1	IN THE WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE	1	PROCEEDINGS
	HOUSE OF DELEGATES	2	CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Good morning. We'll
2	JUDICIARY COMMITTEE		_
3			call this meeting of the Committee on the Judiciary to
4	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	4	order, and I'll ask the clerk to take the role and
5	IN RE:	5	ascertain a quorum is present.
6	House Judiciary Committee Proceeding	6	(The clerk took the roll.)
7	Regarding the Impeachment of West Virginia	7	CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Quorum is present.
8	Supreme Court Justices Pursuant to		And Delegate Byrd is arriving, so please mark him
9	House Resolution 201 Passed During the		
10	Second Extended Session of 2018.		present as well.
11	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	10	We're going to begin today with an
12	VOLUMB TV	11	Affidavit that we received from Kim Ellis, who is a
14	VOLUME IV	12	witness that has an attorney and is not able to be
15	Hearing held on July 20, 2018, before the House	13	before us before the week of the 30th, and so we are
16	Judiciary Committee of the West Virginia Legislature.	14	going to provide this at this time for whatever weight
17			you want to accord to it.
18		16	I'm going to ask counsel to explain how
19		_	
20			this Affidavit was arrived at and to go ahead and read
	Transcribed By:		it since it will be an exhibit for those of you with a
21	REALTIME REPORTERS, LLC		notebook, but since this is an open hearing and we want
	TERESA S. EVANS, RMR, CRR	20	those who are viewing our live stream to know what's
22	713 Lee Street	21	going on with regard to this evidence, so we'll read it
	Charleston, WV 25301	22	into the record.
23	(304) 344-8463	23	Counsel, will you explain the process?
24	realtimereporters.net	24	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
2 -			We. 14 to 1 1 What. 100, thank you. No the
1	Page 1018 APPEARANCES:		Page 1020
	AF F EARANCED.	1	Chairman indicated, Ms. Ellis is currently represented
2		_	I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I
	APPEARING FOR THE HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE:		by counsel. We have been in contact with various
3	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire	3	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings
	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire	3	•
3	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire	3	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings
3 4	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire	3 4 5	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is
3 4 5 6 7	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS:	3 4 5 6	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the
3 4 5	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire	3 4 5 6 7	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until
3 4 5 6 7	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair	3 4 5 6 7 8	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the
3 4 5 6 7 8	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular Affidavit. As the Chairman indicated, for purposes of
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular Affidavit. As the Chairman indicated, for purposes of those that may be listening, I will now read her
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya Amy Summers	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular Affidavit. As the Chairman indicated, for purposes of those that may be listening, I will now read her Affidavit into the record.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular Affidavit. As the Chairman indicated, for purposes of those that may be listening, I will now read her Affidavit into the record. The Affidavit states as follows:
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya Amy Summers Mark Zatezalo ALSO PRESENT:	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular Affidavit. As the Chairman indicated, for purposes of those that may be listening, I will now read her Affidavit into the record. The Affidavit states as follows: "I, Kimberly Ellis, being
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Marsha Kauffman, Esquire John Hardison, Esquire Brian Casto, Esquire Robert E. Akers, Esquire Charles Roskovenski, Esquire HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE MEMBERS: John Shott, Chair Roger Hanshaw, Vice Chair Barbara Evans Fleischauer, Minority Chair Shawn Fluharty, Minority Vice Chair Mark White, Clerk Andrew Byrd Joe Canestraro Moore Capito Frank Deem Tom Fast Geoff Foster Jason Harshbarger Ray Hollen Phil Isner Kayla Kessinger Charlotte Lane Chad Lovejoy Rodney Miller Riley Moore John Overington Mike Pushkin Ben Queen Andrew Robinson Kelli Sobonya Amy Summers Mark Zatezalo	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	witnesses throughout the course of these proceedings and have tried to work around scheduling. It is our understanding that this is one of those where scheduling would not permit the Committee to be able to obtain any testimony until approximately the first week of August, so we went the route of the affidavit. Ms. Ellis provided testimony to the Judicial Investigation Commission, so that some of the information that was provided by her to the Judicial Investigation Commission was taken and this affidavit was drafted as a result of that. It was provided to her counsel and then executed by Ms. Ellis. So that is the method by which the Committee came into possession of this particular Affidavit. As the Chairman indicated, for purposes of those that may be listening, I will now read her Affidavit into the record. The Affidavit states as follows: "I, Kimberly Ellis, being

13

14

16

17

19

20

21

23

24

1

3

4

6

8

9

10

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 say as follows:

2 No. 1. My name is Kimberly

3 Ellis and I am over the age of 18.

No. 2. I am currently

5 employed with the Supreme Court of Appeals of

6 West Virginia as the Director of

Administrative Services in the Administrative 7

8 Offices.

4

9 No. 3. I began working for the Supreme Court of Appeals of West Virginia 10 as Deputy Director of Administrative Services 11 12 on May 16, 2013.

13 I have held the position of Director of Administrative Services since 14

15 November 1, 2015. 16 My duties include, but are 17

not limited to, managing the fleet vehicles, 18 overseeing two warehouses, managing security 19 systems, overseeing facilities planning and upkeep for the lower courts in all 55

20 counties, and consultation/facilitation 21

regarding selection and procurement of

23 furniture and equipment for the Court.

No. 6. Construction on

Page 1022

Justice Loughry's office began in June of --

2 June 2013. 3

24

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

13

15

16

18

20

21

22

No. 7. My initial meeting with Justice Loughry to discuss the renovations to his office occurred before I was an employee of the Court and while I was an employee of Silling Associates.

The initial meeting occurred in Justice Loughry's current office. At that 10 time, there was a desk in his office. The 11 desk was an antique walnut desk, specified by 12 Cass Gilbert.

No. 8. During my initial 14 meeting with Justice Loughry to discuss the renovations to his office, there was a green leather couch in his office. That couch is 17 now at the Venable Avenue warehouse.

No. 9. During my initial 19 meeting with Justice Loughry to discuss the renovations to his office, Justice Loughry did not mention to me that the desk in his office was a Cass Gilbert desk.

23 No. 10. I left the

employment of Silling Associates and began

Page 1023 working for the Supreme Court of Appeals of

West Virginia prior to the beginning of 2

construction on Justice Loughry's office. 4

No. 11. Justice Loughry was very involved in the decisions regarding the renovations to and furnishings of his office.

7 No. 12. The construction 8 costs associated with the renovations to 9 Justice Loughry's office were discussed with Justice Loughry and a detailed cost estimate 10 was provided to Justice Loughry by the 11 12 contractor before construction began.

No. 13. The pillows for Justice Loughry's couch were ordered well 15 after the renovations were completed. Justice Loughry decided that he wanted custom pillows, and he personally selected the 18 fabrics and down inserts for the pillows.

No. 14. Justice Loughry wanted a West Virginia map on the floor of his office. Justice Loughry hand sketched 22 the West Virginia map and the placement of his furnishings on a shell floor plan of his office, which also included his handwritten

notes about other items he wanted for his 2 office and their locations.

No. 15. Justice Loughry wanted Tucker County to stand out on the map. He wanted the granite that was selected for his bathroom floor to be used for Tucker 7 County.

No. 16. Justice Loughry was updated throughout the project. I do not recall any surprises regarding the map.

11 No. 17. I was asked by 12 Justice Davis about a written or oral policy on allowing the justices to have a home 13 office with furniture provided by the Court, 14 15 and I drafted a memo to Justice Davis in 16 response to her request.

No. 18. I was first made 18 aware that a couch was at Justice Loughry's house when I received a call from Paul Mendez, a Court employee who works for my division, informing me that he had been instructed to go to Justice Loughry's house and remove a green leather couch. During that phone call,

Page 1025

Mr. Mendez also informed me that Justice 2 Loughry had a Cass Gilbert desk at his house 3 that he also wanted to remove, but there were -- they were only getting the couch at that 4 5 time.

6

7

8 9

11

13

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

15

17

18

19

20

No. 19. At the time of the phone call from Mr. Mendez referenced above, I did not know that a Cass Gilbert desk or any other Court furniture was located at 10 Justice Loughry's residence.

