But they're very, very clearly Cass Gilbert
- 24 desks.

Page 1269

MS. KAUFFMAN: Mr. Chairman, if you'll 1

- 2 give me just one moment.
- 3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Sure.
- MS. KAUFFMAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 4
- 5 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I have just a few additional
- 6 follow-up questions. With respect to the renovations,
- 7 I know you've indicated there was the original bid and
- 8 you went from that, and then it appears that many of
- 9 the -- or much of the work went by change order as 10 opposed to additional bid.
- 11 A. Yeah.
- 12 Q. Could you just please explain that how that
- 13 came about, that the work was done, for the most part
- 14 it appears, by change orders.
- A. Well, as I said, the Court was -- the 15
- 16 justices were very pleased with the work of the people
- 17 who represented Neighborgall, and you can do a -- you
- 18 can extend a contract through a change order, and we
- extended their contracts for the other projects.
- Q. Okay. All through change orders? 20
- 21 A. All through change orders.
- 22 Q. Okay. Now I'd like to ask you to please
- 23 refer to Report No. 3, and specifically page 15 of
- 24 Report No. 3. At the top of page 15 at the first

Page 1270

- 1 bullet point, there is a note that "The Court did not
- 2 seek reappropriations of approximately \$10,000,000 in
- 3 expenditures in an attempt to bring the year-end
- 4 balance as close to zero as possible, mainly to
- 5 continue to forestall a Constitutional amendment."
- 6 And then there is -- the second
- 7 sentence notes, "The Court discussed the need to
- 8 eliminate any carry-over money at the end of the year
- 9 so that the Senate leadership would not continue down
- 10 the path towards the sponsorship of such amendment."
- 11 My question for you with respect to
- 12 those -- to those statements, I believe that is talking
- 13 about Fiscal Year 2014 when you note the Court
- 14 discussed -- do you recall, was that -- did that
- 15 include all justices at that time?
- 16 A. I don't recall. Generally, they would have
- 17 all been in there, but I don't recall.
- 18 Q. Okay. Do you recall any justice taking issue
- 19 with that -- that plan in the attempt to forestall a
- 20 Constitutional amendment?
- A. Absolutely not. No one had any comment to 21
- 22 the contrary that I recall.
- 23 Q. When -- with respect to the -- the rental
- 24 cars, rental car usage -- and I'm going to ask you

1 specifically with respect to Justice Loughry. I think

- 2 you indicated you might have been at one or two
- 3 conferences that he was at. You've mentioned, I think,
- 4 at least two.
- 5 A. Yes.
- Q. Did you ever become aware as to whether or
- 7 not anyone other than Justice Loughry was -- was
- 8 driving his rental car? And by that, I mean, did --
- 9 was it just Justice Loughry or his wife? If you know.
- A. I don't know. And also, I need to clarify,
- 11 at Asheville, I don't think he had a rental car. I was
- 12 just talking -- I was responding to his not going to
- 13 some of the conferences.
- 14 Q. I apologize, that's correct, you did not.
- 15 A. I want to make sure that that's the case.
 - Q. I believe you did say that.
- 17 A. Right.

16

- 18 MS. KAUFFMAN: Mr. Chairman, I don't
- 19 think I have any further questions at this time.
- 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you, Counselor.
- 21 Mr. Canterbury, our typical practice -
- 22 and you may have picked this up, if you followed any of
- 23 this is to allow our Committee members to ask
- 24 questions in follow-up.

- However, in view of the fact you've
 - 2 been on two and a half plus hours, I think maybe it
 - 3 would be a good time to break for an early lunch to

 - 4 give you a break and also to give our members a chance
 - 5 to collect their thoughts.
 - 6 And just so no one's surprised, I'm
 - 7 gonna rotate around a little bit on who'll I start
 - 8 with. I will start with the back row on the right side
 - 9 first and work my way from my right to my left and then
 - 10 come that way, so that gives -- nobody is gonna be
 - 11 surprised when we come back.
 - 12 We will be in recess until 12:45, and
 - 13 that gives everybody just a little over an hour. I've
 - 14 been told the cafeteria is open until 1:30. So please
 - 15 be back in your seats at 12:45. We're in recess until
 - 16 then.
 - 17 (A recess was taken for lunch after
 - 18 which the proceedings continued as
 - 19 follows:)
 - 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Call the Committee
 - back to order. We're going to continue. Counsel has a
 - 22 question or two she wants to follow up on, then we'll
 - 23 begin with Committee members' questions.
 - 24 Counsel, go ahead.

07/26/2018

MS. KAUFFMAN: Thank you. 1

2 Mr. Chairman, currently being passed out --

- 3 MR. CANTERBURY: That's it.
- 4 MS. KAUFFMAN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Can you put it on the 5
- 6 screen?
- 7 BY MS. KAUFFMAN (Resuming):
- Q. Mr. Canterbury, you have just been handed --
- 9 provided a copy of an exhibit that has now been marked
- 10 as Exhibit No. 39. And it's my understanding it's
- 11 currently being passed out to the Committee members as
- 12 well.
- 13 Earlier in your testimony, you had
- 14 mentioned a sketch that you recall that Justice Loughry
- 15 had provided or had drawn himself with respect to his
- 16 office.
- Let me ask you now if you could take a 17
- 18 moment to look at Exhibit No. 39 and confirm or deny
- 19 for us whether or not this is the sketch that you
- 20 referred to earlier.
- 21 A. Yes. it is.
- 22 Q. Okay. Do you recall when in the -- in the
- 23 process that you first saw or received a copy of this
- 24 sketch or how you first saw it?

Page 1274

Page 1273

- A. I think the project manager showed it to me.
- 2 She might have been working at Silling at the time. I
- 3 just remember it was sometime in early 2013 before
- 4 construction got underway, likely late winter. I don't
- 5 know. Sometime in early 2013.
- Q. And with respect to this -- this sketch
- 7 identified as Exhibit No. 39, what is your
- 8 understanding of the -- the person that prepared this
- 9 sketch?
- 10 A. What's my understanding of the person? It
- 11 was --
- 12 Q. Yes, who prepared --
- 13 A. It was Justice Loughry.
- 14 Q. And does this particular --
- A. Well, I should say Justice Loughry's the one
- 16 who handed it to the project manager. He may have had
- somebody else draw it, but it looked like his writing.
- 18 Q. And I will now try to refer to you in the
- 19 bottom left-hand corner, I believe there is an asterisk
- 20 with a note. If I am reading this note correctly, I
- 21 believe it -- this might be in other handwriting, but
- 22 it states, "Preliminary sketch from Justice Loughry."
- 23 Is that what you read --
- 24 A. Yes. I see that.

1 Q. -- as well?

- 2 A. I don't know who wrote that.
- 3 Q. But it's your understanding that Exhibit 39
- 4 is the sketch that was prepared by Justice Loughry?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And does this particular sketch show the
- 7 medallion that you have previously testified and we
- 8 have discussed here earlier in the morning?
- A. Yes, it does.
- 10 Q. Did you personally have any conversations
- with Justice Loughry about this particular sketch?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Okav.
- MS. KAUFFMAN: Mr. Chairman, I do not 14
- 15 have any further questions with respect to this
- 16 exhibit.
- 17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you, Counsel.
- 18 We'll move now to questions by members. I'm gonna
- start, as I indicated before, third row, far right.
- 20 Delegate Isner, any questions?
- 21 DELEGATE ISNER: Thank you,
- 22 Mr. Chairman.
- 23 **EXAMINATION**
- 24 BY DELEGATE ISNER:

- Q. Thank you for coming today.
 - 2 A. Yes, sir.
 - 3 Q. I have several questions. Earlier in your
 - 4 testimony, I believe you said you had only one
 - 5 conversation with Justice Loughry about the \$32,000
 - 6 couch; is that correct?
 - 7 A. Yes.
 - Q. You also indicated that he had made a trip -
 - 9 or at least it was your understanding to the Carpet
 - 10 Gallery with his wife and maybe his secretary.
 - 11 A. Yes.
 - 12 Q. Did that come up in your sole conversation
 - 13 with Justice Loughry?
 - A. No. 14
 - 15 Q. How did you obtain that information?
 - 16 A. The project manager told me.
 - 17 Q. Okay. Then you also talked about the fabric
 - 18 being the most expensive portion of the \$32,000 couch;
 - 19 is that correct?
 - 20 A. Yes.
 - Q. Did that come up in your conversation with
 - 22 Justice Loughry, or was that also from the project
 - 23 manager?
 - 24 A. That was from the project manager. I think

Page 1280

Page 1277 1 it's -- if memory serves, you can tell that from the

2 invoice itself. But the proj -- I didn't talk about

- 3 that with Justice Loughry, the first part of your
- 4 question.
- 5 Q. Okay. That was actually gonna be my next
- 6 question, if the fabric cost was specifically listed on 7 the invoice?
- 8 A. I think it is. I -- you probably have
- 9 copies. I think that's broken down.
- 10 Q. Did you ever have any conversation with any
- 11 other justice or anyone employed by the Court about the
- 12 \$32,000 couch?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. You talked about Justice Loughry asking for
- 15 your resignation at some point in the past, prior to
- 16 the time you were ultimately terminated, correct?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Who else was present in the room whenever he
- 19 asked for your resignation?
- A. The other justices: Justices Davis, Ketchum, 20
- 21 Workman and Benjamin.
- 22 Q. Did they have any follow-up comments to
- 23 Justice Loughry asking for your resignation at that
- 24 time?

- Page 1278
- A. The only comment that was made that I recall
- 2 was Workman said, "I wouldn't be -- I wouldn't think it
- 3 was a problem at all if somebody said I was a young
- 4 justice." That was the only comment made.
- 5 They did not want to get into the
- 6 conversation.
- Q. And then when you were ultimately let go, 7
- 8 there were some questions about what you said on your
- 9 way out, but I'll ask you the question: Did you say "I
- 10 will destroy you"?
- A. No, I'm not General MacArthur or anything. I 11
- 12 didn't say "I shall destroy you" or anything like that.
- Q. Now, you said that each of the justices had 13
- 14 four law clerks. Is that correct?
- A. Yes. 15
- 16 Q. And we discussed this a little bit, about the
- 17 switch from the individual choices of those. Are you
- 18 aware of any justice utilizing any outside firm or
- 19 individual to assist in writing opinions?
- 20 A. Only from what I read in the newspaper after
- 21 I left. But while I was there, I never heard of
- 22 anything like that being done.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 DELEGATE ISNER: Thank you, I don't

- 1 have any other questions.
 - 2 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
 - 3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Miller.
 - 4 DELEGATE MILLER: Thank you,
 - 5 Mr. Chairman.
 - 6 Mr. Canterbury, thank you for being
 - 7 here.
 - 8 **EXAMINATION**
 - 9 BY DELEGATE MILLER:
 - Q. I'm not sure that we covered this previously,
 - 11 but: How did you become the Administrative Director?
 - 12 Did you have any kind of prior government service? How
 - 13 did you come to this position?
 - 14 A. Well, you've asked two questions. Prior
 - 15 government service, yes. I worked in 1988 for Governor
 - 16 Moore as the Deputy Commissioner of DMV, and then I
 - 17 was, for three months, the acting commissioner, the
 - 18 last one for Governor Moore. And then I took a break.
 - 19 And then in 1997, I was appointed by
 - 20 Governor Underwood to be the Executive Director of the
 - 21 Regional Jail and Correctional Facility Authority. I
 - 22 did that for eight years, and I had let it be known
 - 23 generally that when the last jail was built that I was
 - 24 gonna be leaving and I was gonna find something else to

- 1 do.
 - 2 I got a call from Justice Benjamin. He
- 3 had heard that, and he said they were looking for an
- 4 administrator and they wondered if I -- he wondered if
- 5 I might come over to the Court.
- 6 Frankly, I hadn't heard good things
- 7 about the job, and I said I didn't think so. But he
- 8 was relentless.
- He called a couple more times, and then
- 10 Justice Davis called. So finally -- I had a
- 11 relationship with Justice Maynard. So I called Justice
- 12 Maynard, and I said, "It -- you're conspicuously silent
- 13 on this."
- 14 And he said, "It's kind of a miserable
- 15 job, and we're friends. It would be great for me, but
- 16 I don't know if it would be great for you, but I'd love
- 17 it if you did it."
- 18 And so then Benjamin called again and
- 19 he was convincing, and I said, "Yes, as soon as the
- 20 jail is finished in June of 2005, I'll be able to do
- 21 it." So on July 1st, 2005, I began with the Court.
- 22 That's the story.
- 23 Q. You made reference that you hadn't heard good
- 24 things about the job and maybe some derogatory things

- 1 that came to your knowledge. Can you elaborate on
- 2 that, as to why people -- or folks were leading you to
- 3 believe that it would not be --
- A. Well, they'd gone through four administrators
- 5 in five years. People had guit; people had been forced
- 6 out; and one was forced out away to another job in the
- 7 Court, then brought back later after somebody else
- 8 didn't work out.
- 9 It was -- it's very hard to work for
- 10 five individuals and then also have to work for the
- 11 Court. And when you have a Court split 3 to 2, you do
- what the majority says, but then often you're gonna
- catch some grief from the other two for doing exactly
- 14 what the majority said.
- 15 I guess it takes a certain kind of
- 16 masochist to do the job. It's not easy.
- Q. I understand. In general, during your time 17
- 18 there, how would you characterize the work environment
- 19 of the employees for the Supreme Court?
- A. When I arrived, it was awful. There was no 20
- 21 morale. It was like walking into a morgue or
- 22 something. It was just terrible.
- 23 So one of the things I wanted to do was
- 24 to make sure that employees understood that I would --

Page 1282

- 1 I was empowering them, that they knew more about their
- 2 jobs than -- than I did, and I wanted to find out more
- 3 and I wanted to make sure that I had a group of
- 4 directors that was very clear in what they did and what
- 5 their divisions were responsible for.
- 6 I didn't want the public to have to
- 7 guess who to call if they had a problem with
- 8 magistrates or had a problem with family court or
- 9 whatever. So I developed a number of divisions, and
- 10 they had often just a few employees.
- 11 Probation Division had hundreds, but
- 12 you know, some of them literally just have one or two.
- 13 But those divisions were clear. And I encouraged them
- 14 then to start meeting among themselves.
- 15 By the time I left, I would put the
- 16 morale of the Court, the services of the Court, the
- 17 responsiveness of the Court, Administrative Office.
- against any office in State government, and frankly,
- any administrative office that I'm aware of in the
- 20 entire nation.
- 21 It was -- it was really -- it was -- we
- 22 had a -- we had it cooking. They were really doing
- 23 well. Because they knew that they were respected. And
- 24 that was really important. I don't think they

Page 1283 1 necessarily felt that so much for the previous several

- 2 years. There was just so much confusion.
- Q. You testified and talked about that the 3
- 4 relationship between you and Justice Loughry kind of
- 5 went sour.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Were there any instances -- let me back up.
- 8 He served the Court in a prior capacity before becoming
- 9 a justice?
- 10 A. Yes, he was brought in by Justice Maynard as
- 11 his law clerk, and he was a per curiam clerk, so that
- 12 when Justice Workman won and took the spot of Justice
- 13 Maynard, she inherited his service, and they developed,
- apparently, a very good relationship, and he continued
- 15 there.
- 16 And he ran for office while he was also
- 17 being a law clerk.
- 18 Q. And I believe you also testified that you had
- 19 general supervision and control over employees of the
- 20 Court. During the time that you were director and he
- 21 was an employee of the Court, did you ever have any
- 22 conflicts with him prior to his election as -- as a
- 23 justice while he was under your supervision?
- 24 A. Let me clarify. If I didn't say this, I want

Page 1284

- 1 to clarify it now. I had authority over people in the
- 2 Administrative Office of the Court.
- 3 There are two other - for lack of
- 4 better words departments. There's the Clerk's
- 5 Office, and there's the counsel's office. I had no
- 6 authority over those people.
- 7 And then specifically the clerks - per
- 8 curiam at the time as well as personal their boss
- 9 were the justices. I had absolutely no authority. In
- 10 fact, we kind of worked for them to make sure they had
- whatever they needed as soon as they needed it, because
- 12 the justices were very defensive of their law clerks.
- 13 So I -- and then you asked another 14 question.
- 15 Yes, we had one unfortunate encounter
- 16 when he was a law clerk.

17 Q. Can you elaborate on that?

- 18 A. To a point. He was saying un -- sexually
- 19 harassing things to an employee, a temporary employee,
- 20 of the -- I've never said this. I see people looking
- up. I've never said this out loud. But he was. I'm
- answering your question. He was sexually harassing an
- 23 employee of the Administrative Office.
- 24 And I asked her if she wanted to take

Page 1285

- 1 it to EEOC. She said, "No," that she'd be out of there
- 2 in a few months, she didn't want to have to be dealing
- 3 with this, and she said she just wanted it to stop.
- 4 So I went to talk to him and I told him
- 5 it should stop. And I also then went to Justice
- 6 Maynard, as I told him I would. What their
- 7 conversation was, I have no idea. But according to the
- 8 employee, it stopped.
- 9 Q. Was there any -- at any point after that -10 particularly subsequent to his election as justice -
- 11 that that was ever brought back up to you?
- 12 A. It was never mentioned again. It was almost
- 13 as if it had never happened. And I figured it was --
- 14 it was water over the dam. I never brought it up; he
- 15 never brought it up.
- 16 And since she was free of those
- 17 comments, I felt that it was an unfortunate situation
- 18 that was closed.
- 19 Q. Understand. And I may bounce around just a
- 20 little bit here because of the notes and how we got
- 21 into it, but I want to refer back to Exhibit 39 that
- 22 was just most recently given to us, the sketch of --
- 23 that -- that appears to be -- have been produced by
- 24 Mr. Loughry.

- Page 1286
- I I noticed that there is one spot in
- 2 kind of the center of the -- of the sketch that shows a 3 television.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Can you elaborate on that just a little bit?
- 6 A. Yes. He wanted a fairly large screen TV, but
- 7 he wanted it to be hidden behind the cabinetry, and he
- 8 wanted the cabinetry to be such that you wouldn't know
- 9 that they pulled out in accordion doors instead of just
- 10 being like the other doors in the cabinet, just simple
- 11 opening doors.
- 12 For lack of better words, he wanted to
- 13 hide the TV. I don't think from anybody. He just
- 14 didn't like the look of the TV and he wanted it behind
- 15 the cabinets.
- 16 Q. Somewhere in this process, it's -- I believe
- 17 I read that that was referred to as his "control
- 18 panel," "control center." Was there anything other
- 19 than a television that was associated with that space?
- 20 A. Not that I know of. But there may have been
- 21 some other -- I just don't know. I just know there was
- 22 a big screen TV in there.
- 23 Strangely, the entire Capitol is wired
- 24 for cable. I never figured out who paid the cable

- 1285
 - 1 bill. But there are cable hookups all over this place,
 - 2 and it was easy enough to pull the wire over to put the
 - 3 cable in there. You just had to pull it from the
 - 4 central hall.
 - 5 Q. You also testified in regard to the Carpet
 - 6 Gallery --
 - 7 A. Yes.
 - 8 Q. -- and that Justice Loughry, his wife and
 - 9 secretary went there to make a selection of the
 - 10 material that went on the famous couch. Why -- how did
 - 11 the Carpet Gallery get involved in that? How do they
 - 12 come into play?
 - B A. I really don't know. The project -- I had
 - 14 nothing to do with the couch except for the encounter
 - 15 about the cost of the couch with him. So I'm not sure
 - 16 how Carpet Gallery got into the scene. The project
 - 17 manager was the person who sourced furniture at their
 - 18 demands, of the various justices.
 - He wanted a couch that fit this space.
 - 20 The couch that was closest didn't quite fit it, so he
 - 21 asked if the project manager could make the couch --
 - 22 get the couch to be custom made bigger to fill the
 - 23 space. She did, and that added cost. And then they
 - 24 went to the Carpet Gallery and picked out the fabric.
 - Page 1288
 - 1 All of this, I got through the project
 - 2 manager. I wasn't involved myself.
 - Q. And in looking at the documentation that --
 - 4 that we've been trying to go through, I notice several
 - 5 invoices and orders that came from the Carpet Gallery
 - 6 that had one constant signature of Susan Johnson.
 - 7 A. Yes.
 - 8 Q. Had -- who is she, or have you had any kind
 - 9 of communication with her in regard to any of this 10 project?
 - 11 A. I never had any direct communication that I
 - 12 recall. I couldn't pick her out of a line-up. I don't
 - 13 know her. I'm assuming that she was either the
 - 14 manager, the owner, the director or some sort of
 - 15 factotum at the Carpet Gallery.
 - 16 But I have no idea who she is
 - 17 personally. That was something else that I delegated
 - 18 to the project manager. She probably knows her, but I
 - 19 do not.
 - 20 Q. I understand. We also -- there was also
 - 21 testimony regarding what's been called the Cass Gilbert
 - 22 desk.

- A. Yes.
- 24 Q. I'm not sure that -- that --

Page 1289

1

18

1 DELEGATE MILLER: If you covered it,

2 Mr. Chairman, I apologize.

Q. But do you have knowledge whether JusticeLoughry knew the status of that desk, the value, the

5 historical value, things like that?

A. Well, I do first of all because of testimony7 on the part of the three people who moved the desk.

8 They all said to you that he knew what it was. But he

9 spent a lot of time in Justice Ketchum's office as a

10 law clerk, as well as then later.

And Justice Ketchum -- you couldn'ttake a step into Justice Ketchum's office without him

. 13 talking about how proud he was that he had the complete

14 Cass Gilbert office, because he did. He had Cass

15 Gilbert tables, the original chairs, the original

16 desks.

17 And I don't see how he would not have

18 known it was Cass Gilbert. In fact, I think everybody

19 who worked at the Judicial Branch at the Capitol had

20 some understanding of these Cass Gilbert pieces of

21 furniture. They were frequently discussed.

22 And -- yeah, I don't see how he

23 wouldn't have known. But then I know basically from

24 what those three told you.

Page 1290

- 1 Q. Have you ever been to Mr. Loughry's home?
- 2 A. No.
- Q. Do you have any knowledge regarding his4 request for computers or a computer system to be
- 5 installed or located at his home?
- 6 A. I knew from my tech people that he wanted two
- 7 instead of one. I believe he also wanted a printer. I
- 8 then have heard reports since that he might have also
- 9 had a laptop, but I guess he communicated directly with

10 the IT staff and --

11 You know, judge -- justices were

12 absolutely free to communicate directly with anybody in

13 the -- in the Administrative Office. That's one of the

14 reasons why I wanted to have such clear delineation of

15 their titles and their areas of responsibility, so not

16 only the justices but members of the public - anybody -

17 could find them and make requests.

18 And so I guess he dealt directly with

19 that. The only thing I remember is that he initially

20 seemed to want two. And you know, he's the boss, so

21 yes, he got them.

- 22 Q. Did it come to your knowledge why he asked
- 23 for two computers?
- 24 A. No.

Q. Did it come to your knowledge as to any

2 particular problems with the computers at his home

- 3 after he had requested them?
- 4 A. No, nobody ever told me about those. I've 5 since heard about them, of course, but not while I
- 6 worked there.
- 7 Q. You make reference to an Asheville, North
- 8 Carolina out-of-state travel for a conference --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. -- that he was difficult to find, so it gave

11 the appearance that he did not attend?

12 A. Just one day, the Friday. The reason that

13 was such a noticeable absence is because there had been

14 so much consternation about his need to stay Friday

15 night. We got out of there at 1:00 o'clock. It's a

16 four-and-a-half, five-hour drive or so if you go the

17 Corridor G route to Charleston.

And I didn't know why he needed an

19 extra night, but he wanted it and I served him, so we

20 did what we could to make it happen, and it worked out.

21 But he was nowhere to be found.

22 Q. Were there CLE credits issued for attendance

23 at a conference such as that?

24 A. I don't know. I -- you often -- and there

Page 1292

- 1 may have been in this case, but I don't know if
- 2 Friday's would have qualified. The speakers were Bob
- 3 Mueller and Justice Alito. I would think the Justice
- 4 Alito lecture might very well have been a CLE-credited
- 5 thing, but I -- I'm not a lawyer, so I never worried
- 6 about CLEs.
- 7 Q. Understand. We also talked briefly about
- 8 travel in the Supreme Court's car --
- 9 A. Yes.

- 10 Q. -- by Justice Loughry. And just
- 11 concentrating -- well, in state or out of state, let's
- 12 say. Are you aware of any instance where his family
- 13 traveled with him in a State vehicle?
 - A. I am now because of all the reports since.
- 15 But when I was at the Court, it never came to my
- 16 attention one way or the other.
- 17 Q. Were you familiar at any point to where the
- 18 State vehicle was used to travel to book signings in
- 19 West Virginia?
- 20 A. I didn't know that when I worked there. No.
- 21 I learned that afterwards.
- 22 But while I was there, I had no idea he
- 23 was doing that.
- 24 Q. Were you aware that he was doing book

Page 1293

1 signings?

- A. I knew of one that I read in the newspaper right after he was elected. There was a book signing
- 4 in Charleston. I didn't know about any of those that
- 5 have been reported at the Greenbrier and other places
- 6 like that.
- 7 I haven't heard -- I learned about
- 8 those as everyone has, through reports after the fact.
- 9 Q. Do you know where the book signing was in10 Charleston? If you recall.
- 11 A. I don't recall specifically. I want to say
- 12 Taylor Books, but I'm just -- that's just kind of more
- 13 of a hunch than knowledge. There was a pretty lengthy
- 14 newspaper piece about it, though. It's pretty easy to
- 15 look up.
- 16 Q. Did you have anyone at the Supreme Court that
- 17 handled some of the -- the accounts, who reviewed or
- 18 possibly questioned expenditures that -- on a regular
- 19 basis that was -- that was the person that reviewed and
- 20 brought things to light if they thought it was
- 21 inappropriate, or at least get an explanation for
- 22 those?

1

2

- 23 A. About the justices?
- 24 Q. Any accounts --

Page 1294

- ge 1294
- Q. -- justices or lower courts as well. 2 Q. -- was i
- 3 A. Sure, absolutely. The Fiscal Division would
- 4 review and they would get directly -- again, I

A. Oh, any accounts, sure.

- 5 encouraged them not to run with all their problems to
- 6 me. Lots did anyway.
- 7 But I encouraged them to be direct, and
- 8 they would then directly say, "This is not allowable,
- 9 this -- clarify, be more specific; you didn't give the
- 10 information you needed to give."
- And this was not only for the people at
- 12 the Capitol in Charleston, but throughout the state.
- 13 Because -- and often it was just a matter of just not
- 14 understanding how to fill out a form or two to get
- 15 reimbursed. Sometimes it might have been a little
- 16 more. I don't know. But they would correct it.
- With the justices, we never questioned.
- 18 It was forbidden.
- 19 Q. Were you aware of any personal trips taken in 20 a State car by Justice Loughry?
- 21 A. We surmised. It was almost just the rumor
- 22 within the Administrative Office. He just so often
- 23 checked out cars over weekends. And there just didn't
- 24 seem to be any Court business over weekends. And there

- 1 was also then his apparent checking it out for long
- 2 periods in December.
- 3 This was just discussed among folks
- 4 talking. But I never confronted him about it because
- 5 it was his -- it was his privilege to do what he did.
- 6 And I assumed that it was for Court business, and I
- 7 wasn't gonna question him about it.
- 8 But there was a lot of discussion about
- 9 that, a lot of discussion. And I think that's probably
- 10 what reached the ears of Justice Davis.
- 11 Q. Were you aware of any instances where Justice
- 12 Loughry used a State vehicle to travel to Court
- 13 appearances by family members?
- 14 A. No, just what I read in the paper. That was
- 15 after the fact, just recently. But not while I was
- 16 working there.
- 17 Q. It's been brought up along the way on vehicle
- 18 use that you were brought into as well, is your use of
- 19 a vehicle --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. -- that your personal calendar reportedly
- 22 disappeared at some point after you left.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Did you take that with you or --

Page 1296

- 1 A. No.
 - Q. -- was it there when you left?
 - 3 A. They were there when I left. I had a
 - 4 personal calendar that was my planner that I took care
 - 5 of. But my secretary, my administrative assistant --
 - 6 or Executive Assistant, excuse me, Joan Mullins, wrote
 - 7 down everything that occurred.
 - So if there was a spontaneous trip
 - 9 where I was called to just come down and talk to people
 - 10 at, oh, Division of Community -- Justice and Community
- 11 Services, for example, I didn't plan that so that
- 12 wasn't in my personal planner, but she would write it
- 13 down in the official Administrative Director calendar
- 14 that was supposed to have been kept for posterity.
- 15 I was asked to see if these 30 some
- 16 trips that were blanks -- because the message didn't
- 17 get through to Arthur Angus, I guess. Anyway, they
- 18 weren't listed.

- 19 -- if my personal calendars or any
- 20 personal recollection could fill in the blanks on any
- 21 of those 30 some, and yes, I did have information about
- 22 the vast majority. But there were six that I simply
- 23 had no information about.
 - They seemed to just be one-day uses. I

Page 1297

- 1 suspect that I knew what some of them were, but I
- 2 couldn't say for sure. So I said they could check the
- 3 calendars. And then that's when we all learned that
- 4 the calendars from 2005 through 2012 were there, but
- 5 the calendars from 2013 through '16 were missing.
- 6 Frankly, I don't even know where she
- 7 kept the old calendars in her office. I know where the
- 8 current one was it was on her desk, and she put it in
- 9 her top drawer every day but the others, I don't know10 where she kept them.
- 11 Q. Have you came to learn -- have you come to 12 learn what happened to that calendar?
- 13 A. I have no idea what happened to those four 14 years worth of calendars. I have no idea.
- 15 Q. All right, thank you.
- 16 A. It's troubling, frankly. That's the kind of
- 17 official history of that office, and to have that gone
- 18 is a chunk of history that's missing.
- 19 DELEGATE MILLER: Thank you. Thank
- 20 you, Mr. Chairman.
- 21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Kessinger?
- 22 Back to this side. Delegate Byrd.
- 23 DELEGATE BYRD: Thank you,
- 24 Mr. Chairman.

Page 1298

6

- 1 Thank you for being here, sir.
- 2 EXAMINATION
- 3 BY DELEGATE BYRD:
- 4 Q. Just a -- can you give -- I don't want to
- 5 take too much time and have you talk too much about it,
- 6 but I just want a little -- to know a little bit about
- 7 you, just like a minute about your background before
- 8 you got into the conversation about your government
- 9 background.
- 10 A. The government background is exactly as I11 just said.
- 12 Q. I'm talking previous to that.
- 13 A. Previous to that? Oh, I was a -- I went to
- 14 grad school in Berkeley, had a master's degree and was
- 15 one of those people that was all but dissertation for
- 16 my -- my Ph.D. in English. I was an English instructor
- 17 at a little college called College of Moraine. I had
- 18 contract classes at Berkeley.
- 19 I came back to West Virginia because of
- 20 the illness of my mother and I was -- found myself kind
- 21 of wondering what to do. For a while, I worked in the
- 22 John Raese for Governor campaign. That didn't go so
- 23 well. I then found myself intrigued with Governor
- 24 Moore's possibilities. I went to him, and I had a

- 1 mutual contact, and the rest is history.
- 2 There was a big gap, though, between
- 3 that '88 and '97, and you may be asking what I did
- 4 then.
- Well, you know, when you teach English,
- 6 you think of a lot of things you'd like to do in life,
- 7 because you get exposed to so much when you're teaching
- 8 freshman composition.
- 9 And so I kind of wanted to write some
- 10 commercials, so I wrote many, many commercials for some
- 11 people in Nashville. I did an award-winning sales
- 12 video presentation for a cemetery company on pre-need
- 13 sales.
- 14 I founded a camp for pre-16-year-old
- 15 girls and their children, their babies, that went for a
- 16 long time, and that was one of the more noble things ${\sf I}$
- 17 ever did.
- 18 I wrote grants for southern West
- 19 Virginia health clinics.
- 20 I did general PR work, and I then --
- 21 what's best known, is I was involved in a lot of
- 22 campaigns. Primarily democrat campaigns, a few
- 23 republicans. I've never been much of a party loyalist.
- 24 I just look for the best person.

- 1 Q. Okay. One of the things I wanted -- I'm just
- 2 going to go through a few things I need to clarify
- 3 before passing the mic. You talked a little bit about
- 4 the home office and you had a conversation with Justice
- 5 Loughry about taking a couch to his home office.
 - Did I hear your testimony correctly?
- 7 A. He told me that he wanted to take the couch
- 8 for his home office.
- 9 Q. So he never told you he was taking it for his
- 10 living room; he told you he was taking it for his home 11 office.
- 12 A. He just said he was taking it to his house
- 13 for his home office, and after that, I didn't know what
- 14 had happened to the couch; I just knew it wasn't there.
- 15 I wasn't even sure if he'd actually gone through with
- 16 moving it because he didn't ask me to be involved with
- To moving it because he didn't ask me to be involved with
- 17 any of the move.
- 18 I assumed when he said "home office" he
- 19 was just referring to the fact that he had a State
- 20 computer or two, but I never thought any more of it
- 21 except that it was really surprising to me.
- 22 I mean, I -- nobody had ever said
- 23 anything like that, and I was stunned.
- 24 Q. Okay. And we are -- referring to Exhibit 39.

Page 1304

Page 1301

- 1 A. Yes. sir.
- 2 Q. Just a few things that I wanted to ask if you
- 3 had any knowledge of was -- it looks like he requested
- 4 a taller desk. Do you see that?
- Yes, he wanted a standing desk.
- Q. Okay. And do you recall what the desk was 7 before?
- 8 A. Well, the desk in that office before was the
- 9 -- was a Cass Gilbert desk. It was used by McHugh.
- 10 And it was there for several years, and in -- he -- he
- 11 wanted a different kind of desk.
- 12 I think -- the Cass Gilbert desks are
- 13 very large, and the way he wanted to take that nook of
- 14 the office, he wanted a smaller desk, but then he
- wanted the standing desk to fill that corner.
- 16 He told me he had some back or shoulder
- 17 or neck issues or something and that he needed to have
- 18 a standing desk at times to relieve him from working at
- 19 a sitting desk.
- Q. I was curious because I see also -- I'm not 20
- 21 trying to be funny at all, but I see he requested a
- 22 taller toilet. Was the reason why that -- because of
- 23 medical issues?
- 24 A. I don't know. I remember that, and I guess
 - Page 1302
- 1 that was provided for him. I mean, a lot of things
- 2 come to mind that are irrelevant about a throne, but I
- 3 won't go into them.
- Q. You -- I didn't catch your name -- and I
- 5 think you testified earlier and please clarify if I'm
- 6 wrong but the wife and secretary went to pick up the
- 7 fabric. What was the secretary's name?
 - A. Vici Shaffer.
- 9 Q. Okay. And the conversation that you had
- 10 after he was elected, I think you said that he came up
- 11 to you and said that you -- you had disrespected him.
- 12 Were any -- was anyone else present for that
- 13 conversation?
- 14 A. The "disrespected" conversation was about my
- 15 having allegedly said something about him being -- that
- 16 was in the -- right before we began administrative
- 17 conference. All of the justices were in the room.
- 18 Q. They were --
- 19 A. We had just sat down and he said --
- 20 He just started by saying, "I want your
- 21 resignation and here's why:" I disrespected him, that
- 22 he was -- I'd said he was a young justice who would
- 23 learn more about drug courts. I don't know what he was 24 talking about.

- Q. And the -- one of the last things I wanted to 1
- 2 ask was about the Asheville conference, just to clarify 3 something.
- A. Yes.
- 5 Q. For what time period did you say he did not 6 go to the -- attend the conference?
- A. It was -- the last day of the conference was
- 8 a Friday, and it was that -- that half day that I
- 9 didn't see him there. To clarify, it went from 9:00 in
- 10 the morning, was the first speaker, until 1:00, and
- 11 there -- and then that was it.
- 12 And I didn't -- we didn't -- I mean, I
- 13 -- both Justice Ketchum and I looked around for him.
- 14 and we didn't see him. And -- and it was a fairly
- 15 large conference, but it wasn't so large that we
- 16 wouldn't have been able to find him in the room.
- Q. And if there would have been -- if Justice 17
- 18 Loughry would have, say, extended his time to rent a
- 19 car or change a flight, who would have approved that, 20 or who would he go through with the State?
- 21 A. Well, he approved it himself because the
- 22 justices approved their own travel. Nobody could look
- 23 over their shoulders. I have to emphasize that he was
- 24 the boss. If he decided to go somewhere, he did it.
- Now, who did he arrange it through? He
- 2 would arrange that generally either with his own
- 3 secretary or, more likely, Mary Greene, who was one of
- 4 my executive assistants, because she typically handled
- 5 the direct billing and the travel.
- And she typically arranged not only for
- 7 air flight, but for rental cars or for hotel
- 8 reservations and all of that. And she did that for the
- 9 justices as well as for me.
- Q. And so Mary Greene would receive -- you know,
- 11 if there was a change in extending the rental or a
- 12 change of flights, you'd receive receipts and
- 13 confirmations of those?
- 14 A. No, I don't think she would have done that.
- 15 She just did the original kinds of arrangements. The
- 16 person who would have gotten the receipts would have
- 17 been in Sue Racer-Troy's office, and -- or they'd have
- 18 come directly to Loughry's -- Justice Loughry's office
- 19 and had been sent down for processing.
- 20 DELEGATE BYRD: Thank you for your time
- 21 today, sir. I appreciate it.

23

- 22 MR. CANTERBURY: Sure.
 - CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Fluharty.
- 24 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Thank

Page 1305

1 you, Mr. Chairman.

Thank you, Mr. Canterbury, for being here today.

4 EXAMINATION

5 BY MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY:

Q. You mentioned this television that's hidden7 in the office.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Is there a reason that he wanted it to be 10 hidden?

A. Well, I mean, two things come to mind. But
no, he never told me why he wanted it hidden. Maybe
the aesthetics of it. Some people don't like a big
screen in their offices.

There are obviously other thoughts, that maybe he just didn't want people in his office to know he had that big TV in there.

18 Q. And do you know what the cost was for that 19 television?

A. I don't recall.

21 Q. Do you know the size? You say it's a big 22 screen but --

A. It's large. But I don't know my TV sizes as well as I probably ought to. But -- I haven't bought a

1 Q. Were there any elected officials that would

2 regularly meet with Justice Loughry or any of the other 3 justices upstairs?

4 A. I mean, I wouldn't be privy to that because 5 they didn't keep a list and nobody ever shared with me

6 who was meeting whom. There were some rumors about

7 folks that were meeting with Justice Loughry, but those

8 are idle rumors. I don't know the truth to them, and

9 frankly, I don't remember any of the names. They were 10 lawyers.

There were some rumors, though, that he was meeting with lawyers from the Attorney General's office. Which, of course, raised some red flags for people.

15 Q. Do you know who they were?

16 A. Apparently there was one with -- is his name
17 Elbert Lin? And then there was another person whose
18 name escapes me, but he's now, I think, the chief
19 counsel at the Secretary of State's office.

Q. Did he ever meet with Attorney GeneralPatrick Morrisey?

22 A. I don't know that.

Q. And do you know the time frame for thesemeetings?

Page 1306

Page 1308

1 TV in an awfully long time, so I don't really know.

Q. We had testimony previously from

3 administrators dealing with security. And are you

4 familiar with the process -- for instance, if somebody

5 would have a meeting with Justice Loughry or another

iustice, do they have to sign in?

7 A. No, they don't have to sign in. There's no 8 signing in. I think the justices would not like that.

9 They want to be able to have freedom to be able to meet

10 with people. But you can't just walk to their office.

11 It's not like the legislator's office

12 where anybody can come up and just come to your office.

13 Just anybody, right? But the -- there, you would need

14 to go to the security people who are right outside the15 door.

15 door.

Typically, they're expected, and they
would then have gotten a note from one of the justices
that so-and-so's "coming to visit me" at such and such
a time, and then the -- one of the security people
would unlock the door and let them in and often would
secort them all the way to the appropriate office.

22 If they had come before, they would

23 just unlock the door and then they would be on their

24 way; they would know which office to go to.

1 A. They were always later in the day. And they

2 happened in 2016 primarily. Maybe some in '15. But I

3 heard about them in '16. And again, these are -- these

4 are rumors through the halls. I wasn't there; I didn't

5 see them. I didn't let anybody in the door.

6 Q. You were asked questions previously about the 7 -- I guess I'll just call it the spend-down.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And was there a clear consensus by the Court10 that they supported this activity?

11 A. Well, until I read Justice Workman's comments 12 and heard her response to the Senate Finance, I thought

13 so. That's why I wrote the memo, as a reminder, and I

14 think a line or two similar to "as you know."

15 Nobody wrote any memos back saying,

16 "Well, that's not right, I don't remember any of that,"

17 so I accepted that that was what they all remembered,

18 because there was no protest.

They weren't shy about protesting when they disagreed with something I wrote.

21 Q. Well, along those lines, did they protest or

22 object to this practice taking place when they learned

23 about the spend-down? Did anyone in particular come up

24 to you and say, "Hey, I don't agree with this and we

Page 1309

1 need to stop it"?

- A. No, I don't remember anybody saying, "Let's 2 3 stop doing that." I think they understood that the 4 legislature was cross -- and also, I hope they 5 understood that it was too high. You know, it needed 6 to be brought back down to some size.
- 7 I'm not saying that having a little 8 rollover amount is a bad thing. Unexpected expenses do 9 come up. But you know, when you have a \$130,000,000 10 budget, \$29,000,000 is a big chunk.
- 11 Q. You were asked questions previously about 12 hirings that took place and specifically as Justice 13 Workman may have --
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. -- helped to influence some of the hirings. 16 Do you believe that those hires were legit?
- 17 A. You mean were they qualified for the job 18 legit?
- 19 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. Yes, they were all qualified for the jobs 21 they had. I don't know about the contractor, but the people who were put on our payroll certainly were.
- 23 Q. And when she approached you about hiring 24 certain individuals, did she request a certain salary

1 be paid?

- A. She wanted to know what I could pay them, and 3 she wanted it to be as full as it could be, but she 4 also understood there were limits. Nobody was paid in 5 any of these positions more than was commensurate with 6 other people in those positions.
- Q. So you would agree that the salary that was 7 8 got paid, whether it be a full-time salary versus a 9 contracted salary -- I believe one individual was 10 contracted.
- 11 A. Right.
- Q. -- it was for the market rate? 12
- 13 A. The contractor, I'm not sure about, and you 14 would have to -- I deferred -- I was not -- I was not 15 intimate with most of the contractors in the divisions. 16 I let the division directors who knew their jobs and 17 knew their areas better than I make those decisions, so 18 frankly, what he was paid would be best discussed with 19 somebody who was a IT expert.
- 20 The fact that he never seemed to be 21 able to do the jobs that he was asked to do -- not to 22 say he might not have had some expertise. IT is a huge
- 23 field, and he maybe just wasn't in the right bailiwick.
- 24 But we couldn't find the bailiwick for him, and -- so I

1 don't know.

2 But I will tell you - and I can say 3 this with certainty - that the three employees who were 4 hired were hired at exactly the commensurate salaries 5 of other people in those positions.

6 Q. And before being hired, would the other 7 justices have to approve of the hiring?

A. Yeah, all the -- everybody who was ever hired 9 at the Court while I was there had to be -- have a 10 majority of three voting for their hire. So if you 11 were hired, the Administrative Office - or in the other

12 offices that were brought to the attention by the

13 directors -- you know, by the clerk and by the chief

14 counsel -- they would have the same rigamarole I went

15 through - they had to get a majority vote, with the 16 exception of the justices' personal law clerks and the

17 justices' personal administrative -- well, secretary,

18 is what they're called.

So those were entirely up to the 20 individual justice. Everybody else had to have 21 approval of three. That's from the lowliest, you know,

22 part -- you know, floater, administrator -- you know,

23 floater administrative assistant and receptionist, to,

24 you know, the highest-paid director of something or

1 another.

19

2 Q. And they're aware of the salary that would be 3 paid to these individuals?

A. Yes, that had to be -- you'll see in the 5 administrative conference minutes, it would always say 6 what they were being hired for and how much and when 7 their start date was and all of that.

Q. I have some concerns over possible taxpayer 9 money being spent that we're not aware of yet.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. I know a lot of information has been

12 dispensed about renovations and office expenses and

13 trips. Is there anything that hasn't been disclosed of

14 yet that you know about that involved taxpayer money

15 that we should know about?

A. Well, I will tell you that every penny is 17 accounted for and available for inspection. Now, you 18 know, to get into more specifics, I don't want to try 19 the patience of the Chair or anything, because you get 20 into specifics --

21 Q. He's a patient man.

22 A. \$29,000,000 is a lot of money, and all those 23 budgets were \$130-140,000,000 - as time went on, it 24 went up - a year, so there's a lot of details there,

Page 1313

1

- 1 and I'll answer questions about any of it if you want
- 2 to ask about legal or anything, whatever. Some of them
- 3 went up, and I'm happy to tell it.
- 4 But to suggest that any of the money
- 5 was hidden, any of the money spent was not according to
- 6 practices formed, policies and procedures, it's not
- 7 true. It's all there. There's not any penny that you
- 8 won't be able to find accounted for, unless there was a
- 9 breakdown by somebody I'm not aware of.
- 10 But I don't think so. I think that Sue
- 11 Racer-Troy ran a tight ship. I know that Mike Proops
- 12 ran a tight ship that was her predecessor and I
- 13 think that that money will be accounted for as is
- 14 supposed to.
- 15 Q. Well, do you know if any Supreme Court
- 16 Justice paid someone from outside of the administration
- 17 or outside of the regular work force at the Supreme
- 18 Court to help them write opinions?
- 19 A. I understand that happened after I left by
- 20 Justice Walker, but I never heard of that happening
- 21 ever before I left.
- 22 Q. And what do you know about that?
- 23 A. Only what I read in the paper. It was in a
- 24 column by Phil Kabler. Apparently they contracted
- Page 1314

- 1 Barbara Allen to write --
- 2 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Excuse me,
- 3 Mr. Canterbury, just testify your own knowledge.
- 4 MR. CANTERBURY: Well, he -- I agree.
- 5 But he asked; I'm answering. I'm sorry.
- 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Just stick with what
- 7 he knows and not what he read in the paper. Okay?
- 8 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: All
- 9 right, Mr. Chairman.
- 10 A. I also want it to be noted that I said I read
- 11 it in the paper. I don't want you to think I'm trying
- 12 to say anything that isn't exactly right.
- 13 Q. Okay. Well, how long were you at the Supreme
- 14 Court?
- 15 A. I was there for 11 1/2 years --
- 16 Q. And in your --
- 17 A. -- almost to the day.
- 18 Q. In your 11 1/2 years, you never once recall
- 19 any Supreme Court Justice hiring outside help to write
- 20 an opinion?
- 21 A. No. They would have thought that was
- 22 anathema.
- 23 Q. So it wasn't the normal course of practice
- 24 for a Supreme Court Justice?

- A. Not at all.
- 2 Q. You referred to Justice Loughry as now
- 3 correct me if I'm wrong simulacrum. Is that the
- 4 correct --
- 5 A. Simulacrum.
- 6 Q. And --
- 7 A. Sim-u-la-crum. Now there you go.
- 8 Q. Simulacrum.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And you said it means "elaborate fraud."
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Why did you believe Justice Loughry was an

13 elaborate fraud?

- 14 A. I think he's dishonest. I don't think he has
- 15 the temperament to be a justice, and I think that he
- 16 was -- I don't think he has a temperament to be in
- 17 charge of -- of hiring and -- people. I just found his
- 18 entire tone to be off-putting.
- 19 But I respect the position and I
- 20 respect the people's will, and I would have served him
- 21 as hard as I could have had I had the opportunity.
- 22 Q. You mentioned previously that you approached
- 23 Justice Loughry about the price of the couch, that you
- 24 didn't really go beyond just kind of that one

- 1 encounter. But himself and other justices, were they
- 2 aware that you were unhappy with the way money was
- 3 being spent --
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. -- prior to your firing?
- 6 A. No, no, they weren't aware. Because -- I
- 7 mean, I would question some things in administrative
- 8 conference, ask if we couldn't do things differently.
- 9 But you know, you get your marching orders and you10 march.
- 11 But there wasn't a hue and cry. There
- 12 wasn't a whole lot of specific interest. I mean, about
- 13 the budget is what you're asking, in some sense. They
- 14 would approve the budget. They would express intense
- 15 interest over certain issues, and just vague and
- 16 general interest over others.
- 17 They had intense interest, I think
- 18 reasonably enough, over their offices. That makes
- 19 perfect sense. They knew the details on the offices.
- 20 Other practices, they didn't have that much specific
- 21 interest.
- 22 Q. Now, previously you'd stated that when you
- 23 had an encounter with Justice Loughry about the price
- 24 of the couch, I believe you said something along the

Page 1320

Page 1317

- 1 lines of he told you that if it became public, he would
- 2 just blame you because you're the Court Administrator.
- 3 Is that correct in my analysis?
- 4 A. Yeah, I think that was a joke.
- 5 Q. Okay. So it was a joke at the time.
- 6 A. Yeah, he said it in that way he has and kind 7 of laughed.
- 8 Q. Now that you've had time to reflect back on
- 9 that encounter, do you believe he was still joking or
- 10 that he was kind of intentionally deceiving the public?
- 11 A. I think the joke was on me, but I -- I don't
- 12 know. I can't answer as to what was in his mind. I
- 13 just know his affect and what he said.
- 14 Q. Real quick, back to how these extravagant
- 15 purchases were made. At any time did Justice Loughry
- 16 or any other justice request a certain contractor be 17 used?
- 18 A. Yes, as I said, Justice Workman very much
- 19 wanted Designs by Fisher to be used for her counters
- 20 that were built and then later for the kitchen work
- 21 that was done. I'm assuming when you take your tour,
- 22 you'll be able to see the conference room and the
- 23 kitchen to which I refer.
- 24 The -- the justices all liked the

- 1 for seeing the bill, so I don't know if the project
- 2 manager went into that or not. I have no idea.
- 3 Q. And one last thing. Prior to these purchases
- 4 being made, we've established that for a hire to take
- 5 place, it requires a majority vote by the Supreme Court
- 6 justices.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Prior to these extravagant expenses, does it
- 9 require a similar vote?
- 10 A. No. But that was a general -- you're talking
- 11 about individual expenses. No.
- 12 Q. Correct.
- 13 A. If you're talking about the construction,
- 14 yes, they approved the construction for, first, the
- 15 fourth floor, then the Clerk's Office, then the
- 16 individual justices' offices. This was all part of an
- 17 ongoing approval for the repair to the building, which
- 18 is -- the lion's share of those costs were repairs to
- 19 the building that had to be made. The building was
- 20 crumbling.
- 21 And -- and it was all under that
- 22 umbrella.
- 23 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That's
- 24 all I have. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

- 1 project manager, the foreman and the people from
- 2 Neighborgall, and they requested that we continue with
- 3 them, and then when they -- he changed to another
- 4 construction company, for Justice Davis', it was
- 5 generally believed that -- I think Justice Davis may
- 6 have said something I don't remember specifically -
- 7 but the Court generally wanted to stay with those same
- 8 employees and those same --
- 9 Because several went over to this other
- 10 company with the project manager, and so they wanted to
- 11 have those people working that -- that project. But
- 12 Justice Loughry, I don't remember him ever saying
- 13 anything to me about "Use this contractor" or "that
- 14 contractor." I don't know that was of much interest to
- 15 him.
- 16 Q. Was any follow-up made to these vendors or 17 contractors -- for instance, when I hear a \$32,000
- 17 contractors -- for instance, when I hear a \$32,000
- 18 couch, I don't care what the material is, it just seems
- 19 impossible.
- 20 If the Court wanted to request a
- 21 certain couch or the public at large from these
- 22 vendors, did anybody check to see if that was a valid
- 23 price that was given to the Supreme Court?
- A. Again, I had nothing to do with that except

- 1 Thank you, Mr. Canterbury.
 - 2 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Summers?
 - 3 DELEGATE SUMMERS: Thank you,
 - 4 Mr. Chairman.
 - 5 EXAMINATION
 - 6 BY DELEGATE SUMMERS:
 - 7 Q. Mr. Canterbury, when you were talking about
 - 8 your job description earlier today, you didn't say
 - 9 anything about administering the Court's budget. How
 - 10 is that administered?
 - 11 A. Well, it's under my watch. I gave a brief
 - 12 answer, but the budget's under my watch, but it's not
 - 13 without the Court's approval. The Court approves the
 - 14 budget, and it's up to me to administer it. I'm not a
 - 15 -- I wasn't an executive director; I was an
 - 16 Administrative Director, which means that I followed
 - 17 the -- the -- I followed the orders of the Court and
 - 18 the orders of -- and the demands of individual
 - 19 iustices.
 - 20 So it was up to me to administer the
 - 21 budget but it was not -- and it was up to me to present
 - 22 them with a budget or an appropriation request, but it
 - 23 was their call and their approval at the end of the
 - 24 day.

Page 1321

- 1 Q. Okay. And you said that individual expenses,
- 2 they had free rein of that, or in the budget, there
- 3 were set -- set amounts for each justice of what their
- 4 individual expenses would be?
- 5 A. There were not individual expenses delineated
- 6 per just -- per justice. That would have been under
- 7 the headings of whatever they wanted to do. There was
- 8 so much that was budgeted for travel, and if they, you
- 9 know, wanted to travel, that would have been just under
- 10 the general travel budget.
- 11 But that also would have included a
- 12 whole lot of other people traveling. For example,
- 13 judges in multi-circuit counties have to travel to
- 14 other counties. That's under travel as well. It's a
- 15 big budget.
- 16 Q. Okay. Are there minutes kept at the
- 17 administrative conferences? Because we've had a lot of
- 18 talk about what happens there, but we don't really have
- 19 any documentation.
- 20 A. Yeah, there -- yes -- yes, ma'am, there are
- 21 minutes. The minutes aren't necessarily as full-bodied
- 22 as the discussions, because they didn't want them to be
- 23 very long. They believed as the Chair did that I
- 24 might be a little long-winded and they wanted it to be
 - Page 1322
- 1 a little to the point.

That's why you'll see that the budget

- 3 -- each appropriation request was approved in the last
- 4 June administrative conference. And it usually is just
- 5 a couple of lines with a copy of the appropriation
- 6 request.

2

- 7 But often those discussions would go on
- 8 for a long time, but that's -- like I said, they
- 9 weren't fully -- every line was not represented in the 10 minutes.
- . .
- 11 Sometimes they'd get in arguments and
- 12 they'd both -- both sides of the argument would want
- 13 everything that they ever said in the minutes. So the
- 14 minutes are a mixed bag of brevity and almost
- 15 novelistic detail.
- 16 Q. Okay. When you were talking about the
- 17 process for approving expenditures, I was getting a
- 18 little bit -- I'm not fully understanding the process
- 19 or the checks and balances or who makes the final
- 20 decisions. I know you brought up the Fiscal Division.
- 21 So if someone gets a rental car and
- 22 someone uses the P-card for gas and then someone asks
- 23 for reimbursement for mileage, who approves all of
- 24 those things and checks to make sure that there's no

1 overlap?

7

2 A. Well, you're saying "someone." Do you mean

3 justices or Court employees?

4 Q. Well, I didn't think the justices would write

5 a check to themselves for --

- 6 A. No, that's not what I mean.
 - Q. How does the --
- 8 A. Who are the travelers?
- 9 Q. How does the payment then happen?
- 10 A. Oh, the payment. Well, I delegated to my
- 11 deputy director the responsibility of looking over the
- 12 judges' -- not the justices.
- 13 -- the judges' and other employees'
- 14 travel vouchers, travel expense reimbursement forms,
- 15 and they would make sure -- I had two different direct
- 6 -- deputies through the years. They would make sure
- 17 that they had done the forms correctly and there was no
- 18 overlap or no problems.
- 19 But the justices simply would -- they
- 20 were sent directly to the office of Sue Troy, and they
- 21 were paid.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 DELEGATE SUMMERS: All right, that's
- 24 all I have. Thank you.

- 1 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Sobonya.
- 2 DELEGATE SOBONYA: Thank you,
- 3 Mr. Chairman.
- 4 Thank you for being here,
- 5 Mr. Canterbury.
- 6 EXAMINATION
- 7 BY DELEGATE SOBONYA:
- Q. In the Post Audit Report for March 5th, 2018,
- 9 Ms. Racer-Troy informed you that the commute -- the
- 10 commuting to work from home was a taxable event under
- 11 the IRS taxable fringe benefit guidelines and then it's
- 12 -- she has stated that you told her it was none of her
- 13 business. Is -- was that correct?
- 14 A. It's correct she said that; it's not correct
- 15 that that happened.
- 16 Q. Okay. And who was responsible for
- 17 determining taxable fringe benefits?
- 18 A. Well, she didn't have anything to do with
- 19 payroll, so it was kind of a -- it was the payroll's
- 20 responsibility. But she was a CPA, so she would have
- 21 felt, I think, some -- had some knowledge. And as I
- 22 said earlier, she may have had the discussion with me.
- 23 There were a lot of discussions going on.
- 24 But I can guarantee I never told her it

Page 1325

- 1 was none of her business. We had a very pleasant
- 2 relationship. There was never -- I don't recall ever
- 3 having a harsh word with her, so --
- 4 Q. So is it the honor system that the justices
- 5 just turned in their expenses and they were supposed to
- 6 report that on their own, or -- I mean, how does -- how
- 7 are they notified? Is it up to the Court Administrator
- 8 to oversee that?
- 9 I'm just trying to --
- 10 A. No --
- 11 Q. I can't get a handle as to the process, of
- 12 who -- who notifies them of that.
- 13 A. They're in charge. They are the bosses. And
- 14 the documents that are at the Auditor's Office, it says
- 15 there are not gonna be any questions of whatever the
- 16 justices turn in. I had no approval; there was no
- 17 approval from anybody.
- They approved their own individual
- 19 work, and they sent in their own individual expense
- 20 vouchers. And it was -- they were paid.
- 21 Q. Okay. In the same Post Audit Report it was
- 22 the meeting summary Ms. Racer-Troy said that she
- 23 notified you of an existing policy that was voted on by
- 24 the justices that allowed them to determine for

Page 1326

- 1 themselves what constituted business trips in State 2 vehicles.
- 3 Do you know, was that in writing, or do4 you have any record of that?
- 5 A. Administrative conference of either late
- 6 August '16 or September of '16. But then I learned
- 7 later that they had another meeting without me and
- 8 decided to undo that policy, so I'm not sure finally
- 9 what the policy was that they decided, except it seemed
- 10 that they continued to be able to submit whatever they
- 11 wanted for expenses.
- 12 Although after all this hit the fan
- 13 about the cars, there was far less car use, apparently,
- 14 on the part of the justices. For example, Justice
- 15 Ketchum stopped commuting in his vehicle by the end of
- 16 winter/early spring 2016. The silver Buick was not
- 17 used anymore.
- 18 So I'm not sure how much that was
- 19 really of issue, but -- but no, you'll see in
- 20 administrative conference minutes that that policy --
- 21 that I then informed the security people about, that
- 22 that absolutely was the way they wanted it at the end
- 23 of that administrative conference.
- 24 Q. So we could look at the minutes to see what

1 the current policy is, even if it changed?

- 2 A. I have no idea. That's up to you and the
- 3 Court. I don't have -- I'm just a private citizen who
- 4 has zero authority over anybody.
 - Q. Okay, thanks. On this notification -- it's
- 6 from the state-wide truancy court meetings, direct
- 7 action welfare group and it will -- it was a public
- 8 announcement there were going to be state-wide truancy
- 9 court meetings throughout the state, and I think there
- 10 were gonna be 14 stops throughout the state, and it was
- 11 determined by a vote of the Supreme Court justices that
- 12 Justice Davis would be -- would represent them and go
- 13 around the state during her election year.
- 14 Do you know -- do you know what came
- 15 out of those meetings? Was there a report given that
- 16 -- what cultimated (sic) from those meetings, those
- 17 whistle stop meetings?
- 18 A. Well, I only went to one of the meetings
- 19 myself. I went to the one in Clarksburg. I assume
- 20 that they were all pretty much the same. A Circuit
- 21 Judge, Judge Moats, had developed a very good program.
- 22 And then on top of that, we were having
- 23 remarkable success with lowering truancy by working in
- 24 concert with local Boards of Education to have a

- I probation officer paid for by the Board of Education
- 2 but to be a probation officer responsive to the Court,
- 3 and in those several counties, that had really done
- 4 well.
- 5 So what she did at the meeting, Judge
- 6 Moats described his program, she described the
- 7 probation officer work, and then talked about how it
- 8 was a community problem and that truancy is shown to
- 9 develop into terrible things later.
- So that's what the meetings were about.
- 11 That was the first part of your question.
- 12 The second part, was there a report? I
- 13 don't recall any written report. There may have been
- 14 circulated amongst the justices. I have no idea. But
- 15 I never got a copy of it, if it was.
- 16 Q. Well, the reason why I ask, I attended the
- 17 one in Huntington and I recall it maybe lasting an
- 18 hour. I just wondered, since you attended one, did it
- 19 -- was it an ongoing meeting process in the community
- 20 that lasted all day or did -- did -- after the meeting,
 -
- 21 did --
- 22 A. The one I was in in Clarksburg was probably
- 23 two hours. There were a lot of guestions and answers.
- 24 Then there was the after-meeting rush to talk to them.

Page 1329

1 and I suspect she was there for about three hours, but

- 2 I don't remember.
- 3 I left after the meeting. I had other
- 4 work to get to. But I did want to see one for myself,
- 5 and it just dovetailed with something else I was doing 6 up there.
- 7 Q. Well, the reason I ask, I'm trying to figure
- 8 out what would constitute an overnight stay when there
- 9 -- it was surrounded by a campaign fundraising event.
- 10 I just wondered why like an hour away from Parkersburg
- 11 it would constitute a -- an overnight stay if it only
- 12 lasted maybe one or two hours.
- 13 So I just was trying to find out if --
- 14 did it go on during the day or were there subsequent
- 15 meetings? Did you have any knowledge of that?
- 16 A. I don't have any direct knowledge of what
- 17 happened with the Wheeling/Parkersburg trip except what
- 18 I've heard here.
- 19 Q. Okay. And did -- did you know that Justice
- 20 Workman was looking for the missing Cass Gilbert desk?
- 21 It was in testimony -- I think it was in the
- 22 JIC investigation and part of the federal audit. Did
- 23 -- were you aware that Justice Workman was looking for
- 24 the desk?

Page 1330

- A. Well, I didn't know about her specifically.
- 2 I do know that at the end of '16, in order to get
- 3 prepared for Justice Walker, she was gonna need a desk
- 4 because Justice Benjamin was taking his desk, so she
- 5 needed a desk.
- 6 And the thought was to give her the
- 7 Cass Gilbert desk that I thought was in storage, and it
- 8 wasn't there. So the search was on.
- 9 Now, I don't know about Justice
- 10 Workman's direct discussion about that. I was in
- 11 discussion with the project manager, and I was pretty
- 12 livid, to be perfectly honest.
- That was one of the few times that I
- 14 actually just kind of lost it with anybody at the Court
- 15 Administrative Office. I just said, you know,
- 16 "Goodness gracious, how do you lose one of these 17 desks?"
- 18 Q. That was my --
- 19 A. Now we know --
- 20 Q. I was wondering --
- 21 A. Now we know --
- 22 Q. -- in previous testimony --
- 23 A. -- it was in Justice Loughry's office.
- 24 Q. -- from other -- from other presenters that,

1 you know, she was looking for the desk, I guess, in

- 2 2016, in -- the -- Justice Loughry had moved it to his
- 3 home in 2013, so I was wondering why -- what prompted
- 4 three years wondering where a desk was, if it was --
- 5 A. For Justice Walker.
- 6 Q. Okay. Of the JIC complaint -- I just wanted
- 7 to get clarification on your testimony here today.
- 8 Justice Loughry wrote an op ed December 21st, 2017, and
- 9 in it he stated that you, as the administrator, were
- 10 not left to unfettered authority, that you had strict
- 11 spending limits.
- 12 And I think our counsel had questioned
- 13 you on this, but the \$32,000 couch, you know, fell
- 14 under -- fell over that spending limitation.
- 15 You said something about that they
- 16 delineated from their policy -- because they had to
- 17 vote on that policy in the past. Did they delineate
- 18 from the policy? Did they have a Court action where
- 19 they had actually voted on it?
- 20 A. No, I think "delineation" is probably a
- 21 mischaracterization. What they would say is, "We want
- 22 the construction done," knowing full well that the
- 23 invoices coming in for construction often would exceed
- 24 the \$20,000 limit on each invoice I was allowed to

- 1 process, so there was no problem with me, after they
- 2 had approved a project, to go ahead and complete the
- 3 project without bothering them as they would have
- 4 termed it with every bill that came in about a said
- 5 project they'd already approved.
- 6 Q. So this --
- 7 A. That was my understanding and that's how we
- 8 always did it.
- 9 Q. So since that took an action and a vote of
- 10 the Supreme Court justices, did they send you an e-mail
- 11 collectively to go away from that policy, to give you
- 12 more latitude and leeway to go over your \$20,000
- 13 spending limit?
- 14 Is there any documentation? Was it
- 15 just a -- you know, a conversation in the hallway? How
- 16 -- how did you know to go away from that policy that
- 17 they had a vote on?
- 18 A. Well, as I said earlier, there was an
- 19 explicit memorandum regarding all technology matters
- 20 that preceded me and that I continued to function
- 21 under. When it came to the construction, it was just
- 22 the practice of the Court.
- 23 Nobody had ever questioned the
- 24 individual invoices being over \$20,000 to get a project

Page 1333

- 1 done, when knowing full well they had to get invoices
- 2 over \$20,000 to do this kind of construction.
- 3 So it was not an issue. They approved
- 4 the projects. They were the boss. I followed their
- 5 directive.
- 6 Q. Okay. And -- let's see if I have another
- 7 one. Okay, and you're aware that the proclamation by
- 8 the Governor included matters relating to the removal
- 9 of one or more justices of the Supreme Court, in
- 10 consideration of censure, impeachment, trial,
- 11 conviction and disqualifications, so we're talking
- 12 about all of the justices.
- 13 I was a little troubled that you said
- 14 that you would take some information to the grave as it
- 15 pertained to Justice Walker, that you had some
- 16 knowledge --
- 17 A. No, Justice Workman.
- 18 Q. -- some conversations --
- 19 A. Justice Workman.
- 20 Q. I mean Justice Workman, I'm sorry. I mean,
- 21 you're under subpoena and sworn to testimony. Is --
- 22 can you do that, just say that you're taking something
- 23 to the grave? Or can you elaborate on what you meant
- 24 that you were taking to the grave?

Page 1334

- Because I'm just wondering -- sup --
- 2 Justice Workman had -- you know, her son was in
- 3 trouble, had marijuana charges and DUI arrests a month
- 4 prior to being arrested for an alleged assault, which
- 5 was dismissed, I believe, by the Court.
- 6 Was that -- had something to do with
- 7 that? Was there any conversation --
- 8 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Point of order.
- 9 Q. Was there any conversations or --
- 10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Hold off, let's see
- 11 what the point of order is.
- 12 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: I just want to know
- 13 what the -- the problems that a justice's children have
- 14 gone through have to do with these impeachment
- 15 hearings.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, we'll give the
- 17 -- give the delegate a little bit of latitude. If it
- 18 had to do -- if it involved some sort of use of
- 19 authority or apparent authority, I think it is
- 20 relevant. If it's --
- 21 If it does not, I don't think it is
- 22 relevant.
- 23 So go ahead and finish your question,
- 24 we'll see where it goes.

- 1 BY DELEGATE SOBONYA:
- Q. My question is -- excuse me. I don't -- I
- 3 don't know if you can elaborate on what you plan --
- 4 plan to take to the grave. Did it surround anything of
- 5 Justice Workman's -- maybe making phone calls on behalf
- 6 of her family members when it came to charges? Can you
- 7 elaborate --
- A. It did not have to do with anything that had
- 9 to do with charges of her children. They were
- 10 personal. They had nothing to do with the Court. They
- 11 had nothing to do with my position. They had nothing
- 12 to do with her position.
- They had to do with things that
- 14 sometimes friends lean on other friends for. They had
- 15 -- I was asked earlier if I'd ever done any personal
- 16 favors or had been involved in personal interactions
- 17 with her outside the Court business. Yes, I had.
- 18 Those don't -- it didn't strike me as
- 19 something that is -- is the business of anybody. I
- 20 tend to treat people honorably. Secrets that are
- 21 shared are kept. If there was something that had been
- 22 asked of me that was illegal or something that was
- 23 asked of me that was an abuse of my authority or hers,
- 24 I would be telling you.

Page 1336
I'm very angry with her. I wouldn't

- 2 hesitate to tell you. But they were not those kinds of
- 3 things.
- 4 Q. Okay, I'll move on to another justice,
- 5 Justice Davis.
- 6 As you know, there was an ABC probe
- 7 into the Lear Jet justice and surrounding a certain
- 8 attorney from Mississippi and there was an
- 9 investigation for bundling of -- of donations, and the
- 10 prosecutor in -- in Kanawha County said that it was
- 11 exceeding the five-year statute of limitations.
- 12 Was there any conversations that you
- 13 had had about the court case, the ABC news
- 14 investigation surrounding a certain attorney from
- 15 Mississippi? Have you -- did -- do you recall any
- 16 conversations about that?
- 17 A. When ABC shows up, the nationals show up, of
- 18 course there are conversations about it: "What do they19 want, what's their issue?" When they showed up earlier
- 20 L (2 'l M
- 20 about Spike Maynard, we talked about that. Obviously
- 21 you talk about it.
- 22 I don't have any intimate knowledge of
- 23 the jet.
- 24 The only thing I know about the

s of

Page 1337

- 1 bundling of campaign funds was that that person bundled
- 2 campaign funds for Justice Davis, Candidate Tish Neese
- 3 and Candidate Governor Tomblin, and that's -- that was
- 4 some of the conversation.
- 5 But there was no other -- I mean, I
- 6 didn't have anything to do with any of that. That's
- 7 not -- I didn't do any campaign work.
- 8 Q. I'm just trying to get questions answered.
- 9 A. No. I didn't --
- 10 Q. My last question, in looking at Exhibit 39 --
- 11 it's the rough sketch that was done by Justice Loughry
- 12 apparently --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. -- and in it he says that -- I'm trying to
- 15 see where he's referencing a sofa, and it says, "This
- 16 could be a single chair, a wider chair or even two love
- 17 seats with a couch in the middle, whatever works with
- 18 the space. I just want it to look professional and
- 19 comfortable."
- 20 And then there's another place where he
- 21 says, "Maybe a comfortable chair."
- 22 So if this was the sketch that he had
- 23 presented, who was -- how did the \$32,000 couch come to
- 24 be? Did he go through a catalog? Did he go shopping?
 - Page 1338
- 1 Did somebody present him with this couch and said,
- 2 "Here, can you sign off on this, here are your
- 3 options?"
- 4 I mean, did he just -- from what I can
- 5 gather, he wanted -- very generically wanting to have a
- 6 comfortable chair/couch, whatever, that was
- 7 professional and comfortable.
- 8 How did that selection of the \$32,000
- 9 couch come to be?
- 10 A. I don't know. As I said, the only thing I
- 11 had to do with the couch was telling him that -- about
- 12 the invoice. I have no idea how he reached the
- 13 conclusion he wanted the couch. I don't know if that
- 14 was a discussion with the project manager or if he just
- 15 got the idea himself. I don't know.
- 16 Q. Was there like a designer that worked on the17 project --
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. -- that went to the different justices and
- 20 made suggestions and said, "Well, here's this and
- 21 here's that, can you choose which fabric you like,"
- 22 what --
- 23 A. Well, Silling Associates initially, and then
- 24 when we hired Kim Ellis, we eliminated that part of the

- 1 cost to Silling and it was just she did it as a -- as
 - 2 the project manager and also as a person who'd had
 - 3 years of experience as an interior designer.
 - 4 So it would have been her probably
 - 5 trying to flesh out what he wanted. A good interior
 - 6 designer obviously tries to figure out what the person
 - 7 wants for their interior, and she probably just did her
 - 8 best to figure out what he wanted.
 - 9 Q. Could you repeat who that designer is?
 - A. Who the designer is?
 - 11 Q. Uh-huh.