No. 20. Other than 12 Mr. Mendez, the only information that I had about the couch being returned to the 14 warehouse was from information that I saw on social media.

16 No. 21. It is my 17 understanding that the couch was picked up on 18 a Monday and the desk was supposed to be 19 removed on the following day. However, Paul Mendez told me that Justice Loughry called 20 off the removal of the desk for the following 21 22 day and told Paul to be on standby because Justice Loughry wanted to wait until his neighbor left so that pictures wouldn't be

1

10

11

16

17

1

2

8

9

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

belief.

2 While I was out of the office 3 on Court business, Justice Loughry instructed Tamerra to come into his office and shut the 5 door and then told Tamerra that he believed 6 that she and I were spies for Steve 7 Canterbury. Tamerra found another job and resigned from her position with the Court 9 shortly thereafter.

No. 25. On or about October 18, 2017, Sue Troy came to my office and 12 requested my files on the renovations to Justice Loughry's office and Justice Davis's 13 14 office. I provided her with my files on that 15 date.

No. 26. On the following day, October 19, 2017, I was contacted by Joan Mullins in the Administrative Office, 18 19 and I was told that Judge Johnson wanted to 20 see me in his office immediately. When I arrived at Judge Johnson's office, Justice 21 22 Loughry was sitting at a table with 23 administrative counsel sitting on both sides 24 of him.

Page 1026

taken and posted on social media again.

No. 22. A few days after the couch and desk were both delivered to the warehouse. I went to the warehouse and observed and photographed the couch and the desk.

No. 23. I received a phone call from Justice Loughry on the evening of January 4, 2017, which was the day that Steve 10 Canterbury was fired. Justice Loughry called 11 me at night on my personal cell phone and asked me to keep our conversation off the 13 record. He informed me that he had fired 14 Steve Canterbury.

He also said that it was his 16 understanding that I was a spy or loval to Steve Canterbury, but I had nothing to worry about because they liked me. I felt like this was a threat and feared for my employment with the Court.

21 No. 24. It is my 22 understanding that Justice Loughry also made 23 a similar statement to my former assistant, 24 Tamerra Gilmore, based on information and

Page 1028

Judge Johnson and Sue Troy were also present. Justice Loughry began 3 questioning me about the costs associated with his office. Justice Loughry asked me if I recalled a meeting with him where I had written down on a piece of paper the cost for Justice Ketchum and Justice Workman's office. 7 and I said that I did not.

During this same meeting, Justice Loughry said that he had specifically told me over and over again that regardless 11 of what is spent on his office, it was not to cost more than Justice Ketchum or Justice 13 14 Workman's office, and he asked me if I 15 recalled that conversation, and I said, "No."

I felt like he was trying to intimidate me and coerce me to lie.

No. 27. Not long after the October 19, 27 meeting -- 2017 meeting in Judge Johnson's office, my personal office was relocated from an office suite located down the hall from the Court's main administrative office to a smaller office 24 located within the Court's main

Page 1029 Page 1031 1 administrative office between the offices of 1 If you don't mind, the clerk will administer 2 the Court's two administrative counsel who 2 the oath. 3 were present at the October 19, 2017 3 (Unintelligible) 4 meeting." FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: You're 4 5 Signed, "Kimberly Ellis," and then 5 good, you're good, just stand right here. 6 notarized. 6 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Oh, CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Thank you, Counsel. 7 7 okay. All right. 8 And as indicated, that Affidavit is now part of the 8 THE CLERK: Please raise your exhibits as No. 36. 9 right hand over your heart. Counsel for Ms. Ellis has confirmed to 10 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Right 10 11 us that Ms. Ellis will - if there's need to appear in 11 hand over your heart, okay. 12 the Senate for a trial - appear and testify consistent 12 THE CLERK: And state your 13 with that Affidavit and authenticate any type of 13 name. FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: 14 documents that are necessary. 14 15 We're in the process of gathering 15 "Nothing like getting a notice from a 16 various e-mails, extracting those from the JIC files justice." 16 17 and will forward those to her for inspection and get 17 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Allen 18 her to authenticate them by Affidavit before we 18 Loughry. 19 conclude our proceedings. 19 (Justice Loughry was sworn to The next item that we're gonna take up 20 20 tell the truth.) 21 today -- as I mentioned yesterday, in our conference 21 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Thank 22 with counsel for the JIC, it was pretty clear from 22 you. Welcome. We're glad to have you here 23 their discussion of the hearing before the finance 23 today, and the floor's all yours. 24 committee that they were taking into consideration the 24 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank Page 1032 entirety of Justice Loughry's testimony as opposed to you very much. It is my honor and privilege 2 the excerpt that appeared in their charges. as Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of 3 So we're gonna play for you now the Appeals and administrative head of the third 3 entirety of that -- that testimony, at least insofar as branch of government to speak with you today 5 it involved Justice Loughry. regarding the judiciary's budget for Fiscal If we're ready, let's go ahead and play 6 Year 2019. 6 7 I'd like to talk about that 7 the tape. We need some -- we need some volume. 8 8 budget within the larger frame of reference 9 (A tape was played from January 12 as that includes the judiciary's role in our 10 follows:) 10 government, recent concerns regarding Supreme 11 HOUSE FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Court expenditures, the successful efforts to 11 12 -- take a silent role. All right, today's 12 cut millions of dollars from our budget last 13 our first of guite a few budget hearings for year and the legislature's push for a 14 the Fiscal '19 budget. And we're starting Constitutional amendment to diminish the off with the Supreme Court and we'll have the 15 15 judiciary's independence. 16 Chief up here in just a little bit, and if we We in the judiciary are 16 17 can hold the questions to the end, and then 17 painfully aware of the State's financial 18 the Supremes will be followed by Lottery at worries in recent years. This year will once 18 19 roughly 10:00 o'clock. again require difficult financial decisions 20 So Mr. Chief -- and we do 20 from this legislative body, from the Judicial 21 have a procedure that we do go through so if 21 Branch and from our Governor.

22

23

And in spite of recent

otherwise, the Judicial Branch of government

headlines that may lead you to believe

22

23

24

-- will there be anybody else speaking?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: No.

FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Okay.

Page 1033

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

8

9

10

11

15

17

18

takes this issue very seriously.

2 In full consideration of 3 these fiscal realities, I present to you the 4 2019 fiscal year budget in the amount of 5 \$139,759,670.

This is approximately 1.1 percent of the entire State's budget. This budget represents a \$2,000,000 reduction from 9 the amount requested by the Supreme Court 10 last year and another \$2,000,000 from the 11 year before that. And we make these 12 reductions while our own work load has been 13 increasing.

Before we discuss specifics, 15 I believe it is important to address the issue of some isolated excessive furniture expenditures at the Supreme Court and to place those expenditures in the overall project of which they were a part.

The Court has received significant negative press during the past 22 couple of months regarding some isolated, but obviously inappropriate, purchases. Such extravagant expenditures damage the entire

Page 1034

judiciary.

6

7

8

14

16 17

18

19

20

21

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

16

18

19

20

21

People must have faith in our institutions to have civil order, and these expenditures are indefensible, and they are insensitive to all West Virginians.

We live in a time of cynicism toward our government, and when stories such as this wasteful spending emerge, it feeds that cynicism and clouds the focus of the judiciary's mission to do justice.

One action by any justice, 12 judge, magistrate, administrative director or 13 any other employee within the Judicial Branch is instantaneously transmitted via social 14 15 media around the world.

When we act responsibly, 17 humbly and with regard for the people who come before us, we build trust. When we act in any other way, we damage the trust that people have in our judicial system.

Shortly after this story 22 broke, I received a letter from a citizen of 23 our state. She wrote, in part, "After much thought about the story on TV, I thought each of you judges were supposed to be for the people of West Virginia. When you spent enormous amounts of taxpayers' hard-earned money, do you ever consider us as supplying your salary?"

I called her, and we discussed this issue. We found ourselves in complete agreement. There is simply no justification for such outrageous purchases.

The important result of this conversation, however, is that I am reminded 12 every single day, there is more work to be done to promote financial accountability and 14 transparency in our government.

Keeping this point firmly in mind, I do want to provide to you a clear view of the project within which these purchases were made.

In 2008, the Court began renovating offices on the fourth floor of the Capitol. It obtained bids for that project, and the original contract was for \$876,156. The project covered one half of the fourth floor.

Page 1036

1 Given the disrepair of these 2 offices, renovation was necessary for safety

3 and provision of an appropriate work space. 4

The reporting of this project has been

5 somewhat misleading. It has been widely 6 reported that the Court started with an

7 \$876,000 contract that ballooned out of

control to 3.7 million dollars.

That leaves the impression that the \$876,000 figure was the original overall estimate for all of the restoration 12 and renovations that occurred on the first. 13 third and fourth floors of the Capitol. That 14 is inaccurate.

The \$876,156 contract was 16 only to cover the cost of the renovation and restoration of the fourth floor counsel's office. Upon completion of that office, the 19 justices who were on the Court at that time 20 began restoration, wholly separate, from the counsel's office, including renovating parts 21 22 of the State's only public library, also on 23 the fourth floor, and three offices on the 24 fourth floor.

Page 1037

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

16

17

18

21

23

24

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

nondiscretionary.

Throughout the next few years, the project also continued on the 3 third floor, including the clerk's office, the -- our courtroom, the hallway, the offices there, the public restrooms, the counsel -- the -- our conference room, the hallway of the chambers and the individual iustices' offices.

2

4

5

6

7 8

9

11 12

13

17

18

19

20

21

23

8

9

13

14

15

16

17

18

21

24

On the first floor, a 10 conference room was also renovated. The scope of the work changed dramatically from the original contract.

If you remove the isolated, 14 unjustifiable furniture expenditures, you are 15 left with renovations that were needed and 16 necessary. The first, third and fourth floors of the East Wing of the Capitol needed extensive electrical, heating, cooling, plumbing and structural renovations.

We have a responsibility to take care of this incredible building and the 22 dedicated people who work in it. This is the context within which the Court's foolish 24 furniture expenditures needs to be viewed.

justices, we have 279 judicial officers

2 presiding over their own courts, including 74

circuit judges, 47 family court judges and

158 magistrates.

In addition to those judicial officers, the judiciary has many other people, functions and responsibilities. We employ fewer than 1500 people with the largest group being more than 300 people state-wide in our probation department.

We also have magistrate 12 assistants, circuit and family court judge secretaries, court reporters and law clerks, administrative staff, human resources, an IT department, educational training, accounting and payroll, all serving the entire state of West Virginia.

We have our Supreme Court 19 clerk's office, our chief counsel's office. 20 Workers' Compensation appeals, the State law library, the Board of Law Review, the 22 Judicial Investigation Commission, the Lawyer Disciplinary Board and much more.

Given the nature of our work,

Page 1038

1 Now, let's talk in more 2 detail about the judiciary's budget and our unified system of the courts. In 1974, the 3 4 citizens of our state amended our 5 Constitution to create a unified court 6 system, and in so doing, greatly advanced 7 judicial independence and effectiveness.

Prior to these sweeping revisions to our Constitution - which were 10 overwhelmingly approved by the voters in a subsequent election - the judiciary was 11 fragmented, virtually unsupervised and run primarily at the county level.

As we move from that time period until today, I would ask that you think about the Court differently and beyond the five justices in Charleston.

Here in the Capitol, the 19 judiciary's budget is frequently referred to 20 as the Supreme Court's budget. We need to remember that our budget covers the operation 22 of the courts in all 55 counties, not just in 23 Charleston.

Separate from the five

our budget is necessarily employee-driven, 1 2 but one of the most important points surrounding our budget is that approximately 4 90 percent of our spending is

The largest part of that 90 percent figure is for our 1459 employees. And keep in mind, of those employees, the legislature and not the Court actually sets 10 the salaries for 663 of those individuals. totaling 50.6 million dollars.

For example, Supreme Court justices, circuit and family court judges, 14 family court case coordinators, family court secretaries, magistrates, magistrate clerks, deputy magistrate clerks, and magistrate assistants are all set by the legislature.

This fact means that separate from all of the other nondiscretionary obligations contained within our budget, the legislature has significant control with regard to nearly half of our employees.

And while the court system 23 has certainly grown throughout the years. 24

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

17

18

19

20

21

that is largely due to the unavoidable result 2 of our socioeconomic challenges and the most 3 of that growth is a direct response to

mandates passed by the legislature. 4

5

6

7

8

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

13

19

20

The addition of drug courts and their increased budgetary demands is just one example. However, let's talk about where we are today and the direction that we're 9 going in the future. When I was elected 10 Chief Justice in January of 2017, I was well aware of the fiscal challenges facing West 11 12 Virginia and made transparency and accountability of our budgetary process my 13 14 primary mission.

Since that time, our Court 16 has been going through more changes than any 17 time in recent history, and these changes 18 have created real savings. At the end of Fiscal Year 2016, we had a carryover balance 19 20 of approximately 1.2 million dollars.

21 At the end of Fiscal Year 22 2017, we had approximately 8.5 million in carryover funds. These savings were not a response to any press coverage. They are

Page 1043 that occurred in 2017 included: Reducing our

2 spending by at least \$7,000,000; eliminating

nonessential positions, and with the help of

4 the National Center for State Courts,

5 beginning a significant reorganization. 6

For example, reorganizing our probation division, saving millions of dollars and setting up a system where sexual offenders will be more closely watched.

Redesigning our professional services appointment and invoicing processes, 12 saving hundreds of thousands of dollars. This includes our mental hygiene, guardian ad litem and expert witness invoices.

Moreover, our clarification of our rules regarding guardians ad litem in family court cases has enabled us to cut spending in that area by millions of dollars, while still providing excellent service to our children.

Changing the funding 22 structure for drug courts to save hundreds of thousands of dollars while continuing to provide the level of services necessary to

Page 1042

simply the result of our commitment to sound financial management.

Upon hiring new administrative leadership in Judge Gary Johnson in January of 2017, we began making seismic changes at rapid speeds. We began looking at everything, large and small.

We started asking, "What are the core functions that our court system must 10 perform under the United States and West Virginia Constitution and under the laws of 11 12 our state?"

When sitting down with our 14 administrative team, I made it clear that 15 everything must be on the table and nothing 16 was untouchable. We had to evaluate what we were doing and things not critical to our 17 core mission as a court system must either be 18 eliminated or substantially reduced.

Even small amounts of money 21 add up to large amounts of money. Change is not easy, but the Court has begun building a 22 23 more efficient and effective branch of government. Some of the financial changes

Page 1044

help these people change their lives.

Putting procedures in place in our finance division that will change the transparency of the Court forever. Even the simplest of actions with an invoice is now at least a two-person process.

Reducing library staff and eliminating seven underutilized regional law libraries at a savings of more than \$200,000.

Limiting the appointment of senior status judges when judicial officers are recused from cases. Instead, the Chief Justice appoints sitting judges from other 14 circuits to travel and handle the particular cases, saving hundreds of thousands of 16 dollars per year.

Streamlining some of our educational programs and exploring ways to deliver more education to our people in more cost-effective ways, including web-based education.

22 We have even made a change in 23 the term of our Chief Justice. Instead of a one-year rotation, the Chief Justice is now

Page 1045

10

11

12

13

15

20

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

selected for a four-year term, with the

- ability to serve for subsequent terms. This
- change places more effective administrative 3
- and financial control in the hands of an 4
- 5 elected official rather than an appointed 6 employee.

7 We have improved and implemented a procurement function with 8 9 standards and processes in several of our 10 divisions. We now research and utilize 11 state-wide contracts whenever possible. This 12 change allowed us to immediately realize an 13 approximately \$100,000 savings upon reviewing 14 our copier contracts throughout the state.

15 We have broken down our 16 internal budgeting into spending units, which 17 creates more accountability. Monthly 18 financial reports are now distributed to 19 division directors to monitor spending. And P-cards and technology are to be used on an 21 emergency basis, and only with prior 22 approval.