10

- 12 A. Kim Ellis.
- 13 Q. Okay. And Silling Associates. I'm not sure
- 14 what you wanted me to repeat.
- 15 DELEGATE SOBONYA: That's all I have
- 16 right now. Thank you.
- 17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Harshbarger?
- 18 DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Thank you,
- 19 Mr. Chairman.
- 20 Thank you, Mr. Canterbury, for being
- 21 here today.
- 22 MR. CANTERBURY: Sure.
- 23 EXAMINATION
- 24 BY DELEGATE HARSHBARGER:

Page 1340

- Q. Just -- I'll kind of bounce around in my
- 2 questioning. You'd mentioned a couple of times the
- 3 process, the change orders for the original bid that
- 4 was like \$500,000, I believe.
 - A. Uh-huh.
- 6 Q. We'd heard testimony I think it was last
- 7 week that there were 17 change orders to a purchase 8 order.
- 9 A. Yeah.

14

- 10 Q. What is the process of that? Who eventually
- 11 signs off? Does that -- do all the justices meet and
- 12 sign off, or who actually has the ultimate authority to
- 13 approve that change order?
 - A. Well, the change order process is my
- 15 signature. But my signature didn't happen until they
- 16 had approved that they wanted, for example, the Clerk's
- 17 Office to be redesigned.
- And so once that happened and they made
- 19 it clear that they liked the services of this
- 20 construction company, I signed the change order.
- 21 Q. What was that? I didn't hear that.
- 22 A. I signed the change order. Excuse me.
- 23 Q. Okay. Okay. And then you mentioned Justice
- 24 Workman had preferred a particular designer for

Page 1341

- 1 cabinets and stuff, I believe it was Design by Fisher?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Did that go out to bid, or it was just
- 4 basically their personal preference who to use?
- 5 A. No, the Court didn't have to bid anything, so
- 6 it was her preference; we went there.
- 7 Q. And so you mentioned -- you know, you'd
- 8 inquired about the \$32,000 invoice for the sofa. What
- 9 about other expenses for other justices? You know,
- 10 like there's been a couple pretty expensive rugs that's
- 11 been purchased and --
- 12 A. Right.
- 13 Q. Did you actually see and question those
- 14 invoices?
- 15 A. I did have discussion with Justice Davis
- 16 about the chair and the -- and the rugs, and I had a
- 17 discussion with Justice Workman about the floor.
- 18 Q. And basically what is your discussions?
- 19 What those --
- 20 A. "You sure you still want it? This is pretty
- 21 expensive," and gave them the number.
- 22 Q. Okay. As far as Justice Davis' office,
- 23 there's been some reports of \$498,000 to half a million
- 24 dollars --

Page 1342

- 1 A. Uh-huh.
- 2 Q. -- on her office. Was some of that
- 3 structural, plumbing, HVAC, electrical? Or is that
- 4 basically all cosmetic, furniture?
- 5 A. No, it's almost -- the vast majority of it is
- 6 structural. Her office -- man, when they pulled those
- 7 walls out and started to gut those interiors, it was
- 8 downright scary. The wire still had the original
- 9 paper-covered wiring and the sockets were the
- 10 old-fashioned kind.
- 11 The clay was crumbling, those clay
- 12 tiles had crumbled. They were not -- they were being
- 13 held up by their own weight. There was no structure
- 14 left. Usually you get to a point, you can piggyback on
- 15 -- on more recent wiring.
- 16 That was able to be done in Justice
- 17 Loughry's office because sometime in the previous 20 or
- 18 30 years apparently, they'd pulled reasonably modern
- 19 wire. But none of that could happen in Justice Davis' 20 office.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- 22 A. It all had to be redone.
- 23 Q. As far as those structural, are those
- 24 documented in any type of --

1 A. Sure.

- 2 Q. -- work order?
- 3 A. All of it's documented. First of all, it's
- 4 been publicly documented by Kennie Bass, but it's --
- 5 it's also for your perusal. It's all in specific
- 6 terms.
- 7 Q. Okay, thank you.
- 8 A. Sure.
- DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Thank you,
- 10 Mr. Chairman.
- 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Capito.
- 12 DELEGATE CAPITO: Thank you,
- 13 Mr. Chairman, and thank you, Mr. Canterbury, for being
- 14 here.
- 15 EXAMINATION
- 16 BY DELEGATE CAPITO:
- 17 Q. One -- well, I think, one question here,
- 18 confirmation and then a question. You had said when --
- 19 when you were terminated that you had left the office
- 20 or the conference room and you either -- I don't know
- 21 whether you said it out loud or you simply contemplated
- 22 whether to report this all -- everything you know to
- 23 the press or sail off into the sunset.
- 24 That was your testimony?

- 1 A. Yeah, something -- something along those
- 2 terms, that's true.
- 3 Q. Well, that implies, I think, that there had
- 4 been inappropriate spending and activity going on in
- 5 the past. Would you -- is that an accurate statement?
- 6 A. I -- I -- yes. But you know, in the anger
- 7 and the flush of the moment and all these calls coming
- 8 in from the press about what happened, I can't say that
- 9 I was really focused on any specific wrongdoing or
- 10 overspending or anything except, you know, just general
- 11 anger.
- 12 Q. Understood. Did you ever --
- DELEGATE CAPITO: And this is the last question.
- 15 Q. Did you ever consider in -- throughout any of
- 16 your tenure on the Court and your service, coming
- 17 forward with anything that you thought was
- 18 inappropriate before you were terminated?
- 19 A. I had occasional crises of conscience, but I
- 20 thought that I was doing other things that -- that made
- 21 those mountains not worth dying on, and so I didn't
- 22 pursue them.
- But, you know, there were a lot of
- 24 other things the Court was doing that were very

Page 1345

- 1 important things: Domestic violence, with children and
- 2 divorce, the opiate crisis. I mean, just so many
- 3 things. And I just thought that, you know, you just
- 4 kind of grin and bear some things from bosses that want
- 5 things.
- DELEGATE CAPITO: Thanks, 6
- 7 Mr. Canterbury.
- 8 MR. CANTERBURY: Thank you.
- 9 DELEGATE CAPITO: Thanks, Mr. Chairman.
- 10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Lane.
- 11 DELEGATE LANE: Thank you,
- 12 Mr. Canterbury, for being here.
- 13 **EXAMINATION**
- 14 BY DELEGATE LANE:
- 15 Q. I have a whole lot of questions. Since we
- 16 haven't done the tour yet --
- 17 A. Yes.
- Q. -- could you explain to me and for the 18
- 19 Committee how many floors the Court takes up and what's
- 20 on each floor?
- A. Yeah, essentially two and a half floors. All 21
- 22 of the fourth floor. The side towards the river, the
- 23 southern end of the East Wing is -- on the fourth floor
- 24 is the Office of Counsel where you find the Chief

Page 1346

- Counsel's office. Also some law clerks are there, as
- 2 well as the writ clerks.
- 3 In the center, there's some more law
- 4 clerks.
- 5 Then the law library is to the north
- 6 end. The law library also has a half floor above it,
- 7 and that half floor is found after you go into the
- 8 bowels of the law library.
- 9 There are also some law clerks who have
- 10 offices off to the side of the law library.
- 11 The third floor on the south side are
- 12 the justices' offices. In the center is the courtroom.
- 13 And on the other side of the courtroom is the press
- 14 office and -- or the information office, and the
- 15 security office.
- 16 And then on the -- the north side is
- 17 the office of clerk. And then it extends back -- where
- 18 the law library used to have another half floor, that
- 19 was taken -- excuse me.
- 20 -- that was taken by the Clerk's Office
- 21 as it expanded in that very overwhelming remodeling.
- Then on the first floor, the northern
- 23 part of the first floor is administrative offices.
- 24 That's where my office was, in the back corner, and

1 where employees of the Administrative Office worked.

- 2 Q. Okay, thank you. So just -- is this getting 3 feedback?
- 4 A. Yes, it is. It's gone.
- 5 Q. So the renovations that were done, I think we
- 6 heard that they were like 3 1/2 million dollars, or
- 7 maybe 3.2 million dollars. I'm not sure. That --
- 8 those renovations were on all three floors.
- 9 A. Yes. Very little on the first floor, but
- 10 yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. And I believe that you said that the
- 12 Court is divided into like three departments --
 - That's one way to look at it.
- 14 Q. -- there's the administrative department and
- 15 the Clerk's Office and the counsel's office.
- 16 A. Correct.
- Q. And so I assume the Fiscal Officer then is 17
- 18 under you.
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 Q. And I believe that you testified that you
- 21 reviewed or your deputy would review invoices that
- 22 came in, and you would approve them.
- 23 A. That's right. Well, it was almost all my
- 24 deputy, but some of the larger, more interesting ones

- 1 would come across my desk. And some were sent directly
- 2 to the Fiscal Office. The ones from the justices went
- 3 straight to them; it didn't go through an intermediary.
- Q. Okay. I'm going to jump around a little bit
- 5 too. The invoices to -- or the renovations that were
- 6 done to the individual justices' offices, now, you
- 7 would see those invoices; is that correct?
- A. Not most, I would not. They would just go
- 9 straight to -- through the project manager. Fletch
- 10 Adkins, with whom you've talked, was the first person
- in that position, then later Kim Ellis came in.
- 12 So one or the other would see them.
- 13 make sure that they were right, make sure the work had
- 14 been done, everything was performed according to the
- 15 letter of the invoice, then they would send it straight
- 16 over to the -- to the Fiscal Office.
- 17 Q. Okay. Would -- would the justices have seen
- 18 the invoices for their -- or his or her particular
- 19 office before it went to the Fiscal Officer?
- 20 A. No, they would not. They never saw them. To
- 21 the best of my knowledge. If they did, that was
- 22 between the project managers and them.
- 23 Q. I believe you testified that each of the
- 24 justices were involved in the renovations to his or her

1 office.

- 2 A. Yes. And in that regard, they saw estimates 3 for what things would cost.
- 4 Q. Okay, they would have gotten estimates.
- 5 A. Oh, sure, they got those.
- 6 Q. Okay. Now, in looking at the drawing --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. -- here of Justice Loughry's office, I see
- 9 that there is a refrigerator in the office?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Did all of the justices have refrigerators in
- 12 their offices?
- 13 A. I think they all had those little portable
- 14 refrigerators. Yeah, I think they did.
- 15 Q. Okay. Now --
- 16 A. You know, I don't know about Justice
- 17 Benjamin, but I think he --
- 18 Q. Okay. Now, I may -- I may be mistaken on
- 19 this, but I heard that part of the renovation was
- 20 installing a shower in the Court premises. Is that
- 21 correct?
- A. Well, there was already a shower, but we took
- 23 the shower out when we redid that because that so-
- 24 called bathroom was more than a bathroom. It was also

- Page 1351

 1 documents. But before that, he was also involved in
- 2 sundried other ways. I just mentioned the scanning.
- 3 And it's not a contract; it was a
- 4 number of contracts. And then also he was called as
- 5 needed. So sometimes there were contracts covering his
- 6 work, sometimes not. It's kind of like the difference
- 7 between contracting a plumber to do some sort of
- 8 reconstruction and then calling a plumber to fix
- 9 something that's leaking.
- 10 You don't have a contract for the
- 11 latter, obviously. So he would be called. He did --
- 12 early on when he was still on the active counsel's West
- 13 Virginia bar list, he did some legal -- technical legal
- 14 work for us, because he's a lawyer as well as a tech
- 15 expert. And he went on the inactive list and we never
- 16 used him for legal work, obviously, after that.
- 17 But he did sundry jobs. I mean, he --
- 18 he's really quite an expert in a number of areas. He's
- 19 really quite brilliant. But in the last several years
- 20 and that's what we're talking about, with when he
- 21 left and what he was doing then he was involved in
- 22 scanning.
- 23 He was also involved in the -- the
- 24 creation of the Domestic Violence Register, as I

Page 1350

- 1 the safe room, and it had a lot of special security
- 2 construction involved.
- 3 But in the safe room, they wanted both
- 4 a toilet and a shower. And so that room had just had a
- 5 shower. There was -- it was as a result of one of the
- 6 justices in the 1990s wanting to do exercise mid day
- 7 and then being able to take a shower and go back to
- 8 work, and so there was a shower built then.
- 9 Q. Okay. What floor was -- is the shower on?
- 10 A. It's on the third floor. It's the safe room
- 11 for the justices' courtroom.
- 12 Q. Okay, thank you. Now, you testified that the
- 13 Mark Starcher contract which apparently was
- 14 \$1,000,000 over an 11-year-period you said something
- 15 about that part of that contract was scanning?
- 16 A. Well, the majority was scanning. That's
- 17 his --
- 18 Q. Okay. Was that the scanning --
- 19 A. -- expertise, but not entirely.
- 20 Q. -- of the court records way back from the
- 21 beginning of time?
- 22 A. Well, not with the magistrates. With the
- 23 magistrates, it was -- his -- he didn't actually do the
- 24 scanning. He was the cleanser of the scanned

- 1 recall. I think he was also involved with the mental
- 2 hygiene or the Mental Health Registry to get us
- 3 compliant with the Brady bill.
- 4 And he was involved in a number of
- 5 other projects. He's -- he's really quite a utility
- 6 player. He's very good.
- 7 So over the years, 11 years of work,
- 8 more or less, he -- at least 10 I don't know exactly,
- 9 but 11 -- 10 or 11 his billing added up to about 10 \$1,000,000.
- 11 Q. Okay, thank you. Now, you talked about the
- 12 floor in Justice Workman's office was expensive. What
- 13 kind of a floor is it?
- 14 A. It's wide-planked cherry from Vermont.
- 15 Q. Okay. How much did that cost?
- 16 A. I don't recall.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. I think it was in the \$45,000 range, but I
- 19 can't swear to that.
- 20 Q. I'm sorry, what was the number?
- 21 A. Maybe \$45,000, but I'd have to -- I --
- 22 really, you have the documents, you should look. I
- 23 don't recall specifically. Might have been more. I
- 24 don't know.

Page 1353

- 1 Q. Now, I'm sort of surprised at your testimony
- 2 that said that private spaces such as offices are not
- 3 part of the Capitol Building Commission. Who
- 4 determined that justices' offices are private spaces
- 5 and are not subject to the Building Commission?
- 6 A. Well, I don't know who determined that, but
- 7 that's what was determined. Because I know in the
- 8 Capitol Building Commission, you never got to talk
- 9 about private spaces.
- 10 Q. Well, but nothing in a public building is 11 private. is it?
- 12 A. Well, in the sense that the public can't just
- 13 go marching into the justices' offices or the
- 14 Governor's office or, I suppose, the Attorney General's
- 15 office. You know, I think in that sense, they do have
- 16 some expectation of privacy.
- 17 But I do understand your point,
- 18 Delegate. Everything here is paid for by the public,
- 19 so in that sense, it's all public.
- 20 Q. You -- you may have answered this, but I've
- 21 forgotten what your answer was.
- 22 A. Okay.
- 23 Q. How often did the Court have administrative
- 24 conferences?

Page 1354

- A. Oh, it was up to the chief. Some chiefs had
- 2 them every two or even more months, and then Justice
- 3 Ketchum wanted them every two weeks and everything in
- 4 between.
- 5 Q. Okay. Now, as I understand it, Justice
- 6 Loughry was a law clerk before he became a justice.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And so where was his office when he was a law
- 9 clerk?
- 10 A. He had one of the offices on the fourth floor
- 11 directly -- in the center, directly across from where
- 12 the elevators open up.
- 13 Q. And if you know, what -- while he was a law
- 14 clerk, did he have one of the Cass Gilbert desks?
- 15 A. Yes, he did.
- 16 Q. Okay. Did you see it in his office?
- 17 A. Yes, I did.
- 18 Q. Okay. But you don't recall being in his
- 19 office when it was gone.
- 20 A. I don't recall what? Excuse me?
- 21 Q. Did you ever go in his office, in that
- 22 particular office, after he was elected justice and see
- 23 that the desk was gone?
- A. I don't recall that. I may have, but I don't

- 1 recall.
- Q. In your 11 1/2 years at the Court, it was the traditional practice that a chief justice would be elected every year.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Now, were those elections done in one of the 7 administrative conferences?
- 8 A. The last one of the year preceding --
- 9 calendar year preceding when the new chief would take
- 10 office in January. So it usually happened in late
- 11 November.
- 12 Q. And would you be present at those elections?
- 13 A. Yes

16

- 14 Q. Okay. Now, tell me about the election where
- 15 Chief Justice Loughry was elected for four years.
 - A. I wasn't there for the --
- 17 Q. Oh, you weren't there?
- 18 A. No. I was there when he was selected for the
- 19 one year, because that was in November '16. But he --
- 20 sometime later, they came up with the four years,
- 21 according to reports. But it wasn't four years then;
- 22 it was just one year when I was there.
- 23 Q. Okay. So at the end of 2016 when --
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 1356

- 1 Q. -- you had the normal voting of -- for the
- 2 new chief justice, Justice Loughry was elected for a
- 3 one-year term.
- 4 A. That's right.
- 5 Q. And then at some point in 2017, he was
- 6 elected for a four-year term.
- 7 A. Apparently.

8

11

- Q. Okay. And that was after you were fired.
- 9 A. Long after I was fired.
- 10 Q. I'm sorry, what?
 - A. Long after I was fired sometime.
- 12 Q. Okay. So if it were followed in the normal
- 13 pra -- procedure or process, would there be
- 14 administrative notes on that election?
- 15 A. Yes, if it happened in administrative
- 16 conference, I suppose there'd be minutes that would
- 17 show that whenever it happened in 2017. That would be
- 18 the normal course.
- 19 Lots of things changed after I left,
- 20 though, so I can't say that with certainty.
- 21 Q. Okay. When you were fired, were there other
- 22 employees fired at the same time?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Who -- who else was fired?

Page 1357

- 1 A. They fired the Administrative Counsel, Kirk
- 2 Brandfass, that day.
- 3 Q. Okay. They fired the administrative counsel.
- 4 A. And then later, within the next few months,
- 5 they fired the Director of Mental Hygiene, Linda
- 6 Artimez. They fired the grants expert, the head of
- 7 Court services, Director of Court Services, Angie
- 8 Saunders.
- 9 And there was -- there were a lot of
- 10 people who left after that. Don't know how many were
- 11 fired. I know they eliminated a position, and thus
- 12 Tina Payne, who many of you may know she was our
- 13 legislative liaison her position was eliminated, so
- 14 she was therefore laid off.
- And then the pressures mounted, and my
- 16 understanding was from talking to some of these people
- 17 and hearing about it from others, that others just got
- 18 out of there rather than being fired, because they felt
- 19 that the ax was coming, a lot of people.
- 20 The entire drug court staff, none of
- 21 them are there anymore who were there. They were truly
- 22 grand, experts. And others.
- 23 Q. Okay. Thank you. Now --
- 24 A. They -- he also -- they fired 20 some

Page 1358

- 1 probation officers as well. That was later in the 2 year.
- 3 Q. When -- when a new chief justice is elected,
- 4 they keep their same office, right? They don't --
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. There isn't a chief justice office that
- 7 people move into.
- 8 A. No, they stay in their office.
- 9 Q. Okay, thank you.
- 10 Okay. I know I'm going to be stepping
- 11 outside the bounds probably, but if you know, why did
- 12 Justice Ketchum resign?
- 13 A. I don't know.

14

- DELEGATE LANE: Okay, thank you. I
- 15 don't have any further questions.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Pushkin?
- 17 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you,
- 18 Mr. Chairman. And I thank you for being here,
- 19 Mr. Canterbury.
- 20 EXAMINATION
- 21 BY DELEGATE PUSHKIN:
- 22 Q. Many of the questions I was going to ask have
- 23 already been asked and answered. I'm going to try to
- 24 skip those, if memory serves me wrong -- but because of

1 that, I will be skipping around a little bit, so

2 forgive me for that.

- 3 A. Sure.
- 4 Q. Just to follow up on a couple of questions
- 5 about the Cass Gilbert desk that was in then Law Clerk
- 6 Loughry's office. You said you remember it being on
- 7 the fourth floor when he was a law clerk.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Now, when his -- after he was elected and his
- 10 office was being renovated, where was he working?
- 11 A. While he was -- after he was a justice, he
- 12 took over the office that was vacant in the clerk's --
- 13 excuse me, in the clerk's -- I'm sorry, in the chief
- 14 counsel's suite of offices. I don't know which one,
- 15 but it was just one that was not currently being
- 16 occupied by a writ clerk.
- 17 Q. Okay. Now, was the desk in there?
- 18 A. No, it wouldn't have fit in there.
- 19 Q. It wouldn't have fit in there. So sometime
- 20 between whe -- his election and -- and when he moved
- 21 into his newly-renovated office is when you noticed
- 22 that the Cass Gilbert desk was not there, correct? Or
- 23 you said it wasn't until --
- 24 A. Well -- I never noticed the desk was gone. I

- 1 just assumed -- I guess I just assumed -- I never
- 2 really thought about it, to be perfectly honest.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 A. I just assumed it went to storage, you know,
- 5 like so many things do.
- 6 There is also -- you've heard about two
- 7 warehouse spaces. What you haven't heard is there's
- 8 also a storeroom that the Court has in the basement of
- 9 the Capitol.
- 10 So Cass Gilbert furniture could be
- 11 stored there and not be in violation of the Code that
- 12 says that those pieces can't be out of the Capitol. So
- 13 there's a storeroom. And I just guessed that it went
- 14 to the storeroom.
- 15 The storeroom floods, so everything is
- 16 up on blocks. But they're protected on blocks, at
- 17 least when I was there.
- 18 Q. So an item that was not supposed to be
- 19 removed from the Capitol would -- the -- I guess the
- 20 procedure would be for that to be stored in the
- 21 basement.
- 22 A. That was my procedure, yes. That was what I
- 23 wanted them to do. Now, I didn't do any moving myself.
- 24 So I don't know where they moved it. But that was

Page 1364

Page 1361

- 1 supposed to be what happened.
- 2 Q. Okay. Well, I'm going to skip -- just to try
- 3 to stay on the same subject. When the moving -- well,
- 4 actually, when the -- when the -- we heard testimony
- 5 from some of the Court employees that were at Justice
- 6 Loughry's house moving the -- the couch and the desk to
- 7 the storage area over in -- in Kanawha City.
- 8 And I can't remember which one, but
- 9 during one of their testimonies, they stated that he
- 10 explained to them that you told him he could take it
- 11 home. Now, will you dispute that?
- 12 A. That's just a bare-faced lie.
- 13 Q. Okay. So --
- 14 A. I had no idea he had moved a desk. I had no
- 15 idea there was a desk at his house. I learned in
- 16 November 2017, a day or so before the general public
- 17 learned.
- 18 Q. Okay. Well, that was -- and I don't doubt
- 19 the person who was -- who was also testifying under
- 20 oath who said that that's what Justice Loughry told
- 21 them.
- 22 A. Oh, I have no doubt that that's true.
- 23 Q. So he was not --
- A. Those are honorable people.

- 1 A. Uh-huh.
- 2 Q. They made -- it was very clear from practice
- 3 and procedure that those were just to be paid until the
- 4 project was finished. So obviously when you're doing
- 5 construction, you're gonna get many invoices that are
- 6 over \$20,000, of the kind of construction we were
- 7 doing, and they didn't want to have that pile to have
- 8 to go through and approve and go through and approve.
- 9 They just left that to the project to
- 10 be approved, and that's what I did.11 Q. Okav. But would new furniture be considered
- 12 part of the construction project?
- 3 A. Yes, it would be part of the remodeling, it
- 14 would be under the same thing.
- Now, perhaps hindsight being what it
- 16 is, that was not a good idea, but that was my
- 17 understanding. That was the procedure that had
- 18 happened for years before Loughry, so it continued
- 19 after Loughry -- well, during Loughry and then
- 20 afterwards with Davis.
- 21 Q. Okay. And you stated before that it was the
- 22 project manager that -- that was working closer on the
- 23 -- ordering the furniture, and the floor for then Chief
- 24 Justice Loughry's office.

Page 1362

- Now, have you read the -- I believe
 - 2 Exhibit 36, which is the Affidavit from Kimberly Ellis?
 - 3 Are you --
 - 4 A. Well, I haven't read it, but I heard it read
 - 5 when I watched this proceed -- these proceedings live
 - 6 streamed.
 - 7 Q. You heard it read?
 - 8 A. Yes.
 - 9 Q. Did you find anything -- do you recall
 - 10 anything in that not being factual, to your knowledge?
 - 11 A. No, it was absolutely factual. Everything I
 - 12 heard was right, direct and true.
 - 13 Q. Okay. Because we -- we also -- I believe
 - 14 that same day, we heard a recording from then Chief
 - 15 Justice Loughry testifying -- or giving a budget
 - 16 presentation in front of the House Finance Committee,
 - 17 and I believe at one point, he said -- he stated, "A
 - 18 lot of you" and I'm paraphrasing, I don't have it in
 - 19 front of me "A lot of you have known me for decades,"
 - 20 or for "two decades. I would never approve of that

 - 21 spending."
 - 22 So would you find that to be less than
 - 23 factual?
 - A. Yes, I find it to be less than factual.

Q. He was not telling them the truth if that was

2 the -- if that's what he told them, correct?

- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. All right.
- 5 A. Yes, I want to clarify. I am not calling the
- 6 security person you're talking to -- about, a liar
- 7 here.8 Q. Ok
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. I'm saying that Justice Loughry lied to him
- 10 about something that I allegedly told him. I never
- 11 did.
- 12 Q. Okay, thank you. Did you state earlier that
- 13 your spending limit that you were allowed to spend on
- 14 remodeling or on -- or on office furniture was up to 15 \$20,000?
- 16 A. No. I said that invoices that would come in
- 17 that were not already preapproved by the Court would
- 18 have to go to the Court for approval if it was over
- 19 \$20,000.
- 20 Actually, it just went to the Chief
- 21 Justice if it was up to \$25,000, but then anything over
- 22 \$25,000 had to go to the Court.
- 23 But if they had approved -- if they had
- 24 approved a project like a construction project --

Page 1368

Page 1365

- 1 Q. He did approve of the spending.
- 2 A. He -- well, at least the \$32,000, he did.
- 3 And he knew what the renovation costs were, and he did
- 4 not say, "Don't do it." And I think there are e-mails
- 5 to him that are in evidence. He knew.
- He was very involved with everything.
- 7 And those throw pillows, those \$1700 throw pillows, I
- 8 mean, that was just back and forth forever. I did get
- copied on those e-mails, I think, at least -- or the
- project manager, in frustration, showed them to me I
- don't know which but I saw them. And they --
- 12 You know, he was very involved in all
- 13 of this.
- Q. Okay. So -- and I'm asking because he was 14
- 15 under oath at the time when he -- when he was giving
- 16 that pres -- budget presentation and answering
- questions of the Committee, and I believe it was during
- 18 the question-and-answer part when he said that he had
- 19 no -- he didn't approve of -- he didn't -- he would
- 20 never approve of that.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Now, you said the -- the frus -- you just
- 23 mentioned the frustration of the -- of the project
- 24 manager. Did she ever speak with you about having any

- 1 A. Right. I -- in the 1990s, they slapped some
- 2 paneling up and put some shelves in that were not very
- 3 stable. I think the carpeting had been changed several
- 4 times. They kept going with this red carpet, and they
- 5 kept changing it.
- 6 But other than that, I don't -- there'd
- 7 never been any in-the-wall sorts of -- of remodeling,
- 8 to the best of our knowledge. And then from the
- evidence when they ripped the walls out.
- 10 Q. Was that the only justice's office that had
- 11 -- had been that long -- I mean, since this last round
- 12 of renovations?
 - A. No, there was one other: Justice Benjamin's.
- 14 And his was the first that was done, because there was
- 15 a telltale odor of electrical wires burning and
- 16 something had to be done.
- 17 Q. Okay. So that was renovated while he was --
- 18 A. Yeah, sure, while he was there. The --
 - Q. And that --

19

- A. None of the duty (Phonetic) stuff was done 20
- 21 and then -- I've read that then Justice Walker
- 22 redecorated at some 130 some thousand.
- 23 Q. And that was after it had been renovated
- 24 while Just -- that's the same -- same office --

A. Same office. She took his office.

2 Q. -- Justice Walker's then. So how long had it

3 been since it had been renovated, since she had it --

- A. Four years or so. Not long. 4
- 5 Q. Four years?
- A. Uh-huh. There was -- there were architects 6
- 7 -- there was an architect involved with each of the
- 8 justices' remodelings because there were structural
- 9 issues, and you better have an architect who has a bond
- 10 in case something goes very wrong.

And so they were directing and making

- 12 sure that this was done to the letter. My
- 13 understanding is there was no architect for Justice
- 14 Walker's renovation because there was no need for any
- 15 of that. It was already done.
- Q. So you're saying that -- I asked you before 16
- 17 about the percentage in -- for Justice Davis' office
- 18 that was structural. You said about 75/three-fourths.
- 19 So you're saying that the percentage that would have
- 20 been structural in the renovations in Justice Walker's
- 21 office would be -- be zero?
- 22 A. Well, I would say so. But again, that
- 23 happened after my -- I wasn't around for hers. I just
- 24 know what I read. I was fairly keenly interested

1 misgivings about the amount of money that was being 2 spent on his furniture?

- A. No, I don't recall that, except for the throw
- 4 pillows. That was just -- that was difficult. But I
- 5 don't recall her saying anything else about that. I
- 6 think we all knew the -- that the power came from the
- 7 justices and you don't question what they do. They're
- 8 in charge.
- Q. Okay. You mentioned earlier that Justice
- 10 Davis' office, that a lot of that was -- a lot of the
- 11 renovations were structural renovations as opposed to
- 12 like aesthetic renovations. What -- could you give --
- 13 what percentage do you think of her office renovations
- 14 were structural?
- 15 A. Oh. three-fourths.
- 16 Q. Three-fourths of it was structural?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. Now, and her office had --
- A. And you have to keep in mind, one -- well, 19
- 20 never mind. I don't want to -- sorry.
- 21 Q. And you stated her office hadn't been
- 22 renovated in -- during your tenure here, and not to
- 23 your recollection, hadn't been renovated in quite some
- 24 time?

4

- 1 because I thought that it seemed premature to be doing
- 2 the kind of redecorating she was doing. So --
- 3 But they didn't have an architect hired
- 4 for that, so I think that tells a lot right there.
- Q. Okay. The Supreme Court also has -- or the
- 6 Court has offices over in Kanawha City --
 - A. Yes.

7

- 8 Q. -- at City Center East.
- 9 A. City Center East.
- 10 Q. Now, they recently had remodeling or
- 11 redecorating, or under your tenure, was there --
- 12 A. Every floor.
- 13 Q. Every floor?
- 14 A. No, we took -- of the several floors that the
- 15 Court's on. We did that over a several-year period.
- 16 The Court had employees in six different offices -- six
- 17 different buildings scattered all over the place.
- And there was also the server for the
- 19 Court's computer system, was in yet another facility.
- 20 So there were seven facilities.
- 21 Some of those facilities -- well, one
- 22 of them was referred to as "the crack house" because of
- 23 the neighborhood it was in. They weren't good. And --
- 24 and so we decided we also needed security -- I learned
 - Page 1370
- 1 that City Center East was not 100 percent available,
- 2 but a lot of the floors were available.
- 3 I negotiated the best rent I could for
- 4 a long period of time, knowing that we have one-year
- 5 renewals, of course, but a long period of time rent,
- 6 knowing that we would have to do the buildouts on each7 floor.
- *i* 11001.
- 8 We did. And as a result, we combined
- 9 all of those people into one building, and we also did
- 10 some strategic things to cut costs in other ways that I
- 11 can get into if anybody wants to know.
- 12 Q. Okay. So you -- you oversaw that project
- 13 over at City Center East?
- 14 A. Generally, yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. And when -- when looking for a vendor,
- 16 say, for furn -- new office furnishings, could you tell
- 17 -- what kind of market research goes into that to see
- 18 whether or not -- you said you did it at the greatest
- 19 expense you could do over there {sic}. Can you --
- 20 I mean, can you tell us a little bit
- 21 about the market research that you would do in deciding
- 22 on to purchase the furniture from?
- 23 A. Well, I don't know if there was any market
- 24 research, per se. I think that the project manager

Page 1371

1 would try to figure out what should go in the offices,

- 2 talking with the employees and knowing what kind of
- 2 taking with the employees and knowing what kind to
- 3 work they were doing.
 - For example, there are a lot of books
- 5 that are put together, these big notebooks, and so one
- 6 thing that they wanted was a stand-up counter that was
- 7 high enough to be able to do stuff with a copier right
- 8 behind it. That's the kind of discussion she would
- 9 have with them.
- 10 And then she would try to find what was
- 11 available for the least amount of money not the most,
- 12 but the least amount of money for those offices to
- 13 meet their -- their -- their needs.
- 14 One bit of research we did and I
- 15 don't want to get too deeply into this, because I know
- 16 that this could get too far afield but we actually
- 17 looked into the Biederman theories of retention of
- 18 millennials by their -- by the spaces that they're in,
- 19 the architecture, the interior architecture.
- 20 Now, I know -- I'm not going any
- 21 further into that --
- 22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Mr. Canterbury, you
- 23 are getting really far afield now.
- A. But I just want you to know, there was that
 - Page 1372
- 1 kind of market research. That was in response to --
 - Q. I just have to ask then: Did it work? Did
- 3 you retain millennials in these offices?
- 4 A. Not after Justice Loughry came.
- 5 Q. I'm going to go on to something else. Let's
- 6 see. Yeah, you mentioned earlier about some items that
- 7 were framed, you said at Art Emporium, and you said
- 8 that there should be records of those --
- 9 A. No, no, The Art Store.
- 10 Q. The Art Store.
- 11 A. Different place.
- 12 Q. I'm sorry, I apologize to both businesses.
- 13 A. I think they're competitors. We'd better not
- 14 mess that up.
- 15 Q. Yeah, they're both in the district that I
- 16 represent. So there would be records at The Art Store
- 17 of -- and what were the pictures of that you -- you say
- 18 that there were certain ones that were paid for, of
- 19 course, by the Court, and you never saw those pictures
- 20 anywhere in the Capitol, not in --
- 21 A. Hanging on any of the Court walls or any
- 22 other walls in the Capitol, that's right.
- 23 Q. So I guess we're to assume that -- well, do
- 24 you remember what those pictures were?

Page 1373

7

- A. The two I never saw that I recall was the --1
- 2 the name "Loughry" in a lovely Asian kind of
- 3 watercolor, long, and then there was also the etching
- 4 of the building which was a huge etching, it was very
- 5 large, expensive framing of the place where they got
- 6 married in England.
- 7 I never saw them. I never saw neither
- 8 of those on the walls. Now, perhaps he put them up
- after I was no longer in his office. I don't know.
- But -- after May of '14.
- 11 But before that, I never saw them hung
- 12 in there.
- Q. Okay. I'm going to skip around a little bit. 13
- 14 There were some questions earlier about these -- these
- 15 conferences where circuit judges, I guess, come to,
- 16 they come to Charleston?
- A. Well, they come to -- there are two of them a 17
- 18 year, and roughly once a year, it's in Charleston,
- though it's not exact. Sometimes it will be a couple
- of years before they're in Charleston.
- 21 Q. And is there -- is there usually a reception
- 22 involved --

1

- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. -- at those conferences?

Page 1374

- A. There's usually a Judicial Association
- 2 dinner. I encouraged them to come to Charleston
- 3 because it's so much cheaper when they came to
- 4 Charleston because I didn't have to expense the
- 5 employees to go to Pipestem or Canaan or wherever.
- 6 Q. Now, have there been occasions when these
- 7 receptions were held at local hotels?
- 8 A. Generally that's where they were held.
- 9 Q. Generally the receptions are held -- I
- 10 imagine the Court pays for the -- the renting the room
- at the hotel? 11
- A. Right. Not the hospitality suite; that's 12
- 13 paid for by association dues. Not the booze; that's
- paid for by the individual judges or, I guess,
- 15 association dues.
- 16 However, the food would be paid for by
- 17 the Court with the banquets, as I recall, and you know,
- any kind of snack things that were -- and all the
- 19 breakfasts for the conference, all the lunches for the
- 20 conferences.
- 21 Q. Okay. So what I'm getting at, if it was held
- 22 at -- the occasions that it was held at Justice Davis'
- 23 house, would have been -- that would have saved money
- 24 because the reception wasn't held at a hotel.

- A. Well, the one year, it didn't save any money.
- 2 But the other several years, it saved the Court a whole
- 3 lot of money because she didn't -- she paid for it
- 4 herself, and -- and that meant none of the judges could
- get a per diem, nor was there any cost for any kind of
- 6 banquet on the part of the Court.
 - So those years, it saved a lot of
- 8 money. One year, she got reimbursed and it was a wash.
- Q. A couple more questions. I'm looking at the
- 10 -- at the diagram here, Exhibit 39. Was this largely
- 11 -- if -- when we go -- if we go look at the -- at the
- 12 justices' offices, is this what we're gonna see? Is
- 13 this largely -- was this largely followed?
- 14 A. You're gonna see a few things differently.
- 15 You're gonna see that the couch does go around, as he
- 16 did -- but it's a sectional that makes -- you know,
- 17 it's kind of a three-sided sectional instead of having
- 18 a break there.
- 19 The main difference is you're gonna see
- 20 that underneath -- where there's all that writing
- underneath where the state is, kind of underneath Wayne
- 22 County, you'll see a table and three chairs that ended
- 23 up -- he wanted that there.
- 24 The standing desk and his desk and the

Page 1376

- 1 couple of chairs, they're all exactly as described. I
- 2 think everything in his secretary's office is pretty
- 3 much as he drew it out.
- Q. The three radiators --
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. I'm seeing at least three. Yeah, three
- 7 radiators, were they in the office already? 8
 - A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. They just had to have special covers.
- 11 Q. They got special covers?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Okav.
- 14 A. To match. I think they were walnut and
- 15 something.
- Q. Okay. You'd mentioned earlier about the -- a 16
- 17 conference that you attended in Asheville, North
- 18 Carolina.
- A. Yes. 19
- 20 Q. It was also attended by Justice Ketchum and
- 21 Justice Loughry?
- 22 A. Right.

23

- Q. Okay. Did -- had -- did you drive there?
- 24 A. I drove. I drove my car.

Page 1377

1 Q. Okay. And how did -- how did Justice Loughry

2 get there?

3 A. He drove his own car.

4 Q. He drove his own car?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. That's what I was clarifying earlier, that

8 was not a rental car situation; it was just his not

9 showing up for the last day.

10 Q. Okay, all right. Okay. I think I just have

11 a couple more questions. You mentioned earlier that

12 close to your last day of work, you said you had a --

13 it was one of your two cross moments that you had with

14 Justice Walker.

15 What was the other cross moment?

16 A. No, I never said I had any cross moments with

17 Walker.

18 Q. Oh, I thought that was --

19 A. Except in -- I had one moment where I lost it

20 a little bit in -- while I was being fired in the

21 administrative -- I'm sorry, in the conference room.

22 She -- I said, "Well, I'll have to be fired because I

23 need to get -- collect unemployment," and she said,

24 "Well, you can collect unemployment even if you are

Page 1378

1 resigning," and I turned to her - and I shouldn't have

2 said this - I said, "Well, when you've been around

3 longer than a couple of days, you'll learn that the

4 Court never allows that."

5 Q. Yeah, and I --

6 A. So that was a bad comment.

7 Q. Yeah, and I --

8 (Overtalk)

9 A. I never had another cross moment --

10 Q. Maybe I misunderstood you. I thought you

11 said that was one of two.

12 A. No. No, that was it. It was one of two in

13 the conference room.

14 Q. Oh, okay.

15 A. In the conference room. The second one was

16 the simulacrum thing with the -- with the Chief

17 Justice.

18 Q. Oh --

19 A. But only one encounter like that with Justice

20 Walker.

21 Q. -- one of the two cross moments --

22 A. Justice Walker and I went out to lunch three

23 times during the transition. I thought we were doing

24 pretty well. And the Thank You card even made me think

1 even better of it.

2 Q. Okay, all right. It was asked before about

3 the calendars that you said that when you left, they

4 were -- to your knowledge, they were still there.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And what you -- what you later learned, that

7 the calendars -- not all of the calendars, but just

8 dating from 2013 until -- until your termination --

A. Right.

10

16

19

Q. Okay. And does that -- was -- was Justice

11 Loughry elected in 20 -- what year was he elected?

12 A. He was sworn in -- he was elected in '12,

13 sworn in in '13.

14 Q. So the calendars that were there while he was

15 there as a justice were missing.

A. Yes.

17 Q. All right.

18 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you very much.

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Zatezalo.

20 DELEGATE ZATEZALO: Thank you,

21 Mr. Chairman, and thank you for being here,

22 Mr. Canterbury.

23 I beg the Committee's indulgence in

24 case I ask a question or two that I -- that has already

1 been asked. I -- like the delegate from the 32nd, I've

Page 1380

2 been trying to cross out the ones, but I'm not sure

3 I've achieved that totally.

4 EXAMINATION

5 BY DELEGATE ZATEZALO:

6 Q. Mr. Canterbury, you mentioned that you did

7 not know that Justice Loughry took the desk; is that

8 correct?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. Okay. Did you get any invoices for moving

11 material to his house?

12 A. I wouldn't have seen those invoices. They

13 would have handled by Fletch Adkins, who appeared here.

14 I would have never seen those invoices. He had

15 authority to approve and for payment any invoices that

16 had to do with moving materials.

17 Q. I see. Thank you. A general question for

18 you.

24

19 A. Yes, sir.

20 Q. Were you ever asked or -- by the justices if

21 something that they were about to do was doable or not

22 doable, or did you ever caution any of the justices

23 that maybe they don't want to do that?

A. I was never asked whether things were doable

Page 1381

1

- 1 or not. They tended to decide on their own whether
- 2 they wanted to do things or not. However, I would
- 3 occasionally say that I thought it was a bad idea what
- 4 they were doing, especially in administrative
- 5 conference, I would feel free to disagree.
- 6 That probably wasn't good for my
- 7 health, but I did it. I -- for example, we've talked
- 8 about the per curiam clerks. I thought that was a very
- 9 bad idea, to eliminate that distinction, and I told
- 10 them why, and they disagreed. At least the majority11 did.
- 12 Q. Thank you. Another question. Did you -- you 13 had been there since around 2007, if understand the 14 math correctly.
- 15 A. 2005, yes.
- 16 Q. 2005, okay, so it's over -- okay. You
- 17 witnessed all the latest round of renovations of the 3
- 18 1/2 million dollars; is that correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. You at least witnessed them. My
- 21 understanding from your previous testimony is, the
- 22 Court -- the chambers, or the justices' offices, you
- 23 didn't really have that much to do with.
- 24 A. Well, I -- I had to do with making sure it

Page 1382

- 1 was done in a general management sense, but I didn't
- 2 have specific day-to-day involvement in them.
- 3 That was -- I had some involvement;
- 4 some more, some less. It depended on the justice and
- 5 what they might ask me to be involved with.
- 6 And I was at their beck and call; if
- 7 they asked, I tried to respond. Some wanted more; some
- 8 wanted less. But when they'd ask, I would give my
- 9 advice and tell them what I thought, you know.
- And then they would do what they wanted
- 11 to do.
- 12 Q. Okay, very good. Are you aware of -- of
- 13 floor lighting that was done for Justice Davis' office,
- 14 for instance?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And when -- when about would that have been
- 17 done?
- 18 A. That was done in 2014 with the rest of her
- 19 renovation. They'd ripped the floor up, and to add
- 20 light into that dark entryway, they put the floor
- 21 lights in.
- 22 Q. And were you aware of large amounts of
- 23 drilling or any of that type of thing that had to go
- 24 with the floor lighting?

- A. Large amounts of what?
- 2 Q. Drilling.
- 3 A. The drilling had already been done, sir.
- 4 They'd already taken all of the floor out. They just
- 5 had to move wire, and -- you know, they were down to
- 6 the concrete. And so they had to dredge for
- 7 information wiring and electrical wiring into the
- 8 concrete to have a flat surface, and then to cover it,
- 9 in the conduit.
- 10 But there would have been some for
- 11 that, yes, sir.
- 12 Q. But it was a rather unusual construction; is
- 13 that correct, or not?
- 14 A. Her -- when you see her office, you're gonna
- 15 realize it's very different than any other offices you
- 16 see. It's very modern.
- 17 Q. Okay. I'm looking forward to it.
- 18 A. And it's a matter of taste, I guess, whether
- 19 you like it or not.
- 20 Q. I wanted to double-check something with you.
- 21 The Court did not have to bid any -- anything for the
- 22 private offices; is that correct?
- 23 A. They didn't have to bid anything for anything
- 24 any project ever if they didn't want to. As I said

- 1 earlier, we did bid some things. For instance, the
- 2 drug testing companies' contracts, I had those bid out
- 3 a couple of times.
- 4 But the Court was not under any
- 5 obligation to follow Purchasing in any way, shape or
- 6 form.
- 7 Q. Okay, thank you.
- 8 A. Still isn't at this point.
- 9 Q. Very good. A couple of -- couple of final
- 10 questions. We were given a first and only appraisal of
- 11 a Cass Gilbert desk as of March of 2018.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. If you're in charge of the -- I find it --
- 14 and I mentioned it previously -- do you think it is
- 15 good practice not to have any appraisals of the
- 16 equipment that the Court holds?
- 17 A. It would probably be a good idea to have that
- 18 done, and I'm disappointed in myself I didn't think to
- 19 do it. But in hindsight, yes, that would be a good 20 idea.
- 21 Q. It's kind of hindsight, so I --
- 22 A. Yes
- 23 Q. -- I mean, I understand. But -- okay, very
- 24 good.

Page 1385

- 1 DELEGATE ZATEZALO: Thank you.
- 2 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Hollen.
- 3 DELEGATE HOLLEN: Thank you,
- 4 Mr. Chairman. Thank you for being here,
- Mr. Canterbury.
- 6 MR. CANTERBURY: Yes.
- 7 **EXAMINATION**
- 8 BY DELEGATE HOLLEN:
- 9 Q. I just wanted to follow up on some questions
- 10 that has been asked, I just wanted to drill down a
- little bit deeper on it, figuratively speaking, on the
- 12 construction.
- 13 Now, you had mentioned that there was
- 14 two offices that hasn't -- that haven't been renovated
- 15 in quite a long time; is that correct?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And those were -- being Justice Benjamin's
- 18 and Justice Davis' offices?
- 19 A. That's correct, yes, sir.
- Q. So both of them were in the same condition at 20
- 21 the time of renovation, before the renovation.
- 22 A. Yes, I'd say more or less that's true. There
- 23 may have been a little bit of difference here and
- 24 there, but -- Justice Benjamin's, for example, still
 - Page 1386
- 1 had exactly the original bathroom, I mean, exactly
- 2 original.
- 3 Justice Davis' sometime in the '70s.
- 4 '80s, it looked like to me, had been gutted and they'd
- 5 put in something else.
- 6 So it's not exact, but when you get
- 7 into the walls, it was pretty exact, as I recall.
- Q. Okay. To follow up on that answer, they're
- 9 pretty exact, but the construction costs were 10 significant difference.
- 11 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. We're talking Justice Benjamin's construction 12
- 13 costs \$230,000, but Justice Davis', \$433,000, a
- 14 difference of \$203,000.
- 15 A. Correct.
- 16 Q. What incorporated that huge difference?
- 17 A. I think the competition of the moment might
- 18 have had a lot to do with it. 2008 was a dreadful
- period for construction; you could get really good
- 20 deals. Otherwise, I can't really tell you.
- 21 Both were done with prevailing wage.
- 22 I'm not sure --
- 23 Q. Would the --
- 24 A. -- what else had been done there.

- Q. Would the special floor lighting as -- as has 1
- 2 been heard that it's considered runway lighting, would
- 3 that add to that significant cost?
- A. It might have added some cost, yes.
- 5 Q. Because as we hear --
- A. It would have added some cost. I shouldn't
- 7 say "might." It would have added some cost.
- 8 Q. But we hear in testimony, you know -- and the
- 9 issue that we hear, is that Justice Loughry's floor
- 10 medallion was \$33,000, and we know that's -- that's
- 11 extravagant, but we never hear of the amount that the
- 12 runway lighting cost.
- 13 A. Well, I don't -- I won't be able to tell you
- 14 that off the top of my head. You'd have to look at the
- 15 documents to see.
- 16 Q. Okay. And now, the change orders --
- A. Yes. 17
- Q. -- those were -- those were no approval 18
- 19 process for the change orders, and some of the change
- 20 orders are probably significant? The cost.
- 21 A. In -- I don't know what your question is,
- 22 sir. I'm sorry.
- 23 Q. Okay. So my question is: If you've got a
- 24 contract for a renovation and, you know, as it's

- 1 probably general knowledge, you know, one way for
- 2 contractors to -- to make money is to do change orders.
- 3 Are you -- do you agree or disagree
- 4 with that terminology?
- A. I would agree that some change orders can be
- 6 profitable for companies; some not so much.
- 7 Q. So my question would be: On change orders
- 8 that were being done in the renovations, was there an
- 9 approval process for the change orders above and beyond
- 10 the contract that was negotiated in the beginning?
- 11 A. The Court wanted to keep with Neighborgall,
- 12 and so we did.
- 13 Q. I'm sorry, I didn't -- I didn't hear that.
- 14 A. The Court wanted to keep with Neighborgall,
- 15 the company, and so we did.
- Q. Okay. And what was the name of that company? 16
- 17 A. Neighborgall.
- 18 Q. Neighborgall. And was there any personal
- 19 relationship with any of the justices with -- with the
- 20 owner of that company?
- 21 A. Not that I'm aware of. I doubt it.
- 22 Q. Okay. Switching gears here, on -- on the
- 23 lunches, the working lunches, I believe you testified
- 24 that that's what they were, working lunches?

Page 1389

- 1 A. They were when they were -- the ones I was
- 2 involved with were working lunches. Either the ones I
- 3 actually ate with them or the ones I witnessed them
- 4 eating, was our administrative conference. I can't
- 5 testify to the others.
- 6 Q. Okay. So those were -- those were purchased
- 7 with a P-card. Is that what your understanding is?
- 8 A. Yes. One of the runners would use his P-card 9 to buy them.
- 10 Q. And P-card policy is -- the policy of
- 11 P-cards, is it permissible for personal expenses to be
- 12 put on P-cards?
- 13 A. I don't think so.
- 14 Q. And would some -- would personal lunches be a 15 violation of a P-card policy?
- 16 A. Well, personal lunches would. I guess the
- 17 fine line here is whether those were personal or
- 18 working lunches. The JIC just said they were working
- 19 lunches. I only know about the ones that I was
- 20 involved with.
- 21 They were certainly -- they were eating
- 22 while we were going through administrative conferences.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. Not all the administrative conferences had

- Page 1390

 1 lunches either. Some did; most didn't.
- 2 Q. Okay, thank you. I just want to follow up
- 3 also on Exhibit No. 38, because I wasn't the creator on
- 4 some of the things.
- 5 A. Okay.
- 6 Q. Give you a second to pull that up.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. On June 14th of 2011, the \$907.50 for
- 9 Kanawha Valley Regional Transportation Authority for
- 10 transporting judges and spouses from the hotel to
- 11 Justice Davis' residence and back, can you explain
- 12 that?
- 13 I'm not sure if I heard your testimony,
- 14 and if -- I apologize if you've already answered that.
- 15 A. No, I don't think that's come up, sir.
- Well, the judges were in a hotel
- 17 downtown, and there's limited parking at her house.
- 18 The previous times, it had just been catch as catch
- 19 can. For a couple of them then, she had paid for the
- 20 buses for, I guess, 2007 and 2006. And so the Court
- 21 paid for those buses.
- 22 It's parallel to when the Court, when
- 23 the judicial conference was in Huntington and there was
- 24 a dinner at what's that called Pioneer Village or

- 1 Frontier Village or whatever that's called out there.
 - 2 Anyway, the buses were used to get them
 - 3 to that, and -- to get to that dinner. That was where
 - 4 they had their judicial dinner. And so it was the same
 - 5 kind of thinking, that they would just be transported
 - 6 as a group.
 - 7 And I think Arthur Angus handled the
 - 8 arrangement of all of that.
 - 9 Q. Did there -- was there an event at Justice

10 Davis' residence for that transportation --

- 11 A. Well, there was dinner -- there was dinner
- 12 just like there was at the village in Huntington and --
- 13 it was just they went to dinner.
- 14 Q. And I'm under the assumption that the dinner
- 15 was covered by the -- because I don't see an expense
- 16 here, so that was covered by Justice Davis?
- 17 A. Yes, the only thing that was paid for that
- 18 year by the Court was the transportation.
- 19 Q. Okay. And then we'll switch gears to October 20 8th of 2013.
- 21 A. Correct.
- 22 Q. You've got, you know, a State total dollars
- 23 spent, \$11,360 --
- 24 A. Correct.

- 1 Q. -- and we have a breakdown here on the right
- 2 side of the expenditures. Approximately -- you -- did
- 3 you attend that?
- 4 A. Yes, I was at all of these dinners, as well
- 5 as the others that the Court -- the Judicial
- 6 Association had.
- 7 Q. Approximately how many people attended that
- 8 specific one in 2013?
- 9 A. Oh, I think there are -- you know -- I mean,
- 10 I'm gonna have to just guess.
- 11 Q. Sure.
- 12 A. I don't know the exact number. But roughly
- 13 seven -- about 80, 85 people. Some just -- some judges
- 14 have their spouses, just as they would do with the
- 15 judicial banquets, they would have their spouses. And
- 16 then there are -- there were 60 some judges in
- 17 attendance and then some spouses, and then there was
- 18 also -- there were also a few senior staff people from
- 19 the office, like yours truly, as well as the clerk of
- 20 the Court and the deputy clerk of the Court, some
- 21 people like that.
- 22 Q. Okay, let's go back, we'll go a little
- 23 deeper. Approximately how many judges from out of town
- 24 or other Court employees from out of town would be

Page 1395 Page 1393 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: We can do that if 1 eligible to file an expense acc -- expense report or a 1 2 travel claim for eating dinner that night? 2 you're --A. Well, all of them except the Charleston-3 MR. CANTERBURY: I'm with you. 3 4 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right, if you're 4 based, Kanawha County-based judges, and none of the Court employees would have been able to file a --5 game. 6 Q. Or their spouses. 6 Delegate Overington. 7 A. Well, the spouses couldn't file --7 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you, 8 Q. Right. 8 Mr. Chairman. 9 A. -- no matter where they're from. 9 Thank you, Mr. Canterbury, for being 10 Q. So my question goes back into your testimony, 10 here. 11 it says because it was cheaper to hold an event for 11 **EXAMINATION** 12 \$11,000 than to -- to turn in expense accounts or to 12 BY DELEGATE OVERINGTON: per diem --Q. Back to the three floors that you operate in 14 A. Uh-huh. 14 the East Wing, you have -- the second floor, I believe, 15 Q. -- for those that's eligible for per diem. 15 is the legislative offices. 16 My question is to you is: How many would have been 16 A. True. 17 eligible for per diem that would exceed \$11,000? 17 Q. So you're on the first floor and then the 18 A. I suppose 50 some, towards 60. Because 18 third and the fourth floor. 19 that's how many judges would have been from out of 19 A. About half of the first floor. You also have Kanawha County there. I don't know how many judges 20 the Treasurer's Office and all of that on the other actually came to the judicial conference that year. 21 side, but yes. 22 But I wasn't comparing it just to the 22 Q. And the basement is separate as well. 23 fact that they would be able to submit their vouchers, 23 A. Yeah. We only have a store -- the -- we --24 you know, for their per diem payment; I was comparing 24 the Court only has a storeroom in the basement. Page 1394 Page 1396 Q. Over the last couple of weeks, there's sort it to the typical cost for a banquet. 2 of been uncertainty about the change of command at the 2 The typical banquets included the 3 spouses and people who were local as well as people 3 Supreme Court. There are some decisions that you made; 4 there are some decisions that the Chief Justice made: from out of town. 5 and then there were other decisions that three of the Q. Oh, okay, thank you. 6 five justices made together. A. Yes, sir. 7 Was there -- was that pretty clear DELEGATE HOLLEN: Thank you, 8 among the different parties involved, which group made CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Mr. Canterbury, we've 9 the decision or how each decision was made? A. Well, every decision I made would always go 11 back to a decision made by the Court in some general 12 way. 13 So would you like a ten-minute break? The specifics, they had little interest

22

4 5 6 7 8 Mr. Chairman. 9 10 been going about two and a half hours, and the fact 11 that there's only three people left on the front row 12 will be no assurance that we'll be finished soon. 13 14 MR. CANTERBURY: I'm -- I'm at the pleasure of the Chair. If you'd like to have a break, 16 I'm with you. If you --17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: It's not --MR. CANTERBURY: -- want to keep going, 18 19 I'm happy to. 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: If you're comfortable, 21 we'll move on.

23 to anticipate, but I was thinking we could get through

24 round one and then take a break.

MR. CANTERBURY: I was thinking -- not

14 in. They didn't want to be administrators; they wanted 15 to be justices. But -- and the Chief Justice's powers -17 while I was there - had to do with appointments, 18 setting schedules, setting, you know, when the administrative conferences were, as we've discussed. 20 So primarily the power resonated in the majority of the 21 Court, those three that you mentioned. So that's how the pow -- that's where 23 all of the power went back, with those exceptions that 24 I said about the Chief Justice.

Page 1400

Page 1397

Because there's also the clerk that

- 2 does -- he did not work for me. There was a chief
- 3 counsel who did not work for the Administrative Office,
- 4 and they direct -- and they were directly under the
- 5 watch of the -- of either the Chief in some cases,
- 6 though usually under the majority of the -- of the
- 7 Court.
- 8 I don't know if that answered your
- 9 question, but that's --
- 10 Q. For decisions like the renovations --
- 11 A. Decisions like renovations were decisions
- 12 made by the Court, and then the details were left to
- 13 others.
- 14 Q. What -- you had mentioned that the -- for a
- 15 lot of the renovations, they were major projects so
- 16 that they were exempt from the \$20,000 approval
- process. What -- what was the understanding about what
- decisions had to be made separately that were over the
- 19 \$20,000 --
- 20 I mean, for example, obviously if
- 21 you're renovating the building, taking it down to the
- concrete walls, that's gonna be -- that's gonna be way
- 23 beyond the \$20,000.
- 24 A. Right.

Page 1398

- Q. Was there a clear understanding about what
- 2 decisions were that had the \$20,000 limit, like
- 3 furniture, office equipment, that type of thing?
- 4 A. Well, everything that you mentioned came
- 5 under the -- under the direction of their decision to
- 6 have the renovations, and so the individual bills would
- 7 have been paid as a result of their own -- their own
- 8 direction, but not individually. Because they didn't
- 9 want to be bothered with the individual invoices.
- 10 When you're doing construction at the
- 11 level that we were doing construction, there were a lot
- 12 of invoices over \$20,000. They didn't want a pile of
- 13 those to have to, you know, use up their time to go
- 14 through. They had told me to make it happen; I was to
- 15 make it happen.
- 16 The other part of your question was:
- 17 So then what did come to their attention that was over
- 18 \$20,000. We would get legal bills that would be over
- 19 \$20,000. I would bring it to the Court. They would
- 20 know that the lawyer had been hired, but they wanted to
- see those individual bills, so we would take it to
- 22 them.
- 23 Things that were not previously
- 24 approved by the Court that had resulted in some -- you

- 1 know, previously approved in an umbrella manner that
- 2 would come in would be taken to the Court for approval.
- 3 Or I'd just take it to the Chief.
- 4 Because as I said, the Chief had
- 5 approval power up to \$25,000. So if we got a legal
- 6 bill for \$22,000, I could take it to the Chief and he
- 7 or she could just approve that for payment.
- 8 Q. Would furniture decisions be considered in 9 the \$20,000 or \$25,000 category for higher approval?
- 10 A. They never were. They were always under the
- 11 -- under the watch of remodeling. I mean, remodeling
- 12 involved not only taking out the walls, putting in the
- power, putting in things like plumbing, but it also
- 14 involved carpets, floors, furniture.
- 15 And it never was of issue. Nobody ever
- 16 raised it. They felt that it was going along the way
- 17 they wanted, I guess.
- Q. So for rugs and couches, they would be
- 19 considered within that \$20-25,000 range which would
- 20 need greater approval?
- 21 A. No, they would not. They'd be under the
- 22 general approval of things like the remodeling, which
- 23 would have been things like a bill for -- for wiring
- 24 the -- new wiring in an office or something. It would

1 have been that sort of -- that sort of --

- That was my understanding. And that
- 3 seemed to be their understanding, because we did it for
- 4 years and nobody had any -- a word of protest.
 - Q. Regarding Exhibit 39 --
- A. Yes. 6

5

8

- 7 Q. -- when you look at that chart --
 - DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Maybe staff could
- 9 put it up on the board.
- Q. -- right below -- was that -- who prepared
- 11 that? Who drew it, did the artwork, handwriting, on
- 12 that?
- 13 A. It was Justice Loughry that did the drawing,
- 14 to the best of my knowledge. That's what I was told by
- 15 the -- by the project manager.
- 16 Q. So the -- the --
- 17 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Maybe staff could
- 18 put that up on the --
- Q. So the handwriting would be -- would have 19
- 20 been by --
- 21 A. With the exception of the asterisk section,
- 22 it all looks like Justice Loughry's writing to me.
- 23 Q. The artwork, the drawing of the map of the

24 state, the assumption that would have been as well?

Page 1401

1

- 1 A. Yes, that was what he wanted. He wanted to
- 2 show what he wanted in his office, in general terms.
- 3 Like I said, there were a few things that turned out 4 differently.
- 5 Q. Right -- right below the map in small print 6 --
- 7 A. Uh-huh.
- 8 Q. -- it says, "I am open to suggestions on --
- 9 on this" --
- 10 A. -- "wall."
- 11 Q. Who -- who was that referred to? Was that
- 12 being referred to -- to you?
- 13 A. No, that was --
- 14 Q. He was open to your suggestions --
- 15 A. No, that was --
- 16 Q. -- or who would have been gone to?
- 17 A. The suggestions would have gone to the
- 18 designer, the interior designer who was working for
- 19 Silling. At the time this was drawn, I think -- it was
- 20 around this time that she went to work for the Court.
- 21 So --
- 22 But it would have been to Kim Ellis.
- 23 "I'm open to suggestions on this wall," is what it
- 24 says. And the wall he's referring to is the wall
 - Page 1402
- 1 that's between his space and the space of his
- 2 secretary.
- Q. So that would not have been open to you or to
 the other justices for suggestions. That was to the
 person doing the design work.
- 6 A. Yes. Not me.
- 7 Q. To move on to a different topic, when you
- 8 were escorted out of the building, the -- the security
- 9 that was escorting you out guoted you as saying that --
- 10 in your frustration, that you were going to go to the
- 11 press with this, with what happened, your being
- 12 terminated.
- 13 Do you remember that, saying that?
- 14 A. Well, I think more particularly I said, "I
- 15 don't know whether I'm going to the press or I'm just
- 16 gonna sail off into the sunset."
- 17 Q. Who was that -- what did you mean by that?
- 18 A. Well, the press was calling that day, because
- 19 they had heard that I had been fired. I only contact
- 20 -- I only took the call from -- from Phil Kabler, and I
- 21 figured everybody else could learn it from him.
- 22 I was -- I was angry; I was tired; I
- 23 was moving; I was frustrated --
- 24 Q. Sir --

- A. -- I was going as hard as I could to get
- 2 things out of there because I'd been given until the
- 3 end of the day, which was ungentlemanly.
- 4 But I didn't really have too much
- 5 specifically in mind. Perhaps -- I mean, I was
- 6 mouthing off at that time. But if I had arranged my
- 7 thoughts, I might have had some real thought about what
- 8 I'd tell the press, but I didn't.
- 9 You know, I'm answering under oath. I
- 10 did not have anything in mind except I'm angry.
- 11 Q. So when you directed this to the security,
- 12 you were just expressing frustration and --
 - A. Ticked off.
- 14 Q. -- didn't have specifically how you were
- 15 going to present this to the press or how you might be
- 16 taking it --
- 17 A. Well --
- 18 Q. -- to them.
- 19 A. I was thinking specifically at the moment, I
- 20 think, about just what I was going to say to the press
- 21 about having been fired and -- and fired in the manner
- 22 I was.
- 23 Because that was the issue of the
- 24 moment. I had not collected my thoughts about anything

Page 1404

- 1 else that would ultimately come to pass here.
- 2 Q. I think earlier, you were -- you were guoted
- 3 as saying that you were going to go after the three
- 4 that had voted to fire you.
- 5 A. Now, that's not true. I never said that.
- 6 Q. That you were going to get them or that -- do
- 7 you -- so you didn't say that to them collectively
- 8 then --

9

- A. No.
- 10 Q. -- or --
- 11 A. No. As I left the room, the only thing I
- 12 said was the simulacrum comment. I didn't -- I didn't
- 13 turn to them and say what, I guess, Justice Loughry
- 14 said was something like "I shall destroy you." He
- 15 actually said "I will destroy you."
- 16 I think I would have -- if I'd have
- 17 said that, I would have used proper grammar. But
- 18 anyway, the point is, I -- I didn't say it.
- 19 I didn't turn to them and say it. It
- 20 wasn't said. And I don't know where he dug that up or
- 21 what he's thinking about.
- 22 Q. So you didn't say that either collectively to
- 23 them --
- 24 A. No.

Page 1405

- Q. -- or individually at any time to them. 1
- 2 A. No, no. Even in my anger, I don't think I
- 3 said anything about destroying anybody.
- Q. The last question I have is: Did the 4
- 5 justices -- you had mentioned the missing calendars 6 after 2013.
- A. Uh-huh. 7
- 8 Q. Did the justices or others have access to 9 your office or other offices?
- 10 A. Well, they weren't kept in my office. I'm
- 11 not even sure where they were kept in Joan Mullins'
- 12 office. She was my executive assistant whose office
- 13 adjoined mine. They were in one of those drawers, but
- 14 I don't even know where, because --
- 15 I never handled those calendars. Those
- 16 were her responsibility.
- Having worked at the Regional Jail 17
- 18 Authority, I realized the value of administrative
- calendars to be referenced for history, lawsuits, all
- 20 kinds of reasons you have the official calendar.
- 21 Those were the official calendars, and
- 22 she was very conscientious about making sure everything
- 23 was on it.
- 24 Now, I don't know - because it would be

Page 1406

- 1 proving a negative if those six trips were actually
- 2 listed on those calendars. I suspect they would have
- 3 been. But we'll never know unless the calendars show
- 4 up; then I guess we will.
- 5 But I have no idea where they are; I
- 6 have no idea where she kept them; and I have no idea if
- 7 after I left, others would have had access to be able
- 8 to take them.
- 9 Because I was gone, so I wouldn't have
- 10 known.
- 11 Q. Do you know if other copies were kept of
- 12 those calendars or --
- A. I don't think so. 13
- 14 Q. -- of those years?
- A. I don't think there were any other copies. I
- 16 think it was just the copy of the calendar. They were
- paper. There was some discussion about whether they
- 18 were paper or electronic. They were just big paper
- 19 planner kind of calendars, and you know, with a vinyl
- 20 binder and a spiral kind of arrangement.
- 21 Q. So in other words, helping to coordinate the
- 22 activities and who was going where and what --
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. -- vehicles --

1 A. Right.

4

- 2 Q. -- or security was needed.
- 3 A. Right.
 - Q. Those types of things.
- A. Especially the vehicles. When I wanted a
- 6 vehicle, I would just tell Joan I needed a vehicle,
- 7 "Call Arthur and see if it's available." There were
- 8 two sets of keys kept, actually, in her office, but I
- 9 knew where those were.
- 10 And like I said, sometimes it was so
- 11 spur of the moment that I was needed someplace that I
- 12 would just grab them. As often as not, I would just
- 13 take my own car. But you know, sometimes I'd take the
- 14 State car.
- 15 If it was available, I would. If it
- 16 wasn't available, I wouldn't think about just taking
- 17 mine. And that's how that worked. But -- but she
- 18 would then keep track of what was going on on the
- 19 calendars.
- 20 Q. Who else had access to her office and those 21 records?
- 22 A. While I was there, it would have been Mary
- 23 Greene. I think she generally locked her desk. I
- 24 don't know if she locked the other file cabinets or --

Page 1408 1 or other case goods. But like I said, I don't even

- 2 know where she kept the calendars.
- 3 I know that a couple of times, I needed
- 4 her to get a calendar out so we could figure out what
- 5 had happened on a certain day, and she'd Johnny on
- 6 the spot have the calendar, have the date and we'd
- 7 figure it out.
- But I have no idea where she took them
- 9 after she left my office.
- 10 Q. Do you -- did the justices have access to her 11 office?
- A. Well, her office itself wasn't locked; it's 12
- 13 just that her desk was locked. And I don't know if the
- 14 drawer where she kept the calendars was locked or not.
- But yeah, anybody who had access to the 15
- 16 Administrative Office would have been able to go in her
- 17 office.
- 18 So it's a mystery where they went. I
- 19 have no idea. The thing that I find especially
- 20 interesting is that only '13 through '18 -- through '16 21 is missing.
- 22 2005-2012, they're still available,
- 23 according to what I read in the Auditor's report.
- Q. And lastly, you had made the statement that 24

Page 1409

1 you felt Justice Allen Loughry was dishonest.

2 A. Yes.

Q. Would you want to expand on that or clarify 3 4 it or explain it?

A. When I presented him with the situation as a 5 6 law clerk, when he was harassing an employee, he was, I 7 thought, dishonest. I think he was dishonest in some 8 other specific points of discussion.

9 I don't think he told the truth about 10 my having said that he was young and would learn more about drug courts. I know I never said that. Maybe somebody told him that. I don't know. But it wasn't 13 the truth.