23 And we're looking to the 24 future in working toward the implementation

clear that this has been a year of

- 2 significant financial improvement within the
- Judicial Branch of government. Our
- 4 reorganization has created a more streamlined
- 5 system and a management team of legal,
- 6 education, probation, technology, court
- 7 services and finance that all work together
- to ensure that we are able to do our job in a 9 more effective and efficient manner.

These changes will shape the future of this branch in ways that will provide more accountability and transparency. but also meet the needs and challenges of the 14 future.

Having discussed these important structural and financial changes, I 16 17 will tell you that we are not finished. However, I would now like to take just a few 18 19 minutes to focus on some of the complexities of our budget and where it is difficult to 21 significantly reduce spending.

22 We have to have this 23 conversation with the awareness of the 24 nonnegotiable elements of our judicial

Page 1046

Page 1048

of a state-wide e-filing system that will 1 save county commissions, litigants and others 2 3 significant amounts of money as we move into

4 an essentially paperless process.

We will also be able to provide accurate statistics to the legislative body that we are currently unable to provide.

We have implemented significant cost savings in the day report center program wherein we realized more than \$100,000 within the first quarter after making these changes.

13 14

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

We received the largest 15 Federal drug court grant in the nation, 1.4 16 million dollars. And we have expanded our legal division to allow more review, 17 18 renegotiation and oversight of all contracts and to implement policies, procedures and 20 standards that have been absent. This change has also allowed us to avoid large outside 21 22 legal fees.

23 These examples - and there are many more - should make it abundantly

system. Article III, Section 7 of our 1

2 Constitution provides: "The courts of this 3

state shall be open, and every person for an 4 injury done to him and his person, property

5 or reputation shall have remedy by due course

6 of law and justice shall be administered

7 without sale, denial or delay." 8

It is clear that without

9 adequate funding of the Judicial Branch, we 10 will not be able to provide or guarantee

11 these Constitutional rights. Moreover, it is

12 also clear that administering justice is a

Constitutional mandate for all three branches 13 14 of government.

It is a core function. It is essential that we have adequate court fundina.

A few years ago in his annual report, Chief Justice John Roberts said that failing to adequately fund the court system poses a genuine threat to public safety. He 22 further explained that courts do not have discretionary programs they can postpone or eliminate because virtually all of their

7

8

9

11

13

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

court functions are Constitutionally or statutorily required.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

17

18

19

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

15

21

He explained that reductions in court spending cause widespread delays in civil cases, causing commercial uncertainty, lost opportunities and unvindicated rights.

Chief Justice Roberts made clear that failing to meet the Judiciary's essential requirements undermines the 10 public's confidence in all three branches of government.

Without adequate funding of 13 our judicial budget, West Virginians will 14 experience a lack of services, as problems will emerge from one end to the other. Delays in court services would happen, and 16 justice delayed is tantamount to justice denied.

Insufficient funding would 20 cause specialty courts to be eliminated and our troubled adults and juveniles would get 22 much less supervision, if any at all.

23 Insufficient funding would 24 mean that significant costs would be added to

Page 1051 State of West Virginia. For example, if the

2 current number of people on probation had to

be incarcerated, it would cost the State of

West Virginia more than 280 million dollars

for just one year. Those numbers are scary. 6 Instead, the Judicial Branch

spends a little more than \$20,000,000 to supervise and attempt to rehabilitate these individuals. Anyone can do that math. 10

Along those same lines, our drug courts are helping to keep some 12 individuals out of prison, helping them deal with their dependency issues, allowing them 14 to find a job, take care of their families 15 and to become productive members of society.

They walk away from these courts with a support system, and they are far more likely to succeed in life than an incarcerated felon.

And again, consider the cost savings of millions of dollars not being used to incarcerate these individuals. We've had more than 1600 drug court graduates since December of 2012, at a significant savings

over incarceration. 1

Indigent transcripts. We spend about 1.7 million dollars per year to provide these transcripts, and those people have a Constitutional right to them. That is nondiscretionary.

Language interpreters. It is necessary that we have an appropriate number of interpreters so that litigants, juries, judges and others participating in court proceedings are able to understand what is being said in the courtroom.

We spend more than \$150,000 14 per year, and that is nondiscretionary.

Education. Educating our judicial officers and employees is critical to the services we provide. The 2017 year brought an influx of a significant number of new circuit judges, family court judges and magistrates. To provide due process to our citizens, our judges must know the law and keep up with its changes, and so we in the court system have an obligation to educate them.

West Virginia's general budget, and it would mean fewer opportunities for our citizens.

While that may sound like a

parade of horribles, it is a reality.

Consider just a few examples of the Constitutional and statutorily-required work 7 of the courts:

Probation. West Virginia is one of just 13 states with the probation officers working out of the Judicial Branch of government.

In the vast majority of 13 states, probation is entirely an Executive Branch function. Probation costs amount to 14 about one sixth of our budget. Any cuts to probation officers means more jail time for 16 17 nonviolent offenders, costing the State of West Virginia and our individual counties 18 19 millions of dollars to house these 20 individuals in the regional jails and prisons.

22 While that money is not coming out of the judicial budget, it 23 nonetheless is a significant cost to the

Page 1053

6

7

12

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1 Now, let's briefly discuss 2 the Constitutional amendment issue. There is

3 much talk at the moment about a

4 Constitutional amendment directed at the

5 judiciary's budget. While this is discussed

6 year after year, there is no doubt this will

have more focus this year based upon the news 7

regarding isolated, but excessive, furniture 8

9 spending.

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

1

2

3

4

9

16

When you discuss such an 11 amendment, I would just ask that you take a 12 moment and consider the big picture. Our Constitutional structure is carefully thought 13 14 out. The current Constitutional provision says no item relating to the judiciary can be decreased.

This provision prevents legislative interference with the judiciary and preserves the checks and balances by protecting against retribution by the legislature for any particular action that a 22 court may take.

And before you say, "I would 24 never punish the Court for doing its job,"

Page 1055 passed the same thing the next year, except 2 the provision said it removed all funding for 3 the Judicial Branch.

> 4 This is the sort of thing 5 that can happen when court budgets are not independent. This didn't happen in 1816. This has been happening for the last few vears. And similar controversies continue in

9 those states where legislatures have 10 significant budgetary authority over their

11 court systems.

It has often been said that a 13 fair judiciary is the cornerstone of 14 democracy. We must resolve disputes fairly, 15 and we are often called upon to resolve deeply socially and politically-divisive 16 17 issues wherein the results may not be 18 popular.

19 We may be declaring a law 20 written by this body to be unconstitutional. 21 We simply must uphold the rights and 22 protections of our constitutions.

It has often been said that judicial financial independence is something

Page 1054

let's look at what's been happening in the State of Kansas.

The controversy began a few years ago when the executive and legislative 5 branches became frustrated with some of their 6 Supreme Court's decisions. Among those 7 decisions was one dealing with school 8 funding.

In response to that Kansas 10 Supreme Court decision, their legislature enacted a supplemental funding bill for the 11 12 judiciary, but it included in it provisions 13 that would have removed much of the Supreme 14 Court's administrative power over its own 15 courts.

The provision was clearly 17 unconstitutional. However, the bill 18 contained a nonseverability clause. It provided that the funding was void if the 20 Court struck down any section of the bill 21 that removed the Supreme Court's power.

22 This bill was a direct 23 attempt to punish the Kansas Supreme Court 24 for its decision. And the Kansas legislature

that prior legislators and citizens of this state have worked hard to create and

preserve.

It was solidified in 1917 with the passage of a modern budget amendment, and it was further strengthened with the Judicial Reorganization Amendment of 1974.

As Martin Luther King once wrote, "Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere. We are caught in an 12 inescapable network of mutuality, tied in a single garment of destiny. Whatever affects one directly affects all indirectly."

I believe that those words ring true in considering the relationships between our three co-equal branches of government. The State Constitution is a foundational document.

Like a house, the State needs a stable and firm - not fluid and flexible foundation. If we reject the foundational principle of a fiscally-independent judiciary, we remove a portion of our State's

Page 1057

foundation, making the whole less stable, less durable, and crucially, less safe for 2

3 the most important principles of our 4 democracy.

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

13

17

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

We have, unfortunately, had many instances in all three branches of our government throughout our history that have led to the frustration and disappointment of our citizens.

However, in none of those circumstances do I recall this body's response to be a Constitutional amendment to 12 reduce the authority of an entire branch of 14 government. Instead, the proper and measured response was to institute policies and 16 procedures that minimize the ability of individuals to act without transparency and 18 accountability in the future.

19 We in the Judicial Branch 20 have done just these things. We have made significant staffing changes. We have 21 22 implemented a reorganization replete with policies and procedures that will jealously guard our finances, and each of us will have

to explain ourselves to the voters of West Virginia.

And all I ask of you, our legislators, is that when you judge the acts of the isolated wasteful spending that occurred years ago and those failures of oversight that allowed them, you do so in the judicious, measured fashion of any good judge.

10 I ask that you take into 11 account the extent to which we have, ourselves, remedied our own transgressions. 13 While I certainly understand the legislature 14 is concerned about instances of wasteful 15 spending, I would rather each of the justices 16 stand in front of the voters of this state 17 and let them decide how we have managed the

18 Court's finances instead of having the

drastic measure of a Constitutional amendment

20 that will significantly change this branch of 21 government forever.

22 In summary, this Court is

23 making significant changes with regard to how

we do things, and these changes will benefit

the Court and the people of West Virginia for

decades. We had a problem, and we addressed 2 3 it.

4 I am so proud to work in this 5 branch of government and with these great 6 judges, magistrates and employees of the 7 court system throughout this state. I would put these people up against any of their

9 counterparts anywhere in this country, and I 10 am saddened that these fine judicial officers and employees have been damaged from these 11

12 recent stories.

13 We will continue to work 14 hard, and we will regain the trust of West 15 Virginians. I am looking to the future as we are making substantial positive changes 16 17 throughout the Judicial Branch.

I sincerely thank you for your time today and for allowing me to talk 19 about our Judicial Branch of government, recent changes and our -- our budget. Our 22 three branches of government must continue to 23 work together for the long-term interests of

Page 1058

18

20

21

19

20

Page 1060

that this branch will continue to operate

all of our citizens, and I can assure you

2 with transparency, with integrity and with 3

impartiality. 4 As Alexander Hamilton 5 reflected, "The ordinary administration of criminal and civil justice contributes more 6

than any other circumstance to impressing 7 upon the minds of people affection, esteem 8

9 and reference toward their government." 10

I thank you for your time

11 today, and I look forward to answering your 12 auestions.

13 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Thank 14 you, Chief. Appreciate the information. You 15 know, I applaud your efforts and -- yourself the last two years, and Justice Ketchum 17 before you. And we'll open this up now for 18 some questions.

> Vice Chairman Householder. FINANCE VICE CHAIR

HOUSEHOLDER: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and 21

22 thank you, Chief Justice Loughry.

23 You know, there is no denying 24 that there was wasteful spending and

obviously extravagant purchases happening 2 within the Court, and I think that it begs 3 the need for more transparency and oversight 4 from this body.

5 It appears that some 6 safeguards have failed, and obviously there 7 were -- there were renovation items that were 8 not needed, and in the context of transparency, what is the Court's plan to 10 prevent the misappropriation of taxpayers' 11 dollars in the future?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: I 13 think that's a wonderful question. And one 14 of the things that we started in 2017 was we started a complete reorganization of the 16 administrative office of the courts, and we brought in the National Center for State 18 Courts. This was not a minor undertaking.

I want to be very clear about 20 this. We had a situation where we had -where an administrative director had 20 some

22 people -- I believe 27 people reporting

23 directly -- it's irrelevant who the

24 administrative directors are. Just talking

Page 1062

about the structure. 1

12

17

19

21

2

14

18

21

-- where you had 27 people reporting directly to -- to that individual.

3 4 So you had 27 silos. It makes no sense

5 whatsoever. So you have 27 people out there

6 making decisions. And what we did - in

7 working, again, with the National Center and

8 looking at the structures of court systems

9 throughout this entire country - was we came

10 up with something where you had the

administrative director, and you go down and 11

12 you have six contacts that work with that 13 individual.

You have a legal division; you have finance; you have probation; you 16 have technology; you have education; and you 17 have court services.

So now we have these 19 individuals who meet weekly, number one, and 20 we have communication, we have transparency. So it -- we've hired -- another wonderful

22 thing that we did along those same lines, we

23 hired two procurement individuals. 24

FINANCE VICE CHAIR

Page 1063 HOUSEHOLDER: I was going to ask. So you

don't think you have the fox guarding the hen

3 house?

4

5

8

18

19

9

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY:

Absolutely not.

6 FINANCE VICE CHAIR

7 HOUSEHOLDER: Okay.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: So in

9 the past, invoices would come in, invoices

would get paid, invoices would go out.

11 There's not a single invoice that comes in --

12 my understanding is, there's not a single

invoice that comes into our court system 13 14 where at least two individuals review those.

15 And you know, I've been asked 16 since this has occurred many times, "Well, 17 don't the justices sign off on every invoice

that comes through the court system?" Well, no, and of course not.

20 Because we have more than 20 -- keep in mind,

21 we're talking about an entire court system in

all 55 counties. We have more than 25,000

invoices that come through the court system

every single year. And on top of that, we

Page 1064

have another 10,000 to 15,000 transactions on 1 2 our purchasing cards.

3 So -- and we're also sitting

4 down -- we haven't had written procedures and protocols. And I want to have written

6 procedures and protocols for everything. We

7 need that. We just -- the people of West

8 Virginia deserve that.

So we want to put things in 10 place so that not only this will never happen 11 again, but it doesn't matter who is in the Chief position or who's in the legislature or

12 13 whatever. 14 And another big thing that we

15 did - and I know I touched upon it - but the 16 change of the Chief Justice position is huge. 17

It's not about me. I'm talking about 20 vears down the road. 18

19 If you -- let's look at the

20 renovation period, okay? These renovations 21 occurred from 2008 until 2014, all right? I

wasn't even on the Court until 2013. So for 22

23 that six-year period, you had five

individuals who served in a one-year capacity

Page 1065

5

6

10

14

16

18

20

21

23

24

9

13

21

1 as Chief Justice.

7

15

18

1

7

2 I think that that creates an 3 impossibility -- it puts a lot of pressure on each one of those individuals for any 4

5 long-term project. I think that's one more 6 example of how --

FINANCE VICE CHAIR

HOUSEHOLDER: Well, you know, there is a lot 8

9 of public pressure from this body to do

10 something, because I don't think you would

11 dispute that it was outrageous, there were a

12 lot of claims -- I mean, the average

13 taxpayer, they're out -- they're outraged

14 from what they -- from what was reported.

So we want to make sure that 16 there are some safeguards or assurances that 17 this will not happen again.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: I

19 think that that is an absolutely legitimate

20 concern and question. There is nobody more

21 outraged by these purchases than me. Many 22 people in this room have known me for more

23 than two decades and they know that I would

24 have never approved of such things.

Page 1066

However, there was clearly a

2 failure of oversight at the Court. These

things happened. We can't go back and change 3

them, but what we can do is go forward and 4

5 make sure that something like this never

happens again. 6

FINANCE VICE CHAIR

8 HOUSEHOLDER: Thank you. Thank you,

9 Mr. Chairman.

10 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Thank 11 you. Yes, Delegate Cowles.

12

DELEGATE COWLES: Thank you,

13 Mr. Chairman. And first, thank you Mr. Chief Justice for coming to the meeting today. 14

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank

16 you.

15

DELEGATE COWLES: And I agree

17 18 and appreciate with your com -- your comments

19 that it is indefensible and insensitive and

20 harmful to the Court. But I appreciate you

21 coming here to say that, and what I would --

22 and I also appreciate the reorganization that

23 you just talked about, because if we all

24 recognize -- and I think you've recognized it

1 before the media, but if we all recognize

that changes need to be made, and you've made

-- it sounds like the Court is making some

reorganization changes.

What -- the two things I would like to understand about it is the

7 timeline, the project origin, its completion,

and you became the chief judge, or you got to

9 the Court in 2013?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY:

11 That's correct.

12 DELEGATE COWLES: -- chief

13 judge in 2017?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY:

15 That's correct.

DELEGATE COWLES: A new

17 administrator in 2017?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY:

19 That's correct.

> DELEGATE COWLES: And I guess the disgruntled employee started -- took that

22 spot in 2017? Started in 2017?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well.