14 He seemed frequently to be dissembling 15 in subtle ways. He also presented two very different 16 sides of himself. If a person in the public would say, 17 "Justice Loughry," he would always say, "Now, just call

18 me Allen, I'm just regular Allen." 19 But he called down a few people who'd 20 worked with him for years when they said "Allen" - who 21 were at the Court - and said, "From now on, you'd 22 better call me 'Justice Loughry,' and you better never 23 forget it." I found that to be a sort of dishonesty. 24 I thought his character was -- was --

Page 1410

1 well, just not suitable for the bench.

That's my opinion. I was asked. 2

3 Q. Thank you.

4 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you,

5 Mr. Chairman.

6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Foster.

7 DELEGATE FOSTER: Thank you.

8 **EXAMINATION**

9 BY DELEGATE FOSTER:

Q. The first question I have for you is: We --10 11 we've talked a lot here today about the original 12 contract of the construction. Whenever you did that, 13 first it was done by Neighborgall, and then the project

14 manager, you said, went to a different company?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And my question there is: When you all 17 switched to this other company, it was originally bid 18 out by -- or originally done by contract -- even you

19 didn't have to, it was bid out, received a contract --

20 A. Right.

21 Q. -- and then the remainder of the project, the

22 different floors and offices and everything, was done 23 by change order.

24

A. That's --

1 Q. How's that work whenever it's a change

2 order --

A. No. 3

4 Q. -- to a separate company or --

5 A. Well, I misspoke. I understand where you're 6 going. When it went to -- I wish I could remember the

7 name of that company. I just don't remember. I'm

8 wanting to say Gander Brothers, but that's not right.

9 But when it went to that company, that 10 was just a new contract; it was not a change order.

Q. All right. So there was a new contract. 11

12 A. Right, for them, right.

13 Q. And when these were done, obviously when they

14 dug into the walls and stuff, they weren't gonna know

15 what was in there, so they couldn't have -- I mean,

16 would they have been able -- they wouldn't have given

17 you a budget number of "Here's how much it's gonna

18 cost" --

19 They would have -- was it done by a 20 time and like a materials and man hour bid whenever

21 they came to you and said, "Here, here's how much" --

22 A. Well, they didn't --

23 Q. -- "the materials and man hours" and then it 24 was approved after they were done with the project?

A. Well, the -- the one that wasn't Neighborgall

2 was not bid, so there was nothing that had to do with

3 that. They simply billed for service as they got into

4 the digging of the walls, etc.

5 Q. So it was man hours and materials.

6 A. Yes. It was -- as I said, I think, earlier -

7 if I didn't say this, I should have - it was all

8 prevailing wage. The law hadn't changed yet about

9 that. And -- and it was -- yes, I guess it was man

10 hours/materials and then there was also the architect's

11 services.

12 Q. All right. So all of that would have been --

13 basically you see -- you see the price after it's done

14 and then pay it, pretty much how it would work.

15 In installments, correct.

16 Q. Okay. And then the -- we -- we talked

17 earlier a little bit about Justice Workman, and there

18 were some hire requests.

A. Uh-huh. 19

20 Q. And my question on those: Were all of those

21 done to you in person or were any of those by e-mail?

22 A. No, they were conversations. There was 23 nothing in e-mail.

Q. So it was all in --24

Page 1413

- A. That I recall. I recall the conversations.
- 2 I don't recall any e-mail follow-ups. I may have
- 3 e-mailed her back about some details of it, but the
- 4 initial conversations were in conversations with her
- 5 either live or on the telephone.
- Q. And then whenever the -- and as you discussed
- 7 in your memo and everything, the \$29,000,000 being
- 8 spent down over those years, and the discussion was
- 9 that all the justices agreed that it should be taken
- 10 down from that -- that amount.
- 11 I'm trying to get the five justices
- 12 that would have been on the Court in 2011. Was it
- 13 Workman, Davis, Benjamin, Ketchum and -- who would have
- 14 been the fifth one?
- 15 A. You asked me too fast. It's Workman,
- 16 Ketchum, Davis, Benjamin and McHugh.
- Q. McHugh. Okay. And one other thing and 17
- 18 it's in the audit report, the second one on page 5 -
- 19 and we went over -- I'll let you get there first.
- 20 A. The second audit report. Sorry.
- 21 Q. It's the second audit report on page 5.
- 22 A. Okav.
- 23 Q. And what that is the rental car usage --
- 24 A. Uh-huh.

Page 1414

- 1 Q. -- for -- for yourself?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And I just had a few questions on it. First
- 4 of all, if you go down through, the round trip mileage
- 5 airport to hotel, and my --
- 6 A. Right.
- Q. My understanding is how the Auditor separated 7
- 8 this out is, hey, well, this is how far he had to get
- 9 -- drive to get to the conference and back to the 10 hotel.
- 11 A. Right.
- Q. And they subtracted that out and the 12
- 13 difference of mileage.
- 14 A. Uh-huh.
- 15 Q. Because they were -- they were making the
- 16 assumption that anything other than that was additional
- extra mileage. But on some of them, like for example,
- 18 down in November 28th to December 3rd, Palm Springs,
- 19 California --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. -- why is the round trip mileage from the
- 22 airport 481 miles?
- 23 A. It wasn't. It wasn't 481 miles. You know,
- 24 when the conference was over, I'd go for drives in the

1 desert or whatever. The fact is that it was not

2 charged by the mile; it was charged by the day, at

3 unlimited mileage.

4 And also, any further days that were

5 not conference days, I paid for myself. I prorated all

6 of those days.

7 And their point is to say -- I think

8 they feel there should be a change of policy. But I

9 think that their point is that clearly I was using the

10 car for other than just going to the conference and

going back to the airport. Sure, I was. But at no

12 extra cost to the State.

And I never billed the gas to the State 14 either. That was out of my pocket. So the -- the

15 prorating -- there were two mistakes made in the

16 prorating where -- I heard about in the spring of this

17 year, and I instantly wrote the check for \$911 and some

18 cents, when --

19 I will also freely admit that I had my

20 Executive Assistant, Mary Greene, take care of the 21 expenses. And when she did the prorating, she failed

22 to keep in mind that the weekend days cost more than

23 the weekday rates, so I hadn't reimbursed enough.

And also then, my bad was that when I

11

24

Page 1416 1 would go to the airport and leave my car, I just turned

2 that in for reimbursement, the cost of the parking.

3 And in fact, I should have prorated out the couple of

4 days that weren't on the Court. 5 They found that in the audit. I wrote

6 the \$911.00 check. But I -- in fact, a lot of these 7 were far more expensive than on this that the State

8 paid, because I paid the rest. There was no -- there

9 was nothing improper in this. There was nothing that

10 wasn't by the book.

If there is a change of policy, well,

12 that is prospective, not retrospective. And so I -- I

13 don't know what else I can say except I did my best to

14 make sure that I separated out the personal use from

15 the -- from the appropriate State-reimbursement use.

16 That was it.

17 Q. So part of my question is, on the -- that 18 round trip -- so are you saying that those -- there's

19 like 244, 481, 120 miles, 212, and it's like that round

20 trip just seems like a -- it seems like the airport

21 would be a whole lot closer to the conference.

- 22 A. Well, in one --
- 23 Q. Is that --
- 24 A. In only one case was the airport a long way

Page 1417

- 1 off from the conference. It -- I got off the plane in
- 2 Denver rather than the plane from Denver to Vail. But
- 3 in fact, I did a lot of other driving through the
- 4 mountains when we had free time, when there was no more
- 5 conference going on.
- 6 But my participation at the conferences
- 7 is legend. I participate in every moment. In fact,
- 8 went up the ranks within the National Center for State
- 9 Courts, which was why I was the president-elect. I was 10 very involved.
- 11 But when it was over, you did what you
- 12 want. And I would take the car then -- because it was
- 13 no more cost to the State at all. Just keep in mind,
- 14 there was no extra mileage cost. It was unlimited
- 15 miles. The cost was per day, not per mile.
- 16 Q. Yeah, and I understand that part.
- 17 A. Good. Thanks.
- 18 Q. But my question's on -- and it seems that
- 19 these would make a little bit more sense to me if -- so
- 20 after -- like, for example, the dates -- I believe the
- 21 dates of the conference, from July 23rd -- the very
- 22 first one there, for example, July 23rd through July
- 23 27th --
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 1418

- Q. -- it says that there's 1922 miles? That
- 2 seems extreme. Is that to say that those 1922 miles,
- 3 you rented the car --
- 4 A. That was --
- 5 Q. -- further afterwards --
- 6 A. Right.
- 7 Q. -- and you paid for that yourself?
- 8 A. Right, I paid --
- 9 Q. And then those miles were accrued on those
- 10 days?
- 11 A. I paid for the days; I paid for the gas. And
- 12 those were accrued as -- as I went for a drive through
- 13 southern Utah and looped around into Wyoming and -- and
- 14 then came back to Denver. So --
- 15 Q. So 1900 wasn't put on them --
- 16 A. Not in three days. I --
- 17 Q. I mean, it's --
- 18 A. That would have been a heck of a lot of
- 19 driving.
- 20 Q. I mean, it's like six or seven hours a day
- 21 driving.
- 22 A. Yeah, I know. That would have been
- 23 impossible.
- 24 Q. Okay.

- 1 A. It wouldn't have been impossible. It would
- 2 have been impossible for me to go to the conference and
- 3 do those kind of miles. Those are the total miles, I
- 4 guess, is how they did that.
- 5 But the point is that I -- I did do my
- 6 level best to prorate properly and make sure that there
- 7 was no further cost to the State for my personal use.
- 8 They found \$911.00 I missed, and I wrote the check.
- 9 Q. Okay.

10

- DELEGATE FOSTER: All right, thank you.
- 11 MR. CANTERBURY: Thank you.
- 12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Fast.
- 13 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you,
- 14 Mr. Chairman.
- 15 EXAMINATION
- 16 BY DELEGATE FAST:
- 17 Q. Mr. Canterbury, when were you -- you say it
- 18 was 2005 when you first came on to the Court?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And who hired you?
- 21 A. The Court. There were -- it was four votes
- 22 and one not voting.
- 23 Q. And who was the Chief Justice?
- 24 A. Justice Albright.

- 1 Q. You had mentioned early on in your testimony
 - 2 that Justice Davis asked about -- and you used the word
 - 3 "our," "asked about our use of State vehicles," and
 - 4 then you discussed about how you prepared a responsive
 - 5 memorandum, etc.
 - 6 As I look at the exhibits here,
 - 7 Exhibits 4 and 5, those memoranda from Justice Davis
 - 8 only asked about Justice Loughry, not anyone else.
 - 9 So was that a correct phrase that you
 - 10 used or a correct word when you said "She asked about
 - 11 our use of vehicles," or did she ask about Justice
 - 12 Loughry's use of vehicles, or did you have other
 - 13 conversations just with Justice Davis?
 - 14 A. She asked about the -- I'm afraid that
 - 15 sometimes I say something about the Court and I say
 - 16 "our," out of habit. My apologies for that.
 - 17 What I should have said was that she
 - 18 asked initially what the Court policy was and how the
 - 19 Court had used the cars, the State cars, how --
 - 20 employees of the Court. That was the initial question.
 - 21 Q. Well, I see a memorandum to Arthur Angus
 - 22 about Court policies and his response was, "There were
 - 23 no Court policies."
 - 24 A. Right.

Page 1421

- Q. But as far as usage of vehicles, she --1
- 2 according to the Exhibits 4 and 5, these two memoranda
- 3 from Justice Davis directly to you, she seems to hone
- 4 in specifically and exclusively to Justice Loughry.
- 5 A. That's what it says, you're right.
- Q. Okay. So is it -- I don't want to put words
- 7 in your mouth, but was she asking about Justice
- 8 Loughry, or was she asking about all the justices when
- 9 -- when this issue came up and you had to prepare some 10 response?
- 11 A. Initially, she was asking about how the State
- 12 cars were assigned, how they were, you know, scheduled.
- She was asking about the process.
- 14 Arthur Angus responded. Then as she
- 15 looked through that response, of some details -- I
- 16 guess started to look through details of uses of cars.
- She found that there were a number on the part of
- Justice Loughry that were just blanks.
- 19 And there were some blanks in some
- other cases too but there were just so many blanks in 20
- 21 his case, far more than anyone else.
- 22 There were some blanks on my list.
- 23 There were some blanks on -- a couple
- 24 of blanks, on Justice Workman, I guess. Although I
 - Page 1422
- 1 don't think Justice Workman ever drove a State car
- 2 herself. She always had one of the security people
- 3 driving it, and so --
- 4 Just as with Justice Davis. I don't
- 5 think she ever drove a State car herself.
- 6 Q. Okay. Art -- let me -- let me get back to
- 7 this, if I can. Justice -- so the -- so the memoranda
- 8 that she -- she made specific questions about Justice
- 9 Loughry only, and no other justice.
- 10 A. Well, that's what the memorandum of August
- 11 25th is preoccupied with.
- Q. Okay. Now, you had mentioned that Justice 12
- 13 Ketchum had asked to use a vehicle to commute and the
- 14 Court said he could. I think those were your words.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. "The Court said he could." Is there any
- 17 documentation of that? Would that have been at some
- 18 administrative meeting where the Court granted him
- 19 permission?
- 20 A. It was at the end of the administrative
- 21 conference, and I don't think there's a note on there,
- 22 but I could be mistaken. You'd have to look at the
- 23 administrative conference to see if there was an
- 24 addendum. But honestly, I -- I don't think there was.

- 1
 - Q. Was that some special grant of authority that
- 2 -- unique to him?
- A. No one else had ever asked, and they'd never 3
- 4 decided it about anybody else.
- 5 Q. Okay. Who was the chief -- in reference to
- 6 Exhibit 2, there's a memorandum to you from Justice
- 7 Davis again. At that time, in August of 2016, was it
- 8 Justice Ketchum who was Chief Justice?
- 9 A. Yes, he was.
- 10 Q. And on Exhibit 38, if you could look at that,
- 11 that is a memorandum from yourself to all the justices,
- 12 and you provided some detail as to what Delegate
- 13 Foster, I believe, had asked you or one of the
- 14 previous delegates, Delegate Hollen, I think about
- 15 some of the State dollars spent on Justice Davis' meal
- 16 events.
- A. Yes. 17
- Q. Where did you get that detail? 18
- 19 A. From the Finance Office and through,
- 20 specifically, Sue Racer-Troy.
- Q. Okay. And so how was that -- I'm just 21
- 22 curious. How was that recorded, that \$11,360, how was
- 23 that -- did Justice Davis turn that in?
- 24 A. No. They were directly billed to the Court.

- 1 Q. Okay.
 - 2 A. I think that's what happened. I mean, I
 - 3 don't recall exactly, but I believe it was all directly
 - 4 billed to the Court. But again, you'd have to review
 - 5 the documents. Those documents, though, came out of
 - 6 the Fiscal Office.
 - 7 Q. Okay. And was that wrongdoing? The \$11,360
 - 8 expenditure of State dollars, was that wrong?
 - 9 A. I don't think so. Apparently the JIC didn't
 - 10 think so a few other day -- a few days ago. But
 - 11 wrongdoing, I guess that's what your guys -- you guys
 - 12 are deciding.
 - 13 Q. Okay, gotcha on that. The -- you had
 - 14 mentioned that there were some blanks in some of the
 - 15 documents as far as car usage -- and I'm sorry for
 - 16 jumping around here. And you said there were blanks on
 - 17 yours. And I'm looking at -- I think it's Exhibit 7 --
 - 18 actually, 8. Exhibit 8. It's a spreadsheet there.
 - 19 A. Yes.
 - 20 Q. And there's some highlighting, all the
 - 21 blanks. Is that what you were referring to?
 - A. Yeah, the six that I couldn't -- I think
 - 23 there were six that I could never determine where --
 - 24 excuse me, where they went -- where they -- where I

Page 1425

7

10

- 1 took the car.
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 A. So that's when I suggested to the Auditor's
- 4 Office that they might be able to find out if they
- 5 looked at the official calendars, and that's when I
- 6 learned that the calendars weren't there.
- 7 Q. The previous Exhibit 6 -- 7 --
- 8 A. Yes.
- Q. -- and it has its own attachment Exhibit 1. 9
- 10 Now, do you see that attachment to Exhibit 7?
- 11 A. Yes, I see it.
- 12 Q. Okay, the yellow --
- A. Reservation Chart. 13
- 14 Q. The yellow areas, I believe, were corrections
- 15 or additions made after the fact by Justice Davis where
- 16 she filled in a bunch of information that was not
- 17 previously on the record.
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- A. That's after my time, so I don't know. 20
- 21 Q. Assuming that the yellow parts were filled in
- 22 after the fact, after she was questioned about it,
- 23 wouldn't there be a lot of blanks in her record as
- 24 well?

Page 1426

- If one were to look at it before all
- 2 these additions were made, there would be a lot of
- 3 blank spaces in her record as well, correct?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. The 3-2 vote where you came out and made the
- 6 announcement that "Don't ask justices to put a
- 7 destination on their vehicle usage," where did that
- 8 vote take place?
- A. In administrative conference in either late
- 10 August or early September.
- 11 Q. And when was that, what year?
- 12 A. Oh. 2016, I'm sorry.
- 13 Q. Okay. The couch. Not the -- the new couch,
- 14 but the one that was in -- was Justice Albright's couch
- 15 earlier. I assume you knew Justice Albright guite
- 16 well, as -- having worked under him?
- 17 A. I wouldn't say that I knew him well, but I
- 18 knew him professionally.
- Q. Did you know that that was his couch at one 19
- 20 time?
- 21 A. I did not. I thought it was State property.
- 22 Q. Okay. To this day, do you know who owned
- 23 that couch when it left this premises?
- 24 A. Well, I learned later that it was Justice

- 1 Albright's, I guess. But he left -- they left it
- 2 behind. When -- after Justice Albright died, his wife
- 3 and son came to collect his things.
- 4 I met with them for a little while, and
- 5 then I left them in the able hands of Fletch Adkins.
- They never mentioned the couch.
 - Q. Assuming that was Justice Albright's couch
- 8 and the family left it, then -- then it still was not
- 9 State property; it was just left.
 - A. Well, I've sat -- I've heard there's State
- 11 Code that says if things are left behind, it reverts to
- 12 the State. But I'm not a lawyer. You are. You could
- 13 probably find out if that's true or not.
- 14 Q. And do you know, as far as that couch and it
- 15 being moved to Justice Loughry's house, was that a
- 16 violation of any policy?
- 17 A. I -- there was no policy about home office,
- 18 so it couldn't be a violation of a home office policy.
- 19 There was none.
- 20 The taking of a couch could be viewed
- 21 as taking State property if indeed it became State
- 22 property after it reverted from Albright. Because
- 23 after all, it was used by McHugh in McHugh's office for
- 24 years after Albright, so it had been put to State use
- 1 for some time.
- 2 So again, I think that that's a
- 3 guestion you can ask a lawyer, prosecutor, and not me.
- Q. Okay. About home offices, are you con -- are
- 5 you confirming that there was no policy regarding home
- 6 offices?
- 7 A. That's right.
- 8 Q. So computer, one, or another computer, still
- 9 no policy?
- 10 A. That's what I said. The technology got ahead
- 11 of policy.
- 12 Q. The same if they had a printer or not, same
- 13 thing?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. If they had pencils from the Court, pap -- a
- 16 ream of paper from the Court, still no policy? Is that
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. That's right.
- 19 Q. And even if there were items of furniture,
- 20 desks, still no policy.
- 21 A. No policy about an abstract desk. There is
- 22 Code that prevents the Cass Gilbert desk.
- 23 Q. I'm familiar with that Code.
- 24 A. Okay.

Page 1429

- 1 Q. Okay. As far as renovations, you had
- 2 mentioned that Justice Loughry was involved daily and
- 3 that he had issued multiple e-mails. Were any other
- 4 justices involved to the point of sending and receiving
- 5 e-mails as -- just keeping up with what was going on in
- 6 their office renovations?
- 7 A. Yes. But a fraction --
- 8 Q. Who were they, first?
- 9 A. -- a fraction of what he sent.
- 10 Q. Who were they?
- 11 A. Well, Justice Workman was a little more
- 12 involved with hers.
- 13 Justice Benjamin somewhat.
- 14 Justice Ketchum, much less so. He
- 15 pretty much handed it over. He had made his thoughts
- 16 clear and handed it over to the designers.
- 17 Justice Davis, virtually not at all.
- 18 She had some furniture that she wanted in there. She
- 19 just wanted it to be modern and trusted the designers.
- 20 In fact, she was gone for a few months, came back and
- 21 just saw what had been wrought and she seemed to be
- 22 happy.
- 23 Q. So it's a matter of degree.
- 24 A. That's right.

So no, it wasn't like a new justice

- 2 came -- and like I said, Justice McHugh wouldn't --
- 3 abso -- he didn't care. He just inherited the office
- 4 and was happy to do what he did.
- 5 But -- so I guess it's a matter of
- 6 personality and then timing. The timing was such --
- 7 Q. So was it --
- 8 A. -- that we needed to do some structural
- 9 things.
- 10 Q. -- the final product more of the personal
- 11 tastes of the justice?
- 12 A. Yes. All of those offices reflect their
- 13 personal taste.
- 14 Q. Okay. As far as framing, who paid for the
- 15 framing?
- 16 A. The State paid for the framing.
- 17 Q. And you're sure of that.
- 18 A. I'm positive the Court paid for the framing.
- 19 There are invoices that show as much.
- 20 Q. And all of these particular framed items that
- 21 you mentioned, you're positive that each and every one
- 22 was paid for by the State?
- 23 A. The ones I mentioned, they were paid for by
- 24 the State.

Page 1430

- 1 Q. As far as the other justices, were they aware
- 2 of the costs of -- I think maybe you'd mentioned the
- 3 floor -- the floor lighting and -- and some other4 flooring.
- 5 A. They all got copies of the -- the costs of
- 6 the renovation, and then there was some discussions
- 7 about some specific furniture items.
- 8 Q. And you've seen several justices come and go.
- 9 Was it customary for each justice, new justice, to
- 10 renovate their office to some degree?
- 11 A. No, not -- well, it's just a matter of -- of
- 12 the timing as well as the personality. We realized
- 13 there were some really serious structural things that
- 14 needed to be corrected, and then there was -- there
- 15 were some new justices coming along about that time.
- 16 You had Justice Workman coming back;
- 17 you had Justice Ketchum coming along. Justice Benjamin
- 18 had been there for some time and there had been no
- 19 renovation.
- 20 Justice Davis had been there since '96
- 21 and had not spent much of anything at all. I don't
- 22 know. I don't remember. Maybe there had been some
- 23 spending before I got there. After I got there, there
- 24 wasn't anything spent by her.

- 1 Q. Even the one where they got married?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okav.
- 4 A. If it turned out he paid it back, I'm not
- 5 aware of that. But the State paid at least the
- 6 initial --
- 7 Q. Okay.
 - A. -- the initial invoice.
- 9 Q. Did you keep -- have anything to do with the
- 10 individual justices' schedules on noncourt -- or
- 11 out-of-court events?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Okay. So if Justice Workman was gonna go
- 14 speak at a graduation ceremony, that was her deal.
- 15 A. That's right.
- 16 Q. Okay. The same with Justice Davis or Justice
- 17 Loughry or Ketchum. That was their deal. Now, did
- 18 they -- do you know, maybe just from being there. Did
- 19 they often go to multiple events out of the court, like
- 20 civics classes, graduation ceremonies, things of that
- 21 nature, community type events?
- 22 A. Some justices more; some justices less.
- 23 Q. So that was not a --
- 24 A. The most traveling justice was Justice

Page 1433

- 1 Benjamin, who never missed a drug court graduation and
- 2 showed up for all manner of things.
- 3 Other justices were less interested in
- 4 -- in doing the work out in the field, as it was
- 5 called, the rest of the state. It just depended on the
- individual justice's temperament.
- Q. Okay. Now, you had mentioned that -- and I 7
- -- and I want to get as specific as I can.
- 9 -- that Justice Workman had asked you
- 10 to do some personal things, personal tasks. Correct?
- 11 A. Correct.
- Q. Okay. And am I correct that you said some of 12
- 13 these were during work time, normal work time, and some
- 14 were not?
- 15 A. Well, the "ask" sometimes was in the Capitol,
- 16 but the favors were not about doing things on work
- 17 time. They were about things that were on off time,
- just that she might have asked while we were meeting
- about something else, she'd take me to the side and ask
- 20 something.
- 21 Usually they came in forms of phone
- 22 calls at night, often late at night. But one or two
- 23 times, she asked me to do something while she was at
- 24 the Court. But they were not things that I took care

- 1 of at the Court. They were taken care of afterwards.
- Q. Were --2
- A. Although -- although, you know, I mean, I 3
- 4 could have taken a break and done some of that stuff,
- 5 but you know, it's just not how it worked out.
- Q. Were -- so you didn't do any of these favors 6 7 during court time.
- A. During my work time?
- 9 Q. Yeah.
- 10 A. No. But you know, my work time, I worked
- 11 ten-hour days and more --
- Q. But you had established hours, didn't you? 12
- 13 A. No, I did not. I worked all the time. I was
- 14 always available. I was at the court early; I left
- 15 late.
- 16 Q. What were the court hours?
- 17 A. Court hours were -- the 8:00 to --
- 18 8:00 o'clock till 5:00 o'clock, and then some employees
- 19 worked 9:00 to 5:00, some worked 8:00 to 4:00. There
- 20 were a few who had special interest needs, to work 7:00
- 21 to 3:00. We had flex time in summer when people had
- 22 babysitting kind of issues and we'd work out different
- 23 schedules with them.
- 24 But mine were all the time. I mean,

- 1 even my detractors will tell you, I'm a very hard
 - 2 working guy and I worked all the time.
 - Q. So you didn't do any of these favors before 3
 - 4 5:00 p.m. on a work day?
 - 5 A. Not that I recall.
 - Q. Not that you recall. You had mentioned on
 - 7 the travel trip to North Carolina, the conference or
 - 8 whatever, you, Justice Ketchum and Justice Loughry
 - 9 went --
 - 10 A. Yes.
 - 11 Q. -- and you mentioned -- and I noticed this on
 - 12 -- on both times you were asked about that.
 - -- that on that Friday, he was "nowhere
 - 14 to be found." And I believe those are your exact
 - 15 words.
 - 16 A. Yes. I said that.
 - Q. Okay. Now, can you state with certainty 17
 - 18 under oath that he wasn't there, or you just didn't see
 - 19 him?
 - 20 A. I didn't see him.
 - 21 Q. Okay. So he could have been there; you just
 - 22 didn't see him. You're not sure.
 - 23 A. No. I said I didn't see him, and I don't

 - 24 think he could have been there, because it just wasn't
 - 1 that big of a room. There weren't that many people
 - 2 there. But I can only say under the oath -- under oath
 - 3 that I did not see him.
 - Q. Okay. You had mentioned about Justice
 - 5 Workman had asked you to hire a couple -- I think four
 - 6 different people?
 - 7 A. Contract one; hire three. Yes.
 - 8 Q. Pardon me?
 - 9 A. Contract one --
 - 10 Q. -- hire three.
 - A. Yes. 11
 - 12 Q. And when was this that she had asked you to
 - 13 do that?
 - 14 A. After she was elected in 2008.
 - 15 Q. Early on?
 - A. Early on. 16
 - 17 Q. Okay. Were any of these people campaign --
 - 18 if you know, campaign supporters of hers?
 - A. She told me they'd all worked in her campaign
 - 20 in some capacity or another. I think volunteering. I
 - 21 don't think they were paid campaign people.
 - 22 Q. Do you know if any of them contributed money
 - 23 towards her campaign?
 - A. I don't know. 24

Page 1437

- 1 Q. And you had mentioned and again, I don't
- 2 want to put words in your mouth there was a
- 3 receptionist; there was an administrative assistant;
- 4 there was another person, and I think you said that you
- 5 had an extraordinary relationship with?
- 6 A. Yes, that was the Director of Magistrate
- 7 Services, Janie Moore.8 Q. Okay. And what kind of a relationship did
- 9 you have with this person?
- 10 A. Well, as I said, I had met her in 1999 or
- 11 1998 when we were -- I was at the Regional Jail
- 12 Authority and we were putting in the remote arraignment
- 13 system. We needed some magistrate to volunteer to be
- 14 the first one to use it. She volunteered. I met her
- 15 then.
- She appeared in Fortune magazine, as
 - 17 did I, as a result of that. I got to know her pretty
- 18 well during those years. By phone. I never actually
- 19 met her until years later. But we were talking quite
- 20 often on the phone about this project. It was a very
- 21 important project, one of the proudest projects of my
- 22 career.
- 23 But anyway, that's when I got to know
- 24 her.

Page 1438

Page 1440

- 1 Q. Was this a strictly professional
- 2 relationship?
- 3 A. Yes, of course.
- 4 Q. Okay, that's fine. And you had mentioned
- 5 that a son -- someone's son was hired as an intern?
- 6 A. Yes, one of the employees, a fiscal clerk's
- 7 son, was hired as an intern.
- 8 Q. Okay. And is there any anti-nepotism policy
- 9 of the Supreme Court?
- 10 A. There really isn't. We have people who are
- 11 there who are husbands and wives; we have people who
- 12 are -- I've had several interns who are the sons of --
- 13 any daughters? Maybe a daughter.
- 14 -- of people who work at the Court.
- 15 These are two-month, you know, internships.
- 16 Q. As far as -- I -- the Supreme Court budget,
- 17 you had mentioned you have a hundred and what forty
- 18 some million dollar budget that the legislature
- 19 appropriates.
- 20 Can you explain for me how that is
- 21 broken down and how that relates down to these
- 22 renovation projects, and -- so you've got this large
- 23 pool of money. How does it get broken down?
- 24 A. Well, there's personal services, there's -- I

- 1 mean, it's the usual budget in government. There's
- 2 nothing special about ours. But there are improvements
- 3 and renovations. And that, of course, wasn't just for
- 4 the Capitol.
- 5 There were some renovations that needed
- 6 to be done and furniture bought for magistrate courts
- 7 around the state. New judicial annexes would be built
- 8 and it would be our responsibility to do some part of
- 9 the magistrate and family court offices.
- 10 So there's that category. There are
- 11 various lines in the budget that are broken down. You
- 12 can just get a copy of the budget and you can see how
- 13 --
- 14 Q. And --
- 15 A. -- it's broken down. Without one in front of
- 16 me, I'd hesitate to start just rattling off what the
- 17 lines are.
- 18 Q. Is this broken down at the beginning of the
- 19 fiscal year, or is it we'll itemize certain things and
- 20 then we'll see what comes up and use the rest of it as
- 21 we need it? Or how --
- A. No, it was broken down at the beginning of
- 23 the fiscal year.
- 24 Q. And so these --
- 1 A. Well, it's actually broken down a year before
- 2 -- or 16 months before the beginning of the fiscal
- 3 year, because you're doing it so far ahead.
- 4 Q. So the renovation projects, they were 5 preplanned fiscally.
- 6 A. Yes, although there were some things that
- 7 came up that we did not anticipate and one year
- 8 especially, it went over the budget that we had
- 9 essentially established earlier.
- 10 Q. Now, we had some prior testimony about the 11 extensive needs that it took to renovate the justice
- 40 officer and company sold and lith coult the contract
- 12 offices, and someone said and I thought they were
- 13 referring to all the offices but they pretty much had
- 14 to be gutted down to the walls --
- 15 A. Right.

17

- 16 Q. -- to -- and then go from there.
 - A. Right.
- 18 Q. Is that true?
- 19 A. It's true. But what you found when you
- 20 gutted them to the walls was a different kettle of fish
- 21 in the various offices. Some offices had -- had wiring
- 22 sometimes since the 1920s. At least it was wiring that
- 23 could be piggybacked on, from my understanding of how
- 24 this worked.
 - triis worked.

Page 1444

Page 1441

1

- 1 Other, you just had to pull all new 2 wire, as an example.
- Q. Now, Justice Loughry's office, if you know,4 did it have to be rewired?
- 5 A. No. I don't think it had to be rewired
- 6 entirely. It had had a lot of work done previously.
- 7 But there had to be a lot of infor -- the information
- 8 line had to be pulled.
- 9 There was also some other structural
- 10 matters handled. I'd have to see the documents to be
- 11 able to give you --
- 12 Q. Do you know if it had to have new plumbing?
- 13 A. I think there were some plumbing issues in
- 14 his bathroom. But his office is right next to the
- 15 center of the building, and all of that goes back to
- 16 the center of the building in these old style
- 17 constructions, and so his is the closest to the center,
- 18 so the plumbing would have been much less of a -- of a
- 19 cost and a problem than one that goes to the very end
- 20 of the building where Benjamin's and Davis' offices
- 21 were.
- 22 Q. How about HVAC?
- 23 A. Yeah, all of them had to have HVAC work, all
- 24 of them.

- Page 1442
- 1 Q. Okay. Now, someone told us as far as
- 2 expense-wise for these offices that Justice Davis'
- 3 would have been the most expensive; Justice Benjamin's
- 4 would have been the least; and Justice Loughry's would
- 5 have been somewhere in the middle.
- 6 A. I don't think that's exactly right. I think
- 7 Workman's was actually -- I don't remember. I
- 8 shouldn't say that. But Benjamin's was less than the
- 9 other two, yes. Workman's was less than the other two.
- 10 And Ketchum's was less than the other two.
- 11 Q. And how about Loughry's?
- 12 A. Loughry's was second most expensive, as I
- 13 recall.
- 14 Q. And who was the most? Workman or --
- 15 A. Davis.
- 16 Q. -- Davis? Davis' was, you're sure?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And Diagram 39, Exhibit 39, the
- 19 diagram --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. -- I noticed quite a lot of language on
- 22 Diagram 39. Right in the middle, "I am open to
- 23 suggestions," up at the top left.
- 24 A. Yes, right.

- Q. "Maybe legal-size drawer and sort of top
- 2 middle. Maybe this is a legal-size filing drawer."
- 3 Over on the middle right: "This could be a single
- 4 chair." Goes on to say there "Whatever works."
- 4 Chair. Goes on to say there whatever works.
- 5 Bottom right: "Maybe open wall there."
- 6 And then down in the bottom middle: "Similar to7 Workman and Ketchum." All these maybes and -- who is
- 8 he asking suggestions for?
- A. The designer.
- 10 Q. Okay. And so was he not being absolutely
- 11 specifically direct or --
- 12 A. Well, he got much more specifically
- 13 interested in what he maybe wanted at the beginning.
- 14 Q. Okay. And in that, is -- is there anything
- 15 -- is there anything illegal about that, him being
- 16 direct and specific about how to renovate the office?
- 17 A. Not a thing.
- 18 Q. Okay. And as far as his car usage, are you
- 19 aware of any violation of any policy or law of his car
- 20 usage?
- 21 A. Only what I've read.
- 22 Q. What, in the paper?
- 23 A. I didn't -- I didn't know at the time.
- 24 Q. Okay. Just what you're --

42

A. The --

- 2 Q. -- reading in the newspapers?
- A. Well, as I said earlier, there was a general
- 4 discussion amongst several employees that he so often
- 5 seemed to check the car out on -- on Thursday or Friday
- 6 for weekends.
- 7 And there was a lot of discussion about
- 8 what possible Court business there could be or what
- 9 other kind of business there could be with him taking
- 10 it so frequently then.
- 11 There was also a lot of discussion
- 12 about why he had it for those blocks of time in Dec --
- 13 in two or three Decembers, if memory serves.
- 14 Q. I'm glad you brought that up.
- 15 A. But I -- but I had no specific knowledge of
- 16 what he did with the cars.
- 17 Q. Okay. Did -- are you aware, did anyone --
- 18 has anyone been able to nail it down through
- 19 investigation to find out, was he using the car on all
- 20 of those days? Did he go to an event sometime during
- 21 the weekend that would necessitate a car?
- 22 I mean, are you aware of any solid
- 23 concrete evidence as to whether he was doing right or
- 24 wrong on these weekends in December?

1441–1444

Page 1445

1

- 1 A. I am aware that there were examinations of
- 2 the gas card usage and where those places were when he
- 3 used the gas card. Those places suggest personal use
- 4 because they were in places like Tucker County, Morgan
- County, where he's from and where his wife is from.
- 6 There were other suggestions by the
- 7 analysis of the E-Z Pass that he was taking the car to
- 8 book signings at the Greenbrier. But I've learned this
- 9 from reading the indictment that the Feds put together
- 10 as well as information that I've gotten through media
- 11 sources.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- A. I myself did not do any of that examination. 13
- 14 It was after my time.
- 15 Q. Okay. While you were at the Court and seeing
- 16 these things, did you -- did anyone start logging miles
- 17 of his cars or --
- 18 A. Well, not to my knowledge. But I've heard
- 19 the testimony you heard, so apparently somebody was,
- 20 but not me.
- Q. Okay. Last question, I think. The missing 21
- 22 calendar.
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Missing calendars. 24

Page 1446

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. -- that came up missing after you left. 2
- 3 A. Right.
- Q. I think the memo stated by Judge Johnson,
- 5 your successor that he had the calendars and they
- 6 disappeared. What would these calendars tell us, if we 7 found them?
- A. Well, they'd tell us where and -- I went, who
- came to my office, what kinds of appointments I had,
- what the nature of those were.
- 11 I mean, I never actually looked through
- 12 the calendars. I would ask her for information, once
- 13 or twice very rarely about something: "Could you
- 14 tell me what happened on" such and such a date, you
- know, a couple months back or whatever because
- 16 something's come up that would make me want to know
- 17 that.
- 18 And I don't even remember the specifics
- 19 of that; they were just in passing.
- 20 But she'd always be able to tell, she
- 21 always -- she seemed to keep very complete and very
- 22 clear calendars. I never had a single entry in a
- 23 calendar myself --
- 24 Q. So --

- A. -- because they were kept by her.
- 2 Q. -- it would have been information about you 3 and you only --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. -- not any of the justices.
- 6 A. No, just me, absolutely just about me. But
- 7 you know, she was very specific. Whenever I went
- 8 upstairs to the third floor to talk to a justice, I got
- 9 the impression she would write that down because of my
- 10 activities.
- 11 But again, I didn't examine the
- 12 calendars, so she may not have written it down. I
- don't know.
- 14 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you. Thank you,
- 15 Mr. Chairman.
- 16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Hanshaw.
- 17 Delegate Fleischauer.
- 18 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Thank you,
- 19 Mr. Chairman.
- 20 And thank you, Mr. Canterbury, for
- 21 being here today.
- 22 MR. CANTERBURY: Sure.
- **EXAMINATION** 23
- 24 BY MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER:

- Q. I'd like to go over some questions from that
 - 2 November 7th, 2016 memo that you did which was, I
 - 3 believe, attached to one of the audits, probably No. 3.
 - A. Yes.
 - 5 Q. Because I'm a little bit confused about some
 - 6 things. The gentleman from Putnam asked you who was on
 - 7 the Court -- I guess what I would like to know is a
 - 8 couple of things.
 - 9 This is sort of a chronology and I'm
- 10 just -- we have all of these documents that are all
- 11 different, talking about different things, and I'd sort
- 12 of like to get a better sense of the chronology in my
- 13 head.
- 14 So he was -- you had indicated that
- 15 Workman, Ketchum, Davis, Benjamin and McHugh were there
- 16 in 2011.
- A. Yes. 17
- 18 Q. Okay. And then -- and who was chief justice
- 19 then? If you can remember.
- 20 A. I don't remember. I could maybe figure it
- 21 out but I don't remember.
- 22 Q. You might figure it out as we go along. It
- 23 might come back to you.
- 24 A. Perhaps.

Page 1449

1 Q. But in 2012, was there -- when was the next

2 election?

- 3 A. 2012 was the election of two members of the
- 4 Court: It was Justice Loughry and Justice Davis.
- 5 Q. Okay, so Loughry and Davis. Davis was 6 reelected.
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. And Benjamin left. So Loughry and Davis --
- 9 or Loughry came on that year, and Davis stayed.
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. And -- and do you know who was the chief that
- 12 year?
- 13 A. No, Loughry did not come on that year. Two
- 14 thousand -- yeah, I'm sorry, Loughry and Davis, right.
- 15 Q. Right. But he'd been there for 11 years as
- 16 clerk.
- 17 A. Right, exactly, yes.
- 18 Q. So then in 2013, that stayed the same. So it
- 19 would have been Workman, Ketchum, Davis, McHugh -- no.
- 20 A. No, Loughry.
- 21 Q. -- Loughry --
- 22 A. -- Benjamin.
- 23 Q. One, two, three, four -- and Ketchum.
- 24 A. Ketchum, Benjamin. I don't know which one

Page 1450

- 1 you said.
- 2 Q. And then he -- and you don't know who was
- 3 chief in 2013?
- 4 A. No. I could try to remember, but I don't
- 5 remember off the top of my head.
- 6 Q. Okay. And '14 would have also been the same, 7 right?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And then -- and that's all the farther you
- 10 went. Okay.
- 11 Can you remind me when the change came
- 12 for the law clerks? Was that when --
- 13 A. Yes. That happened in -- sometime in late
- 14 winter, I think, of -- may have been spring. But
- 15 winter or spring of 2013.
- 16 Q. Okay. So -- okay. And prior to that time,
- 17 all the justices could pick two.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And no one had any oversight of that, right?
- 20 A. That's right, entirely their choice.
- 21 Q. And how much did the law clerks make?
- 22 A. The law clerks could make, when I left -- I
- 23 don't know what it was in 2011, because they did raise
- 24 it a few times. They could make up to \$120,000. And

1 some justices paid the max to all of their law clerks.

- 2 Q. Uh-huh.
- 3 A. Other justices did not; they paid
- 4 commensurate with experience.
- 5 Justice Benjamin never paid the max to
- 6 all of his law clerks.
 - Justice Davis did not. She may be now,
- 8 but she didn't when I was there.
- 9 But Justice Ketchum and Justice Loughry
- 10 paid the max.

7

- 11 And I don't remember Justice Workman.
- 12 Q. Okay. So in 2013, in the winter, that policy
- 13 changed, so each of the justices had total authority to
- 14 hire whichever clerks they wanted, and I think you said
- 15 that Justice Walker, when she came in in 2016 --
- 16 A. Right.
- 17 Q. -- she would have been able to hire four.
- 18 A. That's right.
- 19 Q. And did she inherit any, or did she fire four
- 20 new -- I mean, hire four new ones?
- 21 A. I think she kept -- she came in in '17 and I
- 22 went out. But my understanding is she kept one of
- 23 Justice Benjamin's clerks and hired three new.
- 24 Q. Okay. And if any of the justices had had any

- 1 of these clerks working as a volunteer in their
- 2 campaigns --
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. -- that -- there was no -- they had -- there
- 5 was no policy against that.
- 6 A. No, there was no policy against it.
- 7 Q. Are you aware whether any of them might have
- 8 had help from people that later became their clerks?
- 9 A. I'm pretty sure that that didn't happen.
- 10 Well, no, I don't know. Let me just
- 11 say I don't know.
- 12 Q. So we could have had a whole lot of people
- 13 who would have gotten really good jobs who may have
- 14 worked on campaigns.
- 15 A. That's true.
- 16 Q. And I assume you've heard within the
- 17 legislature and within the Executive Branch that it's
- 18 not unusual for -- and other -- the Executive Branch,
- 19 more broadly speaking, because we have the Governor, we
- 20 have the Treasurer's Office, the Secretary of State and
- 21 the Attorney General, that I've certainly heard of
- 22 people who worked on campaigns and then received jobs.
- 23 You've heard of that too.
- 24 A. Sure. That's a tried and true practice.

Page 1456

- 1 Q. That's not really very unusual.
- 2 A. Not at all.
- 3 Q. Okay. And you mentioned this incident where
- 4 you counseled Justice Loughry. I think you said it was
- 5 sexually harassing. Would you -- would you
- 6 characterize -- it was statements, correct?
- 7 A. It was all verbal, yes.
- 8 Q. And would you characterize that in any
- 9 particular way?
- 10 A. It made her very uncomfortable. It was about
- 11 her body and it was -- embarrassed her, made her feel
- 12 just really bad. She didn't want that to happen
- 13 anymore.
- 14 I, naturally, immediately said that
- 15 "The EEOC should be notified, you need to go through
- 16 that." She didn't want to.
- 17 Q. Would you say it was crude, vulgar, any of
- 18 those words?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Now, I think you said that that was one of
- 21 the statements that you thought was untruthful. Did he
- 22 deny that he had made those statements?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And do you think that he was unhappy about
 - _
- 1 you raising that issue with him?
- 2 A. Well, I think he was at the time. Yet
- 3 afterwards, he seemed to be able to interact with me
- 4 without any problems when he was a law clerk.
- 5 Q. Uh-huh.
- 6 A. But that could have been the beginning of
- 7 his --
- 8 Q. But you supervised him.
- 9 A. No. No, I had --
- 10 Q. I mean -- well, I mean, you were higher than
- 11 he was.
- 12 A. I was just -- no, that's like -- you know, I
- 13 was in a different country.
- 14 Q. Right, I know, I know. But you had a
- 15 position --
- 16 A. Well, a lot of people would say the law
- 17 clerks are actually much, much more important than
- 18 anybody, including me in the Administrative Office.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 A. So no, I would never characterize that I had
- 21 any supervisory authority or superiority to him in any
- 22 way.
- 23 Q. But you had the authority to talk to him
- 24 about the --

- A. I did have the authority to talk to him
- 2 because it was my employee. But mainly I had the
- 3 authority to tell his boss, which I did.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. Which I regret that we won't be able to get
- 6 testimony.
- 7 Q. Well, we've heard some testimony about him,
- 8 about his personality, about his not speaking to people
- 9 not just you for months at a time. Do you think
- 10 it's possible that he resented the fact that you spoke
- 11 to him and held that against you?
- 12 A. Well, yes.
- 13 Q. Okay. Lots of us have read things in the
- 14 paper and heard things. One of the things I heard was
- 15 that Justice Loughry was responsible for firing 60
- 16 people. Do -- would you have any knowledge -- and you
- 17 said it was a large number.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Do you think -- and some of the people that
- 20 were gotten rid of -- and I don't know if this was a
- 21 decision of all the Court, but the -- the -- all of the
- 22 programmers, I was told, had gotten fired and all of
- 23 the -- I'm blanking on the name for the people that
- 24 check up on sexual offenders. The probation officers.
- Page 1454
- A. The probation officers, he did fire all of
- 2 those, yeah. Well, I think all but eight. I think
- 3 they created jobs for eight. But of the 35 or 37 or
- 4 so, eight were left and the rest were gone.
- 5 Q. Well, what happened to that duty, that job
- 6 duty?
- 7 A. Well, my understanding is that they simply
- 8 eliminated the sex offender unit and decided that the
- 9 judges' probation officers would just take over that 10 job.
- 11 Q. Well, hadn't that originally been done by a
- 12 probation office --
- 13 A. Yes, it had --
- 14 Q. -- officers?
- 15 A. And the legislature --
- 16 Q. And then the Court created a special unit.
- 17 A. Well, first, the legislature requested the
- 18 Court do that. It's one of those, the Court may, but
- 19 the legislature decided --
- 20 Q. Oh, okay.
- 21 A. -- it needed to happen because --
- 22 Q. And do you remember when that was?
- 23 A. Hmm. Sometime before 2008, because Justice
- 24 Maynard was still on the Court. It was when now Judge

Page 1457

- 1 Webster was chair of this very Committee. So whenever
- 2 that year was is when it happened.
- 3 Q. So the Court was strongly encouraged to --
- A. Strongly encouraged. And the Court didn't 4
- 5 like it. So we had an extraordinary meeting with
- leaders from the legislature and the justices to
- 7 suggest that that shouldn't be a job handed to
- probation; it should be a job handed to parole.
- 9 Because this was primarily for sex
- offenders post-incarceration extended supervision, 10
- because it's rare a sex offender gets probation.
- 12 So that specifically seemed more of a
- job for parole, but they were absolutely firm it was 13
- going to go to probation. And so that's when we began
- the unit. But we didn't have instantly need for 30
- some, because we didn't have these people coming out of
- prison instantly. But as they came out, we had to add
- more and more people.
- 19 Some of the higher employment costs
- 20 from this \$29,000,000 were the additional probation
- 21 officers for that unit.
- 22 Q. So that --
- 23 A. We'd gotten up to about 36 units -- 36
- 24 probation officers.

Page 1458

24

- 1 Q. Are you saying that part of the expenses that
- 2 were absorbed were for these employees?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And would there be an advantage of
- 5 having a state-wide group as opposed to a local group
- 6 because sex offenders sometimes move around?
- 7 A. Well, that's not the primary reason, to be
- perfectly honest. The real reason was a way to try to
- organize this so that we could get sex offenders
- organized in regions and have probation officers in
- regions, because we didn't feel there was a need to
- 12 have one per county --
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. -- or one per circuit.
- 15 Q. Uh-huh.
- A. There just wasn't that kind of a number --16
- 17 Q. So it's a smaller number than 55.
- 18 A. It's a smaller number. Also, there's very
- special training that goes into supervising these
- offenders. They're extremely seductive, and they're
- 21 very different from the typical offender.
- 22 Frankly, I think probably 85 percent of
- 23 them don't need it, but that 15 percent's a scary
- 24 bunch. And that's what these people, these probation

1 officers, were focused on, yes.

- 2 Q. And --
- 3 A. But they were -- they were fired.
- 4 Q. They were all gotten rid of.
- 5 All but eight, all but eight.
- 6 Q. And how many -- and are you clear on who is

7 doing this now?

- 8 A. Well, only from reports from other probation
- 9 officers that I -- whom I happen to know. But it's
- 10 been digested by the Court. And I think that Justice
- 11 Loughry had said some things about that as well -
- perhaps in his Finance statement, perhaps otherwise -
- that that jobs -- those jobs were being done for less
- 14 expense around the state under the judges' watch.
- Q. Okay. So the programmers, can you tell me 16 what they did and why they were dismissed and about 17 when that might have happened in this chronology?
- I'm not sure about them. The tech folks,
- 19 there were a number of contractors, and I think they
- simply dissolved their contract. We didn't want to
- 21 hire a lot of people for the building of a system.
- Once the system is built, they'd have jobs; we'd really
- 23 not have much need for them.
 - So they were contracted or they were

- 1 temp employees, depending on the nature of their job.
- And I know that a lot of people in the
- 3 field who were doing the scanning work for e-filing
- were let go, and -- but a lot of those, as I said, were
- 5 temps or -- or they were -- they were contracted.
- 6 I think the entire probation office -
- 7 the director, the deputy director, the secretary, the
- 8 counsel, all of the drug court people they're all
- 9 gone. All those people who were there in '16 and who
- 10 did extraordinary jobs have been lost to State
- 11 government.
- 12 Q. So do you know if the 60 figure -- 60 figure 13 is close or in the range?
- 14 A. I think that that figure probably includes
- people who felt that the atmosphere was such that they
- 16 had to leave. I don't know if all those people were
- 17 fired. And also, I don't know how many of those people
- 18 were technically contractors.
- Q. And it sounds like you think that the -- some 19 20 of the programmers, maybe their job was done?
- 21 A. Well, not if they had to do with e-filing.
- 22 There is no full e-filing system in West Virginia, so
- 23 they weren't done. But it is true that the Unified
- 24 Judicial Application Information System for the

Page 1464

Page 1461

- 1 magistrate courts is complete.
- 2 And why the public portal is not open,
- 3 I can't answer that; that's after I left. But it is
- 4 complete. And so those folks weren't necessary
- 5 anymore.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. All of that scanning had been done, all --
- 8 Q. Can you talk a little bit more about the
- 9 Unified Judicial -- what's the A stand for?
- 10 A. Application.
- 11 Q. Application.
- 12 A. It's a mouthful.
- 13 Q. And what does "Application" mean when you're

14 talking about the UJA?

- 15 A. Well, it means "applied data." It's just an
- 16 information system, and it was to join all of the
- 17 magistrate courts into a single system so that anybody
- 18 in the State could go to any computer, get on and be
- 19 able to see in any magistrate court what they
- 20 needed to see, whatever is public.
- 21 Q. Okay. And I think you explained about how
- 22 the domestic violence and the mental hygiene orders
- 23 would then be available, and you could --
- 24 A. Right.

Page 1462

- Q. -- know whether somebody was in violation of
- 2 one of those --
- 3 A. Well --

1

- 4 Q. -- in any county.
- 5 A. The Domestic Violence Registry would be able
- 6 to tell police officers instantly if there was some
- 7 threat or somebody was a problem, and others could get
- 8 on and look to see those people as well.
- 9 Q. Would they have -- would -- well, would that
- 10 have been possible before the UJA? Was that --
- 11 A. That was separate from UJA, but it ultimately
- 12 got some linkage, but it was a separate stand-alone.
- 13 But we got federal grants to build -- it was really one
- 14 of the more dramatic -- I mean, it's gotten national
- 15 praise.
- 16 Q. The Domestic Violence Registry.
- 17 A. Yes. Our registry was along with New
- 18 York's was considered the best in the nation by the
- 19 National Center and by some federal groups.
- 20 Q. Okay. One of the reasons I was asking you
- 21 about that is because this memorandum of November 7th,
- 22 you talked about -- where you were talking about the
- 23 expenses, and you said --
- 24 One of the things you said, it was to

1 forestall a Constitutional amendment.

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. But you also listed things about like the new
- 4 drug courts.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. That was -- that was a statutory issue,

7 right?

- 8 A. That was mandated by the legislature, yes, it
- 9 was.
- 10 Q. And do you know how much that cost?
- 11 A. Not off the top of my head.
- 12 Q. On page -- the third page of that which is
- 13 page 15 at the bottom of the first bullet, you said,
- 14 "Some of the increases in the new -- were in the new
- 15 drug courts, the roll-out of the UJA, the completion of
- 16 all remodeling in the Capitol and at City Center East,
- 17 and with mandated raises of certain classification of
- 18 employees."
- 19 I'm thinking that all of those things
- 20 together would be a very big number.
- A. It is a big number. And then to add to the
- 22 number, the Court also raised the fees for guardians ad
- 23 litem during this time, and that's why the legal fee, I
- 24 think, primarily went up.

1 Two -- two things about guardians ad

- 2 litem: Their out-of-court fee went from \$45.00 to
- 3 \$80.00 an hour; their in-court fee went from \$65.00 to
- 5 \$60.00 an nour, their in-court fee went north \$65.00 to
- 4 \$100.00 an hour.
- 5 And then on top of that, we had the
- 6 opiate crisis which hit family court right between the
- 7 eyes. There was so much more need for guardian ad
- 8 litems to be appointed. Alas, I think that's also been
- 9 dwindled, from what I hear.
- 10 Q. So you mean the amount in the budget for 11 guardian ad litems?
- 12 A. No, the number of guardians ad litem
- 13 appointed. I don't know what their budget is now, but
- 14 my understanding is they're doing only 10 percent of
- 15 what they used to do, and I find that to be troublesome
- 16 personally. But that's, nevertheless --
 - About the issue with this document,
- 18 those legal fees had a lot to do with the increase in
- 19 legal. And that's --

- 20 Q. So that had already started occurring in two 21 thousand four -- oh, we're all the way back to 2014.
- A. 2011 is when those fees went up, so that
- 23 started hitting us almost immediately after the
- 24 \$29,000,000 year of 2011.

Page 1465

Q. And if this was written in November 2016, how 1

2 come we don't have 2015 in here? Do you know?

- A. '15 is the year that they were focused on 3
- 4 about us having only -- I think if you read then, you
- 5 can see --
- 6 Q. Oh, yeah --
- A. -- the fiscal year of 2015 was the \$330,000 7
- 8 year, which troubled Justice Workman especially.
- 9 Q. Oh, that -- that it had dropped so much.
- 10 A. Yes. I mean, I -- you're trying to -- you're
- 11 trying to satisfy a lot of masters. She did not like
- 12 it was so narrow. You know, I'm sure that legislators
- would have thought that was appropriate since other
- 14 spending units of government end up at zero at the end
- 15 of the year, and so \$330,000 seems like guite a nice 16 little amount.
- 17 But she did not agree. She was very
- 18 upset about it.
- 19 Q. She thought it should have been --
- 20 A. -- higher.
- 21 Q. -- smaller -- higher.
- 22 A. Much higher.
- 23 Q. Okay. And I suppose that you would have a
- 24 lot of unanticipated expenses that you detail in here.

Page 1466

- 1 A. A lot of those were unanticipated.
- 2 Q. Do you think that that's what she was

3 thinking about or --

- A. Well, she just thought that I should have
- 5 asked for enough money to have kept a nice bundle.
- 6 When I didn't ask for about \$10,000,000 that I could
- 7 have asked for -- after all, the legislature can't do
- anything with whatever is demanded by the Court.
- 9 That that would have kept us with at
- 10 least about a \$10,000,000 surplus. And she was rather
- cross about that. She thought we should have had a
- 12 bigger surplus.
- 13 Q. Okay. In this overall review, would it be
- 14 fair to say -- and I think that -- and I don't have a
- 15 photographic memory, but the lady from Kanawha was
- 16 talking about 3.2 or 3.3 million for the renovations.
- 17 A. Yeah.
- 18 Q. Does that sound about right?
- A. I think it's closer to 3.7. 19
- 20 Q. 3.7.
- 21 That's from memory.
- 22 Q. 3.7. I will -- and a lot of money was given
- 23 -- you know, given back a couple times.
- A. Right. \$6,000,000; \$2,000,000 one year; 24

- 1 \$4,000,000 another. We also --
- 2 Q. And you used the word "digested."
- 3 A. Yeah, the Court digested the increases for
- 4 the judges, and they got a pay increase in 2012, so all
- 5 of that was digested.
- 6 Q. I guess where I'm trying to go with all this
- 7 and I don't know if this is the point of your memo -
- but I think what you're saying -- and -- and if I'm
- putting words in your mouth, tell me I'm wrong.
- 10 -- is that \$29,000,000 was money that
- 11 was mostly needed for things like the UJA --
- 12 A. Right.
 - Q. -- for the City Center East security.
- 14 A. Right.
- 15 Q. And -- and I don't think we've talked very
- 16 much about that. Can -- we talked a little bit about
- 17 that.

13

- 18 A. Uh-huh.
- 19 Q. But do you think that was a really important 20 expense?
- 21 A. Yes, it was vitally important. First, we
- 22 needed to have a secure area for the server, and it
- 23 needed to have all of the bells and whistles. In fact,
- 24 that's one of the reasons City Center East was very

1 appealing, because there had already been a server room

- 2 in the City Center East when Workers' Comp had been
- 3 there, so there was --
- As server rooms go, we didn't have to
- 5 spend as much to get that back up to -- to standards.
- 6 We did have to put in two new generators. You have to
- 7 have a generator, then a backup generator. You have to
- 8 think of every bad thing that could happen.
- 9 Then we needed them to be in secure
- 10 premises. And City Center East, you could secure it
- 11 very easily with the way we set up the -- the elevator
- 12 for -- the top floor, for example, had the -- the
- 13 Judicial Investigation Commission, the Office of
- Disciplinary Counsel, and the Bar people and they all
- 15 needed a conference -- they all needed a board room.
- 16 but we could use one board room and schedule around.
- 17 We can also secure people going up
- 18 there. Because people can get remarkably angry and
- 19 upset with all three of those groups. The lawyers'
- 20 group can really get people angry, and so can people --
- 21 Q. I'm shocked.
- 22 A. -- failing the bar. I know, isn't it
- 23 amazing? And so can people failing the bar. And so
- 24 there was security provided.

1465-1468

Page 1469

1 In fact, you learned that one of the

- 2 security officials is located over there and secures
- 3 the entire building.
- Q. Okay. So in that last paragraph on page 15, 4
- 5 that last sentence, all of those things, you felt, were
- 6 either mandated or critical to the operation of the
- 7 Court. And do you have any idea how much of the
- 8 \$29,000,000 that might have entailed?
- A. Well, the \$29,000,000 is marbled throughout
- 10 these budgetary reductions. You know, we just kept --
- 11 Q. So it's back and forth and back and forth?
- 12 A. Well, it's just slowly but surely, as we
- 13 spent for things that had been demanded by the Court --
- 14 for instance, the increase in the fees for the -- for
- 15 the legal --
- 16 Q. Uh-huh. The guardian ad litems.
- 17 A. Guardians ad litem. I also failed to mention
- 18 that there was an enormous increase in mental hygiene
- 19 hearings again. I think that's related to the opiate 20 problem.
- 21 But all of those costs went up. The
- 22 reason that we ended up with the \$29,000,000 to begin
- 23 with was because I thought that we would be able to
- 24 spend money sooner on UJA, and we didn't.

- It took a couple of years longer than I
- 2 had anticipated --
- Q. To implement it. 3
- A. -- to start the scanning and have --4
- 5 Q. And the --
- 6 A. -- to have all of those people out there
- 7 scanning and going through the files and making sure
- 8 that none of the domestic violence files were thrown
- 9 out -- they have to be kept to perpetuity; everything
- 10 else to ten years.
- 11 They weren't always filed very clearly
- 12 in the individual magistrate offices in paper, in
- 13 boxes.
- 14 Q. When did the UJA project start? Did that go
- 15 back a long way?
- A. 1996. 16
- 17 Q. Okay.
- A. And it just never got anything done. It was 18
- 19 just one false start after another.
- 20 Q. And so when did it actually go into
- 21 implementation?
- A. It was -- all the counties were in by the 22
- 23 fall of 2016.
- 24 Q. Okay.

1

- A. And I really expected the public portal to be
- 2 open. Because I know it's constructed. It should be
- 3 open. I don't know why the Court has not seen fit to
- 4 open it.
- Q. When did all this scanning, when -- when was 6 that taking place?
- A. From about 2012-2013 on. 7
- 8 Q. So it's during this time period.
- 9 A. Exactly right.
- Q. And then -- and then there's -- you -- I 10
- 11 think you -- from what you're saying, there's less of a
- 12 need for it now but there's still some need for
- 13 scanning --
- 14 A. For e-filing, there's a great need, because
- 15 all of that paper has to be turned into electronic data
- 16 in order for e-filing to work. But the magistrates are
- 17 finished. That's complete.
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. And one hopes that the circuit clerks will
- 20 have slightly stronger filing and more -- more ease of
- 21 use.
- 22 But then again, you have to go back so
- 23 much further with the circuit courts than you had to
- 24 with the magistrate courts, with the exception of

Page 1470

1 domestic violence.

2 Q. Okay. Let's go to another topic, the sketch,

- 3 Exhibit 39.
- A. Yes.
- 5 Q. One of the things that we learned from the
- 6 Affidavit was about the marble in the medallion.
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. And I heard some conversations about the blue
- 9 pearl marble. Are you --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- familiar with that term?
- A. Iam. Yes, Iam. 12
- 13 Q. And what can you tell us about blue pearl
- 14 marble?
- A. It's not marble; it's granite. 15
- 16 Q. Oh, granite, I'm sorry. Thank you.
- 17 A. It's a lustrous blue granite with a high
- 18 shine.
- 19 Q. Okay. And do you know what form it comes in
- 20 when it's --
- 21 A. Sheets.
- 22 Q. -- purchased? It comes in sheets?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Do you know if it has to be sliced?

- 1 A. Yes, I think so.
- 2 Q. And this medallion -- or this shape of Tucker 3 County --
- A. Uh-huh. 4
- 5 Q. -- it had to be sliced and also shaped.
- 6 A. Yes, it had to be jig sawed and cut very 7 precisely.
- 8 Q. Okay. And so the bathroom also had this blue pearl marble? It sounds beautiful. 9
- 10 A. Blue pearl granite on the floor.
- 11 Q. Oh, granite. I can't get that right.
- 12 A. Yes, it's dark. It's nice, yes.
- Q. Did anyone -- did any of the other justices 13
- 14 have any granite or blue pearl granite?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Anywhere in their facilities?
- A. Not that -- no, they did not. 17
- 18 Q. Okay. One of the things that I got confused
- 19 about going back to this 2016 memo was the use of
- 20 the term "project manager."
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And is that a person that works for an
- 23 outside company or a person that works for the Court?
- 24 A. The reason you're confused is because there

Page 1475 1 Fletch then, because she'd already worked with the --

- 2 worked with the construction, just allowed her to
- 3 continue to be the project manager for the
- 4 construction, and now she's the director of facilities.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. Facility services, I think is the title.
- 7 Q. Okay. So was he the project manager? Or was
- 8 she the project manager?
- 9 A. He was the one who -- who --
 - Q. Was he a deputy?
- 11 A. A deputy?

10

- 12 Q. A deputy director, you said?
- 13 A. No, no. I -- there was only one deputy
- 14 director, and that was not a position who was a
- 15 division head. That was my deputy director.
- 16 He was a director, a director of
- 17 facility services, I think was the name of it, or
- 18 judicial facility services.
- 19 So before she came over, he would sign
- 20 off on invoices, moving furniture to the warehouse, for
- 21 example. He signed off on that.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. He signed off also on the construction
- 24 invoices that were then sent to the Fiscal Office for

Page 1474

1 was a transition during this time.

- 2 Q. Yeah.
- A. The person who was -- I'm terming "project 3
- 4 manager" actually had a better title, and it's eluding
- 5 me right now. But that was the person you had in here,
- 6 Fletch Adkins.
- 7 Fletch Adkins was the director of that
- 8 division and he was the manager of projects when there
- 9 was a -- any renovation anywhere in any of the courts
- 10 in the state, it would go through Fletch.
- 11 And I mean everything from taking
- 12 furniture to surplus to making sure the contractors
- 13 understood the standards that the Court had
- 14 established. All that went through Fletch Adkins.
- 15 Fletch Adkins told me he was retiring,
- 16 and his office -- his job was really big, and it was
- 17 really comprehensive. So that's when I told the
- 18 justices we needed to get someone in who would be
- 19 appropriate to train for his position and make that
- person a deputy so that they could have a -- we could
- 21 have a seamless transition.
- Justice Workman believed strongly as
- 23 I did that Kim Ellis, with whom we'd had really good
- 24 work with Silling during this time, become that person.

1 processing. Once she came in, he continued to do all

- 2 that work out in the field, slowly turning it over to
- 3 her.
- But she then became the person who was
- 5 able to start to sign off on the -- the invoices that
- 6 went through. And I think for a while, they did it
- 7 together while she learned exactly how that worked.
 - Q. Okay.
- 9 A. So that --
- 10 Q. So -- and do you remember when she came on?
- 11 A. Yes. She came on in May of 2013.
- 12 Q. 2013, okay. I'm still a little confused. Is
- 13 the project manager a person on the inside?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. And because we had the -- the company
- 16 called Neighbor --
- 17 A. -- gall.
- 18 Q. Gone?
- 19 A. Neighborgall.
- 20 Q. Gone.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And I think we've called --
- 23 A. Right. Well --
- 24 Q. We've used some word like "project

1

1 manager" --

2 A. Right.

Q. -- for someone that worked there, and then 3

4 that person went to another company.

- 5 A. Right. That was the construction project
- 6 manager who worked for them.
- Q. Oh. 7
- 8 A. I'm sorry that I'm using language that --
- 9 that overlaps. The project manager for the Court is
- 10 the person who's overseeing all of that work.
- 11 The project manager for the
- 12 construction company is not, for example, interested in
- 13 the furniture.
- 14 Q. Uh-huh.
- 15 A. He's only interested in making sure that the
- 16 wiring's put back right and the floors are right, etc.,
- 17 the subcontractors are showing up and doing what
- 18 they're supposed to do and all that.
- 19 That person works for a private company
- 20 in this case, Neighborgall and then ultimately
- 21 Gander Brothers or -- I don't think that's the name.
- 22 but whatever it is.
- 23 Q. But something along those lines, okay.
- 24

Page 1478

- Q. And so I think you said that she was an
- 2 interior decorator?
- A. Yes. 3
- Q. That's one of the parts of her background. 4
- 5 A. Interior design.
- 6 Q. Plus she had worked for this architectural

7 company --

- A. Right. 8
- 9 Q. -- for a number of years.
- A. Right. 10
- 11 Q. So she had -- in addition to the interior
- 12 part, she had --
- 13 A. General knowledge of construction.
- 14 Q. -- a broader knowledge about construction.
- 15 So did -- and then I also -- I think it
- 16 sounds like Carpet Gallery must have had interior
- decorators on staff or --17
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 Q. Sounds like they were consulted for the
- 20 fabric and so on.
- A. I never directly interacted with Carpet 21
- 22 Gallery. I don't know.
- 23 Q. You don't know.
- A. I have no idea. 24

Page 1479 Q. And do you know if the Court ever hired any

2 interior decorators for any of the justices?