I will say in 2017, I had the honor of -- the

Page 1068

Court hired Gary Johnson as the new

2 Administrative Director, and he's doing a

wonderful job in that position. In January,

4 actually, the -- my first day as Chief, I

5 guess. 6

DELEGATE COWLES: So your reorganization has been fairly sizable:

7 Change in administrator, change in processes 8

and protocols and written procedures and --10

But if you could elaborate

11 any on the timeline, that might help me as we

12 go forward.

> And if you've already done some of these improved oversight issues, from

14 15 your perspective, what can we do, short of a

Constitutional amendment - which I know 16

bothers you - what do you think we the 17 18

legislature could do?

Because we have a role as 19 20 well to protect the taxpayers.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: You

22 most certainly do have a role, and I

23 understand that role and I respect that role. 24

and I think that our three co-equal branches

Page 1072

Page 1069

of government have to have that respect for each other.

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

So where to begin? So please interrupt me and stop me -- you've asked several questions, and I'll come back to the beginning. So you want more of a timeline for what occurred.

So it is my understanding 9 that in 2008, the Court decided to begin some 10 renovation and restoration on the fourth 11 floor of the East Wing of the Capitol. Okay? 12

That is where our chief 13 counsel's office is located. And there were 14 -- four of the current members of the Court 15 were not even members of the Court at that 16 time. So the Court decided to undertake that 17 project.

18 And from reviewing old notes, 19 I saw that they did obtain a contract for 20 that -- for that project. So they did that. 21 And it was successful. And it improved that 22 area drastically.

23 And after that, the members 24 of the Court at that time began restoring

5

10

looking at the other areas. They saw the

success of the coun -- the chief counsel's

3 office, so then restoration of our clerk's office occurred.

Our clerk's office is busy.

6 They do wonderful things. They process about 7 10,000 orders per year. And we put in a more 8 safe work space, created a -- certainly a

9 better work environment.

Our courtroom -- we have a 11 magnificent courtroom. This is -- I mean, 12 Cass Gilbert designed this, and this was supposed to be his last job. And he took on 13 14 one job after that, which was the U.S. 15 Supreme Court, modeled on us.

But nonetheless, we have a 16 17 responsibility to take care of that 18 courtroom.

19 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: He --20 I think the gentleman was also asking how we 21 as a legislature can be involved with this 22 process when -- okay, so --

23 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Okay, 24 just to wind up, the -- and ask -- if I don't

Page 1070

7

8

9

1 these other areas of the Court system. And 2 from reviewing the notes, they did it in a

3 way -- it was done in a way that I wouldn't

4 have -- have done it, but nonetheless, it was 5 done that way.

There was a utilization of 17 7 separate change orders that -- that went 8 forward. Moving forward, that's -- that's 9 not how I would have proceeded on that. But 10 nonetheless, that is -- that's how it 11 occurred.

So the Court then looked at 13 renovating part of the library, which was also on the fourth floor. My understanding

15 is, none of this stuff had been done since 16 the East Wing of the Capitol had been

17 completed in, I believe, December of 1928,

18 and there were -- it has been reported to me

that there were serious electrical issues, 20 some structural issues, plumbing and heating,

21 etc.

6

12

22 So -- and we do have a 23 responsibility to take care of this building. The project -- the justices then moved into 24

answer that fully, just to wind up the

2 others. So then we went -- then the Court at 3 that time completed the hallway renovations,

offices, the conference room, the hallway of

the justices, the conference room on the 6 first floor.

So it was a significant -- it was a large project. One of the things that -- answering the question a little more like 10 this is: I believe that a big part of the responsibility has to come back on the Court.

11 12 When I come over here next year, I have to provide to you a more

13 14 transparent budget than you've ever seen from

15 the Court system. And I think that you

16 deserve that. I think you should be able to

say, a hundred and -- "Why do you want 17

\$139,000,000?" You know, "Explain that to 18

19 us. You know, you say that you spend 1 point

20 -- you only get 1.1 percent of our total

21 budget, so does that mean that because you

22 get so little, you're allowed to waste

23 money?" 24

Absolutely not. And of

Page 1073

1

course not. And I think this branch of government has to be transparent, and we have 3 to be able to come to you and provide that 4 information. 5

And I think in just communications with the Chairman -- I'm not asking you to comment, but I believe that you've seen a transparency in the last year or so that is -- you know, we're making these 10 changes here.

So --

6

7

9

11

12

14

15

5

6

8

13

FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Well. 13 let me bounce one idea off you.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Yes. FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Short 16 of a Constitutional amendment, what if the 17 Legislative branch or the Executive Branch 18 controlled the space of the Court? Any 19 renovations, we decided, any upgrades, we 20 decided, or the Executive Branch decided, 21 whether that's the County Commission at a

23 here on the campus. 24 It strikes me that perhaps

Page 1074

there's a bigger role for us to play in that 1 rather than the -- the Court trying to do 3 that themselves through their administrative 4 office.

22 courthouse or the Supreme Court's facilities

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: You know, I think -- I think -- I'm not speaking 7 for the Court, because we -- you know, I'm speaking -- standing here for me as I say 9 this. I think that's a really legitimate 10 guestion. When you -- you know, should we 11 have three -- perhaps this applies to the 12 Executive as well.

Should we have individual 14 branches who are able to take this wonderful 15 building and do things without one -- maybe 16 it's a legislative -- a joint body where we 17 have to come in front of the legislature and say, "We would like to do" X, Y and Z. I 18 don't have any -- I personally have no 20 problem with that whatsoever.

21 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: That's 22 where my thoughts were going for some issue, 23 and I don't have them formulated yet, but I just wanted to bounce that off of you.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well,

and let me throw this also out and just say

that as far as a Constitutional amendment,

let's say that we had that in place. That

would not have stopped these types of

6 expenditures. I mean, what would have

7 happened would have been there would have 8

been a punishment the next year for that.

9 But that's not going to stop 10 something like that, so I like your idea, and 11 I'd like to explore that.

12 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Thank

13 you.

16

18

24

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

15

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

14 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: --

15 much more. Thank you very much.

FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Yes,

17 Delegate Boggs.

FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS:

Thank you Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chief Justice, 19

20 thank you for being here. It's good to see 21 you.

22 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Good 23 to see you.

FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR

Page 1076

BOGGS: I want to just go back a couple

things. Just for some perspective. Refresh

my memory. How many other states oversee the

judicial budget, the legislature controls the

5 budget?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY:

That's a really good question, and what will sound like a simple answer is this -- because people say, "There's nowhere else in the

10 country with a situation like this."

And on the one hand, with the one aspect of it, that is correct. I am not aware of another state where the legislature cannot reduce the Court's budget. 14

However, when you start talking about budgets throughout this state, 16 there are as many ways of doing judicial budgets as there are states. And let me give vou an example.

Well, also think about it like this: In West Virginia, we have a unified system of courts, so our budget, again, covers all 55 counties, covers all of our court system. That's not the way it is

1

2

4

9

10

11

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

1 across the country.

11

18

1

8

9

17

2 I mean, you have -- you have 3 hybrids all over the place. In many states, you have a Supreme Court budget, and you have 4 5 separate budgets for whatever their court 6 systems may be below, whether they're 7 district courts or circuit courts, justices of the peace or magistrates. Some are set by 9 the legislature; some are set at a county 10 level.

So it's -- it's not apples to 12 apples when you look at these circumstances. 13 And let's also look at the Supreme Court. 14 Even though we have that idea of not being 15 able to reduce the number, we've already 16 talked about approximately 90 percent of our 17 funding is nondiscretionary.

And when you start to look at 19 some of the so-called discretionary money. 20 really a lot of that is millions of dollars 21 for a computer system and licensing for our 22 uniform judicial application, and you wonder, 23 is that really -- is that really 24 discretionary also?

Page 1078

So you know, this branch has 2 the ultimate check and threat on the Judicial 3 Branch of government because it's always 4 looming, to have that Constitutional amendment. And what will probably happen is, if this passes, you will see the judicial 6 7 budget increase.