- A. I hear that that happened for Justice Walker 3
- 4 after I left, but that's hearsay on my part. You'd
- 5 have to ask somebody there now.
- 6 Q. Okay. But the others --
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. The others did not, and --
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. -- you had --
- 11 A. No, wait a second. I'm not sure. Justice
- 12 Ketchum might have hired somebody to do some interior
- 13 work. I just don't recall. I mean, I really don't. I
- 14 -- I'm scratching my brain.
- 15 But there may have been somebody hired
- 16 at Justice Ketchum's request, but I don't recall if
- 17 that's accurate or not. But no one else did.
- 18 Q. But as of 2013, you had one who had that
- 19 background on staff.
- 20 A. Right, exactly, on staff.
- 21 Q. And a broader background at that.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. So can you go through this little chronology
- 24 and tell me when the rooms -- the offices were

1 redecorated, like in chronological order? Would that

- 2 be possible?
- 3 A. Well, I can try. I think Justice Benjamin's
- 4 was either 2011 -- or I'm sorry, it was either 2007 or
- 5 2008. I don't remember which.
- 6 But Justice Workman's and Justice
- 7 Ketchum's was in 2009 and into 2010.
- And then we have Justice Loughry in '13
- 9 and Justice Davis in '14. That's from memory.
- 10 Q. Okay. So Justice Davis was the last.
- 11 A. Yes. She said for Loughry to just go ahead
- 12 in front of her. She was actually slated to be in '13,
- 13 but Justice Loughry really wanted to have his office
- 14 redone and she said, "Let him do it."
- 15 Q. Now, you mentioned the safe room?
- 16
- 17 Q. I've never -- does that mean there's a safe
- 18 in there --
- 19 A. No, it's a --
- 20 Q. -- or is that a place for the justices to be
- 21 secure --
- 22 A. Security --
- 23 Q. Okav.
- 24 A. If somebody came in on the bench and

- 1 threatened them, that's a place they can go and the bad2 guys could not get in there.
- 3 Q. Okay. And then there were a couple of
- 4 questions -- had you ever heard that term "control
- 5 center" about Justice Loughry's --
- 6 A. I've never heard that before until today.
- 7 Q. You hadn't? Okay. And it says there were
- 8 flags in there. I assume they were flag -- they were
- 9 hanging and not -- they were hanging on a pole and not 10 framed?
- 11 A. I don't remember framed flags. I do remember
- 12 them -- I think he had flags that were on free-standing
- 13 poles like you see in the hallways.
- 14 Q. Uh-huh. Okay. I think there was something
- 15 else here that I wondered if it was framed. Diplomas.
- 16 I don't think you've said anything -- are those things
- 17 that he brought with him, his framed diplomas?
- 18 A. I don't recall if those were done at Court
- 19 expense or if he had already gotten those framed. I
- 20 know they were hanging behind his desk in that kind of
- 21 cubbyhole, but I don't remember if they were framed at
- 22 our -- at the Court expense or --
- 23 Q. You mean when he was a law clerk or when --
- 24 A. No, no, I don't --

- Page 1482
- 1 Q. -- when he was in his --
- 2 A. I don't remember what he had on his wall.
- 3 Q. -- justice offices.
- 4 A. Yeah, just in his justice office.
- 5 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Okay, I
- 6 think that's all the questions I have, Mr. Chairman.
- 7 EXAMINATION
- 8 BY CHAIRMAN SHOTT:
- 9 Q. There's a question that's really been nagging
- 10 at me throughout these proceedings, and maybe you can
- 11 -- you can help me. And I'm probably not the only one
- 12 that wonders about this.
- 13 In between the 12 years that there's an
- 14 election, to whom is an individual justice accountable
- 15 if they decide to push the envelope, let's say?
- 16 A. His or her own conscience, and then -- it
- 17 depends on the situation. Potentially the other
- 18 members of the Court about certain matters. But
- 19 primarily, it's the conscience of the individual
- 20 justice, and then if the envelope's been pushed to the
- 21 point of breaking, there probably would be a complaint
- 22 to the Judicial Investigation Commission.
- 23 Q. During the 11 1/2 or 12 years that you were
- 24 working at the Court, were you aware of any situation

Page 1483

1 in which the majority of the justices basically caused

- 2 another justice to change his or her behavior?
- 3 A. "Behavior," is that what you said?
- 4 Q. Yes, uh-huh.
- 5 A. No. People who get elected to justice have
- 6 pretty strong egos. It would be very hard to change
- 7 their behavior. Now, peer pressure being such that
- 8 some people such as I who tend to talk too much in
- 9 conference would talk a little less because they'd get
- 10 the uncomfortable looks and things like that. But
- 11 their fundamental personalities, no.
- 12 Q. Well, for instance, we talk about the
- 13 renovation costs --
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. -- and as I understand your testimony, we
- 16 really had sort of two different things going on. We
- 17 had a base construction budget that was dealing with -
- 18 I'll call it infrastructure and so forth, that each
- 19 justice would get in advance. Correct?
- 20 A. Would get in a -- yes, yes, they would get an
- 21 estimate --
- 22 Q. They knew what --
- 23 A. -- right.
- 24 Q. They knew what the budget --

- 1 A. Yes.
 - 2 Q. -- the face budget for their --
 - 3 A. Exactly.
 - 4 Q. -- specific office was gonna be. Did each
 - 5 justice know what the other justices' budget for their
 - 6 office was gonna be, for his or her office?
 - 7 A. I don't know if they did or not. It was up
 - 8 to them to share it. It was pretty clear that they
 - 9 wanted to interact directly about it. I don't know
 - 10 that they shared it with others.
 - 11 But I don't think I copied them on it,
 - 12 so I think it was just justice to justice.
 - 13 Q. So the justice whose office was being
 - 14 renovated would most likely be the only person that
 - 15 would see that --
 - 16 A. Yes.
 - 17 Q. -- other than the person paying -- paying the
 - 18 bills?
 - 19 A. Right. As it added up.
 - 20 Q. Was there any general understanding or policy
 - 21 among the judges as to a limit on what they're gonna
 - 22 spend on a particular office?
 - 23 A. There was never a discussion about limits.
 - 24 Q. What about with regard to furnishings?

- 1 A. There was never a discussion about any limit
- 2 on furnishing costs.
- 3 Q. So is it fair to say that the justices sort
- 4 of acquiesced to what each other spent with regard to
- 5 their office, to his or her office?
- 6 A. Well, acquiesced out of ignorance. They7 didn't know. But yes.
- 8 Q. Did they make any effort to find out?
- 9 A. No. Not that I'm aware of. If they did, it
- 10 was among themselves.
- 11 Q. So until this friction arose in the summer --
- 12 I think it was August of 2016, basically it was sort of
- 13 laissez faire, leave -- leave the other guy alone and
- 14 let him do whatever he wants to with his office. Is
- 15 that fair to say?
- 16 A. Yes, they were equals and they -- that's
- 17 right.
- 18 Q. Well, in terms of whether -- do you know if
- 19 any effort was made to determine if there's like a
- 20 standard among justices throughout the country as to
- 21 what seems to be appropriate to spend on a renovation,
- 22 or was it just sort of whatever it took?
- 23 A. I regret to say I never did that for them, so
- 24 they didn't have any kind of basis for that.
- Page 1486

18

- 1 Q. Well, let me --
- 2 A. Unless they did it on their own that I'm not
- 3 aware of.
- 4 Q. Okay. So in -- in these administrative
- 5 conferences, the issue of whether some Justice A was
- 6 spending too much money on his or her office for a
- 7 specific item was not discussed, at least not before
- 8 August of 2016?
- 9 A. Oh, I don't think it was discussed before
- 10 January '17. I don't remember it ever being discussed.
- 11 Q. Fair enough. These administrative
- 12 conferences, I think you mentioned before there are
- 13 minutes, but sometimes the minutes are more complete
- 14 than other times. Is that fair to say?
- 15 A. Right. Often the minutes are very general
- 16 statements of just a final conclusion, nothing else.
- 17 Q. Were there ever any discussions in those
- 18 administrative conferences that you attended where
- 19 there was a "Let's go off the record and talk about
- 20 this and don't put it in the minutes"?
- 21 Anything like that that you know of?
- 22 A. They didn't use those terms that I recall,
- 23 but it was pretty clear afterwards when they had a
- 24 chance to edit the minutes that they wanted some things

- Page 1487

 1 not brought up. And on the contrary, sometimes they'd
- 2 be very livid that they didn't get their licks in and
- 3 they wanted their information in. That was especially
- 4 true during the Maynard/Starcher years.
- 5 Q. Could -- could that be an explanation for why
- 6 your memorandum regarding this reduction from this
- 7 \$29,000,000 down, there was never any indication in the
- 8 administrative -- the minutes of the administrative
- 9 conference that there was a discussion about the what
- 10 was going on over in the Senate and that we wanted to
- 11 avoid this Constitutional amendment?
- 12 A. Yes, I don't think they wanted that in
- 13 writing, and it was never in the minutes. Although
- 14 obviously it was a theme -- even in Justice Loughry's
- 15 presentation that you heard, he was saying "We're
- 16 reducing the expenditures, we're reducing expenditures,
- 17 we don't need a Constitutional amendment."
 - It was very much on their minds.
 - Q. Even before Justice Loughry came.
- 20 A. Oh, long before. Yeah, that was one of the
- 21 first things that I learned. In 2005, in a private
- 22 discussion, with Justice Maynard, I said, "I don't know
- 23 if I agree with this philosophically." He said, "Well,
- 24 you're gonna agree with that now, because that's one
- Page 1488

 1 thing we're unanimous about. We can disagree about
- 2 everything else, but you don't mess with this."
- 3 And if anybody read my op ed, you know
- 4 how I really feel about it.
- 5 Q. Okay, fair enough. Well, for instance, the
- 6 vehicle policy, when you look at that -- and that's --
- 7 or the travel policy, I'm sorry, and that's on page 34
- 8 of the first Legislative Audit Report. Beginning on
- 9 34.
- 10 If you'd take a minute, I have a few11 questions about that.
- 12 You'll see there at the very beginning,
- 13 it has in italics, "The regulations set out in this
- 14 section supersede the travel regulations previously
- 4. Control of the con
- 15 promulgated by the Supreme Court of Appeals effective
- 16 October 3rd, 2016."
- 17 And we've yet to find any travel
- 18 regulations that predate that. Do you recall if there
- 19 were travel regulations that were adopted or utilized
- 20 prior to this date?
- 21 A. If you look -- I'm not sure. I would say,
- 22 though, that if you look in the policy and procedure
- 23 manual that was just kind of haphazardly thrown
- 24 together from the 1990s on until we did this rewrite, I

Page 1489

- 1 think that this language is pulled from that language,
- 2 but I think you'd have to find it in the policy and
- 3 procedural manual that predated this one.
- 4 And that copy should be available over
- 5 there someplace. But it's not an easy read, because it
- 6 literally is just, "Let's paste this on, let's add this
- 7 page, let's strike through." It was not easy for
- 8 employees to understand what they were reading, and yet
- 9 they were all mandated to read it and sign a document
- 10 after the first week of employment that they had read
- 11 it. So --
- 12 Q. So there were travel regulations that
- 13 predated October of 2016. Do you know if they were -
- 14 for lack of a word, better word seriously adhered to
- 15 in terms of how, for instance, the justices' vehicles
- 16 were -- the vehicles used by the justices were checked
- 17 out and --
- 18 A. Well, the justices were always exempt from
- 19 these things in some instances. They didn't have to
- 20 worry about reserving. If, for instance, an employee
- 21 had reserved a -- I don't remember a justice ever using
- 22 a van.
- But if an employee had reserved a van
- 24 and a justice wanted the van, that employee got bumped;
 - Page 1490

- 1 the justice got it.
- 2 But they ended up with the three
- 3 Buicks. The Buicks were for the use of the justices.
- 4 the clerk of the Court and me. And that kind of
- 5 eliminated that bumping issue.
- 6 But I don't know how well they adhered
- 7 to the details of it. Obviously there are blanks in
- 8 several spaces for most of the justices.
- 9 Q. There are places within the regulation that
- 10 exempt -- expressly exempt out the Supreme Court
- 11 justices, like --
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. -- the Transportation Rental Vehicle Section
- 14 on page 35, and then again on Out-of-State Travel on
- 15 page 38, they're exempt from that.
- 16 A. Uh-huh.
- 17 Q. And then on 39, 10.4, it says, "An expense
- 18 account submitted by a Justice of the West Virginia
- 19 Supreme Court of Appeals, pursuant to Judicial Branch
- 20 policy, shall be honored irrespective of any of the
- 21 language in these travel regulations."
- 22 Now, first question about that: Is
- 23 the Judicial Branch policy what you're referring to
- 24 earlier with this notebook? Or is that something

1 different?

5

16

- 2 A. I guess -- I think it's what's being -- yes,
- 3 it's what's being referred to earlier in this policy
- 4 and procedure manual.
 - I -- what -- the assumption was, as
- 6 Justice Loughry said in his own memo, if he's using it,
- 7 it must be for official purposes. And it therefore
- 8 adheres to any policy.
- 9 Q. So really, pretty -- is it pretty fair to say
- 10 that the travel regulations applied to everyone but the
- 11 justices?
- 12 A. I think that's a fair statement, sir.
- 13 Q. And would it also be fair to say that you
- 14 could almost interpret the situation as an invitation
- 15 to do whatever you want with the Buicks?
 - A. Well, if a person is less than savory of
- 17 character. We didn't have the problem.
- 18 Q. So we sort of had an honor system.
- 19 A. Yes, and I think it was honored until Justice
- 20 Loughry.
- 21 Q. All right. So there wasn't any internal
- 22 protection --
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. -- from any justice who might not be -- who

- 1 might be less than honorable. Fair enough?
 - A. Right.
- 3 Q. Well --
- 4 A. Go ahead.
- 5 Q. I'm sorry, you were going to answer.
- 6 A. No, I said "Right."
- 7 Q. Okay. Similarly, it doesn't appear that
- 8 there was any effort to produce any type of policy to
- 9 protect the physical assets of the Supreme Court, in
- 10 other words, like an inventory control system. Is that
- 11 fair to say?
- 12 A. There was an inventory control system under
- 13 FIMS that pre -- predecessor to OASIS. Every time
- 14 there was anything bought, the invoicing, that went
- 15 through our Finance Division, then created that
- 16 inventory.
- 17 But after OASIS, somebody dropped the
- 18 ball. Because I learned very late in '16 that that was
- 19 no longer happening, that no one was bothering to
- 20 inventory.
- 21 So that was a real problem, obviously.
- 22 It had to be remedied and it was going to be fixed, and
- 23 I think they're probably fixing it. But I don't know
- 24 that, Lleft,

Page 1493

1

- 1 Q. So if -- would you agree that if we had an
- 2 effective inventory control system, a property control
- 3 system, we wouldn't have been missing a Cass Gilbert
- 4 desk for three or four years before anybody realized it
- 5 was gone?
- 6 A. Perhaps. But I don't know that the
- 7 historical furniture was ever even on the FIMS system.
- 8 so I don't know that that would have made a difference
- 9 to knowing where that was.
- 10 And I'm not sure that -- I mean, I
- 11 think that Fletch Adkins believed that it was either in
- 12 the storeroom or in one of the warehouses, so I think
- 13 that, you know, it would have been perhaps mislabeled
- 14 as to where it was. I don't know.
- 15 Like I said. I didn't know the desk had
- 16 left the -- the property.
- 17 Q. But you would agree that there was not a
- 18 fully effective protection system for property of the
- 19 Supreme Court --
- 20 A. Right.
- 21 Q. -- there was a functional effective system.
- 22 A. Right. I think especially with the
- 23 historical furniture, there should have been a better
- 24 inventory system of --

Page 1494

- Q. Let me move to another area of your
- 2 testimony: The individuals that you were told to hire.
- 3 Did you ever either in connection with the hiring of
- 4 any of those three individuals or the resistance to
- 5 letting another person go ever sense any threat to
- 6 your job if you didn't follow those instructions, or if
- 7 you went forward with that discharge?
- A. Well, I specifically felt that in the case of
- 9 the individual who -- who we felt -- I felt should be
- 10 discharged. I mean, she was pretty blunt about that.
- 11 I didn't know if she had the votes, but you know, she
- 12 certainly didn't express anything more than -- she
- 13 said, you know, new administrators -- I mean, "New
- 14 justices frequently bring in their own new
- 15 administrators," and this was, after all, before she
- 16 had actually taken the oath.
- 17 So I felt that. It was a little more
- 18 implicit not explicit with the hiring of the
- 19 others. Then once I interviewed them and talked to
- 20 them, I felt like they would do good jobs, or at least
- 21 adequate jobs.
- You know, in one case, I'd already had
- 23 the discussion, so that was something I really wanted
- 24 to do.

- Q. But the implicit threat with regard to the
- 2 termination was a pretty clear message.
- 3 A. It was pretty explicit with the termination.
- 4 Q. Okay. With regard to the furnishings -- I
- 5 know you said you didn't do competitive bids with
- 6 regard to -- excuse me -- with regard to some of the
- 7 construction other than the initial --
- 8 A. That's right.
- 9 Q. -- the initial construction. Were any of the
- 10 major items of furnishings -- like I noticed there was
- 11 a lot of money spent on rugs, there was a lot of money
- 12 spent on window treatments --
- 13 A. Uh-huh.
- 14 Q. -- there was even a good bit of money spent
- 15 for design services. Were any of those things bid out?
- 16 A. No, Silling was the choice for -- of
- 17 architects because they had been the architects for so
- 18 court projects in West Virginia, they knew the
- 19 standards. They understood backwards and forwards what
- 20 was necessary.
- 21 They also, you know, did a lot of work
- 22 in the courtroom. I don't know that that's been
- 23 mentioned, but the courtroom work was very intense and
- 24 remarkably, I think, helpful to returning it to its

1 original look. And that's something that the

2 historical architects of Silling were really good at.

3 And so it was -- it was -- the choice

4 of Silling was the obvious choice. We didn't bid that

5 out. That's the design services.

6 As far as the furniture, I don't know

- 7 if -- if Kim Ellis looked at competitive products. I
- 8 suspect she did somewhat. But I also think the
- 9 justices said, "I specifically want" this, that or the 10 other.
- 11 The infamous desk chair problem with
- 12 Justice Loughry -- you know, he had a desk chair that
- 13 he wanted and then he didn't like it, so we ended up
- 14 getting several different sample desk chairs for him to
- 15 try out, and finally he decided that he liked one
- 16 enough.
- 17 He never was really satisfied with it,
- 18 but he got then that desk chair. The first desk chair
- 19 we'd already bought, it went to another employee of the
- 20 Court.
- 21 Q. There's been testimony and I think you
- 22 confirmed this that there's two warehouses and also a
- 23 storeroom.
- 24 A. Yes.

Page 1497

- 1 Q. My question is: When someone came into the
- 2 Capitol, like when -- when those of us that are here
- 3 today come into the Capitol, we're shown our desk and
- 4 our chair and that's the end of the --
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. -- that's the end of the story --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. -- unless you swap with somebody that's here.
- 9 Was there ever any effort to say, "Why don't you go
- 10 down to the warehouse and see what -- what's available
- 11 that won't cost anything more"?
- 12 A. With everybody but the justices.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. That was standard practice for every other
- 15 office need but the justices. But as we added
- 16 employees at City Center East, I mean, there wasn't any
- 17 preexisting furniture. We moved lots of furniture over
- 18 from the other buildings, but in many cases there were
- 19 new employees who had to have new furniture.
- 20 Q. Is there still, as far as the last time
- 21 you've been there, a good bit of furniture stored in
- 22 the two warehouses?
- 23 A. There wasn't that much left. They had
- 24 managed to distribute it pretty effectively, I think.

Page 1498

- 1 The last time I was there. But you know, now it might
- 2 be piled full. I have no idea.
- 3 Q. And the reason for two warehouses is what?
- 4 A. Well, that's really an easy answer. The
- 5 warehouse that's owned by the State is primarily a
- 6 warehouse of -- of filed documents from the Clerk's
- 7 Office. There are very few other things there besides
- 8 paper.
- 9 The warehouse on Venable was created
- 10 primarily initially for two purposes. It was because
- 11 we were taking out all of those books from the
- 12 libraries -- we expanded the Clerk's Office. We had to
- 13 have a place to put those books and have them in
- 14 climate-controlled decent space and easily retrieved
- 15 for any people who might need them from the law
- 16 library, so that's about a quarter of that space.
- 17 Then the technology group, you know,
- 18 they -- they would pull computers and they'd take
- 19 computers apart, they'd use this part and that part to
- 20 put together a computer, prepare a computer and other
- 21 technical equipment, so we had that in another part of
- 22 the space.
- We also had a couple of offices there
- 24 for a couple of employees, and then we also then had

- 1 room for furniture.
- Q. One other area I'd like to explore with you:
- 3 There is -- or we have seen an e-mail from you to
- 4 Justice Loughry, and I think it's an exchange in
- 5 December of '13, about Christmas cards. You had a
- 6 habit, I think, of sending many Christmas cards out.
- 7 A. Yes, I do.
- 8 Q. The e-mail mentions a concern that you had
- 9 about and I'll -- I'll have to give my best
- 10 interpretation on it about any of this information
- 11 about the renovations getting out in the public.
- 12 A. Well, specifically I was concerned about the
- 13 floor.
- 14 Q. The floor in --
- 15 A. The floor in Justice Loughry's office, that
- 16 -- I was concerned that the -- the member of the press
- 17 who was there might see that floor and think, "That's
- 18 excessive" and then whatever he had him up there for
- 19 would suddenly turn into another story, and I was
- 20 concerned.
- 21 Q. And I think you may have mentioned also that
- 22 you were concerned that that would lead to stories
- 23 about other renovations of some of the other justices'
- 24 offices. Am I --

A. I might have. I do know that I was -- I

- $\,2\,$ don't remember exactly, but I do remember that I was
- 3 concerned about that reporter saying something about
- 4 the floor, therefore that would be perhaps a difficult
- 5 story for him and for the Court. I was just trying to
- 6 protect the justice.
- 7 Q. Did you, after that date, ever send similar
- 8 type expressions of your concern to other justices -
- 9 for instance, Justice Davis about any of the expenses
- 10 with respect to her renovations?
- 11 A. No, I didn't. Justice Loughry, as you notice
- 12 in the e-mail, rejected my concerns. And it turned out
- 13 he was right. The reporter didn't say a word about it.
- 14 Q. At that time.
- 15 A. At that time.
- 16 Q. At that time.
- 17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I think that's all I
- 18 have.
- 19 If you've been following us, you know
- 20 that we have allowed the justices to have counsel
- 21 present, and if they wish to ask questions, and if --
- 22 once that's done, we will take a break, if you are
- 23 still able to handle -- hang on.
- 24 Mr. Allen, any questions from you, sir?

Page 1503 Page 1501 1 State retirement laws about the amount of money that 1 MR. ALLEN: Mr. Chair, I have no 2 senior status judges can be paid. 2 questions. Thank you. CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you. 3 Are you aware of that being the case? 3 4 A. I'm generally aware. 4 Mr. Carr? 5 Q. Do you have any knowledge as to how the 5 MR. CARR: No. sir. 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Mr. Carrico, this is 6 Supreme Court - while you were employed with the 7 Supreme Court - as to how the Supreme Court paid senior your client. Do you have any questions you --8 MR. CARRICO: I have no questions, 8 status justice -- judges and what, if anything, they 9 did with respect to that cap? 9 thank you, sir. CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you. We've got A. I -- some of the first conversations I had 10 -- holy cow. It's 5:00 o'clock and we were planning to 11 with my new deputy, and I said, "I want you to handle 12 the senior status judges payment and hours," and she 12 eat at 5:30. 13 knew about the cap. Kathleen Gross had worked there a 13 Could you stand it for another 20 or 30 14 minutes and then we'll break for our -- a good while? 14 very long time, and she knew all about it, and she MR. CANTERBURY: All right. You mean 15 said, "Well, there's a cap and we have to keep track of 15 16 that." 16 right now? 17 17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. And I said, "Well, that's part of your 18 MR. CANTERBURY: All right, sure. 18 job too, I guess, then" -- because I figured it had CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Can you go a little been going on for some time and it hadn't been broken, 19 so there was no need to fix anything there. So I 20 further? 21 turned it over to her. 21 MR. CANTERBURY: I can go a little 22 22 further. And I'm -- I'm probably less 23 knowledgeable about the details of that than just about 23 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Counsel, I believe 24 any function of the Court. 24 you're up next. Is there --

Page 1502 1 MR. CANTERBURY: Are my eyeballs 2 floating? 3 THE COURT REPORTER: Could I perhaps stand up a minute? CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Oh, yeah. The hardest 5 working person in the room, I overlooked. 6 7 MR. CANTERBURY: Absolutely. 8 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: If you need a break, we can go ahead and break now. 10 THE COURT REPORTER: Oh, no, I'm good.

11 Just let me stand a second. 12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Let's go a 13 little longer and we'll stop for dinner.

14 Counsel, do you have some redirect?

15 MS. KAUFFMAN: Yes, Mr. Chairman, just

16 briefly.

17 **RE-EXAMINATION**

18 BY MS. KAUFFMAN:

Q. Mr. Canterbury, I do want to ask about 19 20 something that I had not mentioned earlier, and that is about payments that were made by the Supreme Court to

senior status judges. Let me -- let me begin by just

23 stating that it's my understanding that there are some

24 statutory caps in the Code regarding -- and in the

Page 1504

1 Q. Would that -- if you know, first, does --

2

3 Q. -- is Ms. Gross still -- is she still

4 employed by the Court?

5 A. Oh, no, she retired some time ago. And then

6 Jennifer Singletary took over and then she continued

7 with that work as well, and also was in concert with

8 the -- the Personnel Division, the Human Resources

9 Division.

10 They also were involved with keeping 11 track of this because of the -- because of the cap.

12 And the cap was very problematic at times, though.

13 Q. If you -- if you know, were there times that 14 the Court paid these senior status judges over the 15 statutory cap?

A. I think that did happen. I think that what 16 17 they did was that they then entered into a contractual 18 relationship. But again, I don't know the details very

19 well.

20 I do know that the need for it was 21 because there would be a -- there would be a case that

22 was a very cumbersome, lengthy case that a judge was

23 on, and it just couldn't be accomplished in the amount

24 of time allowed by the cap, and so then they would try

Page 1505

- 1 to find a way to continue the judge on the case, "they"
- 2 meaning just the personnel.
- 3 All of the senior status judges were
- 4 appointed by the Chief Justice. But the Chief Justice
- 5 -- none of the chief justices had anything to do with
- 6 their payment at all, and I don't think they ever gave
- 7 it much of a thought.
- Q. As to how the just -- as to how the judgeswere being paid?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. So would it be correct to state that at least
- 12 as far as you know, there was some knowledge about the
- 13 cap?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And the -- some of the senior status judges,
- 16 it is your understanding, were paid in excess of the17 cap.
- 18 A. I think so, yes.
- 19 Q. And if you know, how was that done? Was
- 20 there a change in how they were paid? Did they begin
- 21 as W-2 employees and then moved to 1099 employee -- or
- 22 1099?
- 23 A. I think so. But again, I -- I didn't handle

1 contract them after they'd run to the cap.

- 24 it, but I -- that's what I said: I think they moved to
 - Page 1506
- Q. Were you -- let me -- let me rephrase that.Were there ever any conversations about the -- the
- o were there ever any conversations about the -- th
- 4 senior status judges and the cap in any of the
- 5 administrative conferences during your tenure with the
- 6 Court?
- A. I don't recall a word about the cap or how
- 8 senior status judges were paid during administrative
- 9 conference. But -- I could be misremembering, but I
- 10 don't recall.
- 11 Q. Do you know whether or not anyone would make
- 12 the justice -- or the judges, rather, the judges aware
- 13 that they were being moved from a W-2 type employee to
- 14 contractor status for -- the reason for that change,
- 15 that they had reached a cap?
- 16 Do you know if there were ever any
- 17 conversations with the judges to let them know that's
- 18 why that was occurring?
- 19 A. I don't know.
- 20 Q. If that had occurred, who if you know -
- 21 would have -- who was in charge of that that would have
- 22 told the judges?
- A. It would have either been one of the two
- 24 deputies I told you, or it would be someone in the

- 1 Office of Human Resources.
 - 2 Q. And I'm sorry, you told me the second one.
 - 3 Was that Jennifer Singletary?
 - 4 A. Yes. Or it could have been Tammy Smith at
 - 5 the -- and before her, Chris Workman at the Personnel
 - 6 Division. Honestly, I just -- I had nothing to do with 7 it, so I don't know.
 - 8 Q. Mr. Canterbury, you have made some comments
 - 9 about some specifications or requests that certain
 - 10 justices had with respect to their offices, including
 - 11 Justice Loughry with the medallion and the TV, and then
 - 12 Justice Workman requesting the wide-planked cherry
 - 13 floor from Vermont.
 - 14 Were there such requests or
 - 15 specifications laid out by Justice Davis for her
 - 16 office?
 - 17 A. Yes, she had some furniture that she had
 - 18 purchased to be part of this office, but it needed
 - 19 work, re-upholstering a couple of chairs, some metals
 - 20 polished out from some scratches. So she was leaving,
 - 21 going out of state and she wanted us to just take care
 - 22 of that, then she'd repay it at the end of the summer.
 - 23 I failed to remind her at the end of
 - 24 the summer, and my understanding is she learned about

Page 1508

- 1 it -- it was roughly \$10,000. She learned that that
- 2 was never paid when all of this came down and she wrote
- 3 the check. Those were a couple of specifics she
- 4 wanted.

- 5 And then she also wanted the expensive
- 6 chair that she became aware would be helpful to her
- 7 arthritic problems with her back.
 - And then after a year of being in there
- 9 without rugs and the echoes and the -- it was really
- 10 kind of -- almost as echoey as this room can be, she
- 11 wanted some rugs. And then she hit upon that she
- 12 wanted those specific rugs.
- 13 Q. And are those the rugs that you talked about
- 14 earlier that total somewhere around \$27,000 or \$28,000?
- 15 A. Yes, correct.
- 16 Q. Did Justice Davis also make a request that
- 17 her office be glass -- have a lot -- some glass and 18 steel and be icy?
- 19 A. Yes. Well, she said specifically that she
- 20 wanted it to be "cool and icy." That's the words she
- 21 used. And that she wanted it to be a lot of -- a lot
- 22 of metals, a lot of white and a lot of glass.
- 23 So her cabinets are plastic. Her
- 24 cabinets are plastic laminate, and they're shiny, you

Page 1509

- 1 know, laminate -- shiny formica. And the glass
- 2 counters are very thick glass. And to support their
- 3 weight, there's stainless steel.
- 4 Q. Do you recall Justice Davis making a comment
- 5 that some people had referred to her as the ice
- princess and that she wanted her office to be icy?
- A. Yes, actually, that's exactly what she said. 7
- 8 I'd kind of forgotten about the "ice princess" comment,
- 9 but yes, that's what she said.
- 10 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I'm going to move now as I
- did before and kind of jump around. I have, I think,
- just two more questions. Were you ever personally --
- and I'm talking about just to you.
- 14 Were you ever personally asked by any
- 15 justice during your time with the Court to call or make
- 16 any type of complaint with the Office of Disciplinary
- 17 Counsel against any attorney that might have filed any
- 18 type of motion to recuse at the Court?
- 19 A. I don't recall that ever happening about an
- attorney with the Office of Disciplinary Counsel. No. 20
- I don't recall -- I don't think I ever filed a
- 22 complaint with the ODC.
- 23 I might have, but I don't recall it.
- 24 Q. Okay. And I believe in answering a prior

Page 1511 1 him about the Albright couch, so-called. But I had no

- 2 idea he had the desk.
- 3 And then I learned that when they moved
- 4 the couch, they also were now preparing to move a desk,
- 5 and it was one of the originals. And that really hurt
- 6 me. I mean, it really did.
 - I -- I don't know if you recall the
- 8 Bollard story and the tree story and all that. I had
- 9 really worked hard to protect this place. And when a
- 10 desk under my watch got taken off campus, I felt like a
- 11 putz. I felt terrible. I hated it.
- 12 There's nothing worth than self-
- 13 loathing, and that's what I felt then, that it had
- 14 gotten away from me.
- 15 Q. Okav.
- 16 MS. KAUFFMAN: Mr. Canterbury, thank
- you very much. I do not have any further questions for
- 18 you.

19

7

- MR. CANTERBURY: Thank you.
- CHAIRMAN SHOTT: We'll start back in 20
- 21 the back of the third row. Delegate Miller, any follow
- up by you? Please proceed.
- 23 DELEGATE MILLER: Thank you,
- 24 Mr. Chairman.

RE-EXAMINATION

2 BY DELEGATE MILLER:

3 Q. Were you aware of any threats made against

4 any of the justices of our Supreme Court?

A. Yes.

- 6 Q. Can you elaborate on any of those, to keep 7 some degree of security as well?
- A. Yes, that's what I was -- was going through
- 9 my head. There were threats made against Justice
- 10 Benjamin, but those were more of the flippant variety
- 11 and they weren't taken quite as seriously. It was
- 12 during all of the -- the Massey Caperton case.
- 13 There were also threats at that time
- 14 when the pictures came out with Justice Maynard.
- 15
- There was another threat that was very 16 serious about Justice Maynard. When he was a circuit
- 17 judge, he had -- he had sentenced somebody to a long
- 18 sentence, and now they were getting out, and they had
- 19 told somebody in prison that as soon as they got out.
- 20 they were gonna kill Spike Maynard, and he was a pretty
- 21 difficult hombre, and there was a lot of concern. So
- 22 there was heightened security at that time.
- Fortunately, he decided to do some 23
- 24 other bad things and went back to prison. That ended

- 1 question, you had mentioned -- this had something to do
- 2 with the desk, and I just missed what the context was.
- 3 I think you indicated that you had learned something
- 4 about the desk either being moved or maybe being moved
- 5 a day before the public.
- 6 Do you recall making that comment?
- 7 A. Oh, yes.
- 8 Q. How did that come about, and if you could
- 9 just please explain that.
- A. I was told by one of two people in a
- 11 conversation either with Kennie Bass or with Kim Ellis
- 12 I honestly don't remember which; it was all a
- 13 cluster; we were all talking in about a two-hour time
- 14 period and I really saw red, because I firmly believe
- 15 you protect the historical icons, and I was probably
- 16 not much fun on the phone with either one of them at 17 that point.
- 18 Q. And what -- what was the context of that
- 19 conversation, that the desk was -- was being moved or
- 20 had --
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. -- had been moved?
- 23 A. I knew of the couch, and I was called by Phil
- 24 Kabler to confirm that -- about the couch. And I told

1

11

16

1 our security threat.

2 But by far, the worse security threats 3 were to Justice Davis. They were abysmal.

Q. Visible threats? 4

5 A. Abysmal. One of them was from a person off 6 and on through the years - they finally got him; he's 7 got mental health problems - and he has -- the general 8 subject was that he was very anti-semitic. And of 9 course, Justice Davis is married to Scott Segal, who's 10 a Jew.

11 And they were -- they were spine-12 chilling threats. And there were some others to her on occasion, but nothing like this.

So yes, I knew of some. There were 15 some threats against me. It happens, you know, when 16 you're in public positions. I never took them very 17 seriously. I always thought the guy would shoot me but 18 not be announcing it ahead of time.

19 Q. I understand. I think there was some inquiry 20 earlier about a specific inquiry by Justice Davis and 21 -- on Justice Loughry's use of the vehicle kind of 22 specifically.

23 A. Very specific.

14

24 Q. In regard to that inquiry, as well as any

1 others, it seemed as though there was a little bit of 2 confusion about why it was directed specifically toward

3 Loughry. Were there any uncertainties about the

4 vehicle use -- usage by other members of the Court?

5 A. Well, I think there were some blank spots on 6 the register. But in the case of Workman and Davis, 7 they just, I'm sure, believed that the person who drove 8 them who was also in charge of keeping track of this 9 would enter it, so I don't think she thought anything 10 of that.

11 She did ask generally about all car 12 uses, the policies, the -- how -- not so much the 13 policies. Just the mechanics, how it works.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. Then when she got back reports of the 16 specifics regarding various justices' uses of the cars, 17 there were just so many from Justice Loughry that 18 that's when she wrote that memorandum.

19 Q. You feel that's why it was more 20 specifically --

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. -- aligned toward him?

23 A. Yes. But there was also a lot of argument

24 back and forth between them.

Page 1515 Q. In regard to the construction/renovation that

2 -- that took place --

A. Uh-huh. 3

Q. -- in the Court chambers, were there any 4 5 particular participation or supervision to detail on

office renovations by any of the justices?

7 A. Was there supervision, like they were coming 8 in and looking over what had been done and asking

9 questions about it and how it should be done

10 differently and things --

Q. Were the just --12 A. -- those kind of things?

Q. Were any of the justices particularly taking 13

14 the supervision role --

A. Justice Loughry. 15

Q. -- under (overtalk).

17 A. Justice Loughry mentioned that for a few 18 summers, he'd worked construction and knew a lot about

19 construction, and he had a lot of opinions. And he was 20 there all the time. I mean, I didn't -- I wasn't there

21 to see that he was there, but it was to the point that

22 the foreman of the job mentioned to me that they were

23 certainly slowed a bit from the time that Justice

24 Loughry would come in, they'd have to stop and explain

Page 1516

1 what they were doing, it was slowing them down.

He was afraid that they weren't going

3 to meet the -- the scheduling objectives.

Q. Okay. During the examination of travel logs,

5 if you're aware, was there any examination of travel

6 logs where locations or reasons registered by Justice 7 Loughry that appeared to be illegitimate on their face

8 were followed up on to actually see if they were

9 legitimate or legal?

10 A. I don't know. That wouldn't have come

11 through me. 12 Q. If a justice is advised by staff of some type

13 of infraction or potential crime and refused to correct 14 the impropriety, is it fair to say that that's on the

15 individual justice?

A. If a justice is informed of a crime or 16

17 something, it's on the individual justice to report?

18 Q. Something that they were doing themselves.

19 A. Yes. Should they be self-reporting, is that 20 what you're saying?

21 Q. Should they be self-reporting, or is it fair

22 to say that that's not the staff's fault, that that

23 lays strictly on the justices?

A. We weren't in positions as staff to be able 24

Page 1517

- 1 to second guess the justices. We could never report a
- 2 justice without some problems for our continued
- 3 employment, if that's what you're saying.
- 4 Q. So you never had the ability to if you saw
- 5 an infraction to be able to approach a justice and
- 6 either politely, friendly or formally or informally -
- 7 advise them that what they were doing might not be 8 correct?
- 9 A. I think that most members of the
- 10 Administrative Office and others who worked at the
- 11 Court would be very hesitant. They would just try to
- 12 either get word through some back channel, maybe
- 13 through another justice that they might want to talk to
- 14 him or to her.
- 15 But I don't think anyone would have
- 16 felt very comfortable doing that. I think that a lot
- 17 of the employees would have rejected an illegal order.
- 18 You know, if some justice had said, "Do" such and such,
- 19 and it wasn't legal, I think that a number would have
- 20 said, "I can't do that," you know.
- 21 But they would have trembled even
- 22 saying that. The justices have absolute power in the
- 23 Court.
- 24 Q. So those people that were employed to serve,
 - Page 15
- 1 support, even go so far as to protect a justice didn't
- 2 have the ability to talk with a justice if they saw an
- 3 impropriety, something the justice might be doing
- 4 wrong?
- 5 A. I guess that would be up to the individual,
- 6 the conscience of the individual. And also, I think
- 7 they would want to know more fully what you mean by
- 8 "wrong." I think that if one of the security people
- 9 saw something that a justice was doing illegally, I
- 10 think that they would have a word with the justice
- 11 because they would --
- 12 I think they're -- they're all former
- 13 state troopers, and I think their state trooper
- 4 background would certainly kick in.
- 15 But then "wrong" in terms of unethical,
- 16 irresponsible, improper, that becomes a matter of
- 17 degrees, and I don't know that they would feel that
- 18 they were in a position to make that judgment.
- But you know, I'm guessing how they
- 20 would think. I know that's what I would think and how
- 21 I would work.
- 22 Q. Based on your tenure and your service with
- 23 the Supreme Court, during your -- your period of
- 24 time --

- 1 A. Yes.
 - Q. -- would a justice be familiar with the WestVirginia Ethics Act regarding financial disclosure?
 - 4 A. I would think they would, but I also wonder
 - 5 if they might think that the Ethics Act doesn't apply
 - 6 to the Court. They would think that's a separate
 - 7 branch. I'm not sure they wouldn't have a lengthy and
 - 8 very lawyerly discussion about that.
 - 9 Q. Based on your experience, do you feel that 10 the Ethics Act applies to a justice of the Supreme 11 Court?
 - A. I'm not a lawyer; I'm not gonna be able to
 - 13 answer that with anything more than my opinion, and
 - 14 it's not a legal opinion. I will also give you an
 - 15 example. I always filled out the form that was sent to
 - 16 me every year or two by the ethics people. I never 17 failed.
 - 18 I'm not sure all the justices filled
 - 19 that out. And I don't know that anybody else at the
 - 20 Court was asked or if they filled it out, like the
 - 21 clerk or the chief counsel.
 - That in itself makes you wonder if the
 - 23 Ethics Act does apply to all of the members of the --
 - 24 the significant leaders in the Court. So --

- idn't 1 I think it does. That's why I filled
 - 2 out my form. But I can't speak for how they may think
 - 3 and -- I've sat through these legal back and forths
 - 4 where I thought I had a strong opinion at the end. I
 - 5 don't think I know my own name anymore; they've gotten
 - 6 me so confused.
 - 7 Because they can make remarkably good
 - 8 arguments for different sides of different issues.9 Q. Based on your prior experience with the
 - 10 Supreme Court, would a justice be familiar with West
 - 11 Virginia Code specifically criminal provisions to
 - 12 know the -- know the elements of a criminal code
 - 13 dealing with embezzlement, grand larceny, falsifying
 - 14 accounts, obtaining property under false pretenses or
 - 15 fraudulent schemes?
 - 16 A. Sure, they'd know that. That's fundamental
 - 17 law. They'd know every bit of that.
 - 18 Q. Would it be your opinion if -- if that took 19 place, that that would be a crime?
 - 20 A. Yes, of course. Those are criminal acts.
 - 21 Q. And this is a general assumption question --
 - 22 A. Okay.
 - 23 DELEGATE MILLER: And this will be my
 - 24 last question, Mr. Chairman.

07/26/2018 Page 1523

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Sobonya? Q. Based on how you answered the questions 2 DELEGATE SOBONYA: Sure. Thank you,

Page 1521

1

2 regarding the West Virginia Ethics Act as well as -- as

- 3 part of the -- the criminal code question, do you feel
- 4 there is a general belief by certain members of the
- 5 Supreme Court that they -- that they are above the law?
- 6 A. No, I believe they think that what -- they 7 say what the law is.
- 8 Q. That they are the law.
- A. No, that they say what the law is. That's a
- 10 little different. But that doesn't mean they're above
- 11 it. They say what it is.

1

- 12 Q. Explain your thoughts on that, please.
- 13 A. Well, I think that they believe - after case
- 14 after case after case comes in that they are the
- people who decide what the law means, what the law is.
- Again, I'm not a lawyer, as I've said many times, and I
- may be explaining this very poorly. 17
- 18 But it seems that Courts decide again
- 19 and again what is meant by the Constitution, what is
- meant by various Code created by this body. As they
- determine that, they are saying what the law is.
- That doesn't mean they're above the 22
- 23 law. I don't think they would ever believe they were
- 24 above the law. Though at times perhaps one or two may

Page 1522

- 1 have acted it. I don't know that they, even then,
- 2 would believe that they were.
- 3 But I think they do believe that they
- 4 say what the law is.
- 5 Q. Do they make an application as to who the law 6 applies to?
- 7 A. That wasn't your last question, incidentally,
- 8 but --
- 9 Q. Yeah, I -- the Chairman's gonna -- the
- 10 Chairman's gonna get me on that.
- 11 A. That's not up to me, brother. I -- yes, in
- 12 some circumstances, they would. Depending on what the
- 13 matter was before them.
- 14 Q. Thank you.
- 15 DELEGATE MILLER: Thank you,
- 16 Mr. Chairman.
- 17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Queen?
- 18 Delegate Byrd?
- 19 Delegate Fluharty?
- 20 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: No,
- 21 thanks.
- 22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you. Back over
- 23 to Delegate Summers?
- 24 DELEGATE SUMMERS: (Nodded negatively.)

- 3 Mr. Chairman.
- 4 **RE-EXAMINATION** 5 BY DELEGATE SOBONYA:
- Q. Mr. Canterbury, was Ms. Ellis under your 7 supervision?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. In her Affidavit, she states that her
- 10 -- one of her duties or part of her duties included -
- 11 but was not limited to managing the fleet vehicles
- 12 and overseeing the two warehouses.
- 13 And she also mentions that her initial
- 14 meeting with Justice Loughry to discuss renovations,
- 15 that he never mentioned the desk in his office was a
- 16 Cass Gilbert desk, and then she goes on to state that
- 17 she was first made aware of the couch at Justice
- 18 Loughry's house when she received the phone call from
- 19 Paul Mendez, a Court employee, who worked for her
- 20 division, and then he subsequently said "that during
- 21 that phone call, Mr. Mendez also informed me that
- 22 Justice Loughry also had a Cass Gilbert desk at his
- 23 house that he also wanted to move, but they were only
- 24 getting the couch at that time."

- Would she have had -- since she was the
 - 2 supervisor of that department and her duty was to
- 3 oversee the warehouses, who would be responsible for
- 4 knowing that that Cass Gilbert desk should be moved to
- 5 the Capitol storage room as stated in State Code and
- 6 not off premises at the -- at the offsite warehouse?
- 7 A. Well, that would have been her
- 8 responsibility, and I want to point out that the fleet
- 9 management duty was added after I left. She was not in
- 10 charge of fleet when I was there. And --
- 11 But she should have known. But then
- 12 again, Justice Loughry was her supervisor and said, I
- 13 guess, "Move it to the warehouse." I don't know. I
- 14 wasn't there.
- 15 Q. But she did have prior knowledge that it was
- 16 a Cass Gilbert desk prior to the removal from Justice
- 17 Loughry's home; is that correct? According to the
- 18 Affidavit?
- 19 A. According to the Affidavit.
- 20 Q. And did you have any discussions with her
- 21 about the Cass Gilbert desk being moved? Did she call
- 22 you and say, "Hey, there's a Cass Gilbert desk and I've
- 23 -- I've been requested to -- Mr. Mendez has been
- 24 requested" --

07/26/2018 Page 1525 Page 1527 1 Was there any conversation whatsoever 1 ethics people would look at that. 2 between you, Ms. Ellis, Mr. Mendez or anyone about that 2 DELEGATE SOBONYA: Thank you. 3 desk being moved prior to its movement? 3 MR. CANTERBURY: Are we there? A. I haven't talked to Paul Mendez since I was 4 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Harshbarger? 5 5 fired. I have talked to Kim Ellis, but I don't MR. CANTERBURY: Are we there? 6 remember if I called her to find out what was going on 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Let's -- let's stop 7 with the couch - because I'd heard about the couch -7 here. 8 and she brought up the desk, or if she called me. I 8 MR. CANTERBURY: Yeah. 9 don't remember. 9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Just show of hands 10 Q. Okay. And when Justice Davis was up for 10 among those of you who haven't answered -- asked 11 reelection -questions, if you still have some questions left. A. Uh-huh. 12 12 Okay, let's -- let's take a break for Q. -- she had filmed a commercial in her -- in 13 13 dinner. I think we have enough for our court reporter, 14 the chambers within the Supreme Court. Who gives 14 our witness, his counsel, our two guest counsels and 15 access to noncourt use to the Supreme Court chambers? 15 all our members, so --16 A. The justices. 16 In the Judiciary Committee room, you'll 17 Q. You wouldn't have to sign off on that? 17 find some food. Because it's already here and it's 18 A. No. No, that wouldn't be up to me. 18 ready to go, let's -- let's break for 45 minutes and Q. And did she have the contractor, the foreman 19 19 try to wrap up at 6:15. 6:15. 20 of the -- the contractor who did the work for the 20 (A break was taken for dinner after 21 Supreme Court, was in the commercial, filmed in the 21 which the proceedings continued as follows:) 22 Supreme Court? Is that -- do you have any knowledge of 22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Okay, folks, we're 23 that? 23 back in session. I was reminded by Minority Chair that 24 A. I think that -- yeah, a couple of contract --24 I ought to announce for the public that although that Page 1526 Page 1528 1 a couple of construction employees might have -- one or 1 was a working dinner, it was not paid for by the 2 the other or both - I don't recall - were in a 2 taxpayers. It was paid for by a taxpayer, but not the 3 commercial. It's been a while. 3 taxpayers plural. Q. So would using the Supreme Court for personal All right. We were, as I recall, just 5 gain, which would be a -- an election or a campaign 5 at Delegate -- I almost -- I almost promoted you. 6 commercial, would that be ethical? 6 Delegate Harshbarger, questions? 7 A. Well, I think the ethics -- the investigation And Mr. Canterbury, you're still under 7 8 commission ethics had allowed judges to use their 8 the same oath. 9 courtrooms in an election, and even people running for 9 MR. CANTERBURY: Yes, sir. 10 court can use courtrooms. 10 DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Thank you, 11 In fact, if the judge agrees, 11 Mr. Chairman. 12 courtrooms can be used for attorneys' commercials. I 12 Thank you, Mr. Canterbury, for still 13 can think of attorneys in a few courtrooms around the 13 being here. 14 state. So --14 **RE-EXAMINATION** Q. But using people paid -- paid with taxpayer 15 BY DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: 15 16 funds for construction projects in that same vein, Q. I just want to kind of dig in a little bit 17 would that be acceptable? 17 more to these change orders. The original agreement

> A. Yes, it was \$500,000 --22 Q. Yeah. 23 A. -- if memory serves.

21

18

24

A. I don't know. I'm not the ethics person to

problem, but on the other hand, even people who are 22 paid in a project with taxpayer money have a right to

So I'm not sure. I don't know how the

19 answer that question. I guess that on the one hand,

20 the way you opine it, sounds like that might be a

23 support a candidate of their choosing.

20 or \$800,000; is that correct?

24 Q. So when the Court issues that, is that based

19 contracting company back to 2009 was like for \$500,000

18 or, I guess you'd say purchase order, with the

Page 1532

Page 1529

- 1 on a scope of work? Because you said you didn't have
- 2 to bid anything. So was that just basically -- so
- 3 there's no dollar value associated?
- 4 So that's how I'm baffled, is how --
- 5 how that division order -- or purchase order is
- 6 determined? Is it by the scope of work or the dollar 7 value?
- 8 A. Well, we didn't have to bid it, but we
- 9 actually did bid the initial construction, so
- 10 Neighborgall won the bid. They looked at the scope of
- 11 work; they submitted the bid. Theirs was the lowest;
- 12 they got the job.
- 13 Q. Okay. So the -- the following change orders,
- 14 did they have to submit a new price to -- for that
- 15 change order if there's another project coming up, an
- 16 estimated cost?
- 17 A. Yes, and they were told that I wanted to see
- 18 what their price would for the per change order, for
- 19 the Clerk's Office, was the next big chunk out of this
- 20 -- or the -- I'm not sure if that came before or after
- 21 the courtroom renovation.
- 22 But I let them know that if I felt that
- 23 it was excessive, we could always bid again.
- 24 Q. Yeah. Now, did this same original purchase

- 1 Based on the scope of work that was presented by
- 2 Silling, they then presented a change order, as I under
- 3 -- as I recall and understand it.
- 4 Q. Okay. So the change order would be the same
- 5 thing for all the other justices' office.
- A. Right.
- 7 Q. When a new project came up, they'd kind of
- 8 get a rough idea, saying "It's gonna cost X amount of
- 9 dollars for these renovations."
- 10 A. Right.
- 11 Q. Okay, so --
- 12 A. But there were unexpected costs that were
- 13 associated that came up --
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. -- and they were -- in some cases, they were
- 16 simply added on. In other cases, there was an
- 17 additional change order.
- 18 Q. Okay. And if I remember right, back in my
- 19 previous questioning in the first round, these change
- 20 orders, you basic -- you said they were discussed among
- 21 all the justices and you eventually were the one who
- 22 signed it.
- 23 So they were aware of the possible
- 24 costs on these remodelings.

Page 1530

- 1 order cover the remodeling for the justices' office?
- 2 A. No, the original -- the original -- when you
- 3 say "purchase order," I think what you mean is the
- 4 bid --
- 5 Q. The bid, yeah.
- 6 A. -- covered the fourth floor Chief Counsel's
- 7 Office, which is basically half of the east -- the East
- 8 Wing of the building.
- 9 Q. Okay. So that original 2009 agreement does
- 10 not cover the justices' office renovation.
- 11 A. No, that came with change orders, and that's
- 12 why there are so many that were individual change
- 13 orders for each of the offices. And there was an
- 14 individual change order for the -- for the courtroom.
- 15 I've got a frog in my throat, I'm sorry.
- 16 Q. So there was a change order, say, to do the
- 17 renovations to Justice Ketchum's office, there was a
- 18 change order, correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. So there had to have been an idea or a
- 21 ballpark cost associated with that.
- 22 A. Well, yes. They talked to the justice --
- 23 talked to Silling, got an idea of what they wanted --
- 24 what he wanted and what they thought needed to be done.

1 A. Yes.

2

3

- Q. Okay. So they were --
- A. I don't think they were aware of each of the
- 4 costs. They just knew that there were gonna be change
- 5 orders that were handled in order to keep this
- 6 construction company on the job and the people they'd
- 7 gotten to know and -- and liked and thought that they
- 8 were respectful of their work habits.
- 9 A lot of this had to do with them
- 10 feeling that the -- that the Neighborgall Construction
- 11 people would -- would not work and make a lot of noise
- 12 when they were in court, they would not be bothersome
- 13 when they were in opinion conference, they would work
- 14 around their schedule.
- 15 And they found -- they found them
- 16 compliant and excellent, and so that's why they wanted
- 17 to keep them.

- 18 Q. Yeah, based on their previous work.
- 19 A. Right. But I don't recall that they saw
- 20 actual numbers for the change orders for the individual
- 21 offices. I think they did for the Clerk's Office,
- 22 because that was very expensive.
 - And I think they might have -- I can't
- 24 say if they did for the courtroom or not. I just don't

Page 1533

1

5

1 recall.

- 2 Q. Okay. The JIC reported I think it's on
- 3 page 3, and I think it's also been reported else
- 4 somewhere that Justice Loughry's office was
- 5 approximately \$363,000 for renovation costs.
- 6 A. That sounds about right. And that does not
- 7 include the furniture, does it? I think it was just --
- 8 well, maybe I'm misremembering. Maybe that does
- 9 include furniture and it was close to \$300,000 for the
- 10 actual construction. I just, frankly, don't remember.
- 11 Q. Yeah, and that's where I'm going with this.
- 12 Do you know how much -- this goes back to the previous
- 13 question I asked about Justice Davis. How much of that
- 14 was actually for structural and --
- 15 A. Right. I would say it was probably about the
- 16 same ratio in Loughry's office.
- 17 Q. So there was a --
- 18 A. Well, no, actually, I wouldn't. I would
- 19 think it was a higher ratio, because every stick of
- 20 furniture in Loughry's office was bought by the State.
- 21 He didn't have a single personal piece in there. From
- 22 the frames on the walls I've discussed to every chair,
- 23 every everything, it was all bought by the State.
 - And Davis' office, there were a couple

Page 1534

- 1 of expensive purchases, but the vast majority of the
- 2 furniture in her office her desk, her couch, her
- 3 chairs, her coffee table, things like that they're
- 4 all hers and at her expense.
- 5 Q. Yeah, I just did some quick math of some of
- 6 the big ticket items that was reported for his office,
- 7 and that ended up being about \$60,000 for the
- 8 furnishings, and you said there's more.
- 9 A. Yeah.

24

- 10 Q. So that still left about \$300,000.
- 11 A. Right.
- 12 Q. So -- but you say some of that was structural
- 13 or HVAC, electrical.
- 14 A. Some of it is structural; some of it is
- 15 casework. A lot of built-in counters, cabinets, things
- 16 like that.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. And it was very expensive because he wanted
- 19 sculpted walnut. As I recall, the sculpted walnut
- 20 alone was 100 and some thousand dollars, because he
- 21 wanted wainscoting out of the walnut, very expensive,
- 22 and he also wanted the walnut to match the cabinets
- 23 throughout, and so it was all sculpted walnut, the
- 24 doors, etc.

I think also the radiator covers were.

- 2 so that was not cheap. But again, if you have the
- 3 documents, you can review them. I don't have them so I
- 4 can't really --
 - Q. Yeah, I think --
- 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Let me just mention to
- 7 the Committee that we expect to have documents to
- 8 submit tomorrow that have been analyzed and have been
- 9 broken down in various ways, and we'll have a member of
- 10 the Legislative Auditor's Office to be here to answer
- 11 some questions.
- 12 So this witness probably isn't going to
- 13 have the kind of detail that we'll get tomorrow.
- 14 DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Okay.
- 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: And one other reminder
- 16 to our members, and also our witness: With our court
- 17 reporter here, it is hard for her to take everything
- 18 down when both parties are speaking at the same time,
- 19 so I would just encourage the questioner to wait till
- 20 the answerer or the responder finishes before you start
- 21 the next question.
- 22 DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Will do.
- 23 BY DELEGATE HARSHBARGER:
- 24 Q. I know there's been a lot of talk about this

- 1 -- about the \$7500 floor medallion, but also you know
- 2 there's been reported costs for Ketchum's office,
- 3 there's \$12,000 worth of carpet. I mean -- and I
- 4 believe your statement was that his office was
- 5 remodeled before Loughry's office in 2009.
- 6 A. Yes, it was.
- 7 Q. Okay. So Workman's office was also before
- 8 Loughry's office.
- 9 A. Yes, it was.
- 10 Q. And I think it was reported that there was a
- 11 \$9,000 sofa purchased for her office.
- 12 A. No, that's not exactly right. It was a
- 13 \$9,000 reupholster. She owns the sofa; the State owns
- 14 the upholstery. I don't know how you divide it up, but
- 15 that's the way it is.
- 16 Q. Okay, that's interesting.
- 17 A. I found -- I found it to be interesting too,
- 18 sir.
- 19 DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Okay, that's all
- 20 I have. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Back to
- 22 the right side of the room, first row, Delegate Lane.
- 23 DELEGATE LANE: Thank you. I'm going
- 24 to try to talk and keep this on. Let me know if you

Page 1537

- 1 get feedback.
- 2 RE-EXAMINATION
- 3 BY DELEGATE LANE:
- 4 Q. Mr. Canterbury, I have a copy of this year's
- 5 budget.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 Q. And for the Court -- for the judicial system,
- 8 and the budget's \$139,759,000. Approximately how much
- 9 of that budget would be for the Supreme Court
- 10 operation, just the Court itself?
- 11 A. Well, I've never been asked that, so I'm
- 12 gonna have to kind of calculate for a second. I doubt
- 13 if it would be more than 12 percent.
- 14 Q. 10 or 12 --
- 15 A. You're talking about the Supreme Court
- 16 itself, or are you talking about the Administrative
- 17 Office, the clerks, the --
- 18 Q. I'm talking about the operation of -- the
- 19 operations in the East Wing.
- 20 A. Okay. I'd say it's closer to probably 18
- 21 percent. But again, I -- it's been a while. I don't
- 22 know that I can say that with absolute assuredness.
- 23 But so much of the expense of the court
- 24 system is in the field with circuit judges, family
- Page 1538

- 1 court judges, probation officers, mental hygiene
- 2 commissioners, magistrates, ad infinitum.
- 3 Q. Okay. Now, going back to a follow-up
- 4 question that the just -- or the delegate from Boone
- 5 asked, the Court has two security guards.
- 6 A. Three.
- 7 Q. Three. One of them's over at --
- 8 A. -- City Center East.
- 9 Q. -- City Center East. So -- and you said that
- 10 Justice Davis never drove herself, that she always had
- 11 someone drive her. And I think we had prior testimony
- 12 that that was the security person.
- 13 A. Yeah. It -- yes, that's true, Delegate.
- 14 Neither Justices Davis nor Workman drove themselves.
- 15 It was always a security person driving them.
- 16 At times, the other justices had
- 17 security people driving them. But always Justices
- 18 Davis and Workman.
- 19 Q. Well, who -- who was securing the Court when
- 20 the security guards or the security personnel were out
- 21 chauffeuring justices?
- 22 A. There was a retired state trooper who was on
- 23 call, and he was contracted to come in. Of course,
- 24 there were two at the Court, so quite frequently, it

- 1 would just be one on the road.
- 2 And if all the justices were at a
- 3 meeting, the security people would be there, and there
- 4 would be nobody as the security person at times; and
- 5 then other times, they would feel that they needed to
- 6 have the -- the contracted person.
- 7 Q. Okay. And you testified that there'd been
- 8 threats against the justices?
- 9 A. Yes, against some justices.
- 10 Q. And is that why the justices asked the 11 security personnel to drive them places?
- 12 A. I think that's part of it, and I think,
- 13 frankly, some of it was well, for lack of better
- 14 words chauvinism from the 1990s.
- 15 Justice Miller felt strongly that
- 16 Justice Workman should never drive. I heard this. I
- 17 wasn't there. I heard this story. That she should
- 18 never drive herself.
- 19 Q. Okay. But let's -- let's talk about --
- 20 A. And I -- I -- but that's just apocryphal. I
- 21 don't know if that's true or not.
- 22 Q. Sorry.
- 23 A. Me too.
- 24 DELEGATE LANE: Sorry.
- 1 Q. Let's talk about Justice Davis.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. So she never goes anyplace without being
- 4 driven by the Court personnel.
- 5 A. If it's a State car, that's true.
- 6 Q. And part of that, you said, is for her own
- 7 safety?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. So does she have a guard when she goes
- 10 to the supermarket at night because she would be out
- 11 there in the public and theoretically would be unsafe
- 12 there too?
- 13 A. At the height of this -- I do not want to get
- 14 into too much detail. But at the height of this, yes,
- 15 Mr. Segal and Justice Davis did have private security
- 16 that they paid for themselves.
- 17 Q. So --
- 18 A. That was at the height of the -- of the
- 19 matter, before they rounded him up and --
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. I think he went to a mental institution.
- 22 Q. Okay. So I think you testified that the
- 23 justices had computers at home and that it was
- 24 necessary that the computers be secure.

Page 1541

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. And did -- did that require Court personnel
- 3 going to the residences to make those computers secure,
- 4 or is it a matter of -- I think one of the prior
- 5 witnesses talked about it was really just a matter of
- 6 logging in to the secured network.
- 7 A. Well, both things are true. The initial
- 8 setup, to make sure that it was a clean system and a
- 9 clean line that they were connected to, you had Court
- 10 personnel go to set them up.
- 11 After that, they just needed to log in,
- 12 and then it could be if they felt that there was
- 13 somebody doing something they shouldn't through their
- 14 system on their computer, then out of the central
- 15 office, they could take a look and see if there was
- 16 some sort of problem.
- 17 It's perhaps hard to believe, but we
- 18 had 3000 to 3500 attempts every day to get in illegally
- 19 to the system. Most of them with North African-
- 20 originating addresses.
- 21 Q. Did -- did anybody ever check to see if the
- 22 justices were actually doing work from home on -- on
- 23 the computers?
- 24 A. No.

Page 1542

24

- Q. This is sort of just a off-the-wall question.
- 2 We've heard all about these Cass Gilbert desks, and
- 3 we've heard that at least one of them has been valued
- 4 at \$42,000 and there are -- of historic value, but it
- 5 doesn't appear that any of the justices except maybe
- 6 Justice Ketchum ever used the Cass Gilbert desks.
- 7 Why are the justices not using these
- 8 desks?
- 9 A. Also Justice McHugh used one.
- 10 Well, it's a matter of taste and a
- 11 matter of what they feel they can use. These are big,
- 12 kind of cumbersome desks. They're perfect for the
- 13 1920s era.
- 14 Q. But it still -- but the size of the chambers15 hasn't -- hasn't expanded any.
- A. Oh, no, no, they'd fit, but they
- 17 just -- you're right. But they're used -- there are
- 18 two used by law clerks. There's one used by the
- 19 Security Director, Arthur Angus.
- 20 I don't know why they don't want to use
- 21 them. It's one of the very few legal phrases I know in
- 22 Latin: De gustibus non est disputandum. Matters of
- 23 dispute, there can be no -- the matters of taste, there
- 24 can be no dispute.

1 Some people like shorter, smaller

- 2 desks, I guess. I don't know.
- Q. Okay. Now, the justices are all on thefourth floor; is that correct? No, the third floor.
 - A. Third floor.
- 6 Q. Third floor. During your 11 1/2 years at the
- 7 Court, was it your observation that the justices
- 8 interacted with each other in each other's offices, or
- 9 not?

5

- 10 A. Different strokes for different Courts. My
- 11 original experience was that Justices Starcher and
- 12 Albright were pretty fast friends, they frequently were
- 13 in one or the other's offices talking.
- 14 Justice Maynard got to know Justice
- 15 Benjamin pretty well, they'd talk a lot. Justice Davis
 - 6 would float in occasionally.
- 17 Later when Justice McHugh was there, he
- 18 was really a wonderful person to hold people together,
- 19 among other things, and all of the justices talked
- 20 frequently among themselves. It was a very collegial
- 21 Court. Those four years were golden years for
- 22 collegiality. It was remarkable just how -- how easy
- 23 the interactions were.
 - But when he left, some barriers started

Page 1544

1 to rise between their interactions and -- Justice

- 2 Ketchum, Justice Loughry spent a lot of time talking.
- 3 Sometimes -- and Justice Loughry and Justice Workman
- 5 Sometimes -- and Justice Loughly and Justice Working
- 4 interacted a lot, sometimes with Ketchum.
- 5 Justice Benjamin and Justice Davis
- 6 would talk, and they had a good relationship. I think
- 7 everybody kind of tried to get along. But I think
- 8 there were some just -- it wasn't like it had been.
- 9 Q. Well, would it be fair to say that when the
- 10 ren -- when the renovations were going on, that the
- 11 justices would have been in each -- each other's
- 12 offices and could have observed what the renovations
- 13 were?
- 14 A. Well, sure. I'm sure that -- I'm sure they
- 15 would see things. Whether they knew -- you know, it's
- 16 like The Price is Right. Would they know what the
- 17 couch cost or what the chair cost or any of that? I
- 18 don't know that they would have known that.
- 19 And I always kept it between the
- 20 justice and me, I mean, unless the justice wanted me to
- 21 go telling the other justices, I felt --
- 22 One of the harder parts of the job I
- 23 think I mentioned earlier I had to serve the Court,
- 24 which was the majority of the Court but I had to

Page 1548

Page 1545

- 1 serve each one of them individually. I did my level
- 2 best, which means that I had to keep certain
- 3 confidences if they seemed to want me to keep the
- 4 confidence.
- 5 Of course, I felt -- if I felt the
- 6 confidence was out of line, I would take it to
- 7 administrative conference. That rarely happened,
- 8 however.
- 9 Q. Okay, one -- one final question. I can't
- 10 remember, but somewhere in all of this, it was said
- 11 that Justice Benjamin spent -- either it was \$122,000
- 12 on travel or maybe it was \$222,000, something like
- 13 that. What -- how could you do that much -- how could
- 14 you run up that much expense?
- 15 A. Well, Justice Benjamin felt that the Court
- 16 needed to have somebody who did some outreach to
- 17 represent the Court on the road, and he started that
- 18 right after he got elected. He felt very strongly
- 19 about that.
- So he made a point of going to all the 20
- 21 drug court graduations; he made a point if there was a
- 22 -- if there was a rural county with a small bar
- 23 association and they had invited any justice to show
- 24 up, he'd drive to the eastern panhandle, he'd drive to
 - Page 1546

- 1 the central part of the state.
- 2 And the reason that he built up the
- 3 expenses is because Justice Benjamin is more of a Boy
- 4 Scout than just about anybody I've ever met, and he
- 5 believed that he should never take a State car if he
- 6 was going to go anywhere that wasn't related to the
- 7 State.
- 8 Well, while he was out to the bar, he
- 9 might want to go visit a pal who lived nearby or take
- 10 kind of circuitous route back, and he didn't think it
- 11 was appropriate for the Court to pay, so he would
- 12 simply have the MapQuest figures for how much it cost,
- 13 how many miles it was from the Capitol to wherever the
- 14 heck he was going and have that computed.
- 15 It didn't matter how many miles he
- 16 actually put on that amazing old Toyota. I was always
- 17 terrified that Toyota would break down in the middle of
- 18 nowhere. But he always, always felt that it was the
- 19 only way he could do that and be honorable, and that's
- 20 the way he did it.
- He's one of the most honorable people 21
- 22 I've ever known in my life.
- 23 Q. Okay, thank you.
- 24 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Pushkin.

- DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you,
- 2 Mr. Chairman.
- 3 **RE-EXAMINATION**
- 4 BY DELEGATE PUSHKIN:
- 5 Q. Just to -- you stated that -- that the
- 6 threats against Justice Davis were -- were I don't
- 7 know if you said taken more seriously than others but
- 8 you said they were taken -- they were obviously taken
- 9 fairly seriously.
- 10 The -- the gentleman who was eventually
- 11 picked up, was he considered to be part of like a
- 12 larger group? Is that why it was taken more seriously?
- A. No, it was the vitriol and his specificity in 14 their move -- he had knowledge of their movement and
- 15 other specifics. And I don't know that he was ever
- 16 part of any organization. I never heard that.
- 17 Q. He never claimed to be part of any sort of
- 18 paramilitary --
- 19 A. He may have, but I don't recall that. But he
- 20 had that -- you've got the right kind of mentality
- 21 there.
- 22 Also. I don't know if he's still
- 23 institutionalized or not. I know that he was. He may
- 24 be out now for all I know, and maybe they've fixed him.

- 1 I don't know. I don't think there are any recent
- 2 threats from him.
- Q. Okay. The storage area downstairs --3
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. -- you mentioned -- this is the first that
- 6 I've heard of that.
- A. Right. 7
- 8 Q. You said that's where the -- a Cass Gilbert
- 9 desk should be stored because there was a -- well,
- 10 there's a rule in place that it -- that it should not
- 11 leave the Capitol. I guess it's a statute, correct?
- 12 There's a --
- 13 Yes. I believe it is.
- 14 Q. -- State law that those desks can't leave the
- 15 Capitol.
- A. I think -- if memory serves, it's 29-1-7, but 16
- 17 I'm no -- again, I'm not the lawyer around here. I
- 18 think it's 29-1-7.
- MR. HARDISON: 29-1-7. 19
- 20 Q. We have confirmation from our -- from our 21 counsel.
- 22 A. Well, if Joe says it, it must be true.
- Q. Yeah, so it's State law that it's not to 23
- 24 leave the Capitol. Is that the reason for the storage

1545-1548

Page 1552

Page 1549

1 area downstairs, for items that are not allowed to --

- 2 A. I don't know. The storage area, I inherited.
- 3 I don't know why it was there, but that's one of the
- 4 reasons it was used. There were other things in there,
- 5 documents -- not clerk's documents, but documents and
- 6 various and sundry things the justices had had in their
- 7 offices and decided they wanted in storage instead of
- 8 in their offices, you know, framed certificates, things 9 that were honorary, plagues that they'd been given
- 10 them. They wanted to keep them, but they didn't
- necessarily want them in their offices.
- 12 Just a -- it's a mixed bag in that
- 13 room. It's not a very big room; it's a relatively
- small room. But it did have enough room to put a
- couple of case goods, pieces of furniture. 15
- 16 And so I think that -- you know, at
- 17 least my thought was: Make sure if we have a Cass
- 18 Gilbert thing, don't let it stray over to the
- 19 warehouse. That's -- that's my feeling about it.
- Q. Do you know of any other -- any other items 20
- 21 in the Capitol that are specifically named in State law
- 22 that are not to be removed from this building?
- 23 A. I think everything that you're sitting in.
- 24 And you might laugh at that, but the Minnesota State

- 1 didn't know he took the desk, so I didn't have any
 - 2 opportunity to think of telling him about it.
 - 3 So I don't know.
 - 4 Q. Okay. One more question. The -- the female
 - 5 employee that, I guess, spoke with you and you later
 - 6 spoke with then Clerk Loughry, she stated she didn't
 - 7 want to follow through with any sort of formal
 - 8 complaint or charges as long as it stopped. Correct?
 - 9 A. Right.

10

- Q. And it stopped?
- 11 A. It stopped.
- 12 Q. And -- one follow-up question. Did she --
- 13 how long -- how much longer after that did she remain
- 14 employed at the Court?
- A. Until she left for school in the end of the 15
- 16 summer. And she didn't go except -- because she
- 17 decided it was time to go. She was a temp. She wasn't
- 18 a permanent employee.
- 19 Q. She was a temp, not --
- 20 A. So she was there roughly from -- gosh, this
- 21 is -- this is hard to remember. But it was in 2006.
- 22 January or February until August, maybe September,
- 23 whatever, and then she went off to school.
- 24 Q. Okay.

- DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you. 1
 - 2 MR. CANTERBURY: Sure.
 - 3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Hollen?
 - 4 Overington? Delegate Overington?
 - DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Yes, thank you, 5
 - 6 Mr. Chairman.
 - 7 **RE-EXAMINATION**
 - 8 BY DELEGATE OVERINGTON:
 - 9 Q. It sounds like you had four desks of the Cass
 - 10 Gilbert desks. The good news was you didn't have the
 - 11 five justices battling for them.
 - 12 A. That's true, yes, sir.
 - 13 Q. For the administrative meetings that you had
 - 14 that were every month or two where you attended most of
 - 15 them, were any of those meetings recorded?
 - 16 A. No, the meetings were never recorded, ever.
 - 17 Did you just ask if the meetings were recorded? I kind
 - 18 of coughed for a second. But none of the
 - 19 administrative conferences were recorded in any way.
 - 20 Q. Were any other meetings recorded?
 - 21 A. Not that I'm aware of. If they were
 - 22 recorded, they were done surreptitiously. There was no
 - 23 official recording.
 - Q. I know here at the Capitol, here in the House

1 Capitol lost some of those desks and they were sold on

- 2 the open market that had been in legislators' chambers.
- 3 from reports. I wasn't there, but I read that.
- 4 Architectural furniture is -- is a very
- 5 hot property right now, so I think anything that was
- 6 originally chosen by the Cass Gilbert firm is -- is
- 7 supposed to stay in the Capitol, and it's -- I don't
- 8 know of anything else that's desig -- designated in
- 9 there. I just remember the Cass Gilbert reference.
- 10 Q. Okay. Well, I'm -- I've got -- I'm just -- I
- 11 don't know that I'm speaking for everybody, but I know
- 12 I'm just learning today that that was actually -- not
- 13 just a policy of the Court, but actually State law.
- 14 Was it widely known over in the Court that that is 15 State law, that those desks are to stay in the
- 17 A. I wouldn't say it was widely known at the
- 18 Court, but it was widely known among the more alert
- 19 members of the Capitol Building Commission.
- 20 Q. So would it be known by someone who served as 21 a clerk at the Supreme Court for 11 years and then was
- 22 later a chief -- a chief justice?
- 23 A. I don't know if he would have known that or
- 24 not, to be perfectly honest. But you know, I -- and I

Page 1553

- 1 of Delegates, every year the staff tells us that we
- 2 have our Ethics Commission reports that we have to fill
- 3 out --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. -- and sort of as a reminder. There was
- 6 nothing in your office where you did that for the 7 justices?
- 8 A. No, I think they were sent directly to them
- 9 by the Ethics Commission. I know I always got mine
- 10 directly from the Ethics Commission. But they also had
- 11 to file something with the Clerk's Office, the clerk's
- 12 version of the ethics statements, as I recall.
- 13 I had nothing to do with that. No.
- 14 that was a Clerk's Office function. And I think they
- 15 had to file something every year with them.
- 16 But I don't know if it was as
- 17 comprehensive as the ethics form that I always had to
- 18 fill -- that I always chose to fill out. I think I had
- 19 to fill it out. I always did.
- 20 Q. Did most of the staff for the Court have to
- 21 do an ethics report?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. Do the judges have to do one?
- 24 A. No, I think the judges, the circuit judges,
- Page 1554
- 1 family court judges -- that's why I think there's
- 2 something filed with the -- with the Clerk's Office.
- 3 but I swear, I just never had anything to do with that,
- 4 so I'm not conversant enough to tell you much.
- 5 Q. Would the assumption have been that if the 6 judges do it, the justices should also do it?
- 7 A. Sure. And I think that the justices filed
- 8 with the Clerk's Office. But I don't think that they
- 9 -- they may have. I don't know if they submitted stuff
- 10 to the ethics office or not.
- 11 But I know that there was some question
- 12 early on about whether or not they needed to or should.
- 13 But that was in the first few years I was there.
- 14 The later ones might have thought it
- 15 was just a matter of, you know, another office thing to
- 16 do. I don't know.
- 17 Q. And my last question then: Do -- was there 18 any policy about bringing private furniture into the 19 court?
- 20 A. No, you could bring in your personal
- 21 furniture if you wished. Justice Workman, Justice
- 22 Benjamin, Justice Davis, I, all had personal furniture
- 23 in our offices.
- 24 Justice Loughry had absolutely nothing

- 1 that wasn't paid for by the Court.
- 2 And I don't think Justice Ketchum did
- 3 either. I think all of his was State furniture.
- 4 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you. Thank
- 5 you, Mr. Chairman.
- 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Fast?
- 7 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you again,
- 8 Mr. Chairman.
- 9 RE-EXAMINATION
- 10 BY DELEGATE FAST:
- 11 Q. Mr. Canterbury, have you ever attended any
- 12 fundraisers for Justice Davis?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Okay. I wanted to ask you some questions.
- 15 There was a memorandum by Justice Loughry writing to
- 16 the other members of the Court, and he stated that
- 17 there was no written policy regarding use of Court
- 18 vehicles by either members of the Court or Court
- 19 employees. Is that true?
- 20 A. There was nothing about the -- there -- I
- 21 think that's true, yes.
- 22 Q. Okay. He also stated -- that that you had
- 23 utilized a Court vehicle on 38 occasions without
- 24 providing a destination.

Page 1556

- 1 A. That's true.
 - 2 Q. That's true?
 - 3 A. Whether either Arthur Angus didn't write it
 - 4 down or my secretary, executive assistant, didn't give
 - 5 him the information. I never did that. It was always
 - 6 her doing, so I don't know what happened.
 - 7 Q. Okay. He stated that on at least eight
 - 8 occasions, Justice Benjamin checked out of court
 - 9 without stating a destination. Is that true?
 - 10 A. I read that. I'll assume it's true, but I

 - 11 don't know that.
 - 12 Q. Okay. And that Justice Workman had use of a
 - 13 vehicle without a destination being supplied as well,
 - 14 that there were entries of that. Do you know if that's
 - 15 true?
 - 16 A. I believe absolutely in the Auditor's report,
 - 17 so I'll say it's true. But I wasn't part of it. I
 - 18 will also say that that would have been a failure on
 - 19 the part of one of the security staff because not only
 - 20 were they the security people, but they were in charge
 - 21 of entering that information.
 - Justice Workman would not have gone in
 - 23 and entered the information herself, for goodness
 - 24 sakes.

1553-1556

1 Q. And likewise, Justice Davis did not list a

2 destination on her use of a Court vehicle on multiple

3 occasions. Would that be true?

- A. Again, that's what was on the report, and I 4
- 5 have no reason to disbelieve the Auditor's report.
- 6 However, again, I would say that that would not have
- 7 been a failure of Justice Davis; it would have been a
- 8 failure of her -- Arthur Angus, who not only was the
- driver, but also in charge of the system.
- 10 Q. So lack of entry of a destination for any justice, are you saying would most likely be a failure
- 12 on the part of the staff versus the individual justice?
- A. Well, of course, the justices have to be 13
- 14 responsible for what staff does, and in that sense, it
- 15 falls -- it falls back on them. But also, they didn't
- do the entries themselves; they were done by Arthur
- 17 Angus and/or Jess Gundy.
- 18 And so since they were doing the
- 19 driving and then they didn't enter the information,
- 20 then that would have been their omission, not the
- 21 justices'.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Just as I said about my secretary following
- 24 up, maybe she did; maybe she didn't.

- Page 1558
- Q. Now, what about for you? Were you 2 responsible for your own entries, or did you --
- 3 A. Well --

1

- 4 Q. -- have staff for yourself as well?
- 5 A. -- ultimately, I'm responsible. But again, I
- 6 had -- Joan Mullins was the person -- or in some
- 7 occasions, Mary Greene, was the person who was supposed
- 8 to call up and say, "Steve's taking the car to" X, Y
- 9 and -- you know, to X for this purpose or that purpose.
- 10 Q. Okay.
- A. And either she didn't make some of those 11
- 12 calls or they took the call and didn't put the
- 13 information into the system. I don't know which --
- 14 where the breakdown was.
- Q. Okay. And while campaigning to become a 15
- justice of this Court, he personally observed Justice
- Davis arrive on more than one campaign event in a Court
- 18 vehicle driven by Court security.
- 19 Do you have any knowledge of that or
- 20 whether that's true or not?
- 21 A. I have no idea.
- Q. Okay. There was a -- some communication
- 23 between Denny Rhodes, West Virginia Legislative
- 24 Auditor's Office and Sue Racer-Troy, and he had sent

- Page 1559 1 her a summary of a meeting and asked for accuracy, and
- 2 there was one -- this is Exhibit 14, No. 5, second 3 page.
- 4 It said, "The Court use" -- and he --
- 5 and right here, she's quoting what was in this summary,
- 6 and then she responds to it. "The Court used the Fixed
- 7 Asset Inventory Management System in WVFIMS, but from
- 8 her inspection, it appears that the Court had not
- 9 updated or utilized it since 2010."
- 10 "Mr. Canterbury had informed her this
- 11 was intentional because he did not want others knowing
- 12 the Court" -- I assume means "what" "the Court had."
- 13 "Since 2010, even IT inventory such as
- 14 server, routers, computers, etc., had not been
- 15 recorded. The IT department -- IT department of the
- 16 Court may have kept an internal record in an Access
- 17 database."
- 18 And then her response was, "After
- 19 returning to the office on Monday afternoon, I reviewed
- the fixed assets in FIMS. The latest acquisition date
- 21 for technology equipment (servers, routers, computers,
- 22 etc.) is 7-9-2010. No technology equipment was added
- 23 after that date.

24 The last acquisition date for vehicles

Page 1560

- 1 was 9-24-13. No vehicles were added after that date.'
- Now, her response right there, is that 2
- 3 true?
- 4 A. No, not entirely. As I said earlier, as we
- 5 transitioned the phones to Amazon -- Amazon -- to
- 6 OASIS, we -- there was a breakdown of keeping records.
- 7 I'm not sure why Ms. Troy didn't keep the procedure
- 8 that Mike Proops, her predecessor, had established.
- 9 But I certainly never told her that I
- 10 wanted to keep from the public any information about
- 11 what the Court had.
- 12 She says further on -- or commenting
- 13 about --

- 14 Q. I haven't got to that part yet.
- 15
- 16 Q. I'm just asking about the entry of -- of the
- 17 data in the system.
- 18 A. Apparently she stopped entering it and felt
- 19 that it was somebody else's responsibility. I guess.
 - Q. So that was her misgiving -- misdoing.
- 21 A. Well, it had been her predecessor's job, so
- 22 it would have been her job too.
- Q. So was she under you? 23
- 24 A. Oh, yes.

- 1 Q. Okay.
- 2 A. So it falls back on me ultimately.
- 3 Q. So is it true that the last acquisition data
- 4 for technology equipment such as servers, routers and
- 5 computer was July 9, 2010? And she wrote this in March 6 of 2018.
- A. Well --
- 8 Q. So is that -- is that an accurate statement 9 right there?
- 10 A. I can't say if that date's accurate. But I
- 11 also know that the IT department decided that they
- 12 wanted to keep their own records and to take that out
- 13 of everybody else's hands, because they felt that some
- 14 of the information wasn't being recorded properly, so
- 15 they started doing it on their own.
- 16 I think she references that as well.
- 17 Q. Is it true that no -- no vehicle acquisitions
- 18 were recorded since -- or --
- 19 A. Well, there were only 19 --
- 20 Q. The last acquisition for vehicles was
- 21 September 24, 2013. Was that -- is that true?
- 22 A. Could be. I'm not sure that -- that anything
- 23 was bought after '13 when I was there. There might
- 24 have been. But there were only 19 vehicles. There was
 - Page 1562
- 1 a list of them. I presented that list in the spring of
- 2 '16, as I recall, to Aaron Allred when he requested it,
- 3 so I submitted the list of vehicles we had.
- 4 It was only 19 vehicles. So we knew
- 5 what the vehicles were. We just may not have had them
- 6 in the system she's referring to.
- 7 Q. Okay. Then she goes on to requote the
- 8 summary again, quoting, "Mr. Canterbury had informed
- 9 her this was intentional because he did not want others
- 10 knowing the Court -- knowing what the Court had," and
- 11 she said, "I don't recall that Mr. Canterbury told me
- 12 this specifically related to the fixed asset inventory.
- 13 He often referred to being a third branch of government
- 14 and the independence of that came with that. I felt
- 15 that best practices were not always followed due to
- 16 wanting to exercise independence."
- 17 And she goes on. So you dispute that
- 18 you told her that you -- you -- that was on purpose
- 19 because you didn't want people knowing what the Court
- 20 had.
- 21 A. I didn't tell anybody to hide anything.
- 22 That's not my style. I didn't do that.
- 23 I did, though, frequently talk about
- 24 that we were a third branch of government, frequently

- Page 1563

 1 OASIS especially -- and she was head over -- she was up
- 2 to her eyeballs in OASIS.
- 3 Kept referring to the Court as an
- 4 agency, not as a branch. They didn't seem to really
- 5 know how to compute us. And they just had a hard time
- 6 understanding it, and I think in lots of discussions
- 7 with her. I would say, "When you're in there, remind
- 8 them that we're a branch, we're not an agency. No, we
- 9 don't work for the Governor. No, we don't respond like
- 10 an executive agency."
- 11 There was a need to make sure that that
- 12 -- that there is an independence to the three branches,
- 13 and I did emphasize that. But in relationship, as I
- 14 recall, with the OASIS -- well, situation, I'll say.
- 15 Q. Okay. Quick question about the floors.
- 16 Which floor was more expensive, Justice Workman's floor
- 17 or Justice Loughry's floor?
- 18 A. Just -- I think Justice Workman's was more
- 19 expensive. Even with the medallion, I think hers was
- 20 more expensive. Again, though, I don't have the
- 21 documents in front of me, but that's just what memory
- 22 serves.
- 23 Q. Okay. When you were terminated in 2017, were
- 24 State vehicles used to transport your items to your

1 home?

2 A. I said that earlier. Yes.

B Q. And were State vehicles ever used to

4 transport any of your personal items into the Capitol?

- 5 A. No. I brought them in my own vehicles.
- 6 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you,
- 7 Mr. Chairman.
 - MR. CANTERBURY: Thank you.
- 9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Capito.
- 10 DELEGATE CAPITO: Thank you,
- 11 Mr. Chairman.
- 12 RE-EXAMINATION
- 13 BY DELEGATE CAPITO:
- 14 Q. During your time on the Court, did you, or to
- 15 your knowledge, any other employee or employees of the
- 16 Court, receive bonuses or any other additional
- 17 compensation from any of the justices?
- 18 A. No. Bonuses aren't allowed. There were no
- 19 bonuses.
- 20 Q. Not even from -- not even a personal from --
- 21 personally from any one of them -- another person?
- 22 A. Not that I'm aware of.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. I never got one.

Page 1565

- 1 Q. Fair enough.
- 2 A. So if somebody else got one, I am now even 3 angrier.
- 4 Q. Fair enough.
- 5 DELEGATE CAPITO: Thank you, thank you
- 6 for being here. Thank you for your patience.
- 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Fleischauer.
- 8 RE-EXAMINATION
- 9 BY CHAIRMAN SHOTT:
- 10 Q. Mr. Canterbury, the name Zach Johnson has
- 11 come up a few times, and I think he's somehow
- 12 associated with the construction and maybe even became
- 13 an employee of the Court. Can you --
- 14 A. He did.
- 15 Q. -- help me follow that?
- 16 A. Zach was extremely popular as a construction
- 17 person. He was -- he was a very good construction man.
- 18 He's a good -- he's a certified -- I think he's a union
- 19 carpenter by training.
- 20 But he's just really knowledgeable
- 21 about all manners of construction. Justice Ketchum was
- 22 extremely impressed with him and brought up, I think,
- 23 at administrative conference --
- 24 I think he brought it up with me

Page 1566

- 1 personally a few times and at administrative
- 2 conference, that he thought that we could use somebody
- 3 to go around and perhaps save the State a little money
- 4 by Zach taking care of a lot of this stuff that we were
- 5 -- at the magistrate courts, family courts, for some
- 6 repairs and some minor construction, rather than having7 to contract it.
- 7 to contract it.
- 8 And so I -- he was hired by the Court
- 9 and he worked under the watch of Kim Ellis.
- 10 Q. Do you know what time frame he switch -- he11 basically transitioned from working with an outside
- 12 contractor to when he became a Court employee?
- 13 A. You know, I'm not 100 percent sure, but I'm
- 14 gonna say 2014 or '15. It was towards -- it was after
- 15 -- either towards the end of the Davis project or after
- 16 it was over.
- 17 Q. We have information that he may have appeared
- 18 in one of her campaign commercials or her husband's
- 19 commercials. Do you know whether or not that's true?
- 20 A. I don't know about the husband's commercial.
- 21 But yes, as I recall -- I wasn't involved with the
- 22 making of the commercial, but I saw them and I think
- 23 Zach was in one of those commercials when he was still
- 24 working -- and not for the Court, but still working as

1 a carpenter for -- a union carpenter, I think, for

2 Neighborgall still.

3 Q. And was that in Justice Davis' commercial or

4 her husband? I didn't --

- 5 A. No, I think -- I don't -- I've never seen him
- 6 in -- I'm one of those people who changes channels on
- 7 commercials, but I do watch the political ads.
- 8 I can't really tell you much about
- 9 Scott Segal's commercials, but I don't really recall
- 10 him being in any of those that I've seen, but she -- he
- 11 definitely was in one of or maybe a couple, but at
- 12 least one of Justice Davis' ads.
- 13 Q. Before he was hired by the Court.
- 14 A. Yes, before he was hired by the Court.
- 15 Q. Okay. I hesitate to ask this next question,
- 16 but I've been asked to do so just to dispel a rumor.
- 17 There was a rumor going around that you were
- 18 communicating directly with one or more members of our
- 19 Committee during our proceedings.
- 20 Is that -- is there any truth to that?
- 21 A. Yes. I texted a person who asked me a
- 22 question, and I texted him back and texted him a few
- 23 other times.
- 24 Q. Okay. Can you identify who that was?

- 1 A. That was Andrew Robinson, Delegate Robinson.
- 2 Q. And was it more than one occasion?
- 3 A. A couple of days, I -- a couple of different
- 4 texts. I really don't know how many.
- 5 Q. All right. Final question. One of the tasks
- 6 of this Committee is to come up with recommendations
- 7 for changes in legislation, and you were intimately
- 8 involved with the Court for 11 1/2 years, if I
- 9 calculated right.
- 10 Do you have any suggestions for our
- 11 group as to what suggestions we should make to the
- 12 House as to changes in the legislation affecting the
- 13 Court?
- 14 A. Well, one you've already done, I strongly
- 15 believe. And this will strike some people as
- 16 surprising unless you read my op ed in the Gazette. I
- 17 never believed that the Court should have control of
- 18 its own budget.
- 19 I thought that just was a imbalance,
- 20 the balance of power. I think the legislature is the
- 21 purse keeper, and you should have that authority.
- 22 Also just strategically, I always
- 23 thought that whenever -- you -- whenever you folks see
- 24 judges, magistrates, family court judges around, you

Page 1569

1 think one thing: It's pay raise time, they're up there 2 lobbying for a pay raise.

And that brings a very bad impression

4 of them. But if every year while the budget's being

5 developed, you interacted with all of those people from

6 the Court, you would start to have more understanding

7 of their jobs, you wouldn't think that they were just

8 money-grubbing pay raise people.

9 And they would have more of an 10 understanding of the challenges you face in trying to 11 balance everything. That can't help but be good to 12 have that kind of familiarity. So I always believed 13 strongly in that.

But you know, I worked for them, and 15 after that initial conversation with Spike Maynard who 16 said, "Never mention that again," and I never did until 17 I was gone.

The second thing I would suggest -- and I feel strongly about this too. You may know that I played a pretty instrumental role in community corrections work -- I'm sorry, the criminal -- if I can get this out. Criminal justice reform work, criminal justice reinvestment.

24 Justice reinvestment is really

Page 157

1 valuable. Take a look at Connecticut and see how their

2 numbers of crimes have gone down and their numbers in

3 institutions have gone down.

But as long as the probation officers

are working for the Court, they will never, ever do

what they need to do to make this work. They simply

are not under your watch.

8 And I believe that like the vast
9 majority of states -- only 13 or so states have
10 probation officers who are under the Court's watch. I
11 think there should be a separated division of probation
12 and parole.

Parole should be brought out from DOC;
probation should be brought out from under the Court,
and then they should have to follow the dictates of
this body to make sure that they're doing the work they
need to do to lower the numbers of people who are
recycling back into prison.

19 I -- I here endeth my lecture. I could 20 really go on a long time about this. I know a lot 21 about it. I was really proud that I was able to get 22 the justice center to bring \$4,000,000 to this state, 23 along with Governor Tomblin, and -- and to help us get 24 the statistics we need. 1 You've got a great start on juvenile

2 justice. You need to see it through. And I'm a little

3 concerned that you -- that the legislation that

4 combined juveniles under the watch of the -- of an

5 agency that also has adult offenders.

6 That's -- that doesn't work out very 7 well in most states, and I think that you better watch

8 very carefully to make sure the juvenile justice

9 reforms work.

Look, we don't have to have thisrecidivism. We could lower the crime rate

12 dramatically. It just takes being smart. Look at what

13 Texas did. Look at what Connecticut did. They have

14 the lowest crime rates in their history.

15 And can you think of any two states

16 that are any more different than Connecticut and Texas?

17 Well, they have one thing in common: They got into

18 justice reinvestment and they did it right. You can

19 too. But it's up to you to have the will to do it.

Q. Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Canterbury. And I
do need to change one thing I said. The name is not
Zach Johnson; it's Zach Thompson.

A. Yeah, I didn't think Johnson was right, but I was having a crisis of memory and I thought, "Is it?"

1 And I thought it was Thompson.

Q. It is Thompson.

A. But I knew exactly who you were talking about. Zach's a good man.

Q. All right.

6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you,

7 Mr. Canterbury.

2

5

8

MR. CANTERBURY: Thank you, sir.

9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Counsel, any further

10 follow-up?

11 MS. KAUFFMAN: No.

12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. You are

13 excused. We appreciate your endurance tonight.

14 MR. CANTERBURY: Sure. Thank you.

MS. KAUFFMAN: All day.

16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All day, yes.

To the members of the Committee, just a

18 brief sort of overview of what we're going to do

19 tomorrow. We will have some information for you

20 regarding the construction costs.

21 It's the -- the Legislative Auditor's

22 Office has been doing a lot of work. They had a huge

23 notebook for of invoices and so forth delivered to

24 them. They've made an effort to analyze that and to

Page 1576

Page 1573

1 summarize it. As well, our executive assistant over

2 here has done some charts that hopefully will be

3 helpful to you.

4 We'll start with that tomorrow. We'll

5 entertain some -- some questions about that, although

the -- as I said, the documentation is pretty -- pretty

7 overwhelming, so I'm not sure how much beyond the scope

8 of what the charts and so forth show we'll be able to

do. But at least you'll have that information for the

10 next week.

11 We also will be developing some

12 information regarding this issue of working lunches

that the JIC dealt with, and you will -- one of our

staff has basically done an analysis of those, and you

can decide for yourself whether the working lunches all

occurred during administrative conferences and so

17 forth. That's part of the information.

18 There's some information that our

managers have developed - and particularly Delegate

Miller - on the -- on the Greenbrier book signing

excursions, and we'll have some information and

documents to share with you then. 22

23 And finally, some information on that

24 Tucker County magistrate case that was mentioned in one

1 following week early, and we're thinking at this point by

2 maybe mimicking the -- the interim schedule, since we're

3 not having interims in August and maybe do a Sunday

4 afternoon, Monday and Tuesday.

5 We have tentatively confirmed the tour for 6 the Supreme Court facilities on Monday, and so please pay

attention to our e-mails. It's possible if we don't feel

8 like we have enough information to spend Sunday, Monday

and Tuesday, we may just wait until Monday and do a long

10 day Monday, sort of like what we've done tonight, and then

Tuesday, rather than three days.

12 So pay attention. We're gonna -- we'll be

13 bringing you up to date. It's gonna take us a little

while to figure out what to do with all this JIC

information, how to -- how to present it, if we feel like

16 it's necessary.

17 So with that, I'll entertain a motion that

18 we be in a -- in recess until, let's just say, Sunday a

week -- the 5th -- no, I'm sorry, tomorrow morning, 9:00

o'clock. Tomorrow morning, 9:00 o'clock. 20

21 DELEGATE CAPITO: Mr. Chairman, I move the

22 Committee stand in recess until 9:00 a.m. tomorrow.

23 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: You've heard the

24 gentleman's motion. All in favor will say "aye."

Page 1574

of the JIC -- I think it was the JIC charges.

2 And that will be probably what we'll be

doing tomorrow. And so I don't expect we'll be here all

day or even late into the afternoon. And as I said

5 earlier, we won't be here Saturday.

6 Now, I would like to meet with the

7 managers for a few minutes after this meeting so that we

can finalize our agenda for tomorrow and for future

purposes. Here's what we're facing: We -- because the

10 JIC has concluded their investigations that were focused

on the -- the lunches and a few other issues, that

12 information which was out of bounds, so to speak, because

13 of the confidentiality provisions of the -- of the JIC's

14 procedural rules, we have subpoenaed that information, but

15 we've also been told that it won't be available probably

16 before Wednesday of next week.

17 And if it's anywhere near as voluminous as

18 the last series of information we got, we're gonna need

some time to digest that. We also have the handicap that

we are going to have two of our staff members gone next

week, and we also have given Ms. Loughry some additional

time to get -- to get counsel.

23 So we're not going to meet on our normal

24 schedule next week, but we probably will meet the

1 DELEGATES: Aye.

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Opposed "no."

The ayes have it. We are in recess until

4 tomorrow morning.

---oOo---

7 8 9

2

3

5

6

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1	Page 1577 STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA,	
	·	
	COUNTY OF KANAWHA, to wit:	
3	I, Teresa Evans, Registered Merit Reporter and a	
	Notary Public within and for the County and State	
	aforesaid, duly commissioned and qualified, do hereby	
	certify that the foregoing proceedings were duly taken by	
	me and before me at the time and place and for the purpose	
	specified in the caption hereof.	
9	I do further certify that the said proceedings	
	were correctly taken by me in shorthand notes, and that	
	the same were accurately written out in full and reduced	
	to typewriting by means of computer-aided transcription.	
13	Given under my hand this 8th day of August,	
14	2018.	
15	Deresa Euro	
16		
17	TERESA EVANS, RMR, CRR	
18		
19		
20	P	
21	Toreid Sue Evoni Commissione relwal trigino Wy Commission Expires October 25, 2020	
22	115 //# Gendinier Drive Albiey, WY 28271	
23		
24		

VOLUME V

07/26/2018 Index: \$1,000,000..2016

٠	J	и

\$1,000,000 1350:14 1352:10

\$10,000 1204:20 1508:1

\$10,000,000 1270:2 1466:6,10

\$100.00 1464:4

\$11,000 1393:12,17

\$11,360 1391:23 1423:22 1424:7

\$12,000 1204:20 1536:3

\$120,000 1450:24

\$122,000 1545:11

\$130,000,000 1309:9

\$130-140,000,000 1312:23

\$139,759,000 1537:8

\$15-18.000 1261:7

\$1700 1365:7

\$2,000,000 1233:18 1466:24

\$2.00 1203:9

\$20,000 1331:24 1332:12,24 1333:2 1362:15,19 1363:6 1397:16,19,23 1398:2,12,18,19 1399:9

\$20-25,000 1399:19

\$203,000 1386:14

\$22,000 1399:6

\$222,000 1545:12

\$230,000 1386:13

\$25,000 1362:21,22 1399:5,9

\$26,000,000 1182:2

\$27,000 1508:14

\$28,000 1508:14

\$28,000,000 1231:10 1232:14 1235:14

\$29,000,000 1228:10 1230:2,13 1231:10 1232:14 1235:15 1239:2 1309:10 1312:22 1413:7 1457:20 1464:24 1467:10 1469:8,9,22 1487:7

\$300,000 1228:10,12 1533:9 1534:10

\$32,000 1197:11,23 1198:3,22 1217:5 1276:5,18 1277:12 1318:17 1331:13 1337:23 1338:8 1341:8 1365:2

\$33,000 1387:10

\$330,000 1465:7,15

\$363,000 1533:5

\$4,000,000 1233:19 1467:1 1570:22

\$42,000 1542:4

\$433,000 1386:13

\$45,000 1352:18,21

\$45.00 1464:2

\$498,000 1341:23

\$500,000 1340:4 1528:19.21

\$6,000,000 1233:19 1466:24

\$60,000 1534:7

\$65.00 1464:3

\$7500 1536:1

\$80.00 1464:3

\$800,000 1528:20

\$9,000 1536:11,13

\$907.50 1390:8

\$911 1415:17

\$911.00 1416:6 1419:8

-

---000--- 1576:6

--from 1254:6

1

1 1162:18,20 1164:12 1228:2 1234:14 1237:24 1425:9

1/2 1314:15,18 1347:6 1355:2 1381:18 1482:23 1543:6 1568:8

10 1168:4,14 1352:8,9 1464:14 1537:14

10.4 1490:17

100 1159:17 1205:22 1370:1 1534:20 1566:13

1099 1505:21.22

10:00 1256:23

11 1314:15,18 1352:7, 9 1355:2 1449:15 1482:23 1543:6 1550:21 1568:8

11-year 1180:5

11-year-period 1350:14

12 1379:12 1482:13, 23 1537:13,14

12-year-old 1265:18

120 1416:19

12:45 1272:12,15

13 1227:10 1233:22 1379:13 1408:20 1480:8,12 1499:5 1561:23 1570:9

130 1367:22

14 1190:22 1214:1 1254:17 1327:10 1373:10 1450:6 1480:9 1559:2

14th 1390:8

15 1214:12,23 1228:11 1237:1 1269:23,24 1308:2 1458:23 1463:13 1465:3 1469:4 1566:14 **16** 1214:12,23 1216:11 1231:12 1297:5 1308:3 1326:6 1330:2 1355:19 1408:20 1440:2 1460:9 1492:18 1562:2

160 1243:4

17 1264:14 1340:7 1451:21 1486:10

18 1264:14 1408:20 1537:20

19 1169:20 1561:19, 24 1562:4

1900 1418:15

1920s 1440:22 1542:13

1922 1418:1,2

1988 1279:15

1990s 1184:18 1350:6 1367:1 1488:24 1539:14

1996 1470:16

1997 1279:19

1998 1437:11

1999 1437:10

1:00 1194:13 1291:15 1303:10

1:30 1272:14

1st 1256:12 1280:21

2

2 1162:18 1166:17,23 1176:19,24 1252:8 1253:1 1281:11 1423:6

20 1342:17 1357:24 1379:11 1501:13

2005 1158:15,22 1161:17 1162:3 1183:19 1239:18 1280:20,21 1297:4 1381:15,16 1419:18 1487:21

2005-2012 1408:22

2006 1390:20 1551:21

2007 1163:10 1381:13 1390:20 1480:4

2008 1189:1,5,8,9 1191:18 1236:24 1251:4 1386:18 1436:14 1456:23 1480:5

2009 1480:7 1528:19 1530:9 1536:5

2010 1188:21 1480:7 1559:9.13 1561:5

2011 1213:5 1228:9 1229:12 1230:17,18 1231:5,6 1232:2 1390:8 1413:12 1448:16 1450:23 1464:22,24 1480:4

2012 1163:5,16 1213:5 1297:4 1449:1,3 1467:4

2012-2013 1471:7

2013 1185:6 1206:6 1210:22 1274:3,5 1297:5 1331:3 1379:8 1391:20 1392:8 1405:6 1449:18 1450:3,15 1451:12 1476:11,12 1479:18 1561:21

2014 1205:22 1206:2, 6 1207:18 1209:2,10 1228:10 1237:1 1270:13 1382:18 1464:21 1566:14

2015 1181:6 1214:8, 11 1217:18 1228:11 1465:2,7

2016 1160:14 1161:4, 14,18 1162:4,8,9 1165:23 1166:2,10,23 1167:4 1168:4,14 1169:20 1171:23 1172:10 1173:7,21 1175:15,20,21 1181:5,17 1183:7,8 1216:9 1229:10 1308:2 1326:16 1331:2 1355:23 1423:7 1426:12 1448:2 1451:15 1465:1 1470:23

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: 2017..added

1473:19 1485:12 1486:8 1488:16 1489:13

2017 1158:20,23 1183:19 1216:8 1244:11 1256:6,10 1263:10 1264:4,8,10 1331:8 1356:5,17 1361:16 1563:23

2018 1238:9 1324:8 1384:11 1561:6 1577:14

21 1166:9

212 1416:19

21st 1199:19 1331:8

23rd 1417:21,22

24 1249:7 1561:21

244 1416:19

25 1172:9

25th 1422:11

26 1174:10

27 1252:10 1253:1

27th 1417:23

28 1230:13

28th 1414:18

29-1-7 1548:16,18,19

29th 1176:5

2:00 1249:10

2:30 1170:2

2nd 1167:4 1168:8 1256:12

3

3 1162:18,20 1170:23 1171:17 1176:19,24 1227:6 1228:14 1234:14 1237:23,24 1269:23,24 1281:11 1347:6 1381:17 1448:3 1533:3

3-2 1426:5

3.2 1347:7 1466:16

3.3 1466:16

3.7 1466:19,20,22

30 1173:7 1266:13 1296:15,21 1342:18 1457:15 1501:13

3000 1541:18

32nd 1380:1

34 1488:7,9

35 1456:3 1490:14

3500 1541:18

36 1364:2 1457:23

37 1167:20 1168:3 1456:3

38 1169:7,8 1390:3 1423:10 1490:15 1555:23

39 1273:10,18 1274:7 1275:3 1285:21 1300:24 1337:10 1375:10 1400:5 1442:18,22 1472:3 1490:17

3:00 1434:21

3rd 1256:13,16,20 1414:18 1488:16

4

4 1158:20 1172:5,8 1256:8,11 1264:4 1420:7 1421:2

41 1164:12,15

45 1527:18

47 1165:6

481 1414:22,23 1416:19

4:00 1434:19

4th 1256:15,21

5

5 1173:5 1413:18,21 1420:7 1421:2 1559:2

50 1393:18

55 1458:17

5:00 1156:22 1434:18.

19 1435:4 1501:11

5:30 1156:22 1501:12

5th 1324:8 1575:19

6

6 1173:16 1181:20 1254:21 1425:7

60 1392:16 1393:18 1455:15 1460:12

6:00 1249:9

6:15 1527:19

7

7 1424:17 1425:7,10

7-9-2010 1559:22

70s 1386:3

75/three-fourths 1368:18

7:00 1434:20

7th 1448:2 1462:21

8

8 1424:18

80 1392:13

80s 1386:4

85 1392:13 1458:22

88 1299:3

8:00 1267:6 1434:17, 18.19

8th 1391:20 1577:13

9

9 1561:5

9-24-13 1560:1

90 1159:17

96 1430:20

97 1299:3

9:00 1267:6 1303:9 1434:19 1575:19,20, 22

Α

a.m. 1575:22

Aaron 1562:2

ABC 1336:6,13,17

ability 1159:7 1168:11 1202:22 1517:4 1518:2

absence 1291:13

abso 1431:3

absolute 1192:7 1517:22 1537:22

absolutely 1190:16 1202:15 1244:8 1254:14 1270:21 1284:9 1290:12 1294:3 1326:22 1364:11 1443:10 1447:6 1457:13 1502:7 1554:24

absorbed 1233:13 1458:2

abstract 1428:21

abuse 1335:23

abysmal 1513:3,5

acc 1393:1

1556:16

acceptable 1526:17

accepted 1308:17

access 1405:8 1406:7 1407:20 1408:10,15 1525:15 1559:16

accessibilities 1255:13

accessibility 1256:3

accommodations 1223:14

accomplished

accordion 1286:9

account 1228:15 1490:18

accountable 1482:14 **accounted** 1182:9 1312:17 1313:8,13

accounts 1293:17,24 1294:1 1393:12 1520:14

accrued 1165:15 1418:9,12

accuracy 1559:1

accurate 1160:9 1168:9 1344:5 1479:17 1561:8,10

accurately 1577:11

achieved 1380:3

acquiesced 1485:4,6

acquisition 1559:20, 24 1561:3.20

acquisitions 1561:17

Act 1519:3,5,10,23 1521:2

acted 1522:1

acting 1279:17

action 1327:7 1331:18 1332:9

active 1351:12

activities 1406:22 1447:10

activity 1308:10 1344:4

actor 1203:13

acts 1520:20

actual 1237:14 1250:2 1532:20 1533:10

actualize 1195:23

actualized 1231:13

ad 1463:22 1464:1,7, 11,12 1469:16,17 1538:2

add 1210:18 1382:19 1387:3 1457:17 1463:21 1489:6

added 1203:22 1287:23 1352:9 1387:4,6,7 1484:19

07/26/2018 Index: addendum..apologize

1497:15 1524:9 1531:16 1559:22 1560:1

addendum 1422:24

addition 1478:11

additional 1219:21 1221:19 1223:20 1269:5,10 1414:16 1457:20 1531:17 1564:16 1574:21

additions 1425:15 1426:2

address 1209:14,15

addressed 1178:2

addresses 1541:20

adequate 1494:21

adhered 1489:14 1490:6

adheres 1491:8

adjoined 1405:13

Adkins 1348:10 1380:13 1427:5 1474:6,7,14,15 1493:11

administer 1159:10 1320:14,20

administered 1320:10

administering

1320:9

administration 1159:17 1313:16

administrative

1159:1,8,16 1163:9 1166:1.4 1167:10.15 1168:24 1170:3 1171:14 1175:19 1178:3.13 1179:23 1182:4 1183:6 1193:8 1207:19 1208:6 1209:9,12 1211:24 1212:7,9,11 1213:6,9, 12 1214:16 1215:1 1226:17 1230:7 1239:9,15 1244:5,16 1245:5 1279:11 1282:17.19 1284:2.23 1290:13 1294:22 1296:5,13 1302:16

1311:11,17,23 1312:5 1316:7 1320:16 1321:17 1322:4 1326:5,20,23 1330:15 1346:23 1347:1.14 1353:23 1355:7 1356:14,15 1357:1,3 1377:21 1381:4 1389:4,22,24 1396:19 1397:3 1405:18 1408:16 1422:18,20, 23 1426:9 1437:3 1454:18 1486:4,11,18 1487:8 1506:5,8 1517:10 1537:16 1545:7 1552:13.19 1565:23 1566:1 1573:16

administrator

1198:8 1224:1 1255:2 1280:4 1311:22 1317:2 1325:7 1331:9

administrators

1247:14 1257:24 1281:4 1306:3 1396:14 1494:13,15

admit 1415:19

adopted 1488:19

ads 1567:7,12

adult 1571:5

advance 1483:19 advantage 1458:4

advice 1382:9

advise 1517:7

advised 1206:14,17

1516:12

aesthetic 1366:12

aesthetics 1305:13

affect 1317:13

affecting 1568:12

Affidavit 1192:20 1364:2 1472:6 1523:9 1524:18,19

afforded 1255:6

afield 1371:16,23

aforesaid 1577:5

afraid 1420:14 1516:2

African 1196:23

African- 1541:19

after-meeting

afternoon 1559:19 1574:4 1575:4

age 1208:17

agency 1563:4,8,10 1571:5

agenda 1167:10,14 1168:23 1179:7 1574:8

agitated 1181:9,10

agree 1193:15 1226:12 1238:14,17 1308:24 1310:7 1314:4 1388:3,5 1465:17 1487:23,24 1493:1,17

agreed 1413:9

agreement 1528:17 1530:9

agrees 1526:11

ahead 1160:4 1183:1 1199:16 1206:3 1272:24 1332:2 1334:23 1428:10 1440:3 1480:11 1492:4 1502:9 1513:18

air 1304:7

airfare 1219:12

airport 1414:5,22 1415:11 1416:1,20,24

akin 1226:5

alarmed 1228:7

Alas 1464:8

Albright 1202:9 1419:24 1426:15 1427:2,22,24 1511:1 1543:12

Albright's 1186:11 1426:14 1427:1,7

alert 1550:18

aligned 1514:22

alike 1268:19,23

Alito 1292:3,4

allegation 1182:4

alleged 1334:4

allegedly 1302:15 1362:10

Allen 1314:1 1409:1, 18,20 1500:24 1501:1

allowable 1294:8

allowed 1225:17 1257:9,19 1325:24 1331:24 1362:13 1475:2 1500:20 1504:24 1526:8 1549:1 1564:18

allowing 1183:21

Allred 1562:2

amazing 1246:9 1468:23 1546:16

Amazon 1560:5

amendment 1229:5, 7,14,24 1230:12 1231:9,20 1232:6,9 1234:8,12 1238:13,24 1270:5,10,20 1463:1 1487:11,17

amount 1182:2 1188:14 1229:12,19 1230:1 1231:1 1239:2 1242:24 1309:8 1366:1 1371:11,12 1387:11 1413:10 1464:10 1465:16 1503:1 1504:23 1531:8

amounts 1321:3 1382:22 1383:1

analysis 1317:3 1445:7 1573:14

analyze 1572:24

analyzed 1535:8

anathema 1314:22

and/or 1557:17

Andrew 1568:1

anger 1229:6 1344:6, 11 1405:2

Angie 1357:7

angrier 1565:3

angry 1248:19 1259:16 1336:1 1402:22 1403:10 1468:18,20

Angus 1161:1,9,20 1162:5,8 1163:22 1171:21 1172:1 1175:14 1177:9 1214:5 1265:16 1267:22 1296:17 1391:7 1420:21 1421:14 1542:19 1556:3 1557:8,17

Angus' 1177:20

annexes 1439:7

announce 1527:24

announcement 1327:8 1426:6

announcements 1156:10

announcing 1513:18

annual 1168:21 1247:10 1261:6

answerer 1535:20

answering 1284:22 1314:5 1365:16 1403:9 1509:24

answers 1328:23

anti-nepotism 1438:8

anti-semitic 1513:8

anticipate 1394:23 1440:7

anticipated 1470:2

anymore 1214:6,7 1326:17 1357:21 1453:13 1461:5 1520:5

anyplace 1540:3

apocryphal 1539:20

apologies 1420:16

apologize 1212:2 1268:1 1271:14

1289:2 1372:12

07/26/2018 Index: apparent..audits

1390:14

apparent 1295:1 1334:19

apparently 1204:11 1283:14 1307:16 1313:24 1326:13 1337:12 1342:18 1350:13 1356:7 1424:9 1445:19 1560:18

appealing 1468:1

Appeals 1158:15 1160:1 1488:15 1490:19

appearance 1291:11

appearances

ı**ppeara**ı 1295:13

appeared 1380:13 1437:16 1516:7 1566:17

appears 1166:22 1168:2 1171:20 1172:8 1173:5 1227:11 1253:5 1254:21 1269:8,14 1285:23 1559:8

Appendix 1227:10

applicable 1165:12

application 1460:24 1461:10,11,13 1522:5

applied 1223:6 1461:15 1491:10

applies 1519:10 1522:6

apply 1519:5,23

appointed 1236:1 1279:19 1464:8,13 1505:4

appointments 1396:17 1446:9

appraisal 1384:10

appraisals 1384:15

appreciation

1170:19

approach 1247:18,20 1517:5

approached 1246:10 1309:23 1315:22

appropriates 1438:19

appropriation

1233:24 1234:6 1320:22 1322:3,5

approval 1162:21 1211:11 1219:3,14,22 1311:21 1319:17 1320:13,23 1325:16, 17 1362:18 1387:18 1388:9 1397:16 1399:2,5,9,20,22

approve 1311:7 1316:14 1340:13 1347:22 1363:8 1364:20 1365:1,19,20 1380:15 1399:7

approved 1199:15,22 1219:4,6 1231:11 1233:6,24 1237:2 1239:16 1244:22,23 1303:19,21,22 1319:14 1322:3 1325:18 1332:2,5 1333:3 1340:16 1362:23,24 1363:10 1398:24 1399:1 1411:24

approves 1320:13 1322:23

approving 1234:6 1322:17

approximately

1168:7 1189:17 1198:21 1210:19 1270:2 1392:2,7,23 1533:5 1537:8

approximation 1160:12

architect 1368:7,9,13 1369:3

architect's 1412:10

architects 1192:16 1368:6 1495:17 1496:2

architectural

1268:10 1478:6 1550:4 architecture 1371:19

area 1227:1,4 1250:22 1361:7 1467:22 1494:1 1499:2 1548:3 1549:1,2

areas 1189:7 1191:22 1290:15 1310:17 1351:18 1425:14

argument 1262:19 1322:12 1514:23

arguments 1322:11 1520:8

arose 1485:11

arraignment 1245:19 1437:12

arrange 1186:7 1304:1,2

arranged 1156:21 1304:6 1403:6

arrangement 1391:8 1406:20

arrangements 1304:15

arrested 1334:4 arrests 1334:3

arrive 1558:17

arrived 1239:18 1281:20

Art 1177:20 1203:2 1372:7,9,10,16 1422:6

arthritic 1508:7

Arthur 1161:1 1214:5 1265:16 1266:5,16 1267:17,22 1296:17 1391:7 1407:7 1420:21 1421:14 1542:19 1556:3 1557:8,16

articles 1203:11

Artimez 1357:6

artist 1195:12

artwork 1400:11,23

ascertain 1156:4

ascertained 1156:7

Asheville 1223:1 1271:11 1291:7 1303:2 1376:17

Asian 1204:11 1373:2

asks 1322:22

assault 1334:4

asset 1559:7 1562:12

assets 1492:9 1559:20

assigned 1167:6 1421:12

assist 1224:2 1278:19

assistance 1229:3 1241:16 1244:19

assistant 1223:16,18 1244:6,17 1245:5 1296:5,6 1311:23 1405:12 1415:20 1437:3 1556:4 1573:1

assistants 1214:4 1266:3 1304:4

assistants' 1244:5

Associates 1192:16, 17,24 1338:23 1339:13

association 1374:1, 13,15 1392:6 1545:23

assume 1327:19 1347:17 1372:23 1426:15 1452:16 1481:8 1556:10 1559:12

assumed 1295:6 1300:18 1360:1.4

assuming 1288:13 1317:21 1425:21 1427:7

assumption 1391:14 1400:24 1414:16 1491:5 1520:21 1554:5

assurance 1394:12

assuredness 1537:22 **asterisk** 1240:15 1274:19 1400:21

ate 1389:3

atmosphere 1460:15

attached 1253:14 1448:3

attachment 1425:9, 10

attempt 1270:3,19

attempted 1182:6

attempts 1541:18

attend 1222:19 1226:3 1291:11 1303:6 1392:3

attendance 1291:22 1392:17

attended 1223:17 1224:24 1225:4 1328:16,18 1376:17, 20 1392:7 1486:18 1552:14 1555:11

attending 1220:15

attention 1232:7 1256:5 1292:16 1311:12 1398:17 1575:7,12

attorney 1156:13 1307:12,20 1336:8,14 1353:14 1452:21 1509:17,20

attorneys 1526:13 **attorneys'** 1526:12

Au 1215:21

audit 1162:13,20 1220:4 1238:9 1253:16 1324:8 1325:21 1329:22 1413:18,20,21 1416:5 1488:8

Auditor 1162:17 1215:9 1414:7

Auditor's 1215:23 1325:14 1408:23 1425:3 1535:10 1556:16 1557:5 1558:24 1572:21

audits 1448:3

VOLUME V

07/26/2018 Index: August..billing

August 1166:23 1167:4 1168:4,8,14 1169:20 1171:14,23 1172:9 1173:7,21 1175:15,20 1176:3,4 1183:7 1326:6 1422:10 1423:7 1426:10 1485:12 1486:8 1551:22 1575:3 1577:13

authority 1180:15 1237:15 1265:23 1279:21 1284:1,6,9 1327:4 1331:10 1334:19 1335:23 1340:12 1380:15 1390:9 1405:18 1423:1 1437:12 1451:13 1454:21,23 1455:1,3 1568:21

average 1213:21

avoid 1238:12 1487:11

award-winning

1299:11

aware 1162:3 1163:17 1164:4.5 1171:22 1185:6 1187:2,9,17 1194:20 1195:6 1199:4 1216:4 1220:10 1221:11 1222:5 1224:6 1225:14 1234:18,22 1256:21 1262:23 1271:6 1278:18 1282:19 1292:12.24 1294:19 1295:11 1312:2,9 1313:9 1316:2.6 1329:23 1333:7 1382:12,22 1388:21 1430:1 1432:5 1443:19 1444:17,22 1445:1 1452:7 1482:24 1485:9 1486:3 1503:3,4 1506:12 1508:6 1512:3 1516:5 1523:17 1531:23 1532:3 1552:21 1564:22

awful 1281:20

awkward 1206:9

ax 1357:19

aye 1575:24 1576:1 ayes 1576:3

В

babies 1299:15

babysitting 1434:22

back 1163:5 1164:20 1167:19 1169:6 1171:17 1175:13 1182:21 1185:14 1193:19 1206:23 1207:6 1208:16 1209:2 1210:9 1217:3 1219:17 1222:4 1229:10 1233:15,20 1235:5,21 1237:24 1239:8 1242:11,13 1245:16 1251:4 1253:18 1258:5 1261:20 1266:14,15 1268:8 1272:8,11,15, 21 1281:7 1283:7 1285:11,21 1297:22 1298:19 1301:16 1308:15 1309:6 1317:8,14 1346:17,24 1350:7,20 1365:8 1390:11 1392:22 1393:10 1395:13 1396:11,23 1413:3 1414:9 1415:11 1418:14 1422:6 1429:20 1430:16 1432:4 1441:15 1446:15 1448:23 1464:21 1466:23 1468:5 1469:11 1470:15 1471:22 1473:19 1477:16 1508:7 1511:20,21 1512:24 1514:15,24 1517:12 1520:3 1522:22 1527:23 1528:19 1531:18 1533:12 1536:21

background 1298:7, 9,10 1478:4 1479:19, 21 1518:14

1538:3 1546:10

1557:15 1561:2

1567:22 1570:18

backup 1468:7

backwards 1495:19 **bad** 1258:18 1309:8

1378:6 1381:3,9 1415:24 1453:12 1468:8 1481:1 1512:24 1569:3

baffled 1529:4

bag 1322:14 1549:12

bailiwick 1310:23,24

balance 1238:12 1270:4 1568:20 1569:11

balances 1322:19

ball 1492:18

ballpark 1530:21

banquet 1375:6 1394:1

banquets 1374:17 1392:15 1394:2

bar 1351:13 1468:14. 22,23 1545:22 1546:8

Barbara 1314:1

bare-faced 1361:12

barriers 1543:24

base 1483:17

based 1393:4 1518:22 1519:9 1520:9 1521:1 1528:24 1531:1 1532:18

basement 1360:8,21 1395:22,24

basic 1531:20

basically 1170:5 1289:23 1341:4,18 1342:4 1412:13 1483:1 1485:12 1529:2 1530:7

basis 1293:19 1485:24

1566:11 1573:14

Bass 1343:4 1510:11

bathroom 1196:15 1349:24 1386:1 1441:14 1473:8

bathrooms 1237:11, 13

battling 1552:11

bear 1345:4

beautiful 1205:5 1473:9

beck 1382:6

beg 1379:23

began 1158:14 1161:4,15,18 1162:10 1163:17 1188:20 1189:1,5 1236:24 1251:5 1280:21 1302:16 1457:14

begged 1257:22

begin 1157:15 1161:5 1176:7 1206:4 1213:3,4 1241:5 1243:13 1251:9 1272:23 1469:22 1502:22 1505:20

beginning 1164:14 1171:15 1189:7 1190:11 1214:10 1350:21 1388:10 1439:18,22 1440:2 1443:13 1454:6 1488:8,12

begins 1192:8 1227:10

behalf 1335:5

behavior 1483:2,3,7

belief 1170:12 1246:19 1247:1 1521:4

believed 1224:15 1318:5 1321:23 1474:22 1493:11 1514:7 1546:5 1568:17 1569:12

bells 1467:23

belongings 1265:11

bench 1410:1 1480:24

beneath 1189:23

benefit 1253:8 1254:3 1324:11

benefits 1257:11,15, 20 1324:17

Benjamin 1177:6 1181:22 1202:13 1277:21 1280:2,18 1330:4 1349:17 1413:13,16 1429:13 1430:17 1433:1 1448:15 1449:8,22,24 1451:5 1512:10 1543:15 1544:5 1545:11,15 1546:3 1554:22 1556:8

Benjamin's 1174:21 1190:11 1367:13 1385:17,24 1386:12 1441:20 1442:3,8 1451:23 1480:3

Berkeley 1298:14,18

bid 1189:15,16 1190:6,7 1191:5,7 1251:7,11,12,15,17, 20 1252:3 1269:7,10 1340:3 1341:3.5 1383:21,23 1384:1,2 1410:17,19 1411:20 1412:2 1495:15 1496:4 1529:2,8,9,10, 11,23 1530:4,5

bidder 1191:11

bids 1191:13 1252:1 1495:5

Biederman 1371:17

big 1193:23 1203:6 1286:22 1299:2 1305:13,17,21 1309:10 1321:15 1371:5 1406:18 1436:1 1463:20,21 1474:16 1529:19 1534:6 1542:11 1549:13

bigger 1287:22 1466:12

bill 1231:20 1287:1 1319:1 1332:4 1352:3 1399:6.23

billed 1412:3 1415:13 1423:24 1424:4

billing 1304:5 1352:9

07/26/2018 Index: bills..calculated

bills 1203:9 1398:6, 18,21 1484:18

binder 1406:20

bit 1164:20 1182:24 1192:18 1198:20 1223:12 1247:15 1249:20 1272:7 1278:16 1285:20 1286:5 1298:6 1300:3 1322:18 1334:17 1348:4 1359:1 1370:20 1371:14 1373:13 1377:20 1385:11,23 1412:17 1417:19 1448:5 1461:8 1467:16 1495:14 1497:21 1514:1 1515:23 1520:17 1528:16

black 1196:23

blah 1262:17

blame 1198:7 1317:2

blank 1192:8 1426:3 1514:5

blanking 1455:23

blanks 1172:18 1174:20 1296:16,20 1421:18,19,20,22,23, 24 1424:14,16,21 1425:23 1490:7

blend 1201:1

blocks 1360:16 1444:12

blue 1196:13,16 1200:22 1472:8,13,17 1473:8,10,14

blunt 1494:10

board 1258:1 1328:1 1400:9 1468:15,16

boards 1258:4 1327:24

Bob 1292:2

body 1453:11 1521:20 1570:16

Bollard 1511:8

bond 1368:9

bonuses 1564:16,18,

book 1203:15 1206:24 1207:2,6,7 1292:18,24 1293:3,9 1416:10 1445:8 1573:20

books 1293:12 1371:4 1498:11,13

Boone 1538:4

booze 1374:13

border 1195:24

boss 1219:7 1284:8 1290:20 1303:24 1333:4 1455:3

bosses 1325:13 1345:4

bother 1246:12

bothered 1398:9

bothering 1332:3 1492:19

bothersome 1532:12

bottom 1204:9,14 1274:19 1443:5,6 1463:13

bought 1305:24 1439:6 1492:14 1496:19 1533:20,23 1561:23

bounce 1268:1 1285:19 1340:1

bouncing 1212:2

bounds 1358:11 1574:12

bowels 1346:8

boxes 1266:4 1470:13

boy 1207:14 1208:18 1546:3

Brady 1352:3

brain 1479:14

branch 1226:6 1234:22 1235:9 1289:19 1452:17,18 1490:19,23 1519:7 1562:13,24 1563:4,8

branches 1563:12

Brandfass 1164:15 1165:3,9 1357:2

Brandfass' 1166:9

breadth 1157:19

break 1252:14 1272:3,4 1279:18 1375:18 1394:13,15, 24 1434:4 1500:22 1501:14 1502:8,9 1527:12,18,20 1546:17

breakdown 1170:7 1313:9 1392:1 1558:14 1560:6

breakfasts 1374:19

breaking 1482:21

breaks 1244:4

brevity 1322:14

briefly 1292:7 1502:16

brilliant 1351:19

brim 1266:23

bring 1208:11 1214:23 1229:18 1258:4 1270:3 1398:19 1494:14 1554:20 1570:22

bringing 1554:18 1575:13

brings 1569:3

bro 1265:1

broader 1478:14 1479:21

broadly 1452:19

broke 1258:18

broken 1265:1 1277:9 1438:21,23 1439:11,15,18,22 1440:1 1503:19 1535:9

brother 1522:11

Brothers 1411:8 1477:21

brought 1156:21 1181:5 1209:15 1226:14 1255:22 1281:7 1283:10 1285:11,14,15 1293:20 1295:17,18 1309:6 1311:12 1322:20 1444:14 1481:17 1487:1 1525:8 1564:5 1565:22,24 1570:13,

budget 1231:11 1235:1 1239:2 1309:10 1316:13,14 1320:9,14,21,22 1321:2,10,15 1322:2 1364:15 1365:16 1411:17 1438:16,18 1439:1,11,12 1440:8 1464:10,13 1483:17, 24 1484:2,5 1537:5,9 1568:18

budget's 1320:12 1537:8 1569:4

budgetary 1232:7 1469:10

budgeted 1321:8

budgets 1231:12 1312:23

Buick 1163:10 1326:16

Buicks 1164:3 1490:3 1491:15

build 1258:12 1462:13

building 1189:24 1190:13 1204:7 1205:6 1232:24 1235:22,24 1236:2,8, 19,21 1237:2,8 1265:12 1319:17,19 1353:3,5,8,10 1370:9 1373:4 1397:21 1402:8 1441:15,16,20 1459:21 1469:3 1530:8 1549:22 1550:16,19

buildings 1369:17 1497:18

buildouts 1370:6

built 1190:13 1279:23 1317:20 1350:8 1439:7 1459:22

1546:2

built-in 1534:15

bumped 1489:24

bullet 1270:1 1463:13

bumping 1490:5

bunch 1425:16 1458:24

bundle 1466:5

bundled 1337:1

bundling 1336:9 1337:1

Bundy 1187:10

burning 1367:15

buses 1170:17 1390:20,21 1391:2

business 1161:23 1170:4 1173:1 1175:4 1178:6 1179:10 1183:9 1204:13 1253:10,20,23 1254:8,15 1294:24 1295:6 1324:13 1325:1 1326:1 1335:17,19 1444:8,9

businesses 1372:12

buy 1389:9

Byrd 1297:22,23 1298:3 1304:20 1522:18

С

cabinet 1250:4 1286:10

cabinetry 1286:7,8

cabinets 1286:15 1341:1 1407:24 1508:23,24 1534:15, 22

cable 1286:24 1287:1,3

Cafe 1216:20

cafeteria 1272:14

calculate 1537:12

calculated 1568:9

07/26/2018 Index: calendar..chair

calendar 1295:21 1296:4,13 1297:12 1355:9 1405:20 1406:16 1408:4,6 1445:22 1446:23

calendars 1296:19 1297:3,4,5,7,14 1379:3,7,14 1405:5, 15,19,21 1406:2,3,12, 19 1407:19 1408:2,14 1425:5,6 1445:24 1446:5,6,12,22 1447:12

California 1414:19

call 1156:3 1157:5 1158:19 1182:7 1214:14 1249:4,5 1250:1 1258:23 1272:20 1280:2 1282:7 1308:7 1320:23 1382:6 1402:20 1407:7 1409:17,22 1483:18 1509:15 1523:18,21 1524:21 1538:23 1558:8,12

called 1158:5 1161:11 1163:10 1189:12 1216:20 1223:24 1224:1 1244:2 1245:22 1280:9,10,11,18 1288:21 1296:9 1298:17 1311:18 1349:24 1351:4,11 1390:24 1391:1 1409:19 1433:5 1476:16,22 1510:23 1525:6,8

calling 1264:23 1351:8 1362:5 1402:18

calls 1157:7 1174:5 1335:5 1344:7 1433:22 1558:12

camp 1299:14

campaign 1241:15 1245:24 1246:1 1298:22 1329:9 1337:1,2,7 1436:17, 18,19,21,23 1526:5 1558:17 1566:18 campaigning 1558:15

campaigns 1299:22 1452:2,14,22

campus 1236:13,15 1511:10

Canaan 1374:5

candidate 1246:2 1337:2,3 1526:23

Canterbury 1157:8, 9,14 1158:10,12,13 1160:3 1166:14.22 1171:16 1175:10 1183:13 1188:7 1193:9 1201:13 1206:1 1210:1,3,7 1217:3 1218:19 1220:3 1224:7 1226:16 1227:5 1237:22 1238:6 1239:8 1252:7,16,19, 23 1256:4 1269:5 1271:21 1273:3,8 1279:6 1304:22 1305:2 1314:3,4 1320:1,7 1324:5 1339:20.22 1343:13 1345:7,8,12 1358:19 1371:22 1379:22 1380:6 1385:5,6 1394:9,14,18,22 1395:3,9 1419:11,17 1447:20,22 1501:15, 18,21 1502:1,7,19 1507:8 1509:10 1511:16.19 1523:6 1527:3,5,8 1528:7,9, 12 1537:4 1552:2 1555:11 1559:10 1562:8,11 1564:8 1565:10 1571:20 1572:7,8,14

cap 1503:9,13,15 1504:11,12,15,24 1505:13,17 1506:1,4, 7,15

capacity 1283:8 1436:20

Caperton 1512:12

Capito 1343:11,12,16 1344:13 1345:6,9 1564:9,10,13 1565:5 1575:21 **Capitol** 1185:16 1186:15 1187:3 1221:22 1222:7,11,12 1235:22,24 1236:2,8, 12,19,21 1237:2,8 1239:16 1255:8 1264:22 1286:23 1289:19 1294:12 1353:3,8 1360:9,12, 19 1372:20,22 1433:15 1439:4 1463:16 1497:2,3 1524:5 1546:13 1548:11,15,24 1549:21 1550:1,7,19 1552:24 1564:4

caps 1502:24

caption 1577:8

car 1161:19,20,24 1162:21,24 1164:24 1172:16 1173:14 1174:15,19,21 1175:3 1176:21 1222:6,9,18 1224:14 1253:7 1255:19,23,24 1266:14,21,23 1270:24 1271:8,11 1292:8 1294:20 1303:19 1322:21 1326:13 1376:24 1377:3,4,8 1407:13, 14 1413:23 1415:10 1416:1 1417:12 1418:3 1422:1,5 1424:15 1425:1 1443:18,19 1444:5, 19,21 1445:7 1514:11 1540:5 1546:5 1558:8

card 1215:4 1219:15 1261:12,14 1266:9 1378:24 1445:2,3

cards 1499:5,6

care 1186:8 1202:1,2, 4 1208:10 1296:4 1318:18 1415:20 1431:3 1433:24 1434:1 1507:21 1566:4

career 1437:22

carefully 1571:8

Carolina 1223:1,15 1224:2 1291:8 1376:18 1435:7

carpenter 1565:19 1567:1

carpet 1200:17 1276:9 1287:5,11,16, 24 1288:5,15 1367:4 1478:16,21 1536:3

carpeting 1367:3

carpets 1399:14

Carr 1501:4,5

Carrico 1501:6,8

carried 1157:20

carry 1199:16

carry-over 1270:8

carryover 1229:12,

cars 1160:19,20 1161:2 1163:23 1164:1,6 1167:6 1172:16 1176:10,12, 13,20 1178:5 1220:18,19,20,23 1221:13 1224:8,11 1253:17 1254:4 1255:15,16 1266:17 1270:24 1294:23 1304:7 1326:13 1420:19 1421:12,16 1444:16 1445:17 1514:16

cart 1183:1

case 1204:1 1225:7 1271:15 1292:1 1336:13 1368:10 1379:24 1408:1 1416:24 1421:21 1477:20 1494:8,22 1503:3 1504:21,22 1505:1 1512:12 1514:6 1521:13,14 1549:15 1573:24

cases 1397:5 1421:20 1497:18 1531:15,16

casework 1534:15

Cass 1236:14 1268:2, 10,23 1288:21 1289:14,18,20 1301:9,12 1329:20 1330:7 1354:14 1359:5,22 1360:10 1384:11 1428:22 1493:3 1523:16,22 1524:4,16,21,22 1542:2,6 1548:8 1549:17 1550:6,9 1552:9

catalog 1337:24

catch 1198:2 1281:13 1302:4 1390:18

category 1399:9 1439:10

caused 1217:11 1483:1

caution 1157:14 1380:22

cell 1265:18 1267:11

cemetery 1299:12

censure 1333:10

center 1171:4,6 1225:19 1258:1,2 1286:2,18 1346:3,12 1354:11 1369:8,9 1370:1,13 1417:8 1441:15,16,17 1462:19 1463:16 1467:13,24 1468:2,10 1481:5 1497:16 1538:8,9 1570:22

central 1287:4 1541:14 1546:1

cents 1415:18

Century 1199:20

ceremonies 1175:6 1432:20

ceremony 1432:14

certainty 1166:13 1311:3 1356:20 1435:17

certificates 1549:8

certified 1565:18

certify 1577:6,9

chair 1187:22 1217:15,16 1304:24 1305:5 1312:19 1314:8 1319:23 1321:23 1337:16,21 1341:16 1394:15 1443:4 1447:18,24 1457:1 1482:5 1496:11,12,18 1497:4 1501:1 1508:6 1522:20 1527:23 1533:22 1544:17

chair/couch 1338:6

chairman 1156:2.8 1157:4,6,9,12 1158:3 1210:1,4 1252:12,18, 21 1258:2 1269:1,3,4 1271:18,20 1272:20 1273:2,4,5 1275:14, 17,22 1279:2,3,5 1289:2 1297:20,21,24 1304:23 1305:1 1314:2,6,9 1319:24 1320:2,4 1324:1,3 1334:10,16 1339:17, 19 1343:10,11,13 1345:9,10 1358:16,18 1371:22 1379:19,21 1385:2,4 1394:8,9,17, 20 1395:1,4,8 1410:5, 6 1419:12,14 1447:15,16,19 1482:6,8 1500:17 1501:3,6,10,17,19,23 1502:5,8,12,15 1511:20,24 1520:24 1522:16,17,22 1523:1,3 1527:4,6,9, 22 1528:11 1535:6,15 1536:20,21 1546:24 1547:2 1552:3,6 1555:5,6,8 1564:7,9, 11 1565:7,9 1572:6,9, 12,16 1575:21,23

Chairman's 1522:9, 10

1576:2

chairs 1289:15 1375:22 1376:1 1496:14 1507:19 1534:3

challenges 1569:10

chambers 1177:20 1381:22 1515:4 1525:14,15 1542:14 1550:2

chance 1272:4 1486:24

change 1190:3 1196:2 1210:10,14, 15,21 1211:1,18 1269:9,14,18,20,21 1303:19 1304:11,12 1340:3,7,13,14,20,22 1387:16,19 1388:2,5, 7,9 1396:2 1410:23 1411:1,10 1415:8 1416:11 1450:11 1483:2,6 1505:20 1506:14 1528:17 1529:13,15,18 1530:11,12,14,16,18 1531:2,4,17,19 1532:4,20 1571:21

changed 1196:1 1210:17 1211:4,6 1318:3 1327:1 1356:19 1367:3 1412:8 1451:13

changing 1367:5

channel 1517:12

channels 1182:10 1567:6

character 1206:8 1409:24 1491:17

characterize

1281:18 1453:6,8 1454:20

characterized

characterizes 1174:9

charge 1160:23,24 1161:1,2 1219:7 1239:11 1266:17 1315:17 1325:13 1366:8 1384:13 1506:21 1514:8 1524:10 1556:20 1557:9

charged 1415:2

charges 1334:3 1335:6,9 1551:8 1574:1

Charleston 1168:17 1291:17 1293:4,10 1294:12 1373:16,18, 20 1374:2,4

Charleston- 1393:3

chart 1400:7 1425:13

charts 1573:2,8

chauffeuring 1538:21

chauvinism 1539:14

cheap 1535:2

cheaper 1374:3 1393:11

check 1194:7 1297:2 1318:22 1323:5 1415:17 1416:6 1419:8 1444:5 1455:24 1508:3 1541:21

checked 1294:23 1489:16 1556:8

checking 1161:16 1162:6 1295:1

checks 1322:19,24

cherry 1352:14 1507:12

chief 1168:19 1189:10 1199:7 1212:13 1238:9 1257:5 1258:22 1267:18,21 1268:9 1307:18 1311:13 1345:24 1354:1 1355:3,9,15 1356:2 1358:3,6 1359:13 1362:20 1363:23 1364:14 1378:16 1396:4.16.24 1397:2. 5 1399:3,4,6 1419:23 1423:5,8 1448:18 1449:11 1450:3 1505:4,5 1519:21 1530:6 1550:22

chiefs 1354:1

children 1299:15 1334:13 1335:9 1345:1

children's 1225:23

chilling 1513:12

choice 1450:20 1495:16 1496:3,4

choices 1196:10 1278:17

choose 1338:21

choosing 1526:23

chose 1191:10 1214:6 1553:18

chosen 1550:6

Chris 1507:5

Christmas 1266:8 1499:5,6

chronological 1480:1

chronology 1448:9, 12 1459:17 1479:23

chuckle 1198:16

chuckled 1198:12

chunk 1297:18 1309:10 1529:19

circuit 1159:20 1168:17 1170:20 1327:20 1373:15 1458:14 1471:19,23 1512:16 1537:24 1553:24

circuitous 1546:10

circuits 1181:15

circulated 1328:14

circumstances 1522:12

cited 1195:2 citizen 1327:3

City 1361:7 1369:6,8, 9 1370:1,13 1463:16 1467:13,24 1468:2,10 1497:16 1538:8,9

civics 1175:4 1432:20

claim 1393:2

claimed 1547:17

clarification 1331:7

clarified 1171:9

clarify 1271:10 1283:24 1284:1 1294:9 1300:2 1302:5 1303:2,9 1362:5 1409:3

clarifying 1377:7

Clarksburg 1327:19

1328:22

classes 1175:5 1298:18 1432:20

classification 1463:17

clay 1342:11

CLE 1291:22

CLE-CREDITED 1292:4

clean 1541:8,9

cleaning 1191:1 1237:6

cleanser 1350:24

clear 1157:18 1159:23 1179:10 1205:3 1211:14 1225:2 1226:24 1232:19,21 1233:4 1238:19 1261:16 1266:12 1282:4,13 1290:14 1308:9 1340:19 1363:2 1396:7 1398:1 1429:16 1446:22 1459:6 1484:8 1486:23 1495:2

clerk 1156:4,6 1189:13 1206:8,14 1268:11 1283:11,17 1284:16 1289:10 1311:13 1346:17 1354:6,9,14 1359:5,7, 16 1392:19,20 1397:1 1409:6 1449:16 1454:4 1481:23 1490:4 1519:21 1550:21 1551:6

clerk's 1190:3 1237:12 1284:4 1319:15 1340:16 1346:20 1347:15 1359:12,13 1438:6 1498:6,12 1529:19 1532:21 1549:5 1553:11,14 1554:2,8

clerks 1189:11,12 1204:5 1205:11 1210:8,11,16,17,18 1211:2,7,8,10,13 1278:14 1284:7,12 1311:16 1346:1,2,4,9