Why is that? Because you're going to get pressured constantly, because 10 people are now going to come to you, and 11 they're going to say, "We don't get enough 12 money. The Supreme Court doesn't give us enough money for our family courtroom. And 13 over here in Braxton County, we need another probation officer. And over here, we need to 16 do this and we need to do that."

But -- but I think we work 18 very well together. If this Court ever came in here, we have a -- we've had a consistent 20 budget, and if this Court ever came in here say for example, next year - and said, "We 21 want -- instead of \$139,000,000, we want 22 \$180,000,000, and we're not gonna tell you 23 24 why."

Page 1079 Well, that may happen for one year, but that Constitutional amendment would pass rapidly. But that's never happened.

FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS:

You mentioned the Kansas situation. Do you have any other examples of -- of maybe the pendulum swinging too far the other way other 7 than Kansas? 8

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well. so I go to these chief justice conference meetings and you meet with chief justices 12 from throughout the country, and you sit down and you have these conversations. And it's 13 14 -- it's very telling when you have judges and justices making comments that they're afraid to rule on a case a certain way because they're scared to death that the legislature 18 is going to cut their budget.

So a lot of these -- a lot of these situations, they occur all the time; they just don't reach the newspapers in the same way that the Kansas situation did.

FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS:

You mentioned -- you mentioned something

about the modern budget amendment. I thought vou said 1917? CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: There

was a -- there was a 1917 amendment --FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS:

So, I'm -- I'm thinking the modern budget amendment being more like in 1960s --

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well

FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS:

-- or '70s.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well, the 1917 budget amendment specifically provided this situation with regard to the judiciary's budget, the 1917.

(Playing of tape was paused.)

17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Let me just alert the Committee members. Apparently our estimate of time of this -- this testimony was -- we underestimated it a 20 bit, but we've notified the Court, so don't worry about 21 our 10:30 appointment.

22 We'll go when we're complete with this 23 testimony, and the Court is aware of it and is --24 that's not gonna create any problems.

Page 1081 Page 1083 1 Go ahead and continue the tape --1 that number \$2,000,000. 2 2 **DELEGATE GEARHEART: So** (Tape continued being played as 3 3 follows:) where's the \$2,000,000 coming out of this? 4 FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS: 4 Mr. Chairman, I'm sure you 5 And the others just dealt with the -- the 5 had to go to that meeting. 6 most recent just dealt with the Executive 6 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: We --7 Branch versus the Board of Public Works 7 we will follow up -putting together a budget. 8 8 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Yes. 9 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well, 9 That will be gone. This -- this document --10 and the 1917 amendment included other things my understanding is this document was not even available until yesterday, I believe, so 11 as well, is my understanding. 11 FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS: 12 12 13 Just one final question, and this has nothing 13 **DELEGATE GEARHEART: That's** 14 to do with it, but just out of curiosity: On 14 the budget bill? 15 the federal level, does Congress control the 15 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: 16 budget for the U.S. Supreme Court? 16 That's correct. CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: They 17 17 **DELEGATE GEARHEART: That's** 18 do control the budget. 18 it. There's \$2,000,000 more than in --19 FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS: 19 Second question. Each of 20 Okay. All right. Thank you. 20 your line items is set up as a reappropriated 21 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: And account. You're kind to mention how much 21 -- and -- very good questions. And you heard 22 carryover you had in '16 and '17, and between 23 some of the comments that I read from Chief those two years was 9.7 million dollars. I 23 24 Justice, Justice Roberts. 24 assume we're going to have an amount carry Page 1082 Page 1084 FINANCE MINORITY CHAIR BOGGS: over for this year. 1 1 2 2 My question is: Is how much Thank you. 3 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank 3 cash are you sitting on in total in 4 you very much. 4 reappropriations? 5 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: We 5 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: have a couple more and if I may ask just --6 6 The -- the reappropriated accounts, it's my 7 we'll get to the summary answers? 7 understanding that it is 8.5 million. So --CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: I'll 8 8 DELEGATE GEARHEART: Okay. 9 work on that. 9 So what you're -- you're saying is that FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Yes. 10 10 amount you gave was the total that you have accumulated, not just what each of those 11 Delegate Gearheart, I'm sorry. 11 12 **DELEGATE GEARHEART: Thank** 12 years turned back. Is that fair --13 you, Mr. Chairman. 13 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well, 14 And my questions are quick 14 I'm not sure I understand the question, so 15 and number oriented. Number one, you 15 let me -- let's -- let me hear it -- let me 16 indicated \$139,000,000 budget. 16 hear it again. 17 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: 17 DELEGATE GEARHEART: Okay. 18 18 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: And That's correct. DELEGATE GEARHEART: The 19 19 what page are you on? budget document says 141. What is the 20 20 DELEGATE GEARHEART: I'm difference? 21 21 looking at the budget bill. In each of your

22

23

22

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: The

reviewed our finances and we decided to drop

23 difference is that we met in January and

accounts, your line items says

"Reappropriated." So your actual spend as

compared to the budget, those dollars are

Page 1085 coming back to you. 1 2 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Oh. 3 that's correct. So we have a -- we have a --4 **DELEGATE GEARHEART: The** 5 question is: How much total cash are you 6 sitting on in reappropriated money? 7 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Yeah, that -- mv understanding -- because I don't 8 want to -- I don't want to say something 9 10 that's incorrect. My understanding is 8.5 11 million dollars. 12 DELEGATE GEARHEART: Okay, I 13 gotcha. Very good. 14 Last question -- and Delegate 15 Walters came in late, and so I'm on his -- I 16 assume he wasn't gonna ask, but you have a 17 couple of special revenue accounts, Account 18 No. 1757 and 1759, both of which had 19 extremely light disbursements and very 20 healthy influx and/or balances. Between the 21 two of them, about 1.6 million dollars.

Are we charging too much for

money that should be available to be captured

the fees that are required here or is there

have appreciation for the function and purpose of the funds. My question, though, is that the amount of revenue in the funds and accumulating is -- well exceeds the expenditures to accomplish the purpose of the 6 funds, which means that those --7 We're either charging too much, frankly, for what folks are doing, or 9 those dollars need to be put into play for -for expenditures as opposed to sitting in a 11 savings account. 12 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: I --13 the -- I have the 2017 current level numbers 14 with me and I do not have the 2018 current levels, but the numbers I had in there were much smaller. But the -- I have \$200,000 and 16 17 \$400,000. 18 So you have \$135,000 --19 DELEGATE GEARHEART: No. 20 it's --21 FINANCE CHAIRMAN NELSON: No. 22 it's 244. 23 DELEGATE GEARHEART: -- 245

Page 1086

24

10

11

12

13

14

15

and --

```
by the legislature for reappropriation?
1
2
             CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Let
3
   me see if I can locate those. Yes, I have
4
   something on special -- so tell me which
5
   accounts one more time, Delegate.
6
             DELEGATE GEARHEART: 1757 and
7
   1759. And I apologize to Delegate Walters.
8
   I didn't think you were gonna make it.
9
             FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: If
10
    anybody's looking at the -- it's page 158.
11
             CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Okay.
12
    In 1757, that is something called a Parental
13
    Education Fund. And what this is, is for
14
    people going through divorce, and they could
15
    be ordered to take certain classes.
             The 1759 is called a Parental
16
    Education and Mediation Fund. Parents are
17
18
    ordered to mediation for child custody
```

22

23

24

24

19 issues.
20 I mean, these aren't things
21 -- these special revenue accounts are things
22 created by the legislative body, as you're
23 aware --

DELEGATE GEARHEART: And I

Page 1088 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Okay, 1 2 245 and 1.4 million. Okay. 3 DELEGATE GEARHEART: The 1.4 4 5 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: If you can let him --7 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: I'll 8 answer --9

FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Come let him know and then -- let the Chief know and then he -- CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Give me one second.

DELEGATE GEARHEART: Is that the money that was wasted on -- (inaudible)

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Oh,

16 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Oh, 17 that's a wonderful question. There was money 18 placed in our account - not by us, by mistake 19 - and I believe that money was regional jail 20 money, 1.4 million.