07/26/2018 Index: CLES..conferences

1381:8 1450:12,21,22 1451:1,6,14,23 1452:1,8 1454:17 1471:19 1537:17 1542:18

CLES 1292:6

client 1501:7

climate-controlled 1498:14

clinics 1299:19

clock 1194:11 1249:7

close 1270:4 1377:12 1460:13 1533:9

closed 1285:18

closer 1363:22 1416:21 1466:19 1537:20

closest 1287:20 1441:17

cloud 1258:20

cluster 1510:13

cocktail 1168:18

code 1165:1,18 1360:11 1427:11 1428:22,23 1502:24 1520:11,12 1521:3,20 1524:5

coffee 1534:3

coincidence 1240:18

collect 1272:5 1377:23,24 1427:3

collected 1403:24

collectively 1332:11 1404:7,22

college 1298:17

collegial 1543:20

collegiality 1543:22

colorful 1204:12

column 1313:24

1205:8

combined 1370:8 1571:4

comfortable 1248:17 1337:19,21 1338:6,7

1394:20 1517:16

command 1396:2

commensurate 1310:5 1311:4 1451:4

comment 1264:15 1270:21 1278:1,4 1378:6 1404:12 1509:4,8 1510:6

commenting 1560:12

comments 1262:12 1277:22 1285:17 1308:11 1507:8

commercial 1203:12 1525:13,21 1526:3,6 1566:20,22 1567:3

commercials

1299:10 1526:12 1566:18,19,23 1567:7,9

commission

1157:17 1165:20 1235:22,24 1236:2,4, 9,19,21 1237:2,8 1353:3,5,8 1468:13 1482:22 1526:8 1550:19 1553:2,9,10

commissioned 1577:5

commissioner 1279:16.17

commissioners 1538:2

Committee 1157:7 1158:5 1159:7 1161:10,16 1164:18 1165:9 1167:3 1168:12 1169:18 1170:24 1172:12 1173:9,24 1176:10 1177:7,17 1178:17 1180:2 1185:24 1189:4,6 1192:19 1194:3 1195:9 1197:17 1201:4 1202:23 1212:8 1216:18 1217:13 1218:7,24 1221:16 1227:20 1230:4,17 1231:7 1235:22

1236:9 1240:7

1241:10 1246:23 1248:11 1265:11 1267:24 1268:2 1271:23 1272:20,23 1273:11 1345:19 1364:16 1365:17 1457:1 1527:16 1535:7 1567:19 1568:6 1572:17 1575:22

Committee's 1379:23

common 1571:17

communicate 1290:12

communicated

1182:16 1290:9

communicating 1567:18

communication 1168:3,14 1288:9,11 1558:22

community 1296:10 1328:8,19 1432:21 1569:20

commute 1163:11 1324:9 1422:13

commuting 1162:24 1163:14,19 1253:9 1255:7 1324:10 1326:15

Comp 1468:2

companies 1388:6

companies' 1384:2

company 1180:17 1192:4 1197:1 1299:12 1318:4,10 1340:20 1388:15,16, 20 1410:14,17 1411:4,7,9 1473:23 1476:15 1477:4,12,19 1478:7 1528:19 1532:6

compare 1209:24

comparing 1393:22, 24

compensation 1564:17

competition 1386:17

competitive 1251:2, 17,18 1495:5 1496:7

competitors 1372:13

complaint 1165:19 1331:6 1482:21 1509:16,22 1551:8

complete 1289:13 1332:2 1446:21 1461:1,4 1471:17 1486:13

completed 1181:2

completely 1190:2

completion 1463:15

compliant 1352:3 1532:16

composition 1299:8

comprehensive

1175:1 1474:17 1553:17

compute 1563:5

computed 1546:14

computer 1180:19 1184:2,8 1188:1 1234:10 1266:1 1290:4 1300:20 1369:19 1428:8 1461:18 1498:20 1541:14 1561:5

computer-aided

1577:12

computers 1184:19, 23 1185:4,5 1290:4, 23 1291:2 1498:18,19 1540:23,24 1541:3,23 1559:14,21

con 1428:4

concentrating 1292:11

concern 1217:11 1499:8 1500:8

1512:21

concerned 1164:22 1167:8 1215:15 1499:12,16,20,22 1500:3 1571:3

concerns 1312:8

1500:12

concert 1327:24 1504:7

concluded 1574:10

conclusion 1176:18 1338:13 1486:16

concrete 1383:6,8 1397:22 1444:23

condition 1385:20

Conduct 1165:18

conduit 1383:9

conference 1163:9 1166:1 1167:10.15 1168:16,18,24 1169:3 1171:14 1175:20,24 1176:3,8,14 1177:16 1178:3,14 1179:7,9, 23 1181:2 1182:4 1183:6 1207:19 1208:6 1212:1 1213:7,9,13,18 1219:2,24 1221:14, 20,22 1222:1,8,19,23 1223:2,3,9 1250:6 1257:3,24 1259:18,19 1261:21 1262:4 1264:17,19,20 1291:8,23 1302:17 1303:2,6,7,15 1312:5 1316:8 1317:22 1322:4 1326:5,20,23 1343:20 1356:16 1374:19 1376:17 1377:21 1378:13.15 1381:5 1389:4 1390:23 1393:21 1414:9,24 1415:5,10 1416:21 1417:1,5,21 1419:2 1422:21,23 1426:9 1435:7 1468:15 1483:9 1487:9 1506:9 1532:13 1545:7 1565:23 1566:2

conferences 1166:4 1209:9,12 1212:7,9, 12,19,22 1213:15 1214:16 1215:1 1219:18 1220:8,15 1223:17 1225:5 1226:3 1230:7 1271:3,13 1321:17 1353:24 1355:7

07/26/2018 Index: confidence..cost

1373:15,24 1374:20 1389:22,24 1396:19 1417:6 1486:5,12,18 1506:5 1552:19 1573:16

confidence 1545:4,6

confidences 1545:3

confidentiality 1574:13

confine 1194:21

confirm 1192:19 1209:1 1228:19 1249:12 1273:18 1510:24

confirmation

1343:18 1548:20

confirmations 1304:13

confirmed 1496:22 1575:5

confirming 1428:5

conflicts 1283:22

confronted 1295:4

confused 1448:5 1473:18,24 1476:12 1520:6

confusion 1255:10 1256:12 1283:2 1514:2

connected 1541:9

Connecticut 1570:1 1571:13,16

connection 1494:3

Connie 1255:3

conscience 1344:19 1482:16,19 1518:6

conscientious 1405:22

consensus 1308:9

consequences

1165:1,7,10

considerate 1189:22

consideration 1333:10

considered 1226:7

1246:8 1363:11 1387:2 1399:8,19 1462:18 1547:11

conspicuously 1280:12

constant 1288:6

consternation 1164:20 1184:22

1291:14

constitute 1329:8,11

constituted 1326:1

Constitution

1521:19

Constitutional

1229:5,7,14,24 1230:12 1231:9 1234:8,12 1238:13,24 1270:5,20 1463:1 1487:11,17

constructed 1471:2

construction

1189:16 1190:8 1192:4 1199:9,22 1274:4 1318:4 1319:13,14 1331:22, 23 1332:21 1333:2 1340:20 1350:2 1362:24 1363:5,6,12 1383:12 1385:12 1386:9,12,19 1398:10,11 1410:12 1475:2,4,23 1477:5, 12 1478:13.14 1483:17 1495:7,9 1515:18,19 1526:1,16 1529:9 1532:6,10 1533:10 1565:12,16, 17,21 1566:6 1572:20

construction/ renovation 1515:1

constructions

1199:23 1441:17

consulted 1478:19 contact 1299:1

1402:19 **contained** 1252:24

contemplated

contention 1182:12

context 1232:19 1510:2,18

continue 1192:15 1270:5,9 1272:21 1318:2 1475:3 1505:1

continued 1272:18 1283:14 1326:10 1332:20 1363:18 1476:1 1504:6 1517:2 1527:21

contract 1181:3 1190:6 1240:22,23 1241:5,7,23 1269:18 1298:18 1350:13,15 1351:3,10 1387:24 1388:10 1410:12,18, 19 1411:10,11 1436:7,9 1459:20 1506:1 1525:24 1566:7

contracted 1181:11 1241:12,24 1250:24 1310:9,10 1313:24 1459:24 1460:5 1538:23 1539:6

contracting 1351:7 1528:19

contractor 1174:8 1179:20 1180:5,6,11 1249:17 1250:15 1309:21 1310:13 1317:16 1318:13,14 1506:14 1525:19,20 1566:12

contractors 1191:24 1249:21 1250:16 1310:15 1318:17 1388:2 1459:19 1460:18 1474:12

contracts 1251:9,13 1269:19 1351:4,5 1384:2

contractual 1504:17

contraire 1215:21

contrary 1270:22 1487:1

contrast 1197:5

contravenes 1165:12

Contravention

1165:17

contributed 1436:22

control 1211:9 1283:19 1286:17,18 1481:4 1492:10,12 1493:2 1568:17

conversant 1554:4

conversation

1178:18 1180:2 1182:21 1185:11,17, 22 1186:1 1196:12 1197:18,20 1198:10 1201:3 1217:5,10 1225:15,21 1226:1 1238:23 1239:5 1240:17 1253:11 1276:5,12,21 1277:10 1278:6 1285:7 1298:8 1300:4 1302:9,13,14 1332:15 1334:7 1337:4 1510:11,19 1525:1 1569:15

conversations

1166:3 1178:17 1179:22 1182:3 1197:18 1201:6 1218:2,3 1230:5,6,11 1231:7 1241:17 1264:13 1275:10 1333:18 1334:9 1336:12,16,18 1412:22 1413:1,4 1420:13 1472:8 1503:10 1506:3,17

conviction 1333:11

convincing 1280:19

cooking 1282:22

cool 1195:16 1508:20

coordinate 1406:21

copied 1194:24 1365:9 1484:11

copier 1371:7

copies 1171:21 1277:9 1406:11,15 1430:5

copy 1165:22 1166:9 1173:20 1273:9,23 1322:5 1328:15 1406:16 1439:12 1489:4 1537:4 **corner** 1162:18 1227:7 1274:19 1301:15 1346:24

correct 1158:16 1161:12 1163:23 1164:16,17 1167:16, 17 1168:5 1175:16 1177:14,15 1188:21 1189:1 1193:1 1204:24 1205:13 1211:16,17 1224:17 1227:12 1228:3,4,16 1233:17 1234:16,17 1239:7 1256:7 1263:14 1271:14 1276:6.19 1277:16 1278:14 1294:16 1315:3,4 1317:3 1319:12 1324:13,14 1347:16,19 1348:7 1349:21 1359:22 1362:2 1380:8,9 1381:18 1383:13,22 1385:15,19 1386:15 1391:21,24 1412:15 1420:9,10 1426:3 1428:14,17 1433:10, 11,12 1449:7,10 1453:6 1483:19 1505:10,11 1508:15 1516:13 1517:8 1524:17 1528:20 1530:18 1543:4 1548:11 1551:8

corrected 1430:14

Correctional 1279:21

corrections 1425:14 1569:21

correctly 1224:13 1274:20 1300:6 1323:17 1381:14 1577:10

Corridor 1291:17

cosmetic 1342:4

cost 1188:14 1194:21 1197:14 1200:19 1203:22 1219:10 1277:6 1287:15,23 1305:18 1339:1 1349:3 1352:15 1375:5 1387:3,4,6,7, 12,20 1394:1 1411:18

07/26/2018 Index: costs..criminal

1415:12,22 1416:2 1417:13,14,15 1419:7 1441:19 1463:10 1497:11 1529:16 1530:21 1531:8 1544:17 1546:12

costs 1194:22 1195:2 1199:14 1201:16 1204:19 1217:1 1319:18 1365:3 1370:10 1386:9,13 1430:2,5 1457:19 1469:21 1483:13 1485:2 1531:12,24 1532:4 1533:5 1536:2 1572:20

couch 1185:18.23 1186:3,9,11,12,13,15 1188:3 1197:7,11,12, 15,21 1198:2,21 1200:11,12,13,14,17, 19,22,23 1201:5,8,10, 12 1205:20 1217:6,10 1276:6,18 1277:12 1287:10,14,15,19,20, 21,22 1300:5,7,14 1315:23 1316:24 1318:18,21 1331:13 1337:17,23 1338:1,9, 11,13 1361:6 1375:15 1426:13,14,19,23 1427:6,7,14,20 1510:23,24 1511:1,4 1523:17,24 1525:7 1534:2 1544:17

couches 1186:10 1399:18

coughed 1552:18

Council 1258:3

counsel 1156:11 1157:2,24 1158:2 1210:4 1252:12 1272:21,24 1275:17 1307:19 1311:14 1331:12 1345:24 1357:1,3 1397:3 1460:8 1468:14 1500:20 1501:23 1502:14 1509:17,20 1519:21 1527:14 1548:21 1572:9

counsel's 1189:1,10 1284:5 1346:1

1347:15 1351:12 1359:14 1530:6

counseled 1453:4

Counselor 1271:20

counsels 1527:14

counter 1371:6

counters 1317:19 1509:2 1534:15

counties 1195:17,19, 24 1196:1 1255:14, 17,19 1321:13,14 1328:3 1470:22

country 1454:13 1485:20

county 1196:13,17 1255:20,21 1256:1 1336:10 1375:22 1393:20 1445:4,5 1458:12 1462:4 1473:3 1545:22 1573:24 1577:2,4

County-based 1393:4

couple 1156:9 1170:21 1181:12 1182:12,16,20 1183:4 1191:17 1194:6 1196:10,22 1204:13 1230:24 1242:9 1255:18,22 1256:2 1264:1.12 1267:7 1280:9 1322:5 1340:2 1341:10 1359:4 1373:19 1375:9 1376:1 1377:11 1378:3 1384:3,9 1390:19 1396:1 1408:3 1416:3 1421:23 1436:5 1446:15 1448:8 1466:23 1470:1 1481:3 1498:23,24 1507:19 1508:3 1525:24 1526:1 1533:24 1549:15 1567:11 1568:3

court 1158:15,19,24 1159:9,12,13,19 1160:1,7 1161:5,18 1163:11 1166:8 1167:6 1169:23 1170:3,10,13,16,21 1172:23 1173:1,3 1175:3 1178:6,24 1179:1,4,11 1180:10 1181:1,8,9 1183:19, 20,21 1184:1,22 1187:1,6,11,18 1188:4,12 1189:19 1190:4 1191:7,10 1192:1,20 1193:1 1194:18 1199:3,8 1201:17 1202:6 1204:8 1208:1 1210:10 1211:8,20 1212:9,21,22 1213:11 1215:3 1216:8 1217:9 1219:8,11,21 1221:12 1224:1 1225:10 1226:19 1231:2 1232:20 1233:24 1234:3,5,18,24 1235:3 1236:1,23 1239:15 1240:1,3,22 1241:16 1243:2 1244:10,22,24 1245:1,2 1246:18 1248:2,23 1249:2 1251:8,22 1252:2 1255:14 1256:14,24 1257:19,24 1263:10, 20 1264:18 1265:14 1266:19 1268:3 1269:15 1270:1,7,13 1277:11 1280:5,21 1281:7,11,19 1282:8, 16,17 1283:8,20,21 1284:2 1292:15 1293:16 1294:24 1295:6,12 1308:9 1311:9 1313:15,18 1314:14,19,24 1317:2 1318:7,20,23 1319:5 1320:13,17 1323:3 1325:7 1327:3.6.9.11 1328:2 1330:14 1331:18 1332:10,22 1333:9 1334:5 1335:10,17 1336:13 1341:5 1344:16,24 1345:19 1347:12 1349:20 1350:20 1353:23 1355:2 1357:7,20 1360:8 1361:5 1362:17,18,22 1369:5,6,16 1372:19, 21 1374:10,17 1375:2,6 1378:4 1381:22 1383:21

1384:4,16 1388:11,14

1390:20,22 1391:18 1392:5,20,24 1393:5 1395:24 1396:3,11,21 1397:7,12 1398:19,24 1399:2 1401:20 1409:21 1413:12 1416:4 1419:18,21 1420:15,18,19,20,22, 23 1422:14,16,18 1423:24 1424:4 1428:15,16 1431:18 1432:19 1433:1,24 1434:1,7,14,16,17 1438:9,14,16 1439:9 1444:8 1445:15 1448:7 1449:4 1455:21 1456:16.18. 24 1457:3,4 1459:10 1460:8 1461:19 1463:22 1464:6 1466:8 1467:3 1469:7,13 1471:3 1473:23 1474:13 1477:9 1479:1 1481:18,22 1482:18, 24 1488:15 1490:4, 10,19 1492:9 1493:19 1495:18 1496:20 1500:5 1502:3,10,21 1503:6,7,24 1504:4, 14 1506:6 1509:15.18 1512:4 1514:4 1515:4 1517:11,23 1518:23 1519:6,11,20,24 1520:10 1521:5 1523:19 1525:14,15, 21,22 1526:4,10 1527:13 1528:24 1532:12 1535:16 1537:7,9,10,15,23 1538:1,5,19,24 1540:4 1541:2,9 1543:7,21 1544:23,24 1545:15,17,21 1546:11 1550:13,14, 18.21 1551:14 1553:20 1554:1,19 1555:1,16,17,18,23 1556:8 1557:2 1558:16,17,18 1559:4,6,8,12,16 1560:11 1562:10,19 1563:3 1564:14,16 1565:13 1566:8,12,24 1567:13,14 1568:8, 13,17,24 1569:6

1570:5,14 1575:6

Court's 1182:1 1187:11,12 1292:8 11396:3,11,21 12 1398:19,24 1401:20 14413:12 1419:18,21 5,18,19,20,22, 2:14,16,18 Courtroom 1346:12, 13 1350:11 1495:22, 23 1529:21 1530:14 1532:24

courtrooms 1526:9, 10,12,13

courts 1159:1 1171:5 1225:19 1234:9 1246:6 1294:2 1302:23 1409:11 1417:9 1439:6 1461:1,17 1463:4,15 1471:23,24 1474:9 1521:18 1543:10 1566:5

cover 1383:8 1530:1, 10

covered 1279:10 1289:1 1391:15,16 1530:6

covering 1351:5

covers 1376:10,11 1535:1

cow 1501:11

CPA 1324:20

crack 1369:22

cracked 1266:24

cram 1266:23

create 1229:17 1250:5

created 1456:3,16 1492:15 1498:9 1521:20

creation 1180:19 1351:24

creator 1390:3

credit 1219:15

credits 1291:22

crime 1516:13,16 1520:19 1571:11,14

crimes 1570:2

criminal 1520:11,12, 20 1521:3 1569:21,22

VOLUME V

07/26/2018 Index: crises..Denny

crises 1344:19

crisis 1345:2 1464:6 1571:24

critical 1469:6

cross 1257:16 1309:4 1377:13,15,16 1378:9,21 1380:2 1466:11

CRR 1577:17

crude 1453:17

crumbled 1342:12

crumbling 1319:20 1342:11

cry 1316:11

cubbyhole 1481:21

cultimated 1327:16

cumbersome

1504:22 1542:12

curiam 1189:13 1210:7,16,18 1211:1, 4,6,7,13 1283:11 1284:8 1381:8

curiams 1211:16

curious 1301:20 1423:22

current 1163:18 1164:5 1221:12 1224:20 1297:8 1327:1

custom 1287:22

customary 1430:9

cut 1196:17 1197:4 1201:1 1370:10 1473:6

cutouts 1203:21

cuts 1235:1

D

daily 1194:6 1429:2

dam 1285:14

Dane 1158:12

dark 1382:20 1473:12

data 1265:19 1268:7

1461:15 1471:15 1560:17 1561:3

database 1559:17

date 1176:9 1256:7 1263:10,16 1312:7 1408:6 1446:14 1488:20 1500:7 1559:20,23,24 1560:1 1575:13

date's 1561:10

dated 1166:9,23 1168:4 1172:9

dates 1173:3 1175:12 1417:20,21

dating 1379:8

daughter 1225:11 1438:13

daughters 1438:13

Davis 1160:19 1162:10 1164:21 1166:23.24 1167:4 1168:8 1171:9,20 1172:9 1173:6,9 1174:4.15 1177:6 1178:2 1190:20 1202:10 1214:6,22 1262:18 1263:5.19 1277:20 1280:10 1295:10 1318:5 1327:12 1336:5 1337:2 1341:15 1363:20 1391:16 1413:13,16 1420:2,7, 13 1421:3 1422:4 1423:7,23 1425:15 1429:17 1430:20 1432:16 1442:15,16 1448:15 1449:4,5,8,9, 14,19 1451:7 1480:9, 10 1500:9 1507:15 1508:16 1509:4 1513:3,9,20 1514:6 1525:10 1533:13 1538:10,14,18

Davis' 1168:16 1169:22 1170:8 1178:23 1179:1,17

1540:1,15 1543:15

1544:5 1547:6

1566:15

1554:22 1555:12

1557:1,7 1558:17

1190:23 1192:4 1217:15,23,24 1318:4 1341:22 1342:19 1366:10 1368:17 1374:22 1382:13 1385:18 1386:3,13 1390:11 1391:10 1423:15 1441:20

1442:2,16 1533:24

1567:3,12

day 1156:19,24

1179:8,9 1182:1

1213:6,8 1222:16

1223:4 1228:8 1232:13 1249:7 1255:22 1256:16 1258:13,14 1263:7 1264:17 1265:10,12 1267:3,5 1291:12 1297:9 1303:7,8 1308:1 1314:17 1320:24 1328:20 1329:14 1350:6 1357:2 1361:16 1364:14 1377:9,12 1402:18 1403:3 1408:5 1415:2 1417:15 1418:20 1424:10 1426:22 1435:4 1510:5 1541:18 1572:15,16 1574:4 1575:10 1577:13

day-to-day 1382:2

days 1168:8 1172:23 1173:6 1212:22 1245:17 1247:9,10 1255:23 1257:18 1258:10 1261:6 1267:7 1378:3 1415:4,5,6,22 1416:4 1418:10,11,16 1424:10 1434:11 1444:20 1568:3 1575:11

De 1542:22

deal 1173:12 1188:8 1223:6,7 1432:14,17

dealing 1256:13 1285:2 1306:3 1483:17 1520:13

deals 1386:20

dealt 1197:22

1290:18 1573:13

Dec 1444:12

decades 1364:19,20

deceiving 1317:10

December 1264:10, 13 1295:2 1331:8 1414:18 1444:24 1499:5

Decembers 1444:13

decent 1498:14

decide 1219:18,20 1381:1 1482:15 1521:15,18 1573:15

decided 1176:21 1190:1 1196:12 1240:16 1265:7 1303:24 1326:8,9 1369:24 1423:4 1456:8,19 1496:15 1512:23 1549:7 1551:17 1561:11

deciding 1370:21 1424:12

decision 1189:9 1219:1 1261:2 1396:9,10,11 1398:5 1455:21

decisions 1239:11 1310:17 1322:20 1396:3,4,5 1397:10, 11,18 1398:2 1399:8

decorator 1478:2

decorators 1478:17 1479:2

dedicated 1185:3

Dee 1243:17,23

deeper 1385:11 1392:23

deeply 1371:15

defended 1180:16

defensive 1284:12

deferred 1310:14

degree 1298:14 1429:23 1430:10 1512:7

degrees 1518:17

delegate 1275:20,21, 24 1278:24 1279:3,4, 9 1289:1 1297:19,21, 22,23 1298:3 1304:20.23 1320:2.3. 6 1323:23 1324:1,2,7 1334:8,12,17 1335:1 1339:15,17,18,24 1343:9,11,12,16 1344:13 1345:6,9,10, 11,14 1353:18 1358:14,16,17,21 1379:18,19,20 1380:1,5 1385:1,2,3,8 1394:7 1395:6,7,12 1400:8,17 1410:4,6,7, 9 1419:10,12,13,16 1423:12,14 1447:14, 16,17 1511:21,23 1512:2 1520:23 1522:15,17,18,19,23, 24 1523:1,2,5 1527:2, 4 1528:5,6,10,15 1535:14,22,23 1536:19,22,23 1537:3 1538:4,13 1539:24 1546:24 1547:1,4 1552:1,3,4,5,8 1555:4,6,7,10 1564:6, 9,10,13 1565:5,7 1568:1 1573:19 1575:21

delegated 1193:22 1288:17 1323:10

delegates 1423:14 1553:1 1576:1

delineate 1331:17

delineated 1321:5 1331:16

delineation 1290:14 1331:20

delivered 1572:23

demanded 1171:3 1466:8 1469:13

demands 1287:18 1320:18

demeaning 1258:18

democrat 1299:22

denied 1265:18,20,23

Denny 1558:23

07/26/2018 Index: Denver..dishonesty

Denver 1417:2 1418:14

deny 1254:14 1273:18 1453:22

department 1227:3 1242:2 1347:14 1524:2 1559:15 1561:11

departments 1284:4 1347:12

depended 1382:4 1433:5

depending 1460:1 1522:12

depends 1482:17

depletion 1174:9 1182:1,8

depth 1157:19

deputies 1323:16 1506:24

deputy 1279:16 1323:11 1347:21,24 1392:20 1460:7 1474:20 1475:10,11, 12,13,15 1503:11

derogatory 1280:24

describe 1159:7 1206:4 1207:13 1229:8 1231:7 1259:13 1265:10

description 1320:8

desert 1415:1

desig 1550:8

design 1341:1 1402:5 1478:5 1495:15 1496:5

designated 1550:8

designed 1200:23

designer 1338:16 1339:3,6,9,10 1340:24 1401:18 1443:9

designers 1249:22 1429:16,19

Designs 1250:4 1317:19

desk 1162:15 1185:19 1186:22 1187:2 1197:23 1223:18 1268:17 1288:22 1289:4,7 1297:8 1301:4,5,6,8,9,11,14, 15,18,19 1329:20,24 1330:3,4,5,7 1331:1,4 1348:1 1354:23 1359:5,17,22,24 1361:6,14,15 1375:24 1380:7 1384:11 1407:23 1408:13 1428:21,22 1481:20 1493:4,15 1496:11, 12,14,18 1497:3 1510:2,4,19 1511:2,4, 10 1523:15,16,22 1524:4,16,21,22 1525:3,8 1534:2 1548:9 1551:1

desks 1268:3,13,15, 18,20,24 1289:16 1301:12 1330:17 1354:14 1428:20 1542:2,6,8,12 1543:2 1548:14 1550:1,15 1552:9,10

desktops 1184:9,11

destination 1172:17 1174:18 1177:1,4,10, 12 1426:7 1555:24 1556:9,13 1557:2,10

destinations 1172:22 1177:24

destroy 1278:10,12 1404:14,15

destroying 1405:3

detail 1170:15 1322:15 1423:12,18 1465:24 1515:5 1535:13 1540:14

details 1248:18 1254:11 1268:21 1312:24 1316:19 1397:12 1413:3 1421:15,16 1490:7 1503:23 1504:18

determination 1165:15

determine 1256:2 1325:24 1424:23

1485:19 1521:21

determined 1327:11 1353:4,6,7 1529:6

determining 1324:17

detractors 1435:1

develop 1328:9

developed 1184:19 1282:9 1283:13 1327:21 1569:5 1573:19

developing 1573:11

developments 1156:17

diagram 1375:10 1442:18,19,22

dictates 1570:15

died 1427:2

diem 1179:14 1375:5 1393:13,15,17,24

difference 1351:6 1375:19 1385:23 1386:10,14,16 1414:13 1493:8

differently 1316:8 1375:14 1401:4 1515:10

difficult 1207:12,18 1223:4,13 1230:16, 22,23 1291:10 1366:4 1500:4 1512:21

difficulty 1207:13

dig 1528:16

digest 1574:19

digested 1459:10 1467:2.3.5

digesting 1233:10

digging 1412:4

dinner 1156:21 1168:19 1170:19 1171:1,7 1178:23 1179:1,5,13,14,15 1374:2 1390:24 1391:3,4,11,13,14 1393:2 1502:13 1527:13,20 1528:1

dinners 1168:15

1178:9,10,11 1392:4

diplomas 1481:15,17

direct 1188:13,14 1194:23 1219:11,14 1288:11 1294:7 1304:5 1323:15 1327:6 1329:16 1330:10 1364:12 1397:4 1443:11,16

directed 1159:12 1403:11 1514:2

directing 1368:11

direction 1398:5,8

directive 1333:5

directives 1159:9

directly 1159:18,24 1189:23 1209:11 1290:9,12,18 1294:4, 8 1304:18 1323:20 1348:1 1354:11 1397:4 1421:3 1423:24 1424:3 1478:21 1484:9 1553:8,10 1567:18

director 1159:1,8 1161:1 1226:17 1239:10 1244:18 1245:21 1279:11,20 1283:20 1288:14 1296:13 1311:24 1320:15,16 1323:11 1357:5,7 1437:6 1460:7 1474:7 1475:4,12,14,15,16 1542:19

directors 1282:4 1310:16 1311:13

disabled 1266:2

disagree 1238:14,16, 17,21 1381:5 1388:3 1488:1

disagreed 1196:9 1308:20 1381:10

disappeared 1295:22 1446:6

disappointed 1384:18

disbelieve 1557:5

discharge 1494:7

discharged 1494:10

Disciplinary 1468:14 1509:16,20

disclosed 1312:13

disclosure 1519:3

discuss 1197:14 1523:14

discussed 1168:23 1169:2 1175:23 1176:13 1178:13 1179:19 1183:6 1230:2 1232:15,16,19 1233:15 1238:11 1248:1 1252:4 1270:7,14 1275:8 1278:16 1289:21 1295:3 1310:18 1396:19 1413:6 1420:4 1486:7,9,10 1531:20 1533:22

discusses 1174:23

discussing 1231:8 1248:5

discussion 1176:18 1178:4 1181:7 1198:24 1212:20 1214:9 1216:24 1218:6,8 1220:4 1223:5,23 1230:21 1231:14 1233:8 1237:7,13 1246:24 1253:17 1254:12 1268:6 1295:8,9 1324:22 1330:10,11 1338:14 1341:15,17 1371:8 1406:17 1409:8 1413:8 1444:4,7,11 1484:23 1485:1 1487:9,22

discussions 1176:16 1180:8 1195:4 1229:6,22 1232:8,11 1321:22 1322:7 1324:23 1341:18 1430:6 1486:17 1524:20 1563:6

1494:23 1519:8

dishonest 1315:14 1409:1,7

dishonesty 1409:23

07/26/2018 Index: dismissed..egos

dismissed 1334:5 1459:16

dispel 1567:16

dispensed 1312:12

displeasure 1194:8

disputandum 1542:22

dispute 1361:11 1542:23,24 1562:17

disqualifications 1333:11

disrespected 1207:23 1302:11,14, 21

dissembling 1409:14

dissertation 1298:15

dissolved 1459:20

distance 1239:20

distinct 1195:19 1216:5

distinction 1210:18 1211:4,6 1381:9

distract 1174:7

distraction 1174:4

distribute 1497:24

district 1372:15

divide 1536:14

divided 1347:12

division 1185:3 1221:1,9 1226:21 1242:3 1245:6 1282:11 1294:3 1296:10 1310:16 1322:20 1474:8 1475:15 1492:15 1504:8,9 1507:6 1523:20 1529:5 1570:11

divisions 1282:5,9, 13 1310:15

divorce 1345:2

DMV 1279:16

doable 1380:21,22,24

DOC 1570:13

Doctor 1236:17 1237:9

document 1166:20 1169:10 1197:22 1199:9 1464:17 1489:9

documentation

1228:24 1235:13 1288:3 1321:19 1332:14 1422:17 1573:6

documented

1342:24 1343:3,4

documents 1325:14 1351:1 1352:22 1387:15 1424:5,15 1441:10 1448:10 1498:6 1535:3,7 1549:5 1563:21 1573:22

dollar 1438:18 1529:3,6

dollars 1189:18 1243:5 1341:24 1347:6,7 1381:18 1391:22 1423:15 1424:8 1531:9 1534:20

domestic 1345:1 1351:24 1461:22 1462:5,16 1470:8 1472:1

donations 1336:9

door 1177:19 1306:15,20,23 1308:5

doors 1222:14 1286:9,10,11 1534:24

double-check 1383:20

doubt 1254:13 1361:18,22 1388:21 1537:12

dovetailed 1329:5

downright 1342:8

downstairs 1548:3 1549:1

downtown 1390:17

drafted 1261:4

drafting 1169:14

dramatic 1462:14

dramatically 1571:12

draw 1274:17

drawer 1297:9 1408:14 1443:1,2

drawers 1405:13

drawing 1349:6 1400:13,23

drawn 1273:15 1401:19

dreadful 1386:18

dredge 1383:6

drew 1376:3 1400:11

drill 1385:10

drilling 1382:23 1383:2,3

drive 1255:16 1266:13 1291:16 1376:23 1414:9 1418:12 1538:11 1539:11,16,18 1545:24

driven 1540:4 1558:18

driver 1557:9

drives 1414:24

driving 1222:17 1271:8 1417:3 1418:19,21 1422:3 1538:15,17 1557:19

dropped 1465:9 1492:17

drove 1376:24 1377:3,4 1422:1,5 1514:7 1538:10,14

drug 1208:1 1234:9 1251:21 1302:23 1357:20 1384:2 1409:11 1433:1 1460:8 1463:4,15 1545:21

due 1562:15

dues 1374:13,15

dug 1404:20 1411:14

DUI 1334:3

duly 1158:6 1577:5,6

duties 1159:8 1226:16 1239:9,10 1243:19 1523:10

duty 1367:20 1456:5, 6 1524:2,9

dwindled 1464:9 **dving** 1344:21

Ε

e-filing 1181:15 1233:7,8 1460:3,21, 22 1471:14,16

e-mail 1168:3,8,14 1194:23 1195:1 1196:8,12 1208:10 1332:10 1412:21,23 1413:2 1499:3,8 1500:12

e-mailed 1413:3

e-mails 1194:10,12 1208:8 1365:4,9 1429:3,5 1575:7

E-Z 1445:7

earlier 1162:14 1167:11,12 1175:19 1182:14 1208:24 1210:8 1227:14,16 1249:11 1273:13.20 1275:8 1276:3 1302:5 1320:8 1324:22 1332:18 1335:15 1336:19 1362:12 1366:9 1372:6 1373:14 1376:16 1377:7,11 1384:1 1404:2 1412:6,17 1426:15 1440:9 1444:3 1490:24 1491:3 1502:20 1508:14 1513:20 1544:23 1560:4 1564:2 1574:5

earliest 1230:11

early 1166:2 1176:6 1199:19 1206:10

1251:4 1272:3 1274:3,5 1351:12 1420:1 1426:10 1434:14 1436:15,16 1554:12 1575:1

early-rising 1249:8

earned 1180:22

ears 1295:10

ease 1471:20

easily 1468:11 1498:14

east 1191:1 1345:23 1369:8,9 1370:1,13 1395:14 1463:16 1467:13,24 1468:2,10 1497:16 1530:7 1537:19 1538:8,9

eastern 1545:24

easy 1281:16 1287:2 1293:14 1489:5,7 1498:4 1543:22

eat 1501:12

eating 1214:17 1215:19 1389:4,21 1393:2

echoes 1508:9

echoey 1508:10

ed 1331:8 1488:3 1568:16

edit 1486:24

education 1175:5 1244:18 1245:7 1327:24 1328:1

Edward 1217:22

EEOC 1285:1 1453:15

effect 1178:6 1199:21

effective 1488:15 1493:2,18,21

effectively 1497:24

effort 1485:8,19 1492:8 1497:9 1572:24

efforts 1224:3

egos 1483:6

07/26/2018 Index: elaborate..excessive

elaborate 1223:11 1259:13 1281:1 1284:17 1286:5 1315:10,13 1333:23 1335:3,7 1512:6

Elbert 1307:17

elected 1185:11 1206:11 1293:3 1302:10 1307:1 1354:22 1355:4,15 1356:2,6 1358:3 1359:9 1379:11,12 1436:14 1483:5 1545:18

election 1247:3 1283:22 1285:10 1327:13 1355:14 1356:14 1359:20 1449:2,3 1482:14 1526:5,9

elections 1355:6,12

electrical 1342:3 1367:15 1383:7 1534:13

electronic 1180:21 1228:19 1406:18 1471:15

elements 1520:12

elevator 1468:11

elevators 1354:12

Eleven 1258:11

eligible 1393:1,15,17

eliminate 1210:17 1270:8 1381:9

eliminated 1338:24 1357:11,13 1456:8 1490:5

Ellis 1192:21,23 1193:21 1338:24 1339:12 1348:11 1364:2 1401:22 1474:23 1496:7 1510:11 1523:6 1525:2,5 1566:9

else's 1560:19 1561:13

eluding 1474:4

embarrassed 1453:11 embezzlement

1520:13

emotion 1257:5

emotional 1176:18

emphasize 1303:23 1563:13

employed 1192:24 1244:10 1277:11 1503:6 1504:4 1517:24 1551:14

employee 1192:20 1241:6,7,11,23 1243:15 1246:19,21 1247:5 1255:2 1283:21 1284:19,23 1285:8 1409:6 1455:2 1489:20,23,24 1496:19 1505:21 1506:13 1523:19 1551:5,18 1564:15 1565:13 1566:12

employee's 1169:23

employees 1159:14 1169:23 1170:1,19 1226:19 1239:12 1240:5,21,22 1243:8 1247:21,24 1281:19, 24 1282:10 1283:19 1311:3 1318:8 1323:3 1347:1 1356:22 1361:5 1369:16 1371:2 1374:5 1392:24 1393:5 1420:20 1434:18 1438:6 1444:4 1458:2 1460:1 1463:18 1489:8 1497:16,19 1498:24 1505:21 1517:17 1526:1 1555:19 1564:15

employees' 1323:13

employment

1158:18 1187:6,8 1216:7 1240:4 1244:11 1246:17 1256:22 1457:19 1489:10 1517:3

Emporium 1372:7

empowering 1282:1

encounter 1284:15 1287:14 1316:1,23

1317:9 1378:19

encourage 1535:19

encouraged

1225:18,20,22 1282:13 1294:5,7 1374:2 1457:3,4

end 1158:18 1163:8
1171:14 1175:20
1183:7 1186:14
1189:24 1198:10
1207:20 1216:9
1228:9 1258:13,14
1261:5 1270:8
1320:23 1326:15,22
1330:2 1345:23
1346:6 1355:23
1403:3 1422:20
1441:19 1465:14
1497:4,6 1507:22,23
1520:4 1551:15

ended 1187:6,9 1190:22 1216:8 1222:9 1223:4 1244:11 1375:22 1469:22 1490:2 1496:13 1512:24 1534:7

endeth 1570:19

endurance 1572:13

England 1205:6 1373:6

English 1298:16 1299:5

enjoy 1170:4

enormous 1469:18

entailed 1469:8

enter 1514:9 1557:19

entered 1504:17 1556:23

entering 1556:21 1560:18

entertain 1573:5 1575:17

entire 1159:4 1171:13 1222:23 1245:2 1253:23 1282:20 1286:23 1315:18 1357:20 1460:6 1469:3

entries 1556:14 1557:16 1558:2

entry 1446:22 1557:10 1560:16

entryway 1382:20 **envelope** 1482:15

envelope's 1482:20

environment 1281:18

equals 1485:16

equipment 1184:2,5 1185:7 1188:1,4 1384:16 1398:3 1498:21 1559:21,22 1561:4

era 1542:13

erroneously 1174:12

escapes 1307:18

escort 1306:21

escorted 1402:8

escorting 1402:9

essential 1204:1

essentially 1191:1 1198:6 1218:11 1345:21 1440:9

est 1542:22

establish 1187:14

established 1319:4 1434:12 1440:9 1474:14 1560:8

estimate 1195:2 1483:21

estimated 1529:16

estimates 1349:2.4

etching 1204:6 1205:5 1373:3,4

ethical 1165:19 1526:6

ethics 1519:3,5,10, 16,23 1521:2 1526:7, 8,18 1527:1 1553:2,9, 10,12,17,21 1554:10 **Evans** 1577:3.17

evening 1156:20

evenings 1249:5,6

event 1223:8 1324:10 1329:9 1391:9 1393:11 1444:20 1558:17

events 1172:23 1174:16 1225:23 1423:16 1432:11,19, 21

eventually 1340:10 1531:21 1547:10

Everybody's 1215:21

everyone's 1257:5

evidence 1365:5 1367:9 1444:23

exact 1268:7 1373:19 1386:6,7,9 1392:12 1435:14

examination 1158:8 1275:23 1279:8 1298:2 1305:4 1320:5 1324:6 1339:23 1343:15 1345:13 1358:20 1380:4 1385:7 1395:11 1410:8 1419:15 1445:13 1447:23 1482:7 1516:4.5

examinations 1445:1

examine 1447:11

exceed 1331:23 1393:17

exceeded 1199:14

exceeding 1336:11

exceeds 1157:19

excellent 1532:16

exception 1311:16 1400:21 1471:24

exceptions 1396:23

excess 1231:2 1232:12 1505:16

excessive 1499:18 1529:23

07/26/2018 Index: exchange..feel

exchange 1499:4 excluded 1214:8,10 Excluding 1205:14 exclusively 1421:4

excursions 1573:21

excuse 1203:23 1228:11 1296:6 1314:2 1335:2 1340:22 1346:19 1354:20 1359:13 1424:24 1495:6

excused 1572:13

executive 1234:22 1235:9 1268:13,18 1279:20 1296:6 1304:4 1320:15 1405:12 1415:20 1452:17,18 1556:4 1563:10 1573:1

exempt 1397:16 1489:18 1490:10,15

exercise 1350:6 1562:16

exhausted 1247:9

exhaustive 1216:16

exhibit 1166:16 1167:19,20 1168:3 1169:7 1170:9 1171:17 1172:4,8 1173:5,16 1181:20 1254:17 1273:9,10,18 1274:7 1275:3,16 1285:21 1300:24 1337:10 1364:2 1375:10 1390:3 1400:5 1423:6,10 1424:17,18 1425:7,9, 10 1442:18 1472:3

exhibits 1162:16 1420:6,7 1421:2

exist 1209:8

existing 1325:23

expand 1409:3

expanded 1346:21 1498:12 1542:15

expect 1257:2 1535:7 1574:3

expectation 1353:16

expected 1306:16 1471:1

expedition 1174:6

expended 1262:20

expenditure 1424:8

expenditures 1234:2 1270:3 1293:18 1322:17 1392:2 1487:16

expense 1170:16 1323:14 1325:19 1370:19 1374:4 1391:15 1393:1,12 1459:14 1467:20 1481:19,22 1490:17 1534:4 1537:23 1545:14

expense-wise 1442:2

expenses 1218:20 1225:11 1309:8 1312:12 1319:8,11 1321:1,4,5 1325:5 1326:11 1341:9 1389:11 1415:21 1458:1 1462:23 1465:24 1500:9 1546:3

expensive 1200:15, 21 1201:2 1203:18 1204:5 1217:16,19,21 1218:9 1276:18 1341:10,21 1352:12 1373:5 1416:7 1442:3,12 1508:5 1532:22 1534:1,18,21 1563:16,19,20

experience 1339:3 1451:4 1519:9 1520:9 1543:11

expert 1180:17 1310:19 1351:15,18 1357:6

expertise 1242:5 1310:22 1350:19

experts 1357:22

explain 1182:6 1210:13 1231:4 1255:9 1260:7 1269:12 1345:18 1390:11 1409:4 1438:20 1510:9 1515:24 1521:12

explained 1361:10 1461:21

explaining 1521:17

explanation 1174:11 1293:21 1487:5

explicit 1332:19 1494:18 1495:3

explicitly 1171:5

explore 1499:2

exposed 1299:7

express 1316:14 1494:12

expressing 1403:12

expressions 1259:11 1500:8

expressly 1490:10

extend 1269:18

extended 1269:19 1303:18 1457:10

extending 1304:11

extends 1346:17

extensive 1440:11

extra 1291:19 1414:17 1415:12 1417:14

extraordinarily 1246:7

extraordinary

1180:9,10 1206:9 1437:5 1457:5 1460:10

extravagant 1317:14 1319:8 1387:11

extreme 1197:24 1418:2

extremely 1181:9 1218:9 1458:20 1565:16.22

eyeballs 1502:1 1563:2

eyes 1464:7

F

fabric 1200:18,21 1276:17 1277:6 1287:24 1302:7 1338:21 1478:20

face 1484:2 1516:7 1569:10

faces 1257:5 1263:1

facilities 1369:20,21 1473:16 1475:4 1575:6

facility 1279:21 1369:19 1475:6,17,18

facing 1234:3,5,15 1574:9

fact 1156:20 1180:17 1186:18 1189:21 1190:5 1208:4 1209:16 1260:11 1272:1 1284:10 1289:18 1293:8 1295:15 1300:19 1310:20 1393:23 1394:10 1415:1 1416:3,6 1417:3,7 1425:15,22 1429:20 1455:10 1467:23 1469:1 1526:11

factotum 1288:15

factual 1364:10,11, 23,24

failed 1209:20 1415:21 1469:17 1507:23 1519:17

failing 1247:21 1468:22,23

failure 1556:18 1557:7,8,11

fair 1466:14 1485:3, 15 1486:11,14 1488:5 1491:9,12,13 1492:1, 11 1516:14,21 1544:9 1565:1,4

faire 1485:13

fairly 1206:10 1286:6 1303:14 1368:24 1547:9 fall 1166:1 1470:23

falls 1557:15 1561:2

false 1470:19 1520:14

falsifying 1520:13

familiar 1197:11 1292:17 1306:4 1428:23 1472:11 1519:2 1520:10

familiarity 1569:12

familiarize 1166:20 1167:23

family 1159:19 1225:4 1248:14 1256:14 1282:8 1292:12 1295:13 1335:6 1427:8 1439:9 1464:6 1537:24 1554:1 1566:5 1568:24

famous 1287:10

fan 1326:12

farther 1450:9

fast 1267:8 1413:15 1419:12,13,16 1447:14 1543:12 1555:6,7,10 1564:6

fault 1516:22

favor 1575:24

favors 1335:16 1433:16 1434:6 1435:3

fax 1184:18

February 1264:8,11, 14 1551:22

federal 1181:12 1329:22 1462:13,19

Feds 1445:9

fee 1463:23 1464:2,3

feedback 1347:3 1537:1

feel 1194:2 1238:1 1247:16 1248:17 1381:5 1415:8 1453:11 1458:11 1488:4 1514:19 1518:17 1519:9 1521:3 1539:5

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: feeling..form

1542:11 1569:19 1575:7.15

feeling 1532:10 1549:19

fees 1463:22 1464:18, 22 1469:14

fell 1331:13,14

felt 1179:3 1207:22 1218:13 1226:2,4 1241:15 1283:1 1285:17 1324:21 1357:18 1399:16 1409:1 1460:15 1469:5 1494:8,9,17, 20 1511:10,11,13 1517:16 1529:22 1539:15 1541:12 1544:21 1545:5,15,18 1546:18 1560:18

female 1551:4

field 1310:23 1433:4 1460:3 1476:2 1537:24

Fields 1217:22

fierce 1236:20

figuratively 1385:11

figure 1196:6 1208:22 1242:17 1259:8 1329:7 1339:6,8 1371:1 1408:4,7 1448:20,22 1460:12, 14 1575:14

figured 1246:13 1285:13 1286:24 1402:21 1503:18

figures 1546:12

file 1266:8,9 1393:1,5, 7 1407:24 1553:11,15

filed 1470:11 1498:6 1509:17,21 1554:2,7

files 1228:14,19,22 1266:5,10,11 1470:7,

filing 1165:19 1443:2 1471:20

fill 1200:14 1287:22 1294:14 1296:20 1301:15 1553:2,18,19 **fill-in** 1243:18

filled 1161:8 1243:23 1244:3 1266:22 1425:16,21 1519:15, 18,20 1520:1

fillets 1203:21

filmed 1525:13,21

FIMS 1492:13 1493:7 1559:20

final 1176:18 1267:3 1322:19 1384:9 1431:10 1486:16 1545:9 1568:5

finalize 1574:8

finally 1173:15 1263:15 1280:10 1326:8 1496:15 1513:6 1573:23

Finance 1230:17 1308:12 1364:16 1423:19 1459:12 1492:15

financial 1519:3

find 1187:5 1194:13 1197:24 1208:9 1223:9 1244:20 1279:24 1282:2 1290:17 1291:10 1303:16 1310:24 1313:8 1329:13 1345:24 1364:9,22,24 1371:10 1384:13 1408:19 1425:4 1427:13 1444:19 1464:15 1485:8 1488:17 1489:2 1505:1 1525:6 1527:17

finding 1266:3

fine 1183:3 1190:21 1192:10 1212:5 1250:12 1389:17 1438:4

finish 1181:16 1245:24 1266:15 1334:23

finished 1198:16 1213:8 1267:5 1280:20 1363:4 1394:12 1471:17 finishes 1535:20

finishing 1181:13

fire 1206:14,17 1261:14 1404:4 1451:19 1456:1

fired 1239:22 1260:7 1264:22 1265:13 1356:8,9,11,21,22,24 1357:1,3,5,6,11,18,24 1377:20,22 1402:19 1403:21 1455:22 1459:3 1460:17 1525:5

firing 1239:19,21 1247:6 1316:5 1455:15

firm 1278:18 1457:13 1550:6

firmly 1510:14

fiscal 1221:1 1226:21 1270:13 1294:3 1322:20 1347:17 1348:2,16,19 1424:6 1438:6 1439:19,23 1440:2 1465:7 1475:24

fiscally 1440:5

fish 1440:20

Fisher 1250:4 1317:19 1341:1

fishing 1174:6

fit 1242:5 1287:19,20 1359:18,19 1471:3 1542:16

five-hour 1291:16

five-year 1336:11

fix 1351:8 1503:20

fixed 1492:22 1547:24 1559:6,20 1562:12

fixing 1492:23

fixtures 1191:3

flag 1481:8

flags 1307:13 1481:8, 11.12

flat 1383:8

fleet 1523:11 1524:8, 10

Fleischauer

1447:17,18,24 1482:5 1565:7

flesh 1339:5

Fletch 1348:9 1380:13 1427:5 1474:6,7,10,14,15 1475:1 1493:11

flex 1434:21

flight 1303:19 1304:7

flights 1304:12

flippant 1512:10

float 1543:16

floater 1244:3 1311:22,23

floating 1502:2

floods 1360:15

floor 1190:24 1195:5, 15,16 1196:15 1218:5,10,16 1237:7 1319:15 1341:17 1345:20,22,23 1346:6,7,11,18,22,23 1347:9 1350:9,10 1352:12,13 1354:10 1359:7 1363:23 1369:12,13 1370:7 1382:13,19,20,24 1383:4 1387:1,9 1395:14,17,18,19 1430:3 1447:8 1468:12 1473:10 1499:13,14,15,17 1500:4 1507:13 1530:6 1536:1 1543:4,5,6 1563:16,

flooring 1250:21 1430:4

floors 1345:19,21 1347:8 1369:14 1370:2 1395:13 1399:14 1410:22 1477:16 1563:15

Fluharty 1304:23,24 1305:5 1314:8 1319:23 1522:19,20 flush 1344:7

focus 1157:22 1193:9 1220:19 1225:1

focused 1344:9 1459:1 1465:3 1574:10

focusing 1234:11

folks 1251:22 1281:2 1295:3 1307:7 1459:18 1461:4 1527:22 1568:23

follow 1158:1 1159:9 1161:8 1190:5 1249:19 1272:22 1359:4 1384:5 1385:9 1386:8 1390:2 1494:6 1511:21 1551:7 1565:15 1570:15

follow-up 1167:11 1269:6 1271:24 1277:22 1318:16 1538:3 1551:12 1572:10

follow-ups 1413:2

food 1170:10 1374:16 1527:17

fool 1248:16

forbidden 1294:18

force 1313:17

forced 1281:5,6

foregoing 1577:6

foreman 1318:1 1515:22 1525:19

forestall 1270:5,19 1463:1

forever 1365:8

forget 1196:14 1207:4 1409:23

forgive 1359:2

forgotten 1171:12 1250:3,10 1353:21 1509:8

form 1161:12 1294:14 1384:6 1472:19 1519:15 1520:2 1553:17

07/26/2018 Index: formal..Gilbert

formal 1162:21 1551:7

formally 1517:6

formed 1313:6

formica 1509:1

forms 1161:8 1323:14,17 1433:21

forths 1520:3

Fortunately 1512:23

fortune 1251:22 1437:16

forty 1438:17

forward 1209:10 1344:17 1383:17 1494:7

forwards 1495:19

Foster 1410:6,7,9 1419:10 1423:13

found 1258:17 1259:7 1291:21 1298:20,23 1315:17 1346:7 1409:23 1416:5 1419:8 1421:17 1435:14 1440:19 1446:7 1532:15 1536:17

founded 1299:14

four-and-a-half 1291:16

four-year 1356:6

Fourteen 1213:24

fourth 1319:15 1345:22,23 1354:10 1359:7 1395:18 1530:6 1543:4

fraction 1429:7,9

frame 1173:21 1175:15 1203:19 1204:2 1307:23 1566:10

framed 1201:22,24 1202:10,11,13,14,20, 24 1203:1,2,7,9,10, 13,15,17,24 1204:6, 16,23 1205:15 1372:7 1431:20 1481:10,11, 15,17,19,21 1549:8 frames 1203:17 1204:5 1205:9 1533:22

framing 1201:14,16, 18 1202:7 1204:19 1373:5 1431:14,15, 16,18

frankly 1174:12 1181:6 1186:4 1193:8 1232:23 1257:21 1263:3 1280:6 1282:18 1297:6,16 1307:9 1310:18 1458:22 1533:10 1539:13

fraud 1259:13 1315:10.13

fraudulent 1520:15

free 1238:1 1285:16 1290:12 1321:2 1381:5 1417:4

free-standing 1481:12

freedom 1306:9

freely 1415:19

frequency 1213:13 1230:15

frequent 1238:23 1263:22,24

frequently 1229:13 1247:14 1289:21 1409:14 1444:10 1494:14 1538:24 1543:12,20 1562:23, 24

freshman 1299:8

friction 1485:11

Friday 1223:3,4,8 1260:17 1291:12,14 1303:8 1435:13 1444:5

Friday's 1292:2

friendly 1517:6

friends 1207:2 1280:15 1335:14 1543:12

friendship 1248:15

fringe 1253:8 1254:3 1324:11,17

frog 1530:15

front 1162:15 1203:14 1364:16,19 1394:11 1439:15 1480:12 1563:21

Frontier 1391:1

frus 1365:22

frustrated 1402:23

frustration 1365:10, 23 1402:10 1403:12

full 1156:19,24 1158:11 1198:21 1310:3 1331:22 1333:1 1460:22 1498:2 1577:11

full-bodied 1321:21

full-time 1310:8

fully 1322:9,18 1493:18 1518:7

fun 1510:16

function 1256:14 1332:20 1503:24 1553:14

functional 1493:21

functions 1255:14

fund 1182:1 1228:8 1233:16 1235:5

fundamental

1483:11 1520:16

funded 1170:13,14

funding 1170:15

fundraisers 1555:12

fundraising 1329:9

funds 1230:1 1231:2 1232:13,14 1337:1,2 1526:16

funny 1301:21

furiously 1266:3

furn 1370:16

furnishing 1485:2

furnishings 1200:7 1370:16 1484:24

1495:4,10 1534:8

furniture 1185:15,18, 21 1200:10 1202:18 1258:10 1287:17 1289:21 1342:4 1360:10 1362:14 1363:11,23 1366:2 1370:22 1398:3 1399:8,14 1428:19 1429:18 1430:7 1439:6 1474:12 1475:20 1477:13 1493:7,23 1496:6 1497:17,19,21 1499:1 1507:17 1533:7,9,20 1534:2 1549:15

future 1574:8

1555:3

futures 1159:21

G

1550:4 1554:18,21,22

gain 1526:5

gall 1476:17

Gallery 1200:17 1276:10 1287:6,11, 16,24 1288:5,15 1478:16.22

game 1395:5

Gander 1411:8 1477:21

gap 1299:2

gas 1322:22 1415:13 1418:11 1445:2,3

gather 1338:5

gathered 1168:20 1169:24

gathering 1170:18

gatherings 1169:22 1170:7 1213:15

gave 1204:2 1291:10 1320:11 1341:21 1505:6

Gazette 1568:16

gears 1388:22 1391:19

general 1160:5 1191:20 1227:23 1229:17 1233:16,20 1235:5 1243:3 1250:15 1264:18 1278:11 1281:17 1283:19 1299:20 1307:20 1316:16 1319:10 1321:10 1344:10 1361:16 1380:17 1382:1 1388:1 1396:11 1399:22 1401:2 1444:3 1452:21 1478:13 1484:20 1486:15 1513:7 1520:21 1521:4

General's 1307:12 1353:14

generally 1160:19 1163:13,19 1170:3 1184:6 1188:11 1200:7 1201:23 1212:8,10,15 1218:23 1219:11 1220:9,12 1225:7 1230:15 1231:16,18 1236:10 1241:1 1254:5 1265:10 1270:16 1279:23 1304:2 1318:5,7 1370:14 1374:8,9 1407:23 1503:4 1514:11

generator 1468:7

generators 1468:6

generically 1338:5

gentleman 1448:6 1547:10

gentleman's 1575:24

get along 1258:16 1544:7

gift 1204:2

Gilbert 1236:14 1268:3,23 1288:21 1289:14,15,18,20 1301:9,12 1329:20 1330:7 1354:14 1359:5,22 1360:10 1384:11 1428:22 1493:3 1523:16,22

1524:4,16,21,22

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: Gilbert's..hard

1542:2,6 1548:8 1549:18 1550:6,9 1552:10 **Gilbert's** 1268:10 **gilt** 1203:18

girls 1299:15

give 1160:12 1161:16 1177:11 1189:3 1202:3 1211:5 1213:21 1220:2 1258:6 1269:2 1272:4 1294:9,10 1298:4 1330:6 1332:11 1334:16,17 1366:12 1382:8 1390:6 1441:11 1499:9 1519:14 1556:4

giving 1233:15 1364:15 1365:15

glad 1444:14

glance 1268:22

glass 1508:17,22 1509:1,2

go-to 1216:23

golden 1543:21

good 1156:2,9 1195:12 1196:9 1203:12 1246:7 1250:8 1251:1 1252:16 1256:3 1258:16 1260:12 1272:3 1280:6,23 1283:14 1327:21 1339:5 1352:6 1363:16 1369:23 1381:6 1382:12 1384:9,15,17,19,24 1386:19 1417:17 1452:13 1474:23 1494:20 1495:14 1496:2 1497:21 1501:14 1502:10 1520:7 1544:6 1552:10 1565:17,18 1569:11 1572:4

goodness 1254:9 1330:16 1556:23

goods 1408:1 1549:15

gosh 1236:5 1551:20

gotcha 1424:13

government 1205:6 1236:12 1264:6 1279:12,15 1282:18 1298:8,10 1439:1 1460:11 1465:14 1562:13,24

Governments 1258:3

Governor 1226:8 1237:18 1279:15,18, 20 1298:22,23 1333:8 1337:3 1452:19 1563:9 1570:23

Governor's 1353:14

grab 1407:12

gracious 1330:16

grad 1298:14

graduation 1175:5 1432:14,20 1433:1

graduations 1545:21

grammar 1404:17

grand 1357:22 1520:13

granite 1196:14,16 1472:15,16,17 1473:10,11,14

grant 1181:12 1423:1

granted 1422:18

grants 1299:18 1357:6 1462:13

grapevine 1260:13

grave 1248:20 1333:14,23,24 1335:4

great 1173:12 1190:12 1241:16 1245:9 1280:15,16 1471:14 1571:1

greater 1234:16 1399:20

greatest 1370:18

Greenbrier 1293:5 1445:8 1573:20

Greene 1304:3,10 1407:23 1415:20 1558:7

grief 1281:13

grin 1345:4

Gross 1503:13 1504:3

group 1282:3 1327:7 1391:6 1396:8 1458:5 1468:20 1498:17 1547:12 1568:11

groups 1203:5 1462:19 1468:19

guarantee 1253:19 1324:24

guard 1540:9

guardian 1464:7,11 1469:16

guardians 1463:22 1464:1,12 1469:17

guards 1538:5,20

quess 1179:4 1184:10 1199:19 1204:2 1219:10 1221:20 1237:10 1248:16 1258:18 1263:24 1265:7 1267:6 1281:15 1282:7 1290:9,18 1296:17 1301:24 1308:7 1331:1 1360:1,19 1372:23 1373:15 1374:14 1383:18 1389:16 1390:20 1392:10 1399:17 1404:13 1406:4 1412:9 1419:4 1421:16.24 1424:11 1427:1 1431:5 1448:7 1467:6 1491:2 1503:18 1517:1 1518:5 1524:13 1526:19 1528:18 1543:2 1548:11 1551:5 1560:19

quessed 1360:13

guessing 1518:19

guest 1527:14

guidelines 1324:11

guinea 1245:19

gun 1264:24

Gundy 1171:21 1172:2 1175:14 1177:9 1265:16 1267:22 1557:17

gustibus 1542:22

gut 1189:9 1190:2 1342:7

gutted 1386:4 1440:14,20

guy 1435:2 1485:13 1513:17

guys 1186:7 1424:11 1481:2

Н

habit 1420:16 1499:6

habits 1532:8

half 1189:17 1210:23 1243:4 1258:7,11 1272:2 1303:8 1341:23 1345:21 1346:6,7,18 1394:10 1395:19 1530:7

hall 1177:19 1198:2 1260:3 1287:4

halls 1308:4

hallway 1190:24 1201:4 1237:7 1261:22 1332:15

hallways 1481:13

hand 1157:10 1161:24 1526:19,21 1577:13

handed 1273:8 1274:16 1429:15,16 1457:7,8

handicap 1574:19

handle 1325:11 1500:23 1503:11 1505:23

handled 1293:17 1304:4 1380:13 1391:7 1405:15 1441:10 1532:5

hands 1427:5 1527:9 1561:13

handwriting 1274:21 1400:11.19

hang 1170:5 1500:23

hanging 1372:21 1481:9,20

Hanshaw 1447:16

hap 1223:21

haphazardly 1488:23

happen 1193:7 1206:19 1211:23 1218:15 1231:18,19, 22,24 1232:9 1291:20 1323:9 1340:15 1342:19 1398:14,15 1452:9 1453:12 1456:21 1459:9 1468:8 1504:16

happened 1163:2,6 1177:21 1198:1 1199:24 1210:22 1213:13 1222:16 1224:6 1230:23 1233:11 1285:13 1297:12,13 1300:14 1308:2 1313:19 1324:15 1329:17 1340:18 1344:8 1355:10 1356:15,17 1361:1 1363:18 1368:23 1402:11 1408:5 1424:2 1446:14 1450:13 1456:5 1457:2 1459:17 1479:3 1545:7 1556:6

happening 1220:11 1313:20 1492:19 1509:19

happy 1204:13 1240:18 1313:3 1394:19 1429:22 1431:4

harassing 1284:19, 22 1409:6 1453:5

hard 1207:12 1213:6 1267:7 1281:9 1315:21 1403:1 1435:1 1483:6 1511:9 1535:17 1541:17 1551:21 1563:5

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: harder..idea

harder 1544:22 hardest 1502:5

HARDISON 1548:19

harsh 1325:3

Harshbarger

1339:17,18,24 1343:9 1527:4 1528:6,10,15 1535:14,22,23 1536:19

Harvey 1242:4,18

hate 1260:4,18

hated 1511:11

head 1208:22 1226:6 1230:15 1260:3 1357:6 1387:14 1448:13 1450:5 1463:11 1475:15 1512:9 1563:1

heading 1200:4

headings 1321:7

health 1299:19 1352:2 1381:7 1513:7

hear 1300:6 1318:17 1340:21 1387:5,8,9, 11 1388:13 1464:9 1479:3

heard 1162:7 1164:9 1184:18 1199:1 1208:17 1256:11 1260:13 1278:21 1280:3,6,23 1290:8 1291:5 1293:7 1308:3,12 1313:20 1329:18 1340:6 1347:6 1349:19 1360:6,7 1361:4 1364:4,7,12,14 1387:2 1390:13 1402:19 1415:16 1427:10 1445:18,19 1452:16,21,23 1455:7,14 1472:8 1481:4,6 1487:15 1525:7 1539:16,17 1542:2,3 1547:16 1548:6 1575:23

hearing 1357:17

hearings 1334:15 1469:19

hearsay 1479:4

heart 1208:22

heck 1208:14 1418:18 1546:14

height 1540:13,14,18

heightened 1512:22

held 1159:3,4 1168:15 1190:18 1221:23 1342:13 1374:7,8,9,21,22,24 1455:11

helped 1258:4 1309:15

helpful 1495:24 1508:6 1573:3

helping 1406:21

hereof 1577:8

hesitant 1517:11

hesitate 1239:7 1336:2 1439:16 1567:15

hey 1308:24 1414:8 1524:22

hidden 1286:7 1305:6,10,12 1313:5

hide 1286:13 1562:21

hides 1200:24

high 1175:4 1197:4 1209:23 1309:5 1371:7 1472:17

higher 1399:9 1454:10 1457:19 1465:20,21,22 1533:19

highest-paid 1311:24

highlighting 1424:20

Hill 1243:17 1244:1,7, 10

Hills 1216:20,22

hindsight 1198:5 1363:15 1384:19,21

hire 1240:5,10,13,16 1241:19,23 1243:16 1244:14 1245:12 1246:5 1248:2 1249:17 1311:10 1319:4 1412:18 1436:5,7,10 1451:14, 17,20 1459:21 1494:2

hired 1193:5 1211:7,8 1239:14 1241:19,20 1245:5 1246:4 1250:16,23 1255:12 1311:4,6,8,11 1312:6 1338:24 1369:3 1398:20 1419:20 1438:5,7 1451:23 1479:1,12,15 1566:8 1567:13,14

hires 1244:23 1249:18 1309:16

hiring 1211:9 1239:11,24 1249:13 1309:23 1311:7 1314:19 1315:17 1494:3,18

hirings 1309:12,15

historic 1542:4

historical 1236:14,16 1289:5 1493:7,23 1496:2 1510:15

history 1297:17,18 1299:1 1405:19 1571:14

hit 1326:12 1464:6 1508:11

hitting 1464:23

Hmm 1202:8 1456:23

hold 1158:23 1334:10 1393:11 1543:18

holds 1384:16

holiday 1256:13

Hollen 1385:2,3,8 1394:7 1423:14 1552:3

holy 1501:11

hombre 1512:21

home 1168:16 1169:22,23 1178:23 1179:2 1183:14,21 1184:2 1185:8,12,16, 21 1186:3,16,19,23 1187:3,15,22 1290:1, 5 1291:2 1300:4,5,8, 10,13,18 1324:10 1331:3 1361:11 1427:17,18 1428:4,5 1524:17 1540:23 1541:22 1564:1

homes 1184:7 1188:4

hone 1421:3

honest 1182:17 1202:18 1330:12 1360:2 1458:8 1550:24

honestly 1208:20 1268:18 1422:24 1507:6 1510:12

honor 1325:4 1491:18

honorable 1361:24 1492:1 1546:19,21

honorably 1335:20

honorary 1549:9

honored 1490:20 1491:19

hookups 1287:1

hope 1309:4

hopeful 1233:11 1264:5

hopes 1471:19

horse 1183:2

hospitality 1374:12

hot 1550:5

hotel 1170:17 1223:5 1304:7 1374:11,24 1390:10,16 1414:5,10

hotels 1219:12,13 1374:7

hour 1262:20 1272:13 1328:18 1329:10 1411:20 1464:3,4

hours 1156:20 1249:2,3,7 1252:15 1272:2 1328:23 1329:1,12 1394:10 1411:23 1412:5 1418:20 1434:12,16, 17 1503:12

hours/materials 1412:10 house 1157:7 1170:1, 5,8,9 1171:7 1174:5 1179:17 1266:14 1300:12 1361:6,15 1364:16 1369:22 1374:23 1380:11 1390:17 1427:15 1523:18,23 1552:24 1568:12

How's 1411:1

hue 1316:11

huge 1229:12 1231:1 1310:22 1373:4 1386:16 1572:22

Human 1504:8 1507:1

humbled 1257:21

humor 1198:13,14

hunch 1293:13

hundred 1438:17

hundreds 1194:10 1282:11

hung 1373:11

Huntington 1250:22, 23 1256:13,19 1328:17 1390:23 1391:12

hurt 1511:5

husband 1567:4

husband's 1566:18, 20

husbands 1438:11

HVAC 1342:3 1441:22,23 1534:13

hygiene 1352:2 1357:5 1461:22 1469:18 1538:1

ı

i.e. 1189:23

ice 1509:5,8

icons 1510:15

icy 1508:18,20 1509:6

idea 1161:16 1195:10, 21,22 1208:20 1216:5

07/26/2018 Index: identified..interstate

1242:18 1266:19 1285:7 1288:16 1292:22 1297:13,14 1319:2 1327:2 1328:14 1338:12,15 1361:14,15 1363:16 1381:3,9 1384:17,20 1406:5,6 1408:8,19 1469:7 1478:24 1498:2 1511:2 1530:20,23 1531:8 1558:21

identified 1274:7 identify 1567:24 idiosyncratic 1203:8

idle 1307:8

ignorance 1485:6

illegal 1335:22 1443:15 1517:17

illegally 1518:9 1541:18

illegitimate 1516:7

illness 1298:20

imagine 1374:10

imbalance 1568:19

immediately 1266:2 1453:14 1464:23

impeachment 1333:10 1334:14

implement 1470:3

implementation 1470:21

implicit 1494:18 1495:1

implies 1344:3

important 1190:4 1261:3 1282:24 1345:1 1437:21 1454:17 1467:19,21

imposed 1199:4

impossible 1266:13 1318:19 1418:23 1419:1,2

impressed 1193:5 1565:22

impression 1216:5

1447:9 1569:3

improper 1165:8 1416:9 1518:16

impropriety 1178:21 1516:14 1518:3

improvements 1439:2

in-court 1464:3

in-the-wall 1367:7

inactive 1351:15

inappropriate

1178:7 1179:4 1180:4,23 1293:21 1344:4.18

incident 1209:2 1453:3

incidentally 1522:7

include 1177:24 1200:7 1215:24 1270:15 1533:7,9

included 1200:10 1215:12,14 1229:9 1321:11 1333:8 1394:2 1523:10

includes 1460:14

including 1174:15 1179:20 1188:2 1454:18 1507:10

incorporated 1386:16

increase 1464:18 1467:4 1469:14,18

increases 1463:14 1467:3

independence 1562:14,16 1563:12

indicating 1258:17

indication 1487:7

indictment 1445:9

individual 1159:13 1199:7 1211:8,10

1221:6 1278:17,19 1310:9 1311:20 1319:11,16 1320:18 1321:1,4,5 1325:18, 19 1332:24 1348:6

1374:14 1398:6,9,21

1432:10 1433:6 1470:12 1482:14,19 1494:9 1516:15,17 1518:5,6 1530:12,14 1532:20 1557:12

individually 1398:8 1405:1 1545:1

individuals 1249:13 1281:10 1309:24 1312:3 1494:2,4

indulgence 1379:23

infamous 1496:11

infinitum 1538:2

influence 1159:20 1309:15

infor 1441:7

informally 1517:6

information 1158:1 1167:5 1172:20 1173:12.13 1178:11 1188:3.19 1192:9 1222:24 1224:23 1255:5 1268:8 1276:15 1294:10 1296:21,23 1312:11 1333:14 1346:14 1383:7 1425:16 1441:7 1445:10 1446:12 1447:2 1460:24 1461:16 1487:3 1499:10 1556:5,21,23 1557:19 1558:13 1560:10 1561:14 1566:17 1572:19 1573:9,12,

informed 1324:9 1326:21 1516:16 1523:21 1559:10 1562:8

14,18 1575:8,15

17,18,21,23 1574:12,

infraction 1516:13 1517:5

infrastructure 1483:18

infrequent 1263:23

inherit 1451:19

inherited 1211:12,13, 15 1218:13 1283:13 1431:3 1549:2 initial 1242:21 1251:12,16 1413:4 1420:20 1432:6,8 1495:7,9 1523:13 1529:9 1541:7 1569:15

initially 1242:3 1290:19 1338:23 1420:18 1421:11 1498:10

input 1193:14 1202:3

inquire 1208:13

inquired 1341:8

inquiry 1171:1 1513:19,20,24

inside 1476:13

insistence 1193:24

insistent 1190:20

inspection 1312:17 1559:8

installed 1290:5

installing 1349:20

installments 1412:15

instance 1292:12 1306:4 1318:17 1382:14 1384:1 1469:14 1483:12 1488:5 1489:15,20 1500:9

instances 1157:20 1197:11 1241:2 1283:7 1295:11 1489:19

instantly 1415:17 1457:15,17 1462:6

institute 1159:11

institution 1540:21

institutionalized 1547:23

institutions 1570:3

instructed 1177:8 instructions 1494:6

instructor 1298:16

instrumental 1569:20 insults 1198:14

intense 1316:14,17 1495:23

intensely 1260:10

intentional 1559:11 1562:9

intentionally 1317:10

interact 1454:3 1484:9

interacted 1478:21 1543:8 1544:4 1569:5

interacting 1206:9

interactions 1335:16 1543:23 1544:1

interest 1157:21 1191:19 1316:12,15, 16,17,21 1318:14 1396:13 1434:20

interested 1170:12 1193:6 1246:4 1368:24 1433:3 1443:13 1477:12,15

interesting 1198:13, 15 1245:13 1347:24 1408:20 1536:16,17

interim 1575:2

interims 1575:3

interior 1249:22 1339:3,5,7 1371:19 1401:18 1478:2,5,11, 16 1479:2,12

interiors 1342:7

intermediary 1348:3

intern 1255:12 1438:5.7

internal 1165:13 1491:21 1559:16

interns 1255:13 1438:12

internships 1438:15

interpret 1491:14

interpretation 1499:10

interstate 1222:16

07/26/2018 Index: interview..justice

interview 1193:13

interviewed 1494:19

intimate 1310:15 1336:22

intimately 1568:7

intranet 1161:11

intrigued 1298:23

introduced 1211:3

inventory 1492:10, 12,16,20 1493:2,24 1559:7,13 1562:12

investigation

1157:16 1165:20 1329:22 1336:9,14 1444:19 1468:13 1482:22 1526:7

investigations 1574:10

invitation 1491:14

invitations 1178:21

invited 1178:23 1209:6 1545:23

invoice 1277:2,7 1331:24 1338:12 1341:8 1348:15 1432:8

invoices 1199:17 1288:5 1331:23 1332:24 1333:1 1341:14 1347:21 1348:5,7,18 1362:16 1363:5 1380:10,12, 14,15 1398:9,12 1431:19 1475:20,24 1476:5 1572:23

invoicing 1492:14

involved 1181:14 1193:18,19,24 1194:4,15,16 1196:4 1213:20 1223:23 1230:21 1236:12 1239:21 1287:11 1288:2 1299:21 1300:16 1312:14 1334:18 1335:16 1348:24 1350:2 1351:1,21,23 1352:1, 4 1365:6,12 1368:7 1373:22 1382:5 1389:2,20 1396:8 1399:12,14 1417:10 1429:2,4,12 1504:10 1566:21 1568:8

involvement

1186:14 1226:18 1235:23 1382:2,3

ironic 1229:14

irrelevant 1302:2

irrespective 1490:20

irresponsible

1518:16

IRS 1165:14,16 1167:7 1324:11

Isner 1275:20,21,24 1278:24

issue 1160:4,13 1174:3 1176:11 1181:5 1199:18 1209:1 1213:1 1234:8 1270:18 1326:19 1333:3 1336:19 1387:9 1399:15 1403:23 1421:9 1454:1 1463:6 1464:17 1486:5 1490:5 1573:12

issued 1187:10 1291:22 1429:3

issues 1160:17 1161:4 1162:4 1164:24 1167:7 1174:2 1175:22 1183:5 1234:1,3,4,9 1254:3 1301:17,23 1316:15 1368:9 1434:22 1441:13 1520:8 1528:24 1574:11

italics 1488:13

item 1360:18 1486:7

itemize 1439:19

items 1167:13,14 1168:23 1194:1 1199:7 1204:22 1205:3,14 1218:4 1372:6 1428:19 1430:7 1431:20 1495:10 1534:6 1549:1,20 1563:24 1564:4

J

Jackson 1168:20 1171:1,7 1222:1

jail 1180:14 1265:22 1279:21,23 1280:20 1405:17 1437:11

jails 1245:17

Janie 1245:16 1246:5 1437:7

January 1158:19 1216:8 1256:5,8,11, 12,13,15,16,21 1263:10 1264:4,7 1355:10 1486:10 1551:22

Jennifer 1187:10 1504:6 1507:3

Jess 1265:16 1267:22 1557:17

jet 1336:7,23

Jew 1513:10

JIC 1329:22 1331:6 1389:18 1424:9 1533:2 1573:13 1574:1,10 1575:14

JIC's 1574:13

jig 1473:6

jingoistic 1250:23

Joan 1296:6 1405:11 1407:6 1558:6

iob 1159:24 1189:22

1192:3 1193:22,23 1196:9 1243:24 1244:1 1245:9,23 1247:7 1260:12 1264:6 1280:7,15,24 1281:6,16 1309:17 1320:8 1456:5,10 1457:7,8,13 1460:1, 20 1474:16 1494:6 1503:18 1515:22 1529:12 1532:6 1544:22 1560:21,22 **iobs** 1244:4,7 1282:2

1309:20 1310:16,21 1351:17 1452:13,22 1456:3 1459:13,22 1460:10 1494:20,21 1569:7

Joe 1548:22

John 1241:12 1298:22

Johnny 1408:5

Johnson 1288:6 1446:4 1565:10 1571:22,23

join 1461:16

joke 1245:14 1317:4, 5,11

joking 1317:9

judge 1159:19 1290:11 1327:21 1328:5 1446:4 1456:24 1504:22 1505:1 1512:17 1526:11

judges 1159:10,18, 19,20 1168:17 1170:20 1178:22 1207:24 1208:13 1233:12 1321:13 1373:15 1374:14 1375:4 1390:10,16 1392:13,16,23 1393:4,19,20 1467:4 1484:21 1502:22 1503:2,8,12 1504:14 1505:3,8,15 1506:4,8, 12,17,22 1526:8 1537:24 1538:1 1553:23,24 1554:1,6 1568:24

judges' 1323:12,13 1456:9 1459:14

judgment 1518:18

judicial 1157:16 1165:18,20 1168:16 1226:6 1244:18 1245:6 1289:19 1374:1 1390:23 1391:4 1392:5,15 1393:21 1439:7 1460:24 1461:9 1468:13 1475:18 1482:22 1490:19,23 1537:7 judiciary 1156:3 1157:7 1158:6 1527:16

July 1166:9 1181:17 1280:21 1417:21,22 1561:5

jump 1348:4 1509:11

jumping 1424:16

June 1181:4,17 1231:11 1280:20 1322:4 1390:8

junior 1209:23 justice 1160:19

1161:19 1162:10,22 1163:8,16 1164:21 1166:23,24 1167:3 1168:4,8,13,16,22 1169:21,22 1170:8,11 1171:9,20 1172:9,16 1173:6,9,14,24 1174:4,14,21 1177:11 1178:1,20,23 1179:1, 17 1181:21 1182:22 1184:8,12,13 1185:7, 10,16,17 1186:2,11, 15,19,21 1187:2,21 1190:11,15,16,19,20, 23 1192:4 1193:4,6, 10,12,19,20,24 1194:4,16,17,20 1195:5,11 1197:8,15 1199:7 1201:5,7,20, 22,23 1202:10,13,14, 16,19,24 1203:24 1204:24 1205:11.15. 16 1206:5,6,7,8,13, 14,19,22,23 1207:4 1208:16,18 1209:3,10 1211:3,9,12,14,15 1212:14 1214:6,22 1215:13 1217:5,15, 23,24 1218:4,5,24 1219:4,8,18,20,24 1220:5 1221:4,18 1222:5,22 1223:10,14 1224:3,5 1225:1,3,11, 16 1226:1.4 1227:22 1230:20 1238:8,9,11, 22 1240:4,8,10,13,17, 24 1241:18 1242:15 1243:16 1245:15 1246:1,5,13,18,24 1247:11 1248:1,6,7 1249:14,18 1250:3,

07/26/2018 Index: justice's..kind

19,20 1253:8 1257:6,
13 1258:2,15 1259:23
1260:10,14,15
1261:17,18,19,21,22,
23 1262:7,9,15,18
1263:2,4,5,11,13,15,
18 1264:3,16
1267:17,18,21
1268:9,17 1270:18
1271:1,7,9 1273:14
1271.1,7,8 1273.14
1274:13,15,22
1275:4,11 1276:5,13,
22 1277:3,11,14,23
1278:4,18 1280:2,10,
11 1283:4,9,10,12,23
1285:5,10 1287:8
1289:3,9,11,12
1292:3,10 1294:20
1295:10,11 1296:10
1300:4 1302:22
1303:13,17 1304:18
1306:5,6 1307:2,7
1308:11 1309:12
1311:20 1313:16,20
1314:19,24 1315:2,
12,15,23 1316:23
1317:15,16,18
1318:4,5,12 1321:3,6
1326:14 1327:12
1329:19,23 1330:3,4,
9,23 1331:2,5,8
1333:15,17,19,20
1334:2 1335:5
1336:4,5,7 1337:2,11
1340:23 1341:15,17,
22 1342:16,19
1349:8,16 1352:12
1354:2,5,6,22 1355:3,
15 1356:2 1358:3,6,
12 1359:11 1361:5,20
1362:9,21 1363:24
1364:15 1366:9
1367:13,21 1368:2,
13,17,20 1372:4
1374:22 1376:20,21
1377:1,14 1378:17,
19,22 1379:10,15
1380:7 1382:4,13
1385:17,18,24
1386:3,12,13 1387:9
1390:11 1391:9,16
1396:4,24 1400:13,22
1404:13 1409:1,17,22
1412:17 1419:23,24
1420:2,7,8,11,13
1421:3,4,7,18,24
1422:1,4,7,8,9,12
1423:6,8,15,23
,-,,

```
1425:15 1426:14,15,
 24 1427:2,7,15
 1429:2,11,13,14,17
 1430:9,16,17,20
 1431:1,2,11 1432:13,
 16,24 1433:9 1435:8
 1436:4 1440:11
 1441:3 1442:2,3,4
 1447:8 1448:18
 1449:4 1451:5,7,9,11,
 15,23 1453:4 1455:15
 1456:23 1459:10
 1465:8 1474:22
 1479:3,11,16 1480:3,
 6,8,9,10,13 1481:5
 1482:3,4,14,20
 1483:2,5,19 1484:5,
 12,13 1486:5
 1487:14,19,22
 1489:21,24 1490:1,18
 1491:6,19,24 1496:12
 1499:4,15 1500:6,9,
 11 1503:8 1505:4
 1506:12 1507:11,12,
 15 1508:16 1509:4,15
 1512:9,14,16 1513:3,
 9,20,21 1514:17
 1515:15,17,23
 1516:6,12,15,16,17
 1517:2,5,13,18
 1518:1,2,3,9,10
 1519:2,10 1520:10
 1523:14,17,22
 1524:12,16 1525:10
 1530:17,22 1533:4,13
 1538:10 1539:15,16
 1540:1,15 1542:6,9
 1543:14,15,17
 1544:1,2,3,5,20
 1545:11,15,23 1546:3
 1547:6 1550:22
 1554:21,22,24
 1555:2,12,15 1556:8,
 12,22 1557:1,7,11,12
 1558:16 1563:16,17,
 18 1565:21 1567:3,12
 1569:22,23,24
 1570:22 1571:2,8,18
justice's 1190:10
 1334:13 1367:10
 1396:16 1433:6
justices 1159:13,24
 1161:17 1162:5,6
 1163:13,18 1164:5,6,
```

22 1165:23 1166:7

1171:21 1175:13

1168:20 1169:14,19

```
1176:13,19,24
1177:2,3,5,6 1180:3
1181:21 1183:21,24
1184:6 1187:14
1188:2,5,12 1189:23
1199:3 1201:21
1202:6,8 1210:11
1211:11 1212:21
1214:3 1218:21
1219:10 1220:13
1221:13 1223:17,20
1224:20 1226:10,12
1227:12 1229:10,21,
23 1230:12 1231:8,24
1232:2,3,7 1233:12
1238:11 1239:17,20
1247:14 1249:8
1250:2,13 1259:21
1262:5,9,11 1263:4
1264:18 1268:12
1269:16 1270:15
1277:20 1278:13
1284:9,12 1287:18
1290:11,16 1293:23
1294:2,17 1302:17
1303:22 1304:9
1306:8,17 1307:3
1311:7 1316:1
1317:24 1319:6
1320:19 1323:3,4,12,
19 1325:4.16.24
1326:14 1327:11
1328:14 1332:10
1333:9,12 1338:19
1340:11 1341:9
1348:2,17,24 1349:11
1350:6 1366:7
1380:20,22 1388:19
1396:6,15 1402:4
1405:5,8 1408:10
1413:9,11 1421:8
1423:11 1426:6
1429:4 1430:1.8.15
1432:22 1433:3
1447:5 1450:17
1451:1,3,13,24
1457:6 1473:13
1474:18 1479:2
1480:20 1483:1
1485:3,20 1489:16,18
1490:3,8,11 1491:11
1494:14 1496:9
1497:12,15 1500:8,20
1505:5 1507:10
1512:4 1515:6,13
1516:23 1517:1,22
1519:18 1525:16
1531:21 1538:14,16,
```

```
keen 1250:4
keener 1232:7
keenly 1368:24
keeper 1568:21
keeping 1236:13
 1239:12 1429:5
 1504:10 1514:8
 1560:6
Kennie 1343:4
 1510:11
```

Kessinger 1297:21

```
17,21 1539:2,8,9,10
                        Ketchum 1162:22
 1540:23 1541:22
                          1163:8,16 1177:2
 1542:5,7 1543:3,7,11,
                          1181:21 1184:13
 19 1544:11,21 1549:6
                          1208:16 1223:9
 1552:11 1553:7
                          1250:20 1253:8
 1554:6,7 1557:13
                          1260:2 1261:21
 1564:17
                          1262:19 1263:2,5
                          1264:3 1277:20
justices' 1160:8
                          1289:11 1303:13
 1161:6 1177:20
                          1326:15 1354:3
 1188:23 1224:24
                          1358:12 1376:20
 1311:16,17 1319:16
                          1413:13,16 1422:13
 1346:12 1348:6
                          1423:8 1429:14
 1350:11 1353:4,13
                          1430:17 1432:17
 1368:8 1375:12
                          1435:8 1443:7
 1381:22 1432:10
                          1448:15 1449:19,23,
 1484:5 1489:15
                          24 1451:9 1479:12
 1499:23 1514:16
                          1542:6 1544:2,4
 1530:1,10 1531:5
                          1555:2 1565:21
 1557:21
                        Ketchum's 1190:15
juvenile 1571:1,8
                          1208:18 1268:17
juveniles 1571:4
                          1289:9,12 1442:10
                          1479:16 1480:7
                          1530:17 1536:2
          Κ
                        kettle 1440:20
Kabler 1264:24
                        key 1161:21
 1313:24 1402:20
                        keys 1162:1 1163:21,
 1510:24
                          22 1164:1,3,6,7
Kanawha 1336:10
                          1407:8
 1361:7 1369:6 1390:9
                        kick 1518:14
 1393:4.20 1466:15
 1577:2
                        kill 1512:20
Kathleen 1503:13
KAUFFMAN 1157:3,
 6 1158:3,9 1210:6
 1252:22 1269:1,4
 1271:18 1273:1,4,7
                          1566:9
 1275:14 1502:15,18
 1511:16 1572:11,15
```

Kim 1192:20 1193:21 1338:24 1339:12 1348:11 1401:22 1474:23 1496:7 1510:11 1525:5

Kimberly 1364:2

kind 1157:20 1167:7 1173:1 1176:5 1196:22 1198:11,13, 16 1209:22 1223:19 1233:10 1236:20 1243:18 1244:2,5 1245:13 1257:19 1258:17 1279:12 1280:14 1281:15 1283:4 1284:10 1286:2 1288:8 1293:12 1297:16 1298:20 1299:9 1301:11 1315:24 1317:6,10 1324:19

VOLUME V

07/26/2018 Index: kinds..letting

1330:14 1333:2 1340:1 1342:10 1345:4 1351:6 1352:13 1363:6 1369:2 1370:17 1371:2,8 1372:1 1373:2 1374:18 1375:5,17,21 1384:21 1391:5 1406:19,20 1419:3 1434:22 1437:8 1444:9 1458:16 1481:20 1485:24 1488:23 1490:4 1508:10 1509:8,11 1513:21 1515:12 1528:16 1531:7 1535:13 1537:12 1542:12 1544:7 1546:10 1547:20 1552:17 1569:12

kinds 1172:24 1197:3 1234:10 1304:15 1336:2 1405:20 1446:9

Kirk 1254:6 1357:1

kitchen 1317:20.23

kitchenette 1250:6

knew 1197:3 1206:13 1208:14,15 1233:13 1245:21 1247:4 1261:5 1263:1 1265:2 1282:1,23 1289:4,8 1290:6 1293:2 1297:1 1300:14 1310:16,17 1316:19 1365:3,5 1366:6 1407:9 1426:15,17,18 1483:22,24 1495:18 1503:13,14 1510:23 1513:14 1515:18 1532:4 1544:15 1562:4 1572:3

knowing 1240:17 1331:22 1333:1 1370:4,6 1371:2 1493:9 1524:4 1559:11 1562:10,19

knowledge 1157:19 1163:12 1187:23 1188:13,14 1212:24 1224:19 1233:9 1281:1 1289:3 1290:3,22 1291:1 1293:13 1301:3 1314:3 1324:21 1329:15,16 1333:16 1336:22 1348:21 1364:10 1367:8 1379:4 1388:1 1400:14 1444:15 1445:18 1455:16 1478:13,14 1503:5 1505:12 1524:15 1525:22 1547:14 1558:19 1564:15

knowledgeable 1503:23 1565:20

L

labeled 1227:6

lack 1183:15 1198:14 1284:3 1286:12 1489:14 1539:13 1557:10

lady 1226:7,8 1466:15

laid 1357:14 1507:15

laissez 1485:13

laminate 1508:24 1509:1

lamp 1267:1

Lane 1345:10,11,14 1358:14 1536:22,23 1537:3 1539:24

language 1442:21 1477:8 1489:1 1490:21

laptop 1290:9

laptops 1184:9,11

larceny 1520:13

large 1200:13 1205:5 1286:6 1301:13 1303:15 1305:23 1318:21 1373:5 1382:22 1383:1 1438:22 1455:17

largely 1375:10,13

larger 1347:24 1547:12

lasted 1328:20 1329:12 lasting 1328:17

lastly 1408:24

late 1160:14 1170:2 1249:8 1274:4 1326:5 1355:10 1426:9 1433:22 1434:15 1450:13 1492:18 1574:4

latest 1381:17 1559:20

Latin 1542:22

latitude 1332:12 1334:17

laugh 1549:24

laughed 1317:7

law 1189:12 1204:4 1205:11 1206:8,14 1278:14 1283:11,17 1284:12,16 1289:10 1311:16 1346:1,3,5,6, 8,9,10,18 1354:6,8,13 1359:5,7 1409:6 1412:8 1443:19 1450:12,21,22 1451:1,6 1454:4,16 1481:23 1498:15 1520:17 1521:5,7,8,9, 15,21,23,24 1522:4,5 1542:18 1548:14,23 1549:21 1550:13,15

laws 1503:1

lawsuits 1405:19

lawyer 1292:5 1351:14 1398:20 1427:12 1428:3 1519:12 1521:16 1548:17

lawyerly 1519:8

lawyers 1307:10,12

lawyers' 1468:19

lays 1516:23

lead 1499:22

leaders 1182:13 1457:6 1519:24

leadership 1270:9

leading 1281:2

leaking 1351:9

lean 1335:14

Lear 1336:7

learn 1207:24 1257:18 1297:11,12 1302:23 1378:3 1402:21 1409:10

learned 1156:10 1207:23 1215:13 1257:2 1292:21 1293:7 1297:3 1308:22 1326:6 1361:15,17 1369:24 1379:6 1425:6 1426:24 1445:8 1469:1 1472:5 1476:7 1487:21 1492:18 1507:24 1508:1 1510:3 1511:3

learning 1550:12

learns 1245:15

leather-covered 1200:23

leave 1260:7 1262:11 1416:1 1460:16 1485:13 1548:11,14, 24

leaving 1218:12 1222:8 1264:16,20 1279:24 1507:20

lecture 1292:4 1570:19

led 1191:2 1229:6

LEDS 1191:4

leeway 1332:12

left 1222:15 1239:19 1259:10.18 1263:10. 19 1265:9,12 1266:10 1272:9 1278:21 1282:15 1295:22 1296:2,3 1313:19,21 1329:3 1331:10 1342:14 1343:19 1351:21 1356:19 1357:10 1363:9 1379:3 1394:11 1397:12 1404:11 1406:7 1408:9 1426:23 1427:1,5,8,9, 11 1434:14 1442:23 1446:2 1449:8

1450:22 1456:4

1461:3 1479:4 1492:24 1493:16 1497:23 1524:9 1527:11 1534:10 1543:24 1551:15

left-hand 1274:19

legal 1164:23 1175:5 1254:8 1313:2 1351:13,16 1398:18 1399:5 1463:23 1464:18,19 1469:15 1516:9 1517:19 1519:14 1520:3 1542:21

legal-size 1443:1,2

legend 1417:7

legislat 1182:13

legislation 1568:7,12 1571:3

legislative 1162:13, 17 1165:13 1220:4 1253:16 1357:13 1395:15 1488:8 1535:10 1558:23 1572:21

legislator's 1306:11

legislators 1229:6 1465:12

legislators' 1550:2

legislature 1232:10 1237:19 1309:4 1438:18 1452:17 1456:15,17,19 1457:6 1463:8 1466:7 1568:20

legit 1309:16,18

legitimate 1516:9

length 1212:6

lengthy 1293:13 1504:22 1519:7

letter 1171:4,9 1252:24 1253:5 1254:20 1348:15 1368:12

letters 1268:8

letting 1239:12 1494:5

level 1159:11 1398:11 1419:6 1545:1

liaison 1357:13

liar 1362:6

Liberty 1180:13

libraries 1498:12

library 1346:5,6,8,10, 18 1498:16

licks 1487:2

lie 1361:12

lied 1362:9

life 1253:23 1299:6 1546:22

light 1162:15 1293:20 1382:20

lighting 1382:13,24 1387:1,2,12 1430:3

lights 1191:2 1237:6 1382:21

likewise 1557:1

limit 1199:6 1200:1 1201:21 1331:24 1332:13 1362:13 1398:2 1484:21 1485:1

limitation 1331:14

limitations 1336:11

limited 1390:17 1523:11

limits 1199:2,4 1310:4 1331:11 1484:23

Lin 1307:17

Lincoln 1221:22 1222:18

Linda 1357:5

line-up 1288:12

lines 1308:21 1317:1 1322:5 1439:11,17 1477:23

lining 1258:21

linkage 1462:12

lion's 1319:18

list 1216:16 1266:9 1307:5 1351:13,15 1421:22 1557:1 1562:1,3

listed 1172:22 1177:4 1179:8 1215:8,9,22 1277:6 1296:18 1406:2 1463:3

litem 1463:23 1464:2, 12 1469:17

litems 1464:8,11 1469:16

literally 1177:18 1209:7 1259:5 1266:23 1282:12 1489:6

live 1364:5 1413:5

lived 1255:19 1546:9

livid 1229:12 1234:20 1330:12 1487:2

living 1300:10

loathing 1511:13

lobby 1237:10,11,12

lobbying 1569:2

local 1327:24 1374:7 1394:3 1458:5

located 1197:8 1290:5 1469:2

location 1189:15

locations 1516:6

locked 1407:23,24 1408:12,13,14

log 1541:11

Logan 1255:20

logging 1445:16 1541:6

logs 1516:4,6

long 1194:16 1195:23 1196:3 1204:15 1213:6 1236:4,7 1265:8 1267:2,3 1295:1 1299:16 1306:1 1314:13 1321:23 1322:8 1356:9,11 1367:11 1368:2,4 1370:4,5 1373:3 1385:15 1416:24 1470:15 1487:20 1503:14 1512:17 1551:8,13 1570:4,20 1575:9

long-standing 1187:18

long-winded 1321:24

longer 1257:18 1373:9 1378:3 1470:1 1492:19 1502:13 1551:13

longstanding

1187:13

looked 1274:17 1303:13 1371:17 1386:4 1421:15 1425:5 1446:11 1496:7 1529:10

looped 1418:13

lose 1261:6 1330:16

lost 1261:10 1330:14 1377:19 1460:10 1550:1

lot 1160:18 1172:17 1174:2 1178:4 1181:6 1191:18 1193:22 1202:14,20 1207:2 1226:7 1233:2 1258:10,11,12 1259:11 1264:7 1268:6,22 1289:9 1295:8,9 1299:6,21 1302:1 1312:11,22,24 1316:12 1321:12,17 1324:23 1328:23 1344:23 1345:15 1350:1 1357:9,19 1364:18,19 1366:10 1369:4 1370:2 1371:4 1375:3,7 1386:18 1397:15 1398:11 1410:11 1416:6,21 1417:3 1418:18 1425:23 1426:2 1441:6,7 1442:21 1444:7,11 1452:12 1454:16 1459:21 1460:2,4 1464:18 1465:11,24 1466:1,22 1495:11,21 1508:17,

21,22 1512:21

1514:23 1515:18,19

1517:16 1532:9,11 1534:15 1535:24 1543:15 1544:2,4 1566:4 1570:20 1572:22

lots 1294:6 1356:19 1455:13 1497:17 1563:6

loud 1284:21 1343:21

Lough 1181:22

Loughry 1156:12 1164:21 1168:4.13.22 1169:21 1170:11 1172:16 1173:14 1177:2 1178:20 1180:3 1181:21 1184:13 1185:10,18 1186:2,21 1187:2 1190:19 1193:12,19 1194:4,20 1195:11 1197:15 1201:6,7 1202:14,19,24 1205:15 1206:5 1209:11 1211:3 1215:13 1217:5 1221:18 1222:6,22 1223:10 1224:3,5 1225:1,16 1226:1,4 1257:6 1259:23 1260:15 1261:23 1262:7 1263:11 1264:16 1267:17,21 1271:1,7,9 1273:14 1274:13,22 1275:4,11 1276:5,13,22 1277:3, 14,23 1283:4 1285:24 1287:8 1289:4 1292:10 1294:20 1295:12 1300:5 1303:18 1306:5 1307:2,7 1315:2,12, 23 1316:23 1317:15 1318:12 1331:2,8 1337:11 1354:6 1355:15 1356:2 1361:20 1362:9 1363:18,19 1364:15 1372:4 1373:2 1376:21 1377:1 1379:11 1380:7 1400:13 1404:13 1409:1,17,22 1420:8 1421:4,8,18 1422:9 1429:2 1432:17 1435:8 1449:4,5,8,9, 13,14,20,21 1451:9

1453:4 1455:15 1459:11 1480:8,11,13 1487:19 1491:6,20 1496:12 1499:4 1500:11 1507:11 1514:3,17 1515:15, 17,24 1516:7 1523:14,22 1524:12 1544:2,3 1551:6 1554:24 1555:15 1574:21

Loughry's 1173:24 1185:16 1186:15,19 1193:10,20,24 1195:6 1197:8 1204:24 1205:16 1206:7.23 1209:3 1220:5 1223:14 1225:3,11 1274:15 1290:1 1304:18 1330:23 1342:17 1349:8 1359:6 1361:6 1363:24 1387:9 1400:22 1420:12 1427:15 1441:3 1442:4,11,12 1481:5 1487:14 1499:15 1513:21 1523:18 1524:17 1533:4,16,20 1536:5,8 1563:17

love 1280:16 1337:16

lovely 1260:12 1373:2

lower 1294:2 1570:17 1571:11

lowering 1327:23

lowest 1191:11 1529:11 1571:14

lowliest 1311:21

loyalist 1299:23

lunch 1170:2 1213:1, 8,9,19 1214:6,13,19, 21,23 1215:9 1252:16 1272:3,17 1378:22

lunches 1212:20 1213:4,14,19,21 1214:7,10,17,24 1215:2,15,19,20 1216:1,10,17,21 1374:19 1388:23,24 1389:2,14,16,18,19 1390:1 1573:12,15

07/26/2018 Index: lustrous..members

1574:11

lustrous 1472:17

M

Macarthur 1278:11 **machines** 1184:18, 19

made 1162:3 1164:5 1171:22 1172:13.14 1177:12 1187:20 1189:9 1199:23 1200:14 1211:18 1218:24 1220:22 1223:16 1225:10 1230:23 1234:23 1235:6 1236:19 1238:22 1240:8,24 1241:10 1243:7 1245:12 1248:12 1249:1.2 1264:15 1266:22 1267:3.11 1276:8 1278:1,4 1280:23 1287:22 1317:15 1318:16 1319:4,19 1338:20 1340:18 1344:20 1363:2 1378:24 1396:3,4,6,8,9,10,11 1397:12,18 1408:24 1415:15 1422:8 1425:15 1426:2,5 1429:15 1453:10,11, 22 1485:19 1493:8 1502:21 1507:8 1512:3,9 1523:17 1545:20,21 1572:24

magazine 1437:16

magistrate 1233:1 1245:18,21 1246:6 1437:6,13 1439:6,9 1461:1,17,19 1470:12 1471:24 1566:5 1573:24

magistrates 1159:19 1282:8 1350:22,23 1471:16 1538:2 1568:24

main 1178:19,20 1200:19 1375:19

major 1234:1,3,4 1397:15 1495:10

majority 1281:12,14 1296:22 1311:10,15 1319:5 1342:5 1350:16 1381:10 1396:20 1397:6 1483:1 1534:1 1544:24 1570:9

make 1159:23 1183:3 1197:5 1198:17 1204:21 1205:2 1223:21 1229:16 1234:24 1236:13 1237:19,20 1242:17 1244:21 1247:17 1248:7 1250:10 1251:2 1256:7 1261:1,15 1262:11 1267:16 1271:15 1281:24 1282:3 1284:10 1287:9,21 1290:17 1291:7,20 1310:17 1322:24 1323:15,16 1348:13 1388:2 1398:14,15 1416:14 1417:19 1419:6 1446:16 1450:21.22.24 1474:19 1485:8 1506:11 1508:16 1509:15 1518:18 1520:7 1522:5 1532:11 1541:3,8 1549:17 1558:11 1563:11 1568:11 1570:6,16 1571:8

makes 1212:3 1254:7 1316:18 1322:19 1375:16 1519:22

making 1193:6 1231:14 1249:15 1264:17 1335:5 1368:11 1381:24 1405:22 1414:15 1470:7 1474:12 1477:15 1509:4 1510:6 1566:22

man 1312:21 1342:6 1411:20,23 1412:5,9 1565:17 1572:4

managed 1497:24

management

1226:18 1382:1 1524:9 1559:7 manager 1189:21 1192:2,3,12 1193:22 1197:22 1202:4 1223:5,18 1274:1,16 1276:16,23,24 1287:17,21 1288:2, 14,18 1318:1,10 1319:2 1330:11 1338:14 1339:2 1348:9 1363:22 1365:10,24 1370:24 1400:15 1410:14 1473:20 1474:4,8 1475:3,7,8 1476:13 1477:1,6,9,11

managers 1348:22 1573:19 1574:7

managing 1523:11 mandated 1234:9

1463:8,17 1469:6 1489:9

manner 1165:11 1399:1 1403:21 1433:2

manners 1565:21

manual 1488:23 1489:3 1491:4

map 1195:18 1197:6 1400:23 1401:5

Mapquest 1546:12

marble 1191:1 1237:6 1472:6,9,14,15 1473:9

marbled 1469:9

march 1316:10 1324:8 1384:11 1561:5

marching 1316:9 1353:13

marijuana 1334:3

Mark 1174:8 1179:21 1180:7,9 1350:13

marked 1167:20 1273:9

market 1216:20 1310:12 1370:17,21, 23 1372:1 1550:2

married 1204:7,10 1205:6 1373:6 1432:1 1513:9

marvelous 1245:20

Mary 1171:5,10 1304:3,10 1407:22 1415:20 1558:7

masochist 1281:16

Massey 1512:12

master's 1298:14

masters 1465:11

match 1376:14 1534:22

material 1180:20 1287:10 1318:18 1380:11

materials 1380:16 1411:20,23 1412:5

math 1381:14 1534:5

matter 1215:15 1294:13 1383:18 1393:9 1429:23 1430:11 1431:5 1518:16 1522:13 1540:19 1541:4,5 1542:10,11 1546:15 1554:15

matters 1248:12 1256:14 1332:19 1333:8 1441:10 1482:18 1542:22,23

max 1451:1,5,10

maybes 1443:7

Maynard 1202:9 1206:14,19,22 1207:5 1280:11,12 1283:10, 13 1285:6 1336:20 1456:24 1487:22 1512:14,16,20 1543:14 1569:15

Maynard's 1206:13

Maynard/starcher 1487:4

Mchugh 1190:16 1202:14,16 1301:9 1413:16,17 1427:23 1431:2 1448:15 1449:19 1542:9 1543:17 Mchugh's 1427:23

Mcqueen 1171:5,10

meal 1423:15

meals 1217:1

meaning 1505:2

means 1259:12 1315:10 1320:16 1461:15 1521:15 1545:2 1559:12 1577:12

meant 1238:20 1333:23 1375:4 1521:19,20

measure 1256:2 1268:19

measuring 1255:13

mechanics 1514:13

medallion 1195:5,7, 14,18 1196:19 1275:7 1387:10 1472:6 1473:2 1507:11 1536:1 1563:19

media 1445:10

medical 1301:23

meet 1156:24 1306:9 1307:2,20 1340:11 1371:13 1516:3 1574:6,23,24

meeting 1156:3,18 1168:21 1178:1 1220:1 1238:10 1259:19 1282:14 1306:5 1307:6,7,12 1325:22 1326:7 1328:5,19,20 1329:3 1422:18 1433:18 1457:5 1523:14 1539:3 1559:1 1574:7

meetings 1172:24 1215:17 1242:21 1307:24 1327:6,9,15, 16,17,18 1328:10 1329:15 1552:13,15, 16,17,20

member 1225:4 1236:3,20 1499:16 1535:9

members 1181:9 1248:11 1271:23

07/26/2018 Index: members'..mother

1272:4 1273:11 1275:18 1290:16 1295:13 1335:6 1449:3 1482:18 1514:4 1517:9 1519:23 1521:4 1527:15 1535:16 1550:19 1555:16,18 1567:18 1572:17 1574:20

members' 1272:23

memo 1156:10 1164:15,19 1165:3,6, 22 1166:4,6,9,22,24 1169:14,18,20 1170:6,7,15 1172:2, 10,14 1173:10,21 1227:18 1229:2,4,9 1233:22 1234:14 1239:6 1308:13 1413:7 1446:4 1448:2 1467:7 1473:19 1491:6

memoranda 1420:7 1421:2 1422:7

memorandum

1171:18,20 1172:6,9 1173:5,18 1174:3 1181:20 1182:19 1199:20 1227:11,15, 21 1253:13 1254:5 1332:19 1420:5,21 1422:10 1423:6,11 1462:21 1487:6 1514:18 1555:15

memory 1176:5 1183:10 1277:1 1358:24 1444:13 1466:15,21 1480:9 1528:23 1548:16 1563:21 1571:24

memos 1175:11,12, 22 1179:19 1308:15

Mendez 1523:19,21 1524:23 1525:2,4

Menis 1223:9 1260:2

mental 1192:7 1352:1,2 1357:5 1461:22 1469:18 1513:7 1538:1 1540:21

mentality 1547:20

mention 1162:14 1181:19 1186:10,21 1187:20 1229:5 1234:14 1469:17 1535:6 1569:16

mentioned 1163:22 1175:18,22 1176:23 1192:17 1201:5 1204:21 1206:1 1208:24 1210:7 1227:15 1246:20 1249:11,19 1271:3 1273:14 1285:12 1305:6 1315:22 1340:2,23 1341:7 1351:2 1365:23 1366:9 1372:6 1376:16 1377:11 1380:6 1384:14 1385:13 1396:21 1397:14 1398:4 1405:5 1420:1 1422:12 1424:14 1427:6 1429:2 1430:2 1431:21,23 1433:7 1435:6,11 1436:4 1437:1 1438:4,17 1453:3 1480:15 1486:12 1495:23 1499:21 1502:20 1510:1 1515:17,22 1523:15 1544:23 1548:5 1573:24

mentions 1162:20 1499:8 1523:13

Merit 1577:3

mess 1265:3 1372:14 1488:2

message 1296:16 1495:2

met 1202:17 1427:4 1437:10,14,19 1546:4

metals 1507:19 1508:22

mic 1300:3

mid 1223:4 1350:6

middle 1337:17 1442:5,22 1443:2,3,6 1546:17

midnight 1194:13

Mike 1313:11 1560:8

mile 1415:2 1417:15

mileage 1322:23 1414:4,13,17,21 1415:3 1417:14

miles 1414:22,23 1416:19 1417:15 1418:1,2,9 1419:3 1445:16 1546:13,15

millennials 1371:18 1372:3

Miller 1244:16 1245:4 1279:3,4,9 1289:1 1297:19 1511:21,23 1512:2 1520:23 1522:15 1539:15 1573:20

million 1174:10 1189:18 1341:23 1347:6,7 1381:18 1438:18 1466:16

mimicking 1575:2

mind 1232:9 1302:2 1305:11 1317:12 1366:19,20 1403:5,10 1415:22 1417:13

minds 1487:18

mine 1157:19 1266:9 1405:13 1407:17 1434:24 1553:9

Minnesota 1549:24

minor 1566:6

Minority 1304:24 1305:5 1314:8 1319:23 1447:18,24 1482:5 1522:20 1527:23

minute 1162:11 1298:7 1488:10 1502:4

minutes 1212:1 1266:13 1312:5 1321:16,21 1322:10, 13,14 1326:20,24 1356:16 1486:13,15, 20,24 1487:8,13 1501:14 1527:18 1574:7

minutia 1194:9

mischaracterization

1182:7 1331:21

misdoing 1560:20 miserable 1280:14

misgiving 1560:20

misgivings 1366:1

mislabeled 1493:13

misremembering 1506:9 1533:8

missed 1239:4 1245:4 1419:8 1433:1 1510:2

missing 1297:5,18 1329:20 1379:15 1405:5 1408:21 1445:21,24 1446:2 1493:3

Mississippi 1336:8, 15

misspoke 1411:5 mistaken 1170:12 1349:18 1422:22

mistakenly 1248:15

mistakes 1415:15

misunderstood 1378:10

mixed 1322:14 1549:12

Moats 1327:21 1328:6

modern 1342:18 1383:16 1429:19

moment 1166:19 1167:21 1169:4,9,17 1172:5 1173:18 1201:9 1202:21 1208:4 1216:6 1220:2 1238:3 1252:24 1254:22 1264:24 1269:2 1273:18 1344:7 1377:15,19 1378:9 1386:17 1403:19,24 1407:11

moments 1257:16 1377:13,16 1378:21

Monday 1179:8 1559:19 1575:4,6,8,9, 10

money 1171:6 1174:5 1179:5 1180:22 1228:3,5,15,24 1229:12 1232:12,20 1233:3,15 1235:5,11, 14 1239:1 1243:1 1258:5 1261:7,10 1270:8 1312:9,14,22 1313:4,5,13 1316:2 1366:1 1371:11,12 1374:23 1375:1,3,8 1388:2 1436:22 1438:23 1466:5,22 1467:10 1469:24 1486:6 1495:11.14 1503:1 1526:22 1566:3

money-grubbing 1569:8

moneys 1233:5

month 1175:21 1212:15,16 1334:3 1552:14

months 1164:10 1167:12 1182:20 1189:15 1231:13 1242:5 1261:1 1279:17 1285:2 1354:2 1357:4 1429:20 1440:2 1446:15 1455:9

Moore 1245:16 1246:6,10 1279:16,18 1437:7

Moore's 1298:24

Moraine 1298:17

morale 1281:21 1282:16

Morgan 1445:4

morgue 1281:21

morning 1156:2,9 1179:20 1194:14 1249:10 1252:4 1256:18,23 1275:8 1303:10 1575:19,20 1576:4

Morrisey 1307:21

mother 1298:20

07/26/2018 Index: motion..occurred

motion 1509:18 1575:17,24

mountains 1344:21 1417:4

mounted 1357:15

mouth 1421:7 1437:2 1467:9

mouthful 1461:12

mouthing 1403:6

move 1183:16 1188:7 1189:14 1198:19 1201:13 1218:19 1224:7 1239:8 1243:6 1244:13 1264:24 1275:18 1300:17 1336:4 1358:7 1383:5 1394:21 1402:7 1458:6 1494:1 1509:10 1511:4 1523:23 1524:13 1547:14 1575:21

moved 1185:15 1187:3 1192:3,12,13 1243:23,24 1289:7 1331:2 1359:20 1360:24 1361:14 1427:15 1497:17 1505:21,24 1506:13 1510:4,19,22 1511:3 1524:4,21 1525:3

movement 1525:3 1547:14

moving 1185:18 1186:8,15,22 1267:7 1300:16 1360:23 1361:3,6 1380:10,16 1402:23 1475:20

muddied 1180:8

Mueller 1292:3

Mullins 1296:6 1558:6

Mullins' 1405:11

multi-circuit 1321:13

multiple 1429:3 1432:19 1557:2

mutual 1299:1

mvriad 1203:1

mystery 1408:18

Ν

nagging 1482:9

nail 1444:18

named 1174:8 1180:18 1221:6 1255:2 1549:21

names 1215:8,12,14 1307:9

narrow 1465:12

Nashville 1299:11

nation 1168:20 1282:20 1462:18

national 1171:4,6 1225:18 1258:1 1417:8 1462:14,19

nationals 1336:17

naturally 1180:16 1453:14

nature 1432:21 1446:10 1460:1

nearby 1546:9

Nebraska 1221:22 1222:4,12

necessarily 1283:1 1321:21 1549:11

necessitate 1444:21

necessities 1159:10

neck 1301:17

needed 1161:19 1164:23 1176:21 1209:14 1215:12 1223:19 1243:19 1247:1 1284:11 1291:18 1294:10

1301:17 1309:5 1330:5 1351:5

1369:24 1407:2,6,11

1408:3 1430:14 1431:8 1437:13

1439:5 1456:21 1461:20 1467:11,22,

23 1468:9,15 1474:18 1507:18 1530:24

1539:5 1541:11 1545:16 1554:12 Neese 1337:2

negative 1406:1

negatively 1522:24

negotiated 1370:3 1388:10

Neighbor 1476:16

Neighborgall

1189:16,20 1191:11, 22 1192:1,5,14 1194:24 1250:15 1269:17 1318:2 1388:11,14,17,18 1410:13 1412:1 1476:19 1477:20 1529:10 1532:10 1567:2

neighborhood 1369:23

network 1541:6

newly-renovated 1359:21

news 1199:2 1336:13 1552:10

newspaper 1278:20 1293:2,14

newspapers 1266:4 1444:2

nice 1196:8 1261:12 1267:1 1465:15 1466:5 1473:12

niceties 1236:15

night 1223:3 1291:15, 19 1393:2 1433:22 1540:10

noble 1299:16

nodded 1522:24

noise 1532:11

Nokia 1265:18

noncourt 1432:10 1525:15

nonvoting 1236:2

nook 1301:13

normal 1314:23 1356:1,12,18 1433:13 1574:23 **north** 1223:1,15 1224:2 1291:7 1346:5,16 1376:17 1435:7 1541:19

northern 1346:22

Notary 1577:4

note 1190:4 1206:23 1221:6 1233:23 1234:2 1239:5 1260:12 1270:1,13 1274:20 1306:17 1422:21

notebook 1162:16 1166:15,16 1167:19 1171:17 1254:17 1490:24 1572:23

notebooks 1371:5

noted 1170:8 1314:10

notes 1270:7 1285:20 1356:14 1577:10

notice 1288:4 1500:11

noticeable 1291:13

noticed 1197:22 1202:17 1286:1 1359:21,24 1435:11 1442:21 1495:10

notification 1327:5

notified 1325:7,23 1453:15

notifies 1325:12

notify 1239:21

novelistic 1322:15

November 1181:6 1355:11,19 1361:16 1414:18 1448:2 1462:21 1465:1

number 1174:11,17 1240:12 1265:22,23 1267:15 1282:9 1341:21 1351:4,18 1352:4,20 1392:12 1411:17 1421:17 1455:17 1458:16,17, 18 1459:19 1463:20, 21,22 1464:12 1478:9 1517:19

numbered 1162:18

numbers 1532:20 1570:2,17

numerous 1174:15

0

oak 1196:21

OASIS 1242:18,19,22 1492:13,17 1560:6 1563:1.2.14

oath 1361:20 1365:15 1403:9 1435:18 1436:2 1494:16 1528:8

object 1308:22

objectives 1516:3

obligation 1384:5

observation 1543:7

observed 1544:12 1558:16

obtain 1156:13 1276:15

obtaining 1520:14

obvious 1231:14 1496:4

occasion 1217:8 1221:21 1513:13 1568:2

occasional 1207:11 1344:19

occasionally 1381:3 1543:16

occasions 1170:2 1174:18 1374:6,22 1555:23 1556:8 1557:3 1558:7

occupied 1359:16

occur 1212:10 1230:6,7

occurred 1163:6 1176:3 1178:1 1183:7 1189:7 1210:21 1216:11 1231:5 1253:16 1256:5 1259:19 1296:7 1506:20 1573:16

07/26/2018 Index: occurrence..owns

occurrence 1257:1 1263:22,23

occurring 1162:22, 23 1188:20 1216:10 1220:10 1253:12 1464:20 1506:18

October 1391:19 1488:16 1489:13

ODC 1509:22

odor 1367:15

off-putting 1315:18

off-the-wall 1542:1

offender 1456:8 1457:11 1458:21

offenders 1455:24 1457:10 1458:6,9,20 1571:5

office 1159:16 1161:20 1170:4 1175:9 1177:20 1183:15,22 1185:8,12 1186:3 1187:15 1188:8,24 1189:2,10 1190:10,11,15,23 1192:4 1193:8,10,14, 20 1194:5,22 1195:6, 14 1197:8 1200:2,5,6 1202:18 1204:17,24 1205:4,16,21 1207:14 1209:3 1215:23 1217:23 1218:5,11 1236:16 1237:12,18, 19 1239:15 1247:4 1250:19 1256:17,18 1258:11 1268:10,17 1273:16 1282:17,18, 19 1283:16 1284:2,5, 23 1289:9,12,14 1290:13 1294:22 1297:7,17 1300:4,5,8, 11,13,18 1301:8,14 1304:17,18 1305:7,16 1306:10,11,12,21,24 1307:13,19 1311:11 1312:12 1319:15 1323:20 1325:14 1330:15,23 1340:17 1341:22 1342:2,6,17, 20 1343:19 1345:24 1346:1,14,15,17,20, 24 1347:1,15 1348:2,

16,19 1349:1,8,9

1352:12 1353:14,15

1354:8,16,19,21,22 1355:10 1358:4,6,8 1359:6,10,12,21 1362:14 1363:24 1366:10.13.18.21 1367:10,24 1368:1, 17,21 1370:16 1373:9 1376:2,7 1382:13 1383:14 1392:19 1395:20 1397:3 1398:3 1399:24 1401:2 1405:9,10,12 1407:8,20 1408:9,11, 12,16,17 1423:19 1424:6 1425:4 1427:17,18,23 1429:6 1430:10 1431:3 1441:3,14 1443:16 1446:9 1452:20 1454:18 1456:12 1460:6 1468:13 1474:16 1475:24 1480:13 1482:4 1484:4,6,13,22 1485:5,14 1486:6 1497:15 1498:7,12 1499:15 1507:1,16,18 1508:17 1509:6,16,20 1515:6 1517:10 1523:15 1529:19 1530:1.7.10.17 1531:5 1532:21 1533:4,16,20,24 1534:2,6 1535:10 1536:2,4,5,7,8,11 1537:17 1541:15 1553:6,11,14 1554:2, 8,10,15 1558:24

officer 1328:1,2,7 1347:17 1348:19

1559:19 1572:22

officers 1358:1 1455:24 1456:1,9,14 1457:21,24 1458:10 1459:1,9 1462:6 1538:1 1570:4,10

offices 1188:15,16 1189:10,13 1190:3 1196:4 1217:24 1237:14,16 1239:15 1305:14 1311:12 1316:18,19 1319:16 1346:10,12,23 1348:6 1349:12 1353:2,4,13 1354:10 1359:14 1369:6,16 1371:1,12 1372:3 1375:12 1381:22 1383:15,22 1385:14,18 1395:15 1405:9 1410:22 1428:4,6 1431:12 1439:9 1440:12,13,21 1441:20 1442:2 1470:12 1479:24 1482:3 1498:23 1499:24 1507:10 1530:13 1532:21 1543:8,13 1544:12 1549:7,8,11 1554:23

official 1179:10 1296:13 1297:17 1405:20,21 1425:5 1491:7 1552:23

officials 1307:1 1469:2

offsite 1524:6

old-fashioned 1342:10

Omaha 1221:23 1222:18

omission 1557:20

one's 1272:6

one-day 1296:24

one-year 1356:3 1370:4

ongoing 1319:17 1328:19

op 1331:8 1488:3 1568:16

open 1246:3 1272:14 1354:12 1401:8,14,23 1402:3 1442:22 1443:5 1461:2 1471:2,3,4 1550:2

opening 1286:11

operate 1395:13

operation 1469:6 1537:10,18

operations 1537:19

opiate 1345:2 1464:6 1469:19

opine 1526:20

opinion 1164:23 1193:18 1194:3

1203:17 1213:15 1232:4,5 1254:9 1314:20 1410:2 1519:13,14 1520:4,18 1532:13

opinions 1278:19 1313:18 1515:19

opportunity 1157:15 1161:11 1173:8 1187:14 1315:21 1551:2

opposed 1269:10 1366:11 1458:5 1576:2

optimistic 1232:23

options 1338:3

oral 1234:23

order 1156:3 1190:3 1213:8 1269:9,18 1272:21 1330:2 1334:8,11 1340:8,13, 14,20,22 1343:2 1410:23 1411:2,10 1471:16 1480:1 1517:17 1528:18 1529:5,15,18 1530:1, 3,14,16,18 1531:2,4, 17 1532:5

ordered 1214:13 ordering 1363:23

orders 1269:14,20,21 1288:5 1316:9 1320:17,18 1340:3,7 1387:16,19,20 1388:2,5,7,9 1461:22 1528:17 1529:13 1530:11,13 1531:20 1532:5,20

organization 1225:20 1547:16

organize 1458:9

organized 1458:10

original 1181:5 1190:6 1191:7 1200:6 1269:7 1289:15 1304:15 1340:3 1342:8 1386:1,2 1410:11 1496:1 1528:17 1529:24 1530:2,9 1543:11 originally 1268:5 1410:17,18 1456:11 1550:6

originals 1511:5

originating 1541:20

other's 1543:8,13 1544:11

out-of-court 1432:11 1464:2

out-of-state 1220:8 1224:21,24 1225:4 1291:8 1490:14

out-of-town 1218:20

outpaced 1184:17

outreach 1545:16

Overington 1395:6, 7,12 1400:8,17 1410:4 1552:4,5,8 1555:4

overlap 1323:1,18

overlaps 1477:9

overlooked 1502:6

overnight 1329:8,11

oversaw 1370:12

oversee 1325:8 1524:3

overseeing 1477:10 1523:12

oversight 1450:19

overspending 1344:10

overtalk 1378:8 1515:16

overview 1189:4,6 1572:18

overwhelming 1346:21 1573:7

owned 1177:13 1255:7 1426:22 1498:5

owner 1288:14 1388:20

owns 1536:13

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: P-CARD..person

Ρ

P-CARD 1215:4,5,7 1226:20 1322:22 1389:7,8,10,15

P-CARDS 1226:18, 23 1389:11,12

p.m. 1435:4

pack 1266:4

packing 1266:2

paid 1170:10 1171:6, 8 1178:11,24 1179:4, 14 1215:2,3 1220:24 1221:3,4 1225:10 1226:9 1232:7 1243:1 1286:24 1310:1,4,8, 18 1312:3 1313:16 1323:21 1325:20 1328:1 1353:18 1363:3 1372:18 1374:13,14,16 1375:3 1390:19,21 1391:17 1398:7 1415:5 1416:8 1418:7,8,11 1431:14, 16,18,22,23 1432:4,5 1436:21 1451:1,3,5, 10 1503:2,7 1504:14 1505:9,16,20 1506:8 1508:2 1526:15.22 1528:1,2 1540:16 1555:1

pal 1546:9

Palm 1414:18

pandemonious 1267:10

panel 1286:18

paneling 1367:2

Panera's 1216:22

panhandle 1545:24

panoramic 1203:7

pap 1428:15

paper 1216:14 1295:14 1313:23 1314:7,11 1406:17,18 1428:16 1443:22 1455:14 1470:12 1471:15 1498:8 paper-covered 1342:9

paragraph 1228:2,14 1229:4 1233:23 1234:13,14 1238:1,3, 4,8 1253:5 1469:4

parallel 1390:22

paramilitary 1547:18

paraphrase 1187:12

paraphrasing 1364:18

Pardon 1436:8

Parkersburg 1329:10

parking 1390:17 1416:2

parole 1457:8,13 1570:12,13

part 1159:23 1171:7 1179:10 1198:9 1199:19 1200:2 1226:16 1231:8 1239:10 1269:13 1277:3 1289:7 1311:22 1319:16 1326:14 1328:11,12 1329:22 1338:24 1346:23 1349:19

1350:15 1353:3 1363:12,13 1365:18 1375:6 1398:16 1416:17 1417:16

1421:17 1439:8 1458:1 1478:12 1479:4 1498:19.21

1479:4 1498:19,2 1503:17 1507:18

1521:3 1523:10 1539:12 1540:6

1546:1 1547:11,16,17 1556:17,19 1557:12

1560:17,19 1557:1 1560:14 1573:17

partially 1170:14

participate 1417:7

participation 1417:6 1515:5

parties 1396:8 1535:18

parts 1221:19,24 1425:21 1478:4 1544:22 party 1168:18 1174:5 1299:23

pass 1404:1 1445:7

passed 1232:10 1273:2,11

passing 1300:3 1446:19

past 1277:15 1331:17 1344:5

paste 1489:6

path 1270:10

paths 1170:5

patience 1312:19 1565:6

patient 1312:21

Patrick 1307:21

pattern 1212:16 1213:11

Paul 1523:19 1525:4

pay 1179:16 1226:3 1265:17 1310:2 1412:14 1467:4 1546:11 1569:1,2,8 1575:6,12

paying 1484:17

payment 1199:17 1215:10 1219:11 1225:10 1323:9,10 1380:15 1393:24 1399:7 1503:12 1505:6

payments 1174:8 1179:20 1180:5 1502:21

Payne 1357:12

payroll 1309:22 1324:19

payroll's 1324:19

pays 1374:10

pearl 1196:13,16 1472:9,13 1473:9,10, 14

peer 1483:7

pencils 1428:15

penny 1171:8 1182:9

1312:16 1313:7

people 1166:13 1170:21 1184:19,23 1185:2 1189:21,23 1192:2 1202:17 1208:7 1213:20 1214:2,5 1215:16 1226:5 1231:21 1232:13 1250:21 1251:21 1257:14,19 1265:14 1269:16 1281:2,5 1284:1,6,20 1289:7 1290:6 1294:11 1296:9 1298:15 1299:11 1305:13.16 1306:10. 14,19 1307:14 1309:22 1310:6 1311:5 1315:17 1318:1,11 1321:12 1326:21 1335:20 1357:10,16,19 1358:7 1361:24 1370:9 1392:7,13,18,21 1394:3,11 1409:19 1422:2 1434:21 1436:1,6,17,21 1438:10.11.14 1452:8,12,22 1454:16 1455:8,16,19,23 1457:16,18 1458:24 1459:21 1460:2,8,9, 15,16,17 1462:8 1468:14,17,18,20,23 1470:6 1483:5,8 1498:15 1509:5 1510:10 1517:24 1518:8 1519:16 1521:15 1526:9,15,21 1527:1 1532:6,11 1538:17 1539:3 1543:1,18 1546:21

1569:5,8 1570:17 **people's** 1315:20

1556:20 1562:19

1567:6 1568:15

percent 1205:22 1370:1 1458:22 1464:14 1537:13,21 1566:13

percent's 1458:23

percentage 1366:13 1368:17,19

perfect 1316:19

1542:12

perfectly 1182:17 1202:18 1330:12 1360:2 1458:8 1550:24

performed 1249:21 1348:14

performing 1181:1

period 1158:22 1161:18 1163:5 1171:23 1180:5 1183:24 1206:2 1209:10 1210:21 1214:11 1232:2 1234:22 1251:5 1303:5 1369:15 1370:4,5 1386:19 1471:8 1510:14 1518:23

periods 1295:2

permanent 1239:14 1240:21,23 1243:8,15 1551:18

permissible 1389:11

permission 1223:2 1266:18 1422:19

perpetuity 1470:9

person 1160:24 1180:9 1208:5 1209:17 1226:22 1236:1.12 1240:16 1241:12 1242:19 1243:15,18,22,23,24 1244:9,13 1245:11 1246:1 1249:14 1260:1 1262:3 1274:8,10 1287:17 1293:19 1299:24 1304:16 1307:17 1337:1 1339:2,6 1348:10 1361:19 1362:6 1402:5 1409:16 1412:21 1437:4,9 1473:22,23 1474:3,5,20,24 1476:4,13 1477:4,10, 19 1484:14.17 1491:16 1494:5 1502:6 1513:5 1514:7 1526:18 1538:12.15

1539:4,6 1543:18

1558:6,7 1564:21

07/26/2018 Index: personal..precipitated

1565:17 1567:21

personal 1189:11
1210:17,18 1211:2,8
1221:13,20 1224:16
1248:12,13,18,21,22
1284:8 1294:19
1295:21 1296:4,12,
19,20 1311:16,17
1335:10,15,16 1341:4
1388:18 1389:11,14,
16,17 1416:14 1419:7
1431:10,13 1433:10
1438:24 1445:3
1526:4 1533:21
1554:20,22 1564:4,20

personalities 1483:11

personality 1430:12 1431:6 1455:8

personally 1186:18 1197:14 1228:18 1275:10 1288:17 1464:16 1509:12,14 1558:16 1564:21 1566:1

personnel 1212:21 1239:11 1240:1 1504:8 1505:2 1507:5 1538:20 1539:11 1540:4 1541:2,10

persons 1199:3

pertained 1333:15

perusal 1343:5

Ph.d. 1298:16

Phil 1264:23 1313:24 1402:20 1510:23

philosophically

1487:23

phone 1249:9 1265:18,21,24 1267:12 1335:5 1433:21 1437:18,20 1510:16 1523:18,21

phones 1560:5

Phonetic 1367:20

photograph 1203:7

photographic

1466:15

phrase 1420:9

phrases 1542:21

phrasing 1253:24

physical 1492:9

physically 1266:13

pick 1288:12 1302:6 1450:17

picked 1200:18 1271:22 1287:24 1547:11

pictures 1372:17,19, 24 1512:14

piece 1185:21 1207:3,6,9 1293:14 1533:21

pieces 1289:20 1360:12 1549:15

Pierce 1236:17 1237:9

pig 1245:19

piggyback 1342:14

piggybacked 1440:23

pile 1363:7 1398:12

piled 1498:2

pillows 1365:7 1366:4

Pioneer 1390:24

Pipestem 1374:5

place 1216:23 1244:20 1287:1 1308:22 1309:12 1319:5 1337:20 1369:17 1372:11 1373:5 1426:8 1471:6 1480:20 1481:1 1498:13 1511:9 1515:2 1520:19 1548:10 1577:7

places 1242:10 1293:5 1445:2,3,4 1490:9 1539:11

plan 1270:19 1296:11 1335:3,4

plane 1417:1,2

planner 1296:4,12 1406:19

planning 1501:11

plans 1186:22 1246:19

plaques 1549:9

plastic 1508:23,24

platform 1180:21

play 1287:12

played 1248:16 1569:20

player 1352:6

pleasant 1253:20 1325:1

pleased 1189:19,20 1247:11 1269:16

pleasure 1257:7 1394:15

pledged 1207:13

plumber 1351:7,8

plumbing 1342:3 1399:13 1441:12,13, 18

plural 1528:3

pocket 1415:14

pockets 1179:16

point 1160:6 1175:19 1177:7 1178:19,20 1180:9 1182:12 1185:10 1187:2,8,20 1200:11 1203:20 1210:9 1212:18 1223:16 1231:3 1232:11 1242:17 1244:22 1248:6

1258:19 1265:9 1270:1 1277:15 1284:18 1285:9 1292:17 1295:22 1322:1 1334:8,11

1342:14 1353:17 1356:5 1364:17 1384:8 1404:18

1415:7,9 1419:5 1429:4 1467:7

1482:21 1510:17 1515:21 1524:8

1545:20,21 1575:1

pointed 1179:12 1182:8 1222:11

points 1174:17 1175:2,7 1409:8

pole 1481:9

poles 1481:13

police 1180:13 1462:6

policies 1183:15 1313:6 1420:22,23 1514:12,13

policy 1161:5,6,7 1174:24 1175:1 1183:20 1184:14,17 1187:13,17,18 1201:18 1265:14 1325:23 1326:8,9,20 1327:1 1331:16,17,18 1332:11,16 1389:10, 15 1415:8 1416:11 1420:18 1427:16,17, 18 1428:5,9,11,16,20, 21 1438:8 1443:19 1451:12 1452:5.6 1484:20 1488:6,7,22 1489:2 1490:20,23 1491:3,8 1492:8 1550:13 1554:18 1555:17

polished 1507:20

politely 1517:6

political 1174:16 1567:7

pool 1438:23

poorly 1521:17

popular 1565:16

portable 1349:13

portal 1461:2 1471:1

-

portion 1276:18

position 1158:23 1159:3 1173:24 1239:14 1257:7 1262:8 1279:13 1315:19 1335:11,12 1348:11 1357:11,13 1454:15 1474:19 1475:14 1518:18

positions 1158:23 1214:1 1258:4

1310:5,6 1311:5 1513:16 1516:24

positive 1247:18 1431:18,21

possibilities 1298:24

possibility 1229:24 1231:9

possibly 1293:18

Post 1238:9 1253:16 1324:8 1325:21

post-incarceration 1457:10

poster 1203:14

posterity 1296:14

potential 1516:13

Potentially 1482:17

pow 1396:22

power 1366:6 1396:20,23 1399:5,13 1517:22 1568:20

powers 1396:16

PR 1299:20

pra 1356:13

practically 1257:22

practice 1187:13 1213:11 1271:21 1308:22 1314:23 1332:22 1355:3 1363:2 1384:15

practices 1313:6 1316:20 1562:15

1452:24 1497:14

praise 1206:23 1462:15

pre 1492:13

pre-16-year-old 1299:14

pre-need 1299:12

preapproved 1362:17

preceded 1332:20

preceding 1355:8,9

precipitated 1160:16

1211:1

07/26/2018 Index: precisely..Proops

precisely 1197:4 1473:7

predate 1488:18

predated 1489:3,13

predecessor

1313:12 1492:13 1560:8

predecessor's 1560:21

preexisting 1497:17 preference 1341:4.6

preferred 1340:24

Preliminary 1274:22

premature 1369:1

premises 1349:20 1426:23 1468:10 1524:6

preoccupation 1180:18

preoccupied 1422:11

preparation 1209:21

prepare 1165:3 1227:18,21,22 1421:9 1498:20

prepared 1164:19 1183:16 1229:2 1274:8,12 1275:4 1330:3 1400:10 1420:4

preparing 1511:4 preplanned 1440:5

pres 1365:16

presence 1156:4 1217:1 1226:15

present 1156:7 1229:23 1259:21 1277:18 1302:12 1320:21 1338:1 1355:12 1403:15 1500:21 1575:15

presentation

1203:16 1230:16,18, 23 1231:6 1299:12 1364:16 1365:16 1487:15 **presented** 1231:21 1337:23 1409:5,15 1531:1,2 1562:1

presenters 1330:24

president 1171:4

president-elect 1257:23 1417:9

press 1264:22 1265:5 1343:23 1344:8 1346:13 1402:11,15, 18 1403:8,15,20 1499:16

pressure 1483:7

pressures 1357:15

presumption 1176:21

pretenses 1520:14

pretty 1176:17 1191:18 1192:1 1193:23 1195:12 1196:9 1198:4.17 1205:23 1206:10 1221:4 1232:21 1233:4 1238:24 1293:13,14 1327:20 1330:11 1341:10,20 1376:2 1378:24 1386:7,9 1396:7 1412:14 1429:15 1437:17 1440:13 1452:9 1483:6 1484:8 1486:23 1491:9 1494:10 1495:2.3 1497:24 1512:20 1543:12,15 1569:20 1573:6

prevailing 1386:21 1412:8

prevents 1428:22

previous 1262:20 1283:1 1298:12,13 1330:22 1342:17 1381:21 1390:18 1423:14 1425:7 1531:19 1532:18 1533:12

previously 1172:19 1193:12 1222:21 1246:20 1275:7 1279:10 1306:2 1308:6 1309:11 1315:22 1316:22 1384:14 1398:23 1399:1 1425:17 1441:6 1488:14

Prezioso 1229:11

price 1198:21 1201:5, 7 1217:6 1218:15 1251:23 1315:23 1316:23 1318:23 1412:13 1529:14,18 1544:16

prices 1218:4 1251:1

primarily 1182:13 1191:23 1299:22 1308:2 1396:20 1457:9 1463:24 1482:19 1498:5,10

primary 1204:1 1458:7

princess 1509:6,8

print 1193:13 1401:5

printer 1184:12 1290:7 1428:12

printers 1185:5 1188:2

prior 1161:14 1220:3 1227:7 1277:15 1279:12,14 1283:8,22 1316:5 1319:3,8 1334:4 1440:10 1450:16 1488:20 1509:24 1520:9 1524:15,16 1525:3 1538:11 1541:4

prison 1457:17 1512:19,24 1570:18

Pritt 1241:12 1242:1, 23 1243:1

privacy 1353:16

private 1237:4,5,16, 19 1245:14 1327:3 1353:2,4,9,11 1383:22 1477:19 1487:21 1540:15 1554:18

privilege 1295:5

privy 1307:4

probation 1215:17 1282:11 1328:1,2,7

1358:1 1455:24 1456:1,9,12 1457:8, 11,14,20,24 1458:10, 24 1459:8 1460:6 1538:1 1570:4,10,11,

probe 1336:6

problem 1229:17 1250:9 1257:4 1260:5 1278:3 1282:7,8 1328:8 1332:1 1441:19 1462:7 1469:20 1491:17 1492:21 1496:11 1526:21 1541:16

problematic 1199:19 1504:12

problems 1291:2 1294:5 1323:18 1334:13 1454:4 1508:7 1513:7 1517:2

procedural 1489:3 1574:14

procedure 1190:5 1356:13 1360:20,22 1363:3,17 1488:22 1491:4 1560:7

procedures 1313:6

proceed 1157:2 1364:5 1511:22

proceedings 1272:18 1364:5 1482:10 1527:21 1567:19 1577:6,9

process 1162:2 1191:5 1219:3 1239:13 1273:23 1286:16 1306:4 1322:17,18 1325:11 1328:19 1332:1 1340:3,10,14 1356:13 1387:19 1388:9 1397:17 1421:13

processing 1304:19 1476:1

proclamation 1333:7

produce 1492:8

produced 1285:23

product 1431:10

products 1496:7

professional 1337:18 1338:7 1438:1

professionally 1426:18

profitable 1388:6

program 1327:21 1328:6

programmers

1455:22 1459:15 1460:20

programs 1159:12 1175:5

proj 1277:2

project 1189:4,15,21 1190:9 1192:2,3,12 1193:22 1197:21 1199:13 1202:3 1252:2 1274:1,16 1276:16,22,24 1287:13,16,21 1288:1,10,18 1318:1, 10,11 1319:1 1330:11 1332:2,3,5,24 1338:14,17 1339:2 1348:9,22 1362:24 1363:4,9,12,22 1365:10,23 1370:12, 24 1383:24 1400:15 1410:13,21 1411:24 1437:20,21 1470:14 1473:20 1474:3 1475:3,7,8 1476:13, 24 1477:5,9,11 1526:22 1529:15 1531:7 1566:15

projects 1197:3 1251:18,19 1269:19 1333:4 1352:5 1397:15 1437:21 1438:22 1440:4 1474:8 1495:18 1526:16

promoted 1528:5

prompted 1227:21 1331:3

promulgated 1488:15

Proops 1313:11 1560:8

07/26/2018 Index: proper..ratio

proper 1182:10 1404:17

properly 1419:6 1561:14

property 1426:21 1427:9,21,22 1493:2, 16,18 1520:14 1550:5

prophetic 1198:5 proposed 1236:11

prorate 1224:14,16 1419:6

prorated 1415:5 1416:3

prorating 1415:15, 16,21

proration 1224:21

prosecutor 1336:10 1428:3

prospective 1416:12

protect 1492:9 1500:6 1510:15 1511:9 1518:1

protected 1360:16

protection 1236:17 1491:22 1493:18

protest 1308:18,21 1400:4

protesting 1308:19

proud 1289:13 1570:21

proudest 1437:21

provide 1157:23 1165:22 1167:2 1168:12 1184:22 1189:6 1215:18

provided 1165:24 1166:8,11,12 1170:16 1172:20 1173:13 1184:6 1195:1 1196:16 1212:20 1273:9,15 1302:1 1423:12 1468:24

provider 1251:16

providing 1179:1 1187:14 1555:24

proving 1406:1

provisions 1165:12, 18 1520:11 1574:13

public 1198:7 1282:6 1290:16 1317:1,10 1318:21 1327:7 1353:10,12,18,19 1361:16 1409:16 1461:2,20 1471:1 1499:11 1510:5 1513:16 1527:24 1540:11 1560:10 1577:4

publicity 1160:18

publicly 1343:4

pull 1287:2,3 1390:6 1441:1 1498:18

pulled 1286:9 1342:6, 18 1441:8 1489:1

purchase 1217:11 1340:7 1370:22 1528:18 1529:5,24 1530:3

purchased 1341:11 1389:6 1472:22 1507:18 1536:11

purchases 1317:15 1319:3 1534:1

purchasing 1190:5 1215:4 1384:5

purest 1202:16

purpose 1161:23 1172:17 1558:9 1562:18 1577:7

purposes 1162:24 1163:14,19 1176:22 1255:7 1491:7 1498:10 1574:9

purse 1568:21

pursuant 1490:19

pursue 1231:16 1344:22

purview 1237:5

push 1482:15

pushed 1482:20

Pushkin 1334:8,12 1358:16.17.21 1379:18 1546:24 1547:1,4 1552:1

put 1191:4 1195:11 1196:17 1251:7,11,15 1252:3 1260:18 1273:5 1282:15 1287:2 1297:8 1309:22 1367:2 1371:5 1373:8 1382:20 1386:5 1389:12 1400:9,18 1418:15 1421:6 1426:6 1427:24 1437:2 1445:9 1468:6 1477:16 1486:20 1498:13,20 1546:16 1549:14 1558:12

Putnam 1448:6

putting 1191:2 1231:12 1266:20 1399:12,13 1437:12 1467:9

putz 1511:11

puzzled 1187:16 1259:11

puzzling 1259:7

Q

qualified 1244:7 1245:7 1292:2 1309:17,20 1577:5

qualify 1257:11

quarter 1498:16

Queen 1522:17

question 1157:23,24 1171:19 1184:21 1191:20 1200:12 1210:2,5 1212:4 1221:5 1224:9 1232:18 1238:2,19 1248:7 1250:13 1252:13 1253:3 1263:8 1270:11 1272:22 1277:4,6 1278:9 1284:14,22 1295:7 1316:7 1328:11 1334:23 1335:2 1337:10 1341:13 1343:17,18 1344:14 1366:7 1379:24 1380:17 1381:12 1387:21,23

1388:7 1393:10,16

1397:9 1398:16 1405:4 1410:10.16 1412:20 1416:17 1420:20 1428:3 1445:21 1482:9 1490:22 1497:1 1510:1 1520:21,24 1521:3 1522:7 1526:19 1533:13 1535:21 1538:4 1542:1 1545:9 1551:4,12 1554:11,17 1563:15 1567:15,22 1568:5

question's 1417:18

question-andanswer 1365:18

questioned 1215:11 1293:18 1294:17 1331:12 1332:23 1425:22

questioner 1535:19 questioning 1167:12 1201:21 1340:2 1531:19

questions 1160:6,8 1161:15 1162:11 1177:22 1178:1 1179:18 1194:7 1225:2 1254:20 1256:6 1269:6 1271:19,24 1272:23 1275:15.18.20 1276:3 1278:8 1279:1.14 1308:6 1309:11 1313:1 1325:15 1328:23 1337:8 1345:15 1358:15,22 1359:4 1365:17 1373:14 1375:9 1377:11 1384:10 1385:9 1414:3 1422:8 1448:1 1481:4 1482:6 1488:11 1500:21,24 1501:2,7,8 1509:12 1511:17 1515:9 1521:1 1527:11 1528:6 1535:11 1555:14 1573:5

quick 1156:10 1204:11 1317:14 1534:5 1563:15

quit 1242:23 1257:14,

19 1281:5

quorum 1156:5,9

quote 1200:6

quoted 1402:9 1404:2

quoting 1559:5 1562:8

R

Racer-troy 1221:7 1253:6 1254:2,21 1313:11 1324:9 1325:22 1423:20 1558:24

Racer-troy's 1227:4 1304:17

races 1176:6

radiator 1535:1

radiators 1376:4,7

Raese 1298:22

rainy 1182:1 1228:8 1232:13

raise 1157:10 1233:10.12 1450:23 1569:1,2,8

raised 1160:8 1161:4, 15 1162:4 1174:3 1179:18 1307:13 1399:16 1463:22

raises 1174:2 1463:17

raising 1454:1

ran 1283:16 1313:11, 12

range 1352:18 1399:19 1460:13

ranks 1417:8

rare 1457:11

rarely 1446:13 1545:7

rate 1224:1.4 1310:12 1571:11

rates 1223:6 1415:23 1571:14

ratio 1533:16,19

rattling 1439:16

RE-EXAMINATION

1502:17 1512:1 1523:4 1528:14 1537:2 1547:3 1552:7 1555:9 1564:12 1565:8

re-upholstering 1507:19

reached 1295:10 1338:12 1506:15

reaction 1186:4

read 1165:9 1176:4 1187:9,16 1199:1 1216:14 1228:1 1238:1 1274:23 1278:20 1286:17 1293:2 1295:14 1308:11 1313:23 1314:7,10 1364:1,4,7 1367:21 1368:24 1408:23 1443:21 1455:13 1465:4 1488:3 1489:5.9.10 1550:3 1556:10 1568:16

reading 1274:20 1444:2 1445:9 1489:8

ready 1157:2 1249:9 1527:18

real 1317:14 1403:7 1458:8 1492:21

realize 1383:15

realized 1405:18 1430:12 1493:4

ream 1428:16

reappropriations 1270:2

reason 1164:19 1165:2 1169:18 1181:8 1209:3 1210:15,24 1211:5 1227:8 1234:19 1238:21 1261:3 1291:12 1301:22 1305:9 1328:16 1329:7 1458:7,8 1469:22 1473:24 1498:3 1506:14 1546:2 1548:24 1557:5

reasons 1290:14 1405:20 1462:20 1467:24 1516:6 1549:4

rebuild 1190:3

recall 1159:15 1160:11 1162:22 1166:3,5,8,11,24 1169:1,14 1171:22 1172:10,13 1173:20 1176:2,9,16,19,23,24 1177:9 1179:22 1181:17 1182:3 1183:4,5,10 1184:3,5, 12 1185:14,17,22 1186:1 1191:11,13 1196:18 1197:2 1198:9,11 1200:17 1201:6 1202:8,12 1203:2,7 1204:4,23 1205:4,14,15,18 1206:17 1209:5,13 1210:19,20,24 1211:20,23 1212:1 1213:3 1216:15,17 1217:8 1218:2,8,15 1225:15,24 1230:6, 11,19,20 1232:3 1235:2,6 1240:12 1241:15,17,22 1243:14 1244:14 1245:11 1247:13 1248:4 1249:14,16 1252:1,6 1253:11 1254:2 1262:9 1264:17 1267:2 1270:14,16,17,18,22 1273:14,22 1278:1 1288:12 1293:10.11 1301:6 1305:20 1314:18 1325:2 1328:13,17 1336:15 1352:1,16,23 1354:18,20,24 1355:1 1364:9 1366:3,5 1373:1 1374:17 1386:7 1413:1,2 1424:3 1435:5,6 1442:13 1479:13,16 1481:18 1486:22 1488:18 1506:7,10 1509:4,19,21,23 1510:6 1511:7 1526:2 1528:4 1531:3 1532:19 1533:1 1534:19 1547:19 1553:12 1562:2,11

1563:14 1566:21 1567:9

recalling 1248:3

receipts 1304:12,16

receive 1179:15 1304:10,12 1564:16

received 1177:8 1188:19 1191:14 1192:19 1194:23 1243:4 1273:23 1410:19 1452:22 1523:18

receiving 1166:24 1172:10 1173:20 1261:13 1429:4

recent 1342:15 1548:1

recently 1175:23 1285:22 1295:15 1369:10

reception 1373:21 1374:24

receptionist

1243:17.20 1244:3 1311:23 1437:3

receptions 1374:7,9

recess 1173:3 1272:12,15,17 1575:18,22 1576:3

recidivism 1571:11

recollection 1160:16 1167:3 1178:17 1202:22 1242:24 1243:3 1296:20 1366:23

recommendations 1236:18 1568:6

reconstruction 1351:8

record 1158:10 1326:4 1425:17,23 1426:3 1486:19 1559:16

recorded 1423:22 1552:15,16,17,19,20, 22 1559:15 1561:14,

recording 1364:14

1552:23

records 1203:3,4 1350:20 1372:8,16 1407:21 1560:6 1561:12

recuse 1509:18

recycling 1570:18

red 1307:13 1367:4 1510:14

redecorated 1367:22 1480:1

redecorating 1369:2,11

redesigned 1340:17

redid 1349:23

redirect 1502:14

redone 1196:15 1342:22 1480:14

reduced 1228:10 1577:11

reducing 1487:16

reduction 1487:6

reductions 1469:10

reelected 1449:6

reelection 1525:11

refamiliarize

1167:24 1169:10 1172:6

refer 1162:13,19 1164:12 1165:5 1169:6 1171:17 1172:4 1173:4,16 1208:5,17 1209:16 1227:6 1237:23 1252:8.10 1254:16 1269:23 1274:18 1285:21 1317:23

reference 1280:23 1291:7 1423:5 1550:9

referenced 1405:19

references 1561:16

referencing 1337:15

referred 1186:11 1197:10 1208:16 1233:1 1273:20 1286:17 1315:2

1369:22 1401:11,12 1491:3 1509:5 1562:13

referring 1186:9,12 1227:16 1300:19,24 1401:24 1424:21 1440:13 1490:23 1562:6 1563:3

reflect 1317:8 1431:12

reform 1569:22

reforms 1571:9

refrigerator 1349:9

refrigerators 1349:11,14

refused 1516:13

regard 1202:15 1212:16 1287:5 1288:9 1349:2 1484:24 1485:4 1495:1,4,6 1513:24 1515:1

regional 1180:14 1245:17 1265:22 1279:21 1390:9 1405:17 1437:11

regions 1458:10,11

register 1351:24 1514:6

registered 1516:6 1577:3

registry 1352:2 1462:5,16,17

regret 1455:5 1485:23

regular 1293:18 1313:17 1409:18

regularly 1307:2

regulation 1165:14 1490:9

regulations 1488:13, 14,18,19 1489:12 1490:21 1491:10

reimbursed 1219:5, 16 1294:15 1375:8 1415:23

reimbursement

1218:20 1220:22 1322:23 1323:14 1416:2

reimbursements

1220:18

rein 1321:2

reinvestment

1569:23,24 1571:18

rejected 1500:12 1517:17

related 1225:11 1469:19 1546:6 1562:12

relates 1438:21

relating 1333:8

relation 1229:24

relationship 1206:5 1245:16,20 1247:5 1253:20 1280:11 1283:4,14 1325:2 1388:19 1437:5,8 1438:2 1504:18 1544:6 1563:13

relay 1169:19

relentless 1280:8

relevant 1165:17 1334:20,22

relieve 1301:18

remain 1551:13

remainder 1410:21

remarkable 1194:9 1327:23 1543:22

remarkably 1468:18 1495:24 1520:7

remedied 1492:22

remember 1168:1 1171:18 1178:19 1183:12,19 1189:17 1192:6,8 1198:4 1208:2 1225:21 1231:17 1235:4 1236:5 1244:15 1254:11 1263:3 1265:4 1267:22 1274:3 1290:19 1301:24 1307:9 1308:16 1309:2

1318:6,12 1329:2

1359:6 1361:8 1372:24 1402:13 1411:6,7 1430:22 1442:7 1446:18 1448:19,20,21 1450:4,5 1451:11 1456:22 1476:10 1480:5 1481:11,21 1482:2 1486:10 1489:21 1500:2 1510:12 1525:6,9 1531:18 1533:10 1545:10 1550:9 1551:21

remembered 1308:17

remembering 1268:16

remind 1450:11 1507:23 1563:7

reminded 1182:11 1527:23

reminder 1308:13 1535:15 1553:5

remodeled 1536:5

remodeling 1346:21 1362:14 1363:13 1367:7 1369:10 1399:11,22 1463:16 1530:1

remodelings 1368:8 1531:24

remote 1245:19 1437:12

removal 1333:8 1524:16

removed 1360:19 1549:22

ren 1544:10

rendering 1195:12 1205:7

renewals 1370:5

renovate 1430:10 1440:11 1443:16

renovated 1359:10 1366:22,23 1367:17, 23 1368:3 1385:14 1484:14 renovating 1397:21

renovation 1189:4 1191:8 1194:21,22 1200:3 1250:5,14 1252:3 1349:19 1365:3 1368:14 1382:19 1385:21 1387:24 1430:6,19 1438:22 1440:4 1474:9 1483:13 1485:21 1529:21 1530:10 1533:5

renovations 1188:9, 15,20 1189:7 1191:21,23 1193:10, 14,20 1194:5 1200:5, 6 1235:16 1236:23 1237:1 1249:22 1251:5,10 1269:6 1312:12 1347:5,8 1348:5,24 1366:11, 12,13 1367:12 1368:20 1381:17 1388:8 1397:10,11,15 1398:6 1429:1,6 1439:3,5 1466:16 1499:11,23 1500:10 1515:6 1523:14 1530:17 1531:9 1544:10,12

rent 1220:14 1303:18 1370:3.5

rental 1220:6,19,20, 23 1221:13 1222:6,18 1224:8,11 1270:23,24 1271:8,11 1304:7,11 1322:21 1377:8 1413:23 1490:13

rented 1418:3

renting 1374:10

repainting 1218:12

repair 1190:12 1319:17

repairs 1319:18 1566:6

repay 1507:22

repeat 1339:9,14

• ′

rephrase 1506:2

report 1162:13,20 1164:12 1227:6,8,9, 11 1237:23,24 1252:8,11 1253:1,15 1256:3 1269:23,24 1324:8 1325:6,21 1327:15 1328:12,13 1343:22 1393:1 1408:23 1413:18,20, 21 1488:8 1516:17 1517:1 1553:21 1556:16 1557:4,5

reported 1165:16 1222:3 1293:5 1533:2,3 1534:6 1536:2,10

reportedly 1295:21

reporter 1500:3,13 1502:3,10 1527:13 1535:17 1577:3

reports 1162:17 1220:4 1290:8 1292:14 1293:8 1341:23 1355:21 1459:8 1514:15 1550:3 1553:2

represent 1327:12 1372:16 1545:17

represented 1269:17 1322:9

republicans 1299:23

request 1167:13 1172:13 1178:10 1202:7 1219:3 1234:23 1235:6 1240:9,13,21 1241:10 1244:18 1245:12 1249:12 1250:10,18 1251:17,18 1267:11, 15 1290:4 1309:24 1317:16 1318:20 1320:22 1322:3,6 1479:16 1508:16

requested 1156:16 1235:2 1243:16 1244:14 1248:2 1254:6,8 1291:3 1301:3,21 1318:2 1456:17 1524:23,24 1562:2

requesting 1167:4 1173:9 1235:4 1239:1 1507:12

requests 1172:14 1174:11 1220:22 1234:1,6 1240:24 1243:7,11 1248:7,11 1249:1,15,24 1250:1, 20 1257:1 1267:16 1290:17 1412:18 1507:9,14

require 1219:21 1319:9 1541:2

required 1177:11,23 1219:22

requires 1319:5

requiring 1177:1

requote 1562:7

reroute 1190:2

rescheduling 1156:15

research 1370:17,21, 24 1371:14 1372:1

resented 1455:10

reservation 1177:12 1425:13

reservations 1304:8

reserve 1161:24

reserved 1489:21,23

reserving 1489:20

residence 1170:17 1390:11 1391:10

residences 1541:3

resign 1208:3 1257:9 1261:5 1358:12

resignation 1207:20 1261:4 1277:15,19,23 1302:21

resigned 1261:10

resigning 1257:12 1378:1

resistance 1494:4

resonated 1396:20

Resources 1504:8 1507:1

respect 1162:2,5 1163:6,21 1168:2 1170:24 1172:2 1177:3,22 1178:8 1191:5 1195:17

07/26/2018 Index: respected..screening

1198:20 1207:14,15
1210:10 1213:18
1219:17 1223:13
1225:12 1233:21
1235:11 1236:22
1240:19 1243:7
1248:5 1249:12,20
1250:13 1251:3,9
1263:13,15,18
1264:3,16 1269:6
1270:11,23 1271:1
1273:15 1274:6
1275:15 1315:19,20
1500:10 1503:9
1507:10

respected 1282:23 respectful 1532:8 respective 1188:15 respond 1241:1 1382:7 1563:9

responded 1174:13 1238:10 1421:14

responder 1535:20

responding 1271:12

responds 1559:6

response 1179:6 1239:6 1241:3 1246:24 1247:2 1308:12 1372:1 1420:22 1421:10,15 1559:18 1560:2

responsibility

1160:23 1290:15 1323:11 1324:20 1405:16 1439:8 1524:8 1560:19

responsible 1282:5 1324:16 1455:15 1524:3 1557:14 1558:2,5

responsive 1328:2 1420:4

responsiveness

1282:17

rest 1299:1 1382:18 1416:8 1433:5 1439:20 1456:4

restaurants 1216:17

result 1156:16

1165:14,18 1177:16 1350:5 1370:8 1398:7 1437:17

resulted 1182:19 1398:24

Resuming 1273:7

retain 1372:3

retained 1241:11

retention 1371:17

retired 1504:5 1538:22

retirement 1503:1

retiring 1474:15

retrieved 1498:14

retrospective 1416:12

return 1224:16

returned 1224:14

returning 1495:24 1559:19

reupholster 1536:13

revenue 1165:13 1233:16,20 1235:5

reverted 1427:22

reverts 1427:11

review 1157:15 1166:19 1169:10 1173:8,18 1221:2 1238:4 1252:24 1254:22 1294:4 1347:21 1424:4 1466:13 1535:3

reviewed 1172:18 1220:23 1227:8 1236:18 1266:7 1293:17,19 1347:21 1559:19

reviews 1236:11

rewired 1441:4,5

rewrite 1488:24

Rhodes 1558:23

1100es 1000.20

rid 1455:20 1459:4

rigamarole 1311:14

right-hand 1162:18 1227:7

ripped 1367:9 1382:19

rise 1157:10 1544:1

river 1345:22

RMR 1577:17

road 1539:1 1545:17

Robinson 1568:1

role 1515:14 1569:20

roll 1156:4,6

roll-out 1463:15

rollover 1231:1 1239:2 1309:8

rolls 1200:24

room 1207:21 1208:6 1209:14 1214:21 1223:14 1250:7 1257:3,17 1259:18,19 1262:4 1264:19,20 1277:18 1300:10 1302:17 1303:16 1317:22 1343:20 1350:1,3,4,10 1374:10 1377:21 1378:13,15 1404:11

1436:1 1468:1,15,16 1480:15 1499:1 1502:6 1508:10 1524:5 1527:16

1536:22 1549:13.14

rooms 1468:4 1479:24

rotate 1272:7

rough 1337:11 1531:8

roughly 1159:17 1228:9 1231:12 1373:18 1392:12 1508:1 1551:20

round 1367:11 1381:17 1394:24 1414:4,21 1416:18,19 1531:19

rounded 1540:19

route 1198:15 1291:17 1546:10 routers 1559:14,21 1561:4

routine 1183:9

row 1272:8 1275:19 1394:11 1511:21 1536:22

rugs 1217:18,22 1341:10,16 1399:18 1495:11 1508:9,11, 12,13

rule 1165:13 1548:10

rules 1574:14

rumor 1294:21 1567:16,17

rumors 1307:6,8,11 1308:4

run 1170:17 1236:17 1258:16 1294:5 1506:1 1545:14

runner 1215:7

runners 1389:8

running 1526:9

runway 1387:2,12

rural 1545:22

rush 1328:24

S

safe 1350:1,3,10 1480:15,17

safety 1540:7

sail 1265:6,7 1343:23 1402:16

sakes 1254:9 1556:24

salaries 1311:4

salary 1309:24 1310:7,8,9 1312:2

sales 1299:11,13

sample 1496:14

sat 1201:12 1262:2 1302:19 1427:10 1520:3

satisfied 1496:17

satisfy 1465:11

Saturday 1156:18 1157:1 1574:5

Saunders 1357:8

save 1375:1 1566:3

saved 1374:23 1375:2,7

savory 1491:16

sawed 1473:6

Scanmark 1180:18

scanned 1350:24

scanning 1180:17 1181:15 1350:15,16, 18,24 1351:2,22 1460:3 1461:7 1470:4,7 1471:5,13

scary 1342:8 1458:23

scattered 1369:17

scene 1287:16

scenes 1224:6

schedule 1175:8 1212:11 1468:16 1532:14 1574:24 1575:2

scheduled 1212:10, 14 1421:12

schedules 1396:18 1432:10 1434:23

scheduling 1516:3

schemes 1520:15

scholarship 1184:16

school 1175:4 1298:14 1551:15,23

scope 1529:1,6,10 1531:1 1573:7

scores 1194:10

Scott 1242:4,17 1513:9 1567:9

Scout 1207:15 1546:4

scratches 1507:20

scratching 1479:14

screen 1273:6 1286:6,22 1305:14,22

screening 1251:21

07/26/2018 Index: sculpted..silent

sculpted 1534:19,23 **seal** 1197:6

seam 1201:2

seamless 1474:21

search 1330:8

searched 1208:21

seated 1157:13

seats 1272:15 1337:17

secretarial 1243:18

secretary 1200:16 1243:21 1268:15,16, 20 1276:10 1287:9 1296:5 1302:6 1304:3 1307:19 1311:17 1402:2 1452:20 1460:7 1556:4 1557:23

secretary's 1268:17 1302:7 1376:2

Secrets 1335:20

section 1400:21 1488:14 1490:13

sectional 1375:16,17

secure 1185:1 1467:22 1468:9,10,17 1480:21 1540:24 1541:3

secured 1541:6

secures 1469:2

securing 1538:19

security 1161:2 1184:24 1185:2 1214:4 1222:10,13 1265:14 1306:3.14.19 1326:21 1346:15 1350:1 1362:6 1369:24 1402:8 1403:11 1407:2 1422:2 1467:13 1468:24 1469:2 1480:22 1512:7,22 1513:1,2 1518:8 1538:5,12,15,17,20 1539:3,4,11 1540:15 1542:19 1556:19.20 1558:18

seductive 1458:20

seek 1270:2

seeking 1256:20

Segal 1513:9 1540:15

Segal's 1567:9

selected 1355:18

selection 1287:9 1338:8

self- 1511:12

self-reporting 1516:19,21

self-satisfied

Senate 1182:13 1230:17 1231:6 1234:20 1270:9 1308:12 1487:10

Senators 1229:11 1230:24 1231:15

send 1208:8 1332:10 1348:15 1500:7

sending 1429:4 1499:6

senior 1392:18 1502:22 1503:2,7,12 1504:14 1505:3,15 1506:4.8

sense 1244:21 1251:2 1254:7 1316:13,19 1353:12, 15,19 1382:1 1417:19 1448:12 1494:5 1557:14

sentence 1228:1,14 1238:7 1253:4 1270:7 1469:5 1512:18

sentenced 1512:17

separate 1395:22 1411:4 1462:11,12 1519:6

separated 1414:7 1416:14 1570:11

separately 1397:18

September 1166:2 1171:15 1175:21 1176:3 1183:8 1326:6 1426:10 1551:22 1561:21

series 1574:18

serve 1186:6 1207:14,16 1517:24 1544:23 1545:1

served 1283:8 1291:19 1315:20 1550:20

server 1369:18 1467:22 1468:1,4 1559:14

servers 1559:21 1561:4

serves 1277:1 1358:24 1444:13 1528:23 1548:16 1563:22

service 1165:14 1279:12,15 1283:13 1344:16 1412:3 1518:22

services 1245:22 1282:16 1296:11 1340:19 1357:7 1412:11 1437:7 1438:24 1475:6,17,18 1495:15 1496:5

session 1527:23

set 1164:7 1212:11 1321:3 1468:11 1488:13 1541:10

sets 1407:8

setting 1241:14 1396:18

setup 1541:8

several-year 1369:15

sex 1456:8 1457:9,11 1458:6.9

sexual 1455:24

sexually 1284:18,22 1453:5

shades 1196:24

Shaffer 1302:8

shape 1384:5 1473:2

shaped 1473:5

share 1246:12 1319:18 1484:8 1573:22

shared 1307:5 1335:21 1484:10

she'd 1249:5 1261:8 1285:1 1408:5 1433:19 1446:20 1475:1 1507:22

sheets 1472:21,22

shelves 1367:2

shine 1472:18

shiny 1508:24 1509:1

ship 1313:11,12

shocked 1468:21

shook 1260:3

shoot 1513:17

shop 1200:17

shopping 1337:24

short-termer

shortages 1234:16

shorter 1543:1

shorthand 1577:10

shot 1194:16

SHOTT 1156:2,8 1157:4,9,12 1210:1,4 1252:12,18,21 1269:3 1271:20 1272:20 1273:5 1275:17 1279:3 1297:21 1304:23 1314:2,6 1320:2 1324:1 1334:10,16 1339:17 1343:11 1345:10 1358:16 1371:22 1379:19 1385:2 1394:9,17,20 1395:1, 4 1410:6 1419:12 1447:16 1482:8 1500:17 1501:3,6,10, 17,19,23 1502:5,8,12 1511:20 1522:17,22 1523:1 1527:4,6,9,22 1535:6,15 1536:21 1546:24 1552:3 1555:6 1564:9 1565:7,9 1572:6,9,12, 16 1575:23 1576:2

shoulder 1266:6 1301:16

shoulders 1303:23

show 1228:24 1275:6 1336:17 1356:17 1401:2 1406:3 1431:19 1527:9 1545:23 1573:8

showed 1274:1 1336:19 1365:10 1433:2

shower 1349:20,22, 23 1350:4,5,7,8,9

showing 1247:8 1377:9 1477:17

shown 1328:8 1497:3

shows 1286:2 1336:17

shy 1308:19

sic 1327:16 1370:19

sick 1247:9

side 1205:19 1250:6 1272:8 1297:22 1345:22 1346:10,11, 13,16 1392:2 1395:21 1433:19 1536:22

sides 1322:12 1409:16 1520:8

sign 1306:6,7 1338:2 1340:12 1475:19 1476:5 1489:9 1525:17

signature 1203:20 1288:6 1340:15

signed 1340:20,22 1475:21,23 1531:22

significant 1258:5 1386:10 1387:3,20 1519:24

signing 1293:3,9 1306:8 1573:20

signings 1292:18 1293:1 1445:8

signs 1340:11

silent 1280:12

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: Silling..spot

Silling 1192:16,17,24 1195:1 1274:2 1338:23 1339:1,13 1401:19 1474:24

1495:16 1496:2,4 1530:23 1531:2

silver 1163:10 1258:21 1326:16

Sim-u-la-crum 1315:7

similar 1217:9 1224:20 1226:1 1308:14 1319:9 1443:6 1500:7

Similarly 1492:7

simple 1286:10

simply 1161:7 1233:2 1246:9 1296:22 1323:19 1343:21 1412:3 1456:7 1459:20 1531:16 1546:12 1570:6

simulacrum 1258:22 1259:1,12 1315:3,5,8 1378:16 1404:12

single 1182:9 1337:16 1443:3 1446:22 1461:17 1533:21

Singletary 1504:6 1507:3

sir 1163:1 1268:14 1276:2 1298:1 1301:1 1304:21 1380:19 1383:3,11 1385:19 1387:22 1390:15 1394:6 1402:24 1491:12 1500:24 1501:5,9 1528:9 1536:18 1552:12

sitting 1301:19 1549:23

situation 1285:17 1377:8 1409:5 1482:17,24 1491:14 1563:14

size 1305:21 1309:6 1542:14

sizes 1305:23

sketch 1273:14,19,24 1274:6,9,22 1275:4,6, 11 1285:22 1286:2 1337:11,22 1472:2

sketched 1195:12,13

skin 1156:8

skip 1221:19 1358:24 1361:2 1373:13

skipping 1359:1

slapped 1367:1

slated 1480:12

sliced 1472:24 1473:5

slight 1246:8

slightly 1471:20

slot 1196:17

slow 1191:18

slowed 1515:23

slowing 1516:1

slowly 1190:14 1469:12 1476:2

small 1401:5 1545:22 1549:14

smaller 1268:20 1301:14 1458:17,18 1465:21 1543:1

smart 1571:12

Smith 1507:4

snack 1374:18

so- 1349:23

so-and-so's 1306:18

so-called 1182:1 1511:1

Sobonya 1324:1,2,7 1335:1 1339:15 1523:1,2,5 1527:2

sockets 1342:9

sofa 1337:15 1341:8 1536:11,13

software 1251:16

Soho's 1216:21

sold 1550:1

sole 1276:12

solid 1444:22

someone's 1438:5

someplace 1407:11 1489:5

something's 1446:16

son 1203:12 1225:6, 12 1255:12 1334:2 1427:3 1438:5,7

sons 1438:12

sooner 1469:24

sore 1267:6

sort 1196:23 1288:14 1334:18 1351:7 1353:1 1396:1 1400:1 1409:23 1443:1 1448:9,11 1483:16 1485:3,12,22 1491:18 1541:16 1542:1 1547:17 1551:7 1553:5 1572:18 1575:10

sorts 1367:7

sought 1203:4

sound 1161:12 1466:18

sounds 1460:19 1473:9 1478:16,19 1526:20 1533:6 1552:9

sour 1283:5

sourced 1287:17

sources 1445:11

soured 1207:17

south 1216:19,22 1346:11

southern 1255:19,21 1299:18 1345:23 1418:13

space 1200:14 1237:4,5 1286:19 1287:19,23 1337:18 1402:1 1498:14,16,22

spaces 1353:2,4,9 1360:7 1371:18 1426:3 1490:8 **speak** 1172:1 1175:4 1208:4 1209:11

1246:18 1262:1 1264:4 1365:24

1432:14 1520:2

1574:12

speaker 1303:10 **speakers** 1292:2

speaking 1163:19 1188:11 1201:23 1212:8 1254:2

1385:11 1452:19 1455:8 1535:18

1550:11

special 1223:2,6,24 1224:4 1225:20,22 1249:24 1350:1 1376:10,11 1387:1 1423:1 1434:20 1439:2 1456:16 1458:19

specialist 1226:22

specialized 1197:2

specific 1167:5 1172:19 1176:9 1194:1,7 1213:18,19 1218:4 1231:17 1240:5 1250:19,20 1294:9 1316:12,20 1343:5 1344:9 1382:2 1392:8 1409:8 1422:8 1430:7 1433:8 1443:16 1444:15 1447:7 1484:4 1486:7 1508:12 1513:20,23

specifically 1162:7 1166:5 1169:1 1172:15 1176:2 1183:11 1198:4 1200:13 1202:2 1226:20 1254:19 1269:23 1271:1 1277:6 1284:7 1293:11 1309:12 1318:6 1330:1 1352:23 1403:5,14,19 1421:4 1423:20 1443:11,12 1457:12

1494:8 1496:9 1499:12 1508:19 1513:22 1514:2,20 1520:11 1549:21

1562:12

specifications 1507:9.15

specificity 1547:13

specifics 1183:12 1220:12 1312:18,20 1396:13 1446:18 1508:3 1514:16 1547:15

spell 1259:6,9

spend 1233:2 1238:12 1362:13 1468:5 1469:24 1484:22 1485:21 1575:8

spend-down 1308:7, 23

spending 1199:2,4,6 1331:11,14 1332:13 1344:4 1362:13 1364:21 1365:1 1430:23 1465:14 1486:6

spends 1251:22

spent 1195:23 1196:3 1228:16 1233:5 1235:15 1289:9 1312:9 1313:5 1316:3 1366:2 1391:23 1413:8 1423:15 1430:21,24 1469:13 1485:4 1495:11,12,14 1544:2 1545:11

Spike 1207:1 1336:20 1512:20 1569:15

spine- 1513:11

spiral 1406:20

split 1281:11

spoke 1260:1 1261:21 1264:10 1455:10 1551:5,6

spoken 1212:6 1263:6,11,16,19

sponsorship 1238:12 1270:10

spontaneous 1257:1 1296:8

spot 1260:18,19 1283:12 1286:1 1408:6

07/26/2018 Index: spots..success

spots 1514:5

spouse 1224:24 1225:17,20,23

spouses 1225:19 1226:7,10 1390:10 1392:14,15,17 1393:6,7 1394:3

spreadsheet 1424:18

spring 1160:14 1326:16 1415:16 1450:14,15 1562:1

Springs 1414:18

spur 1407:11

stable 1367:3

staff 1156:11 1170:21 1290:10 1357:20 1392:18 1400:8,17 1478:17 1479:19,20 1516:12,24 1553:1,20 1556:19 1557:12,14 1558:4 1573:14 1574:20

staff's 1516:22

stainless 1509:3

stairs 1204:10

stand 1461:9 1501:13 1502:4.11 1575:22

stand-alone 1462:12

stand-up 1371:6

standard 1485:20 1497:14

standards 1468:5 1474:13 1495:19

standing 1301:5,15, 18 1375:24

Starcher 1174:8 1179:21 1180:9,11,24 1202:9 1350:13 1543:11

Starcher's 1180:7

stars 1193:8

start 1210:14 1230:10 1272:7,8 1275:19 1282:14 1312:7 1439:16 1445:16 1470:4,14,19 1476:5

1511:20 1535:20 1569:6 1571:1 1573:4

started 1190:10 1236:6 1266:2 1302:20 1342:7 1421:16 1464:20,23 1543:24 1545:17 1561:15

starting 1242:18 state 1158:11 1159:11 1160:4,9,17 1163:13 1165:8,11 1171:5 1173:14 1174:4 1176:10.12 1180:11,13 1195:18 1215:17 1219:2 1220:14 1222:6 1224:1 1225:19 1226:9 1227:24 1228:13 1234:15 1253:7 1254:4 1255:15,16,19 1257:24 1258:3,5 1282:18 1292:11,13, 18 1294:12,20 1295:12 1300:19 1303:20 1326:1 1327:9,10,13 1362:12 1375:21 1391:22 1400:24 1407:14 1415:12,13 1416:7 1417:8,13 1419:7 1420:3,19 1421:11 1422:1,5 1423:15 1424:8 1426:21 1427:9,10,12,21,24 1431:16,22,24 1432:5

1433:5 1435:17 1439:7 1452:20 1459:14 1460:10 1461:18 1474:10 1498:5 1503:1

1505:11 1507:21

1518:13 1523:16

1524:5 1526:14

1538:22 1540:5

23 1549:21,24

1563:24 1564:3

1566:3 1570:22

State's 1160:19

1577:1.4

1307:19

1533:20,23 1536:13

1546:1,5,7 1548:14,

1550:13.15 1555:3

stay 1184:20 1223:3 1233:21 1237:23 1262:21 1266:9 1291:14 1318:7 1329:8,11 1358:8 1361:3 1550:7,15

State- 1177:12 1255:6

State-owned 1161:6 1162:6

Statereimbursement 1416:15

state-wide 1327:6.8 1458:5

stated 1159:22 1191:6 1316:22 1324:12 1331:9 1361:9 1363:21 1364:17 1366:21 1446:4 1524:5 1547:5 1551:6 1555:16.22 1556:7

statement 1187:10 1193:16 1238:15,22 1344:5 1408:24 1459:12 1491:12 1536:4 1561:8

statements 1270:12 1453:6.21.22 1486:16 1553:12

states 1181:24 1228:2 1253:6 1274:22 1523:9 1570:9 1571:7,15

stating 1502:23 1556:9

statistics 1570:24

status 1289:4 1502:22 1503:2,8,12 1504:14 1505:3,15 1506:4,8,14

statute 1336:11 1548:11

statutory 1463:6 1502:24 1504:15

stayed 1449:9,18

steel 1508:18 1509:3

step 1265:15 1289:12

stepping 1358:10

steps 1204:14

Steve 1157:7

Steve's 1558:8

Steven 1158:12

stick 1314:6 1533:19

stop 1285:3,5 1309:1, 3 1327:17 1502:13 1515:24 1527:6

stopped 1181:4 1214:23 1285:8 1326:15 1551:8,10,11 1560:18

stops 1327:10

storage 1330:7 1360:4 1361:7 1524:5 1548:3,24 1549:2,7

store 1203:2 1372:9, 10,16 1395:23

stored 1360:11.20 1497:21 1548:9

storeroom 1360:8, 13,14,15 1395:24 1493:12 1496:23

stories 1499:22

story 1280:22 1497:6 1499:19 1500:5 1511:8 1539:17

straight 1348:3,9,15

Strangely 1286:23

strategic 1370:10

strategically 1568:22

stray 1549:18

streamed 1364:6

stretched 1245:16

strict 1331:10

strictly 1438:1 1516:23

strike 1335:18 1489:7 1568:15

strokes 1543:10

strong 1483:6 1520:4

stronger 1471:20

strongly 1247:16 1254:14 1260:14 1457:3,4 1474:22 1539:15 1545:18 1568:14 1569:13,19

structural 1342:3,6, 23 1366:11,14,16 1368:8,18,20 1430:13 1431:8 1441:9 1533:14 1534:12,14

structure 1342:13

stuck 1171:3

stuff 1258:11 1265:1 1266:14 1341:1 1367:20 1371:7 1411:14 1434:4 1554:9 1566:4

stunned 1300:23

style 1207:5 1208:19 1441:16 1562:22

Subcommittee 1238:10

subcontractors 1477:17

subject 1211:3 1260:8 1353:5 1361:3 1513:8

subjects 1207:7

submit 1199:17 1326:10 1393:23 1529:14 1535:8

submitted 1221:4 1490:18 1529:11 1554:9 1562:3

subpoena 1333:21

subpoenaed 1156:11 1574:14

Subs 1250:17

subsequent 1285:10 1329:14

subsequently 1523:20

subtle 1409:15

subtracted 1414:12

success 1327:23

successor 1266:10 1446:5

suddenly 1266:19 1499:19

Sue 1221:6 1227:2 1228:14 1235:12 1242:19 1253:6 1254:21 1304:17 1313:10 1323:20 1423:20 1558:24

suede 1200:22,24

suggest 1313:4 1445:3 1457:7 1569:18

suggested 1206:21 1425:3

suggestions 1242:9 1338:20 1401:8,14, 17,23 1402:4 1442:23 1443:8 1445:6 1568:10,11

suitable 1410:1

suite 1359:14 1374:12

summarize 1168:12 1173:8,23 1178:16 1180:1 1573:1

summary 1325:22 1559:1,5 1562:8

summer 1434:21 1485:11 1507:22.24 1551:16

summers 1320:2,3,6 1323:23 1515:18 1522:23,24

Sunday 1256:12 1575:3,8,18

sundried 1351:2

sundry 1351:17 1549:6

sunset 1265:6,8 1343:23 1402:16

superiority 1454:21

supermarket 1540:10

supersede 1488:14

supervised 1454:8

supervising 1458:19

supervision

1283:19,23 1457:10 1515:5,7,14 1523:7

supervisor 1524:2, 12

supervisory 1454:21

supplied 1556:13

support 1509:2 1518:1 1526:23

supported 1308:10

supporters 1436:18

suppose 1221:2 1353:14 1356:16 1393:18 1465:23

supposed 1221:3 1296:14 1313:14 1325:5 1360:18 1361:1 1477:18 1550:7 1558:7

Supreme 1158:14,18 1160:1 1183:21 1187:11,12 1188:4 1191:7 1221:12 1234:24 1236:23 1268:3 1281:19 1292:8 1293:16 1313:15,17 1314:13, 19,24 1318:23 1319:5 1327:11 1332:10 1333:9 1369:5 1396:3 1438:9.16 1488:15 1490:10,19 1492:9 1493:19 1502:21 1503:6.7 1512:4 1518:23 1519:10

1520:10 1521:5

1525:14,15,21,22

1526:4 1537:9,15 1550:21 1575:6

supremely 1245:7

surely 1469:12

surface 1383:8

surmised 1294:21

surplus 1230:1 1232:13,22 1233:13 1466:10,12 1474:12

surprised 1207:20, 22 1215:13 1272:6,11 1353:1

surprising 1300:21 1568:16

surreptitiously 1552:22

surround 1335:4

surrounded 1329:9

surrounding 1336:7, 14

Susan 1288:6

suspect 1200:23 1203:3 1297:1 1329:1 1406:2 1496:8

swap 1497:8

swear 1352:19 1554:3

swearing-in 1203:6, 7

switch 1184:10 1278:17 1391:19 1566:10

switched 1410:17

Switching 1388:22

sworn 1157:11 1158:6 1333:21 1379:12,13

syllabus 1203:20

symbol 1197:6

system 1180:19 1185:1 1233:1 1234:10 1290:4 1325:4 1369:19 1437:13 1459:21,22 1460:22,24 1461:16, 17 1491:18 1492:10. 12 1493:2,3,7,18,21, 24 1537:7,24 1541:8, 14,19 1557:9 1558:13 1559:7 1560:17 1562:6

Т

Tab 1166:17 table 1375:22 1534:3 tables 1289:15

takes 1281:15 1345:19 1571:12

taking 1176:20 1178:5 1270:18 1300:5,9,10,12 1308:22 1330:4 1333:22,24 1397:21 1399:12 1403:16 1407:16 1427:20,21 1444:9 1445:7 1471:6 1474:11 1498:11 1515:13 1558:8 1566:4

talk 1170:3 1186:22 1195:4 1202:21 1209:14 1212:20 1264:9,23 1265:4 1277:2 1285:4 1296:9 1298:5 1321:18 1328:24 1336:21 1353:8 1447:8 1454:23 1455:1 1461:8 1483:8,9,12 1486:19 1517:13 1518:2 1535:24 1536:24 1539:19 1540:1 1543:15 1544:6 1562:23

talked 1209:7 1240:15 1246:13 1264:12 1276:17 1277:14 1283:3 1292:7 1300:3 1328:7 1336:20 1348:10 1352:11 1381:7 1410:11 1412:16 1462:22 1467:15,16 1494:19 1508:13 1525:4,5 1530:22,23

1541:5 1543:19 talking 1182:5 1208:14,15,21 1218:20 1222:10 1232:1 1264:7 1270:12 1271:12 1289:13 1295:4 1298:12 1302:24 1319:10,13 1320:7 1322:16 1333:11 1351:20 1357:16 1362:6 1371:2 1386:12 1437:19 1448:11 1461:14 1462:22 1466:16 1509:13 1510:13 1537:15,16,18

1543:13 1544:2 1572:3

taller 1301:4,22

Tammy 1507:4

tasks 1433:10 1568:5

taste 1383:18 1431:13 1542:10,23

tastes 1431:11

tax 1165:1

taxable 1253:8 1254:3 1324:10,11,17

taxes 1253:18

taxpayer 1312:8,14 1526:15,22 1528:2

taxpayers 1528:2,3

Taylor 1293:12

teach 1299:5

teaching 1299:7

tech 1290:6 1351:14 1459:18

technical 1241:13 1351:13 1498:21

technically 1460:18

technology 1180:6 1184:16 1199:10,18 1242:3 1251:14 1332:19 1428:10 1498:17 1559:21,22 1561:4

teeth 1156:9

telephone 1413:5

television 1286:3,19 1305:6,19

telling 1223:18 1246:14 1335:24 1338:11 1362:1 1544:21 1551:2

tells 1369:4 1553:1

telltale 1367:15

Telly 1203:12

temp 1460:1 1551:17, 19

temperament

1315:15,16 1433:6

07/26/2018 Index: temporary..time

temporary 1240:1 1284:19 temps 1460:5

ten 1236:6 1470:10

ten-hour 1434:11

ten-minute 1394:13

tend 1335:20 1483:8

tended 1184:9,10 1209:13 1381:1

tender 1194:18

tentatively 1575:5

tenure 1194:18 1344:16 1366:22 1369:11 1506:5 1518:22

Teresa 1577:3,17

term 1196:14 1228:8 1356:3,6 1472:11 1473:20 1481:4

termed 1228:8 1232:13 1332:4

terminate 1260:23

terminated 1246:21 1247:1 1256:22 1257:6,8,10 1260:21 1262:8 1277:16 1343:19 1344:18 1402:12 1563:23

termination 1256:5 1262:23 1379:8 1495:2.3

terming 1474:3

terminology 1388:4

terms 1227:23 1343:6 1344:2 1401:2 1485:18 1486:22 1489:15 1518:15

terrible 1281:22 1328:9 1511:11

terrified 1546:17

testified 1158:6 1217:4 1275:7 1283:3,18 1287:5 1302:5 1347:20 1348:23 1350:12 1388:23 1539:7 1540:22

testify 1314:3 1389:5

testifying 1361:19 1364:15

testimonies 1361:9 **testimony** 1157:16

1164:8 1177:8 1210:8 1227:14 1243:10 1273:13 1276:4 1288:21 1289:6 1300:6 1306:2 1329:21 1330:22 1331:7 1333:21 1340:6 1343:24 1353:1 1361:4 1381:21 1387:8 1390:13 1393:10 1420:1 1440:10 1445:19 1455:6,7 1483:15 1494:2 1496:21 1538:11

testing 1384:2

Texas 1571:13,16

texted 1567:21,22

texts 1568:4

them's 1538:7

theme 1487:14

theoretically 1540:11

theories 1371:17

there'd 1356:16 1367:6 1539:7

thereof 1183:15

thick 1509:2

thing 1170:6 1171:11 1197:21 1203:24 1204:16 1206:21 1209:24 1217:17 1239:24 1290:19 1292:5 1309:8 1319:3 1336:24 1338:10 1363:14 1371:6 1378:16 1382:23 1391:17 1398:3 1404:11 1408:19 1413:17 1428:13 1443:17 1468:8 1488:1 1531:5

1549:18 1554:15

1569:1,18 1571:17,21

things 1156:17 1178:10 1194:8 1199:16,24 1202:13, 20,24 1203:1,9 1204:18 1209:18 1226:9 1234:10 1244:6 1248:13,18,20 1249:6 1251:14 1259:5 1265:1 1266:5,20,24 1267:18 1280:6,24 1281:23 1284:19 1289:5 1293:20 1299:6,16

1300:1,2 1301:2 1302:1 1303:1 1305:11 1316:7,8 1322:24 1328:9 1335:13 1336:3

1344:20,24 1345:1,3, 4,5 1349:3 1356:19 1360:5 1370:10 1374:18 1375:14 1380:24 1381:2

1384:1 1390:4 1398:23 1399:13,22, 23 1401:3 1403:2 1407:4 1427:3,11 1430:13 1431:9

1432:20 1433:2,10, 16,17,24 1439:19 1440:6 1445:16 1448:6,8,11 1455:13,

14 1459:11 1462:24 1463:3,19 1464:1 1467:11 1469:5,13 1472:5 1473:18

1481:16 1483:10,16 1486:24 1487:21 1489:19 1495:15 1498:7 1512:24

1515:10,12 1534:3,15 1541:7 1543:19 1544:15 1549:4.6.8

thinking 1183:11 1196:5 1208:11 1209:20 1247:6 1391:5 1394:22,23 1403:19 1404:21 1463:19 1466:3 1575:1

Thompson 1571:22 1572:1,2

thought 1164:22 1178:20 1180:3 1181:15 1186:2 1191:4 1195:16

1213:24 1229:18 1238:20 1242:16 1247:12 1248:15 1251:23 1260:4,11,16 1261:11 1293:20 1300:20 1308:12 1314:21 1330:6,7 1344:17,20 1345:3 1360:2 1369:1 1377:18 1378:10,23 1381:3,8 1382:9 1403:7 1409:7,24 1426:21 1440:12 1453:21 1465:13,19 1466:4,11 1469:23 1505:7 1513:17 1514:9 1520:4 1530:24 1532:7 1549:17 1554:14 1566:2 1568:19,23 1571:24 1572:1

thoughts 1272:5 1305:15 1403:7,24 1429:15 1521:12

thous 1214:11

thousand 1166:1 1205:21 1243:5 1367:22 1449:14 1464:21 1534:20

threat 1229:14 1234:7 1247:15 1462:7 1494:5 1495:1 1512:15 1513:1

threatened 1264:21 1481:1

threats 1264:17 1512:3,9,13 1513:2,4, 12.15 1539:8 1547:6 1548:2

three-fourths 1366:15,16

three-sided 1375:17

throat 1530:15

throne 1302:2

throw 1365:7 1366:3 thrown 1470:8

1488:23

Thursday 1223:6 1444:5

Ticked 1403:13

ticket 1534:6 tickle 1176:5 tickled 1183:11 tight 1313:11,12 tiles 1342:12

till 1223:3 1434:18 1535:19

time 1156:13,14 1157:21,22 1158:22 1159:4 1160:7,15 1161:4,18,21 1162:3 1163:5,6,12,16 1169:5 1171:13,23 1173:21 1174:1 1175:15 1181:1 1183:18,24 1187:1,5 1188:12 1189:12 1190:10,11,23 1191:14 1195:23 1196:3 1199:5 1201:17 1202:5 1206:2,6 1208:1 1209:10 1210:9,20 1211:12,21 1212:8 1213:10 1214:11 1216:4,7 1217:9 1220:10 1221:19 1223:15 1232:1,2 1233:2,7,18 1234:15, 21 1236:7 1240:3 1243:1,21 1244:17 1245:14 1246:17 1251:4,24 1252:2 1255:2 1256:15 1257:15 1259:14 1263:19 1264:10.23 1265:3,8 1268:9 1270:15 1271:19 1272:3 1274:2 1277:16,24 1281:17 1282:15 1283:20 1284:8 1289:9 1298:5 1299:16 1303:5,18 1304:20 1306:1,19 1307:23 1312:23 1317:5,8,15 1322:8 1350:21 1356:22 1365:15 1366:24 1370:4,5 1385:15,21 1398:13 1401:19.20 1403:6 1405:1 1411:20 1417:4 1423:7 1425:20 1426:20 1428:1

07/26/2018 Index: times..typically

1430:15,18 1433:13, 17 1434:7,8,10,13,21, 24 1435:2 1443:23 1444:12 1445:14 1450:16 1454:2 1455:9 1463:23 1471:8 1474:1,24 1492:13 1497:20 1498:1 1500:14,15,16 1503:14,19 1504:5,24 1509:15 1510:13 1512:13,22 1513:18 1515:20,23 1518:24 1523:24 1535:18 1544:2 1551:17 1563:5 1564:14 1566:10 1569:1 1570:20 1574:19,22 1577:7

times 1174:15 1194:6 1196:7 1207:11 1214:8 1222:22 1230:8 1240:12 1255:18 1280:9 1301:18 1330:13 1340:2 1367:4 1378:23 1384:3 1390:18 1408:3 1433:23 1435:12 1450:24 1466:23 1486:14 1504:12,13 1521:16,24 1538:16 1539:4,5 1565:11 1566:1 1567:23

1431:6 **Tina** 1357:12

timing 1430:12

tired 1402:22

Tish 1337:2

title 1203:19 1474:4 1475:6

titles 1290:15

today 1156:19,23 1227:7 1276:1 1304:21 1305:3 1320:8 1331:7 1339:21 1410:11 1447:21 1481:6 1497:3 1550:12

toilet 1301:22 1350:4

told 1177:21 1186:2 1198:17 1201:4

1206:11,19 1207:23 1226:4 1228:20,21 1247:5 1253:6,9,22 1254:15 1261:8 1263:2.4 1267:19 1272:14 1276:16 1285:4,6 1289:24 1291:4 1300:7,9,10 1301:16 1305:12 1317:1 1324:12,24 1361:10,20 1362:2,10 1381:9 1398:14 1400:14 1409:9,12 1436:19 1442:1 1455:22 1474:15,17 1494:2 1506:22,24 1507:2 1510:10.24 1512:19 1529:17 1560:9 1562:11,18 1574:15

Tomblin 1337:3 1570:23

tomorrow 1156:12, 24 1535:8,13 1572:19 1573:4 1574:3,8 1575:19,20,22 1576:4

tone 1207:13 1315:18

Toney 1255:3,6

tonight 1572:13 1575:10

top 1162:18 1269:24 1297:9 1327:22 1387:14 1442:23 1443:1 1450:5 1463:11 1464:5 1468:12

topic 1183:14,16 1184:15 1188:8 1192:18 1198:20 1201:14 1229:13 1230:14 1232:12 1238:23 1247:22 1402:7 1472:2

total 1192:7 1204:19 1391:22 1419:3 1451:13 1508:14

totaled 1261:6

totally 1250:10 1380:3

touch 1171:3 1184:20 tour 1156:16 1317:21 1345:16 1575:5

town 1392:23,24 1394:4

Toyota 1546:16,17

track 1407:18 1503:15 1504:11 1514:8

traditional 1355:3

train 1474:19

training 1215:16 1458:19 1565:19

transcript 1157:15

transcription 1577:12

transfer 1265:19

transformation 1206:7

transition 1206:3 1260:11 1378:23 1474:1,21

transitioned 1560:5 1566:11

transport 1563:24 1564:4

transportation 1170:16 1390:9

1391:10,18 1490:13

transported 1391:5

transporting 1390:10

travel 1218:21 1219:4,5 1291:8 1292:8,18 1295:12 1303:22 1304:5 1321:8,9,10,13,14 1323:14 1393:2 1435:7 1488:7,14,17, 19 1489:12 1490:14, 21 1491:10 1516:4,5 1545:12

traveled 1292:13

travelers 1323:8

traveling 1321:12 1432:24

Treasurer's 1395:20 1452:20

treat 1335:20

treatment 1209:22

treatments 1495:12

tree 1511:8

trembled 1517:21

trial 1333:10

trip 1222:4 1266:22 1267:4 1276:8 1296:8 1329:17 1414:4,21 1416:18,20 1435:7

trips 1173:13 1221:13,20 1224:10, 21 1225:13 1294:19 1296:16 1312:13 1326:1 1406:1

trooper 1518:13 1538:22

troopers 1518:13

trouble 1334:3

troubled 1333:13 1465:8

troublesome 1464:15

troubling 1297:16

Troy 1228:20,21,23 1235:12 1242:19 1323:20 1560:7

Troy's 1227:1 1228:14,19

truancy 1327:6,8,23 1328:8

true 1249:23 1313:7 1344:2 1361:22 1364:12 1385:22 1395:16 1404:5 1427:13 1440:18,19 1452:15,24 1460:23 1487:4 1538:13 1539:21 1540:5 1541:7 1548:22 1552:12 1555:19,21 1556:1,2,9,10,15,17 1557:3 1558:20 1560:3 1561:3,17,21 1566:19

trusted 1429:19

truth 1261:9 1307:8 1362:1 1409:9,13

1567:20

Tucker 1196:13,17 1445:4 1473:2 1573:24

Tuesday 1179:9 1575:4,9,11

turn 1160:4 1167:19 1183:14 1231:20 1256:4 1325:16 1393:12 1404:13,19 1423:23 1499:19

turned 1180:20 1260:14 1325:5 1378:1 1401:3 1416:1 1432:4 1471:15 1500:12 1503:21

turning 1476:2

Turns 1251:23

TV 1286:6,13,14,22 1305:17,23 1306:1 1507:11

Twelve 1213:22

two-hour 1510:13

two-month 1438:15

type 1184:1,5 1185:7, 17 1196:18 1212:11, 16 1219:1 1222:24 1224:15,20 1234:4, 23,24 1242:2 1251:10,14 1252:2 1342:24 1382:23 1398:3 1432:21 1492:8 1500:8 1506:13 1509:16,18 1516:12

types 1196:18 1202:23 1210:10 1213:23 1248:11 1407:4

typewriting 1577:12

typical 1209:19 1271:21 1394:1,2 1458:21

typically 1202:1 1241:2 1304:4,6 1306:16

U

uh-huh 1175:17 1191:9 1220:21 1224:12 1254:18 1267:14 1339:11 1340:5 1342:1 1363:1 1368:6 1386:11 1393:14 1401:7 1405:7 1412:19 1413:24 1414:14 1451:2 1454:5 1458:15 1467:18 1469:16 1473:4 1477:14 1481:14 1483:4 1490:16 1495:13 1515:3 1525:12

UJA 1215:16 1233:1, 6,8 1251:16 1461:14 1462:10,11 1463:15 1467:11 1469:24 1470:14

ultimate 1340:12

ultimately 1182:19 1214:5,6 1233:7 1277:16 1278:7 1404:1 1462:11 1477:20 1558:5 1561:2

umbrella 1319:22 1399:1

un 1207:18 1284:18

unanimous 1488:1

unanswered 1208:10

unanticipated 1465:24 1466:1

uncertainties 1514:3

uncertainty 1396:2

uncomfortable

1453:10 1483:10

uncommon 1220:13, 16,17

uncut 1203:9

underneath 1375:20, 21

understand 1161:3, 14 1162:9 1164:24

1169:16 1176:8 1189:5 1191:5 1200:5 1205:10 1208:19 1224:13 1235:12 1250:14 1251:3 1261:21 1281:17 1285:19 1288:20 1292:7 1313:19 1353:17 1354:5 1381:13 1384:23 1411:5 1417:16 1483:15 1489:8 1513:19 1531:3

understanding

1158:13 1160:6 1164:14 1168:13 1175:11 1184:24 1188:13 1192:23 1224:9 1234:1 1238:6 1243:10 1273:10 1274:8,10 1275:3 1276:9 1289:20 1294:14 1322:18 1332:7 1357:16 1363:17 1368:13 1381:21 1389:7 1397:17 1398:1 1400:2.3 1414:7 1440:23 1451:22 1456:7 1464:14 1484:20 1502:23 1505:16 1507:24

understood 1207:9 1208:23 1281:24 1309:3,5 1310:4 1344:12 1474:13 1495:19

1563:6 1569:6,10

underway 1274:4

Underwood 1279:20

undo 1326:8

unemployment

1257:11,14,20 1262:16 1377:23,24

unethical 1518:15

unexpected 1309:8 1531:12

unfettered 1331:10

unfortunate 1284:15 1285:17

ungentlemanly 1403:3 Unger 1229:11

unhappy 1231:15 1316:2 1453:24

unified 1233:1 1460:23 1461:9

union 1565:18 1567:1

unique 1423:2

unit 1456:8,16 1457:15,21

units 1457:23 1465:14

unlimited 1415:3 1417:14

unlock 1306:20,23

unsafe 1540:11

untaxed 1165:15

untruthful 1453:21

unusual 1256:24 1383:12 1452:18 1453:1

unwise 1190:7

upcoming 1167:15 1168:24

updated 1559:9

upholstery 1536:14

upset 1231:1 1465:18 1468:19

upstairs 1307:3 1447:8

urinalysis 1251:22

usage 1270:24 1413:23 1421:1 1424:15 1426:7 1443:18,20 1445:2 1514:4

usual 1170:20 1439:1

Utah 1418:13

utility 1352:5

utilized 1488:19 1555:23 1559:9

utilizing 1278:18

٧

vacant 1359:12

vague 1316:15

Vail 1417:2

valid 1318:22

Valley 1390:9

valuable 1570:1

valued 1542:3

van 1489:22,23,24

vans 1266:16,20,21

variety 1512:10

vast 1296:22 1342:5 1534:1 1570:8

vehicle 1162:6 1163:7,13,17,19 1165:11 1177:13,23 1253:7 1255:7 1292:13,18 1295:12, 17,19 1326:15 1407:6 1422:13 1426:7 1488:6 1490:13 1513:21 1514:4 1555:23 1556:13 1557:2 1558:18

vehicles 1160:4,9,17 1161:6,17 1165:8 1167:9 1220:5,6,14 1326:2 1406:24 1407:5 1420:3,11,12 1421:1 1489:15,16 1523:11 1555:18 1559:24 1560:1 1561:20,24 1562:3,4, 5 1563:24 1564:3.5

vein 1526:16

Venable 1498:9

vendor 1251:24 1370:15

vendors 1318:16,22

verbal 1453:7

Vermont 1352:14 1507:13

version 1553:12

versions 1196:21 1268:21

versus 1310:8 1557:12

vice 1258:1 1304:24 1305:5 1314:8 1319:23 1522:20

Vici 1302:8

video 1299:12

view 1272:1

viewed 1427:20

village 1390:24 1391:1,12

vinyl 1406:19

violation 1165:19 1360:11 1389:15 1427:16,18 1443:19 1462:1

violence 1345:1 1351:24 1461:22 1462:5,16 1470:8 1472:1

Virginia 1158:15 1159:2 1165:13 1292:19 1298:19 1299:19 1351:13 1460:22 1490:18 1495:18 1519:3 1520:11 1521:2 1558:23 1577:1

virtually 1190:12 1429:17

Visible 1513:4

vision 1236:14

visit 1306:18 1546:9

vitally 1467:21

vitriol 1547:13

voluminous 1574:17

volunteer 1241:14 1437:13 1452:1

volunteered 1437:14

volunteering 1436:20

vote 1176:19,24 1211:20,23 1219:8 1239:16 1260:16,20,

VOLUME V 07/26/2018 Index: voted..work

22 1261:9 1262:22 1311:15 1319:5,9 1327:11 1331:17 1332:9,17 1426:5,8

voted 1176:24 1177:4 1261:14 1262:21,22 1325:23 1331:19 1404:4

votes 1419:21 1494:11

voting 1311:10 1356:1 1419:22

vouchers 1323:14 1325:20 1393:23

vulgar 1453:17

W

W-2 1505:21 1506:13

wage 1386:21 1412:8

wages 1165:15

wainscoting 1218:12 1250:21 1534:21

wait 1479:11 1535:19 1575:9

walk 1306:10

walked 1177:19 1259:24

Walker 1257:13 1260:11 1261:17,18, 19 1262:15 1263:15 1313:20 1330:3 1331:5 1333:15 1367:21 1377:14,17 1378:20,22 1451:15 1479:3

Walker's 1368:2,14, 20

walking 1281:21

wall 1204:8 1205:18, 19 1401:10,23,24 1443:5 1482:2

walls 1342:7 1367:9 1372:21,22 1373:8 1386:7 1397:22 1399:12 1411:14 1412:4 1440:14,20 1533:22 walnut 1196:21 1376:14 1534:19,21, 22,23

wanted 1159:23 1167:5,9 1172:15,21, 22,23 1173:2 1185:3 1186:6 1190:16 1192:19 1193:5 1195:11,13,16,22 1196:13 1199:8 1200:13 1201:22 1202:3,20 1203:10, 13,15,18,19,21,24 1204:16,21 1207:20 1208:11 1211:4,5,9 1219:8 1223:24 1227:23 1229:16 1231:3 1239:20 1240:16 1250:7,23 1258:8,9 1261:7 1281:23 1282:2,3 1284:24 1285:3 1286:6,7,8,12,14 1287:19 1290:6,7,14 1291:19 1299:9 1300:1,7 1301:2,5,11, 13,14,15 1303:1 1305:9,12 1310:2,3 1317:19 1318:7,10,20 1321:7,9,24 1326:11, 22 1331:6 1338:5,13 1339:5,8,14 1340:16 1350:3 1354:3 1360:23 1371:6 1375:23 1381:2 1382:7,8,10 1383:20 1385:9,10 1388:11,14 1396:14 1398:20 1399:17 1401:1,2 1407:5 1429:18,19 1443:13 1451:14 1480:13 1484:9 1486:24 1487:3,10,12 1489:24 1494:23 1496:13 1507:21 1508:4,5,11,12,20,21 1509:6 1523:23 1529:17 1530:23,24 1532:16 1534:18,21,

wanting 1213:7 1338:5 1350:6 1411:8 1562:16

1555:14 1560:10

1561:12

22 1544:20 1549:7,10

warehouse 1360:7

1475:20 1497:10 1498:5,6,9 1524:6,13 1549:19

warehouses 1493:12 1496:22 1497:22 1498:3 1523:12 1524:3

wash 1375:8

watch 1265:15 1320:11,12 1397:5 1399:11 1459:14 1511:10 1566:9 1567:7 1570:7,10 1571:4.7

watched 1265:16 1364:5

water 1285:14

watercolor 1373:3

watercolors 1204:12 1205:8

Wayne 1375:21

ways 1351:2 1370:10 1409:15 1535:9

website 1241:14

Webster 1457:1

Wednesday 1574:16

week 1156:16 1261:13 1340:7 1489:10 1573:10 1574:16,21,24 1575:1,19

weekday 1415:23

weekend 1415:22 1444:21

weekends 1294:23, 24 1444:6.24

weeks 1264:1 1354:3 1396:1

weight 1342:13 1509:3

welfare 1327:7

West 1158:15 1159:1 1165:12 1180:13 1292:19 1298:19 1299:18 1351:12 1460:22 1490:18 1495:18 1519:2

1520:10 1521:2 1558:23 1577:1

whatsoever 1222:13 1262:14 1525:1

whe 1359:20

Wheeling/ parkersburg 1329:17

whichever 1451:14

whistle 1327:17

whistles 1467:23

white 1166:15 1508:22

whiz 1241:13

who'd 1339:2 1409:19

who'll 1272:7

wide-planked 1352:14 1507:12

widely 1550:14,17,18

wider 1337:16

wife 1200:16 1225:6, 12 1226:3 1271:9 1276:10 1287:8 1302:6 1427:2 1445:5

win 1209:19

window 1495:12

Wing 1191:1 1345:23 1395:14 1530:8 1537:19

winter 1160:14 1274:4 1450:14,15 1451:12

winter/early 1326:16

wire 1287:2 1342:8,19 1383:5 1441:2

wired 1286:23

wires 1367:15

wiring 1342:9,15 1383:7 1399:23,24 1440:21,22

wiring's 1477:16

Wisconsin 1197:2

wise 1181:16

wished 1554:21

wit 1577:2

witnessed 1381:17, 20 1389:3

witnesses 1541:5

wives 1438:11

woman 1204:11

won 1189:16 1203:12 1251:24 1283:12 1529:10

wondered 1280:4 1328:18 1329:10 1481:15

wonderful 1180:15 1244:8 1543:18

wondering 1298:21 1330:20 1331:3,4 1334:1

wonders 1482:12

wood 1195:5,6 1196:1,10,19,23,24

woods 1195:24 1196:7,22 1197:3,5

wool 1201:1

word 1206:9 1259:2, 13 1261:13 1262:3,19 1264:21 1325:3 1400:4 1420:2,10 1467:2 1476:24 1489:14 1500:13 1506:7 1517:12 1518:10

words 1198:14 1284:4 1286:12 1406:21 1421:6 1422:14 1435:15 1437:2 1453:18 1467:9 1492:10 1508:20 1539:14

work 1156:23 1159:24 1180:10,15, 16 1181:1,10,12 1189:20 1190:2,24 1191:8,17 1193:5 1208:9 1213:7 1223:21 1226:11 1242:1,2,17 1247:17 1249:2,6,21 1250:5,7 1255:22 1256:16 1258:21 1260:24 1269:9,13,16 1272:9 1281:8,9,10,18 1299:20 1313:17 1317:20 1324:10 1325:19 1328:7 1329:4 1337:7 1343:2 1348:13 1350:8 1351:6,14,16 1352:7 1371:3 1372:2 1377:12 1397:2,3 1401:20 1402:5 1411:1 1412:14 1433:4,13,16 1434:8, 10,20,22 1435:4 1438:14 1441:6,23 1460:3 1471:16 1474:24 1476:2 1477:10 1479:13 1495:21,23 1504:7 1507:19 1518:21 1525:20 1529:1,6,11 1531:1 1532:8,11,13, 18 1541:22 1563:9 1569:21,22 1570:6,16 1571:6,9 1572:22

work-related 1248:8

worked 1160:21 1161:17 1164:10 1194:17 1202:6 1235:12 1241:14 1260:10 1279:15 1284:10 1289:19 1291:6,20 1292:20 1298:21 1338:16 1347:1 1405:17 1407:17 1409:20 1426:16 1434:5.10. 13,19 1435:2 1436:19 1440:24 1452:14,22 1475:1,2 1476:7 1477:3,6 1478:6 1503:13 1511:9 1515:18 1517:10 1523:19 1566:9 1569:14

Workers' 1468:2

working 1158:14 1181:4 1206:5 1242:4,14 1245:22,24 1256:17 1274:2 1295:16 1301:18 1318:11 1327:23 1359:10 1363:22 1388:23,24 1389:2,18 1401:18 1435:2 1452:1 1482:24 1502:6 1528:1 1566:11,24 1570:5 1573:12.15

Workman 1177:2 1180:3 1181:22 1182:22 1187:22 1193:4,6 1203:24 1205:12 1227:22 1238:9,22 1240:10, 13,17 1241:1,18 1242:15 1243:16 1245:15 1246:1,2,5, 13,18 1247:11 1248:1,6,7 1249:14 1250:3 1258:15 1260:14 1262:10 1263:13 1277:21 1278:2 1283:12 1309:13 1317:18 1329:20,23 1333:17, 19,20 1334:2 1340:24 1341:17 1412:17 1413:13,15 1421:24 1422:1 1429:11 1430:16 1432:13 1433:9 1436:5 1442:14 1443:7 1448:15 1449:19 1451:11 1465:8 1474:22 1507:5,12 1514:6 1538:14,18 1539:16 1544:3

Workman's 1174:22 1190:15 1218:5 1246:24 1308:11 1330:10 1335:5 1352:12 1442:7,9 1480:6 1536:7 1563:16,18

1554:21 1556:12,22

works 1337:17 1443:4 1473:22,23 1477:19 1514:13

world 1246:7 worried 1292:5 worry 1489:20

worse 1513:2

worth 1297:14 1344:21 1511:12 1536:3 wrap 1527:19

writ 1189:11 1346:2 1359:16

write 1206:22 1207:3, 6 1239:5 1296:12 1299:9 1313:18 1314:1,19 1323:4 1447:9 1556:3

writing 1234:24 1274:17 1278:19 1326:3 1375:20 1400:22 1487:13 1555:15

written 1161:5,7 1174:24 1180:20 1183:20 1203:17 1253:6 1328:13 1447:12 1465:1 1555:17 1577:11

wrong 1202:12 1216:19 1239:7 1257:14 1302:6 1315:3 1358:24 1368:10 1424:8 1444:24 1467:9 1518:4.8,15

wrongdoing 1344:9 1424:7,11

wrote 1194:9 1207:8 1260:12 1261:12 1275:2 1296:6 1299:10,18 1308:13, 15,20 1331:8 1415:17 1416:5 1419:8 1508:2 1514:18 1561:5

wrought 1429:21

WVFIMS 1559:7

Wyoming 1168:19 1171:1 1222:2 1418:13

Υ

year 1160:11 1171:12 1176:6 1188:21 1210:20,23 1217:16 1239:3 1243:4 1255:13 1258:6 1260:18 1261:6 1264:11 1270:8,13 1312:24 1327:13 1355:4,8,9,19,22 1358:2 1373:18 1375:1,8 1379:11 1391:18 1393:21 1415:17 1426:11 1439:19,23 1440:1,3, 7 1449:9,12,13 1457:2 1464:24 1465:3,7,8,15 1466:24 1508:8 1519:16 1553:1,15 1569:4

year's 1537:4

year-end 1270:3

vears 1180:12 1182:14 1187:18 1190:14 1191:21 1202:7 1233:5,18 1235:24 1236:5,7 1258:11 1260:15 1279:22 1281:5 1283:2 1297:14 1301:10 1314:15,18 1323:16 1331:4 1339:3 1342:18 1351:19 1352:7 1355:2,15,20,21 1363:18 1368:4,5 1373:20 1375:2,7 1400:4 1406:14 1409:20 1413:8 1427:24 1437:18,19 1449:15 1470:1,10 1478:9 1482:13,23 1487:4 1493:4 1513:6 1543:6,21 1550:21 1554:13 1568:8

yellow 1425:12,14,21

Yellowstone 1222:1

York's 1462:18

young 1207:24 1278:3 1302:22 1409:10

Ζ

Zach 1565:10,16 1566:4,23 1571:22

Zach's 1572:4

Zatezalo 1379:19,20 1380:5 1385:1