So this money was placed into our account by mistake. It was then put back into the proper account. So it was not money that went to the judiciary.

Page 1089

7

8

9

11

13

14

21

4

5

6

12

13

15

16

17

19

22

23

There are other special accounts as well. We have an Access to Justice -- something called Access to Justice account. It's a little misleading. I kind of wish you would rename that, because it's not really access to justice.

That is something where all 8 the money collected in the fees for the Supreme Court, that money goes directly to 10 Legal Aid.

FINANCE CHAIR NELSON:

12 Delegate Boggs, you asked what the -- yield? DELEGATE BOGGS: Can we find 14 out what the account was that that went back 15 into?

16 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Yes, 17 I will have our finance -- I -- my office 18 will -- will provide that information to you 19 today.

DELEGATE BOGGS: That would 21 be good. And you know, I think it's 22 questions like this that other agencies that 23 come in and the transparency and the 24 discussion that goes on around not only

think that's a good question; it's a fair 2 question. And one thing -- I'm not sure if they announced it yet or not, but the -- the auditor is rolling out a new web page -- I'm 5 not certain if that has occurred today or not 6 or whatever.

But we've worked with them and asked them to feature us on the front page so that people can jump right into the 10 Supreme Court and dig in and start to look at things. 12

But some of our funding -when you look at -- when you look at our entire spending, so much of that spending is, 15 again, employee-driven.

16 MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES: 17 So I'm sorry -- I didn't mean to interrupt but we're on a time -- timeline here. So 18 19 where is the books? That's the question, 20 basically. If I had a \$134,000,000 business,

22 So where are the books? 23 Where do I go to find the books? Where do I 24 go, whether as a member of this legislature,

Page 1090

Page 1092

```
special revenue line items, but also general
1
2
   revenue line items and so -- yes, sir.
3
            FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Let me
4
  see. Sorry. Delegate Bates.
```

MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES: Just real quick. You alluded to the word

"transparency" multiple times.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Yes. MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES:

10 Sometimes when something becomes very transparent, you can see right through it. 11

12 So what I'm looking for is: Where would I. 13 or a member of this legislature or a member

14 of the public, or member of the press, find 15 the detailed breakdown or analysis of your

16 actual expenditures from 2017 of \$134,000,000

that was spent by the judiciary. 17

Where would an individual go 18 19 to see where that money was spent --CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well 20

21 --

22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

11

13

20

5

6 7

8

9

MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES:

23 -- or to find that? 24

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: I

the press, or the public go to see the books 1 2 of the Supreme Court like the books of any 3 other governmental agency?

I would have a set of books.

Where do I find those? Where do I see them? Or do they exist? CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well,

7 what you have today is you have the information that has always been provided to 9 this body. But I believe that the Supreme

10 Court absolutely must provide more 11

information.

MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES:

So can you -- can you provide a commitment to this Committee, the members of this Committee of the legislature, that you will provide us with a copy of those expenditures for 2017?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY:

18 That's fine with me.

MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES:

So that we can consider your -- your request? 20 21 So -- I think we have that responsibility.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Okay. MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES:

24 Thank you.

Page 1095 Page 1093 1 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank 1 DELEGATE HARTMAN: Thank you. 2 2 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank you. 3 3 MINORITY VICE CHAIR BATES: you. 4 Thank you, Mr. Chair. 4 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: 5 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Yes, 5 Delegate Walters, if we could have a very --6 Delegate Hartman? 6 DELEGATE WALTERS: We're 7 DELEGATE HARTMAN: Thank you, 7 going to do it quick, I promise you. 8 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Okay. Mr. Chairman. And thank you --8 9 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: We've 9 DELEGATE WALTERS: We're -just got a couple guick guestions, if that's 10 10 within the Department of Administration, okay, for everybody else. we're rewriting the Purchasing Division's 11 11 12 function. My question is simply this, and it CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Okay. 12 13 FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Go will bounce off with the -- what Delegate 13 14 ahead. I'm sorry. 14 Cowles asked. 15 DELEGATE HARTMAN: Let's talk 15 You are exempt under 16 about the drug courts. I mean, does each 16 Purchasing, currently. That bill is going to 17 circuit have a drug court? And is that 17 say that you will have the ability to work 18 mandated that they have one and maybe one of with the Department of Administration to 18 19 the most important expenditures that you establish rules and regulations. And then 20 could make today? 20 after a certain period of time, all agencies will come back under Purchasing, but they 21 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: The 21 22 -- so this is your -- I will speak a little 22 will all have input. 23 faster. So as you're well aware, this Court 23 Are you okay with -- with 24 mandated that drug courts occur. However, 24 working with the Department of Administration Page 1094 within that same legislation, it says the to reformulate purchasing? 1 2 continuance or discontinuance is up to the 2 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Part 3 Court. 3 of it -- so you said, "but they will all have 4 However, we have drug courts, 4 input." What do you mean -- what do you mean 5 I believe, in every circuit -- if -- I 5 by that? questioned one circuit because there was an 6 6 DELEGATE WALTERS: Well. issue with regard to Day Report Centers, but during the rule-making process - and probably 7 8 there's nothing in our budget that is the Chairman will make you not answer this 9 preventing -- in fact, we just approved the 9 question - there's open hearings, there's 10 start of another drug court this week. Won't 10 comment periods, you will have the ability to 11 mention where until we finalize our discuss the rules as they would apply to you, 11 12 administrative minutes. 12 and then those rules have to come back to the 13 But we're committed to this 13 legislature to be approved. 14 occurring. And people are able to change 14 And I'm -- my question simply 15 their lives. I mean, I've heard comments 15 is this: If we rewrite the Purchasing 16 saying, "We should get control of the budget, 16 Division, re -- repackage it and give you the 17 because we want to put more money in the drug opportunity to work in establishing the rules 17 and regulations as it applies to you, will 18 courts." 18 19 you be willing to be under Purchasing? But the thing about that is, 19 20 there isn't anyone that I'm aware of who has 20 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: You 21 not been able to participate in a drug court 21 know, I think that's a good question, and I 22 due to court funding. So they are providing 22 think that's a fair question, and I think if 23 significant resource to the State, and we've 23 you tie -- if you tie that question with 24 been committed to those. 24 Delegate Cowles' question, that also is

Page 1097

another way where you're saying we can have more accountability and transparency of the Judicial Branch.

I have not discussed that issue with the entire Court; however, personally, it's not -- it's not something that I would be opposed to.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

13

19

10 plan.

11

18

DELEGATE WALTERS: Thank you. FINANCE CHAIRMAN

10 NELSON: Okay, so two last quick ones, please. I'm going way over on this one. But 12 Delegate Frich.

DELEGATE FRICH: Thank you, 14 Mr. Chairman. Did you mention that -- a 15 different way of funding day courts was part of your streamlining or savings? And was 16 17 that due to the 1.4 million dollar grant, or 18 something else?

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: No. 20 it had nothing to do with the 1.4 million 21 dollar grant. What happened was, again, in 22 started to work with putting procedures and 23 protocols in place -- again, we looked at 24 everything.

Page 1099 2.6 million dollars just for drug tests. And

there's no way of knowing when you do this

how many people are going to be taking drug

4 tests. I mean, there's a lot of

5 unpredictability when you look at the Court's

6 budget.

7

13

18

24

6

16

So we worked with them, we came up with the -- a plan to where we pay them a per diem to provide these services, and within the very first quarter after doing this, we realized 100 plus thousand dollars 12 in savings.

Now, in addition to that, 14 with the various providers, we are having 15 them work very hard to be able to get Medicaid reimbursement, and we think that 16 17 will help us and also help them.

DELEGATE FRICH: All right. 19 And real guick, do you have any comments or 20 updates on the real estate rent dispute in 21 Monongalia County? I know I shouldn't make 22 it local, but you've discussed it in the 23 past.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: No, I

Page 1098

1 I mean, we got into mental 2 hygiene fees and guardian ad litem fees and 3 our probation division and sexual offender 4 probation officers, and we started looking at 5 these Day Report Centers, and we worked with 6 them to come up with a per diem to provide 7 the services that they needed to provide to us versus just invoicing back and forth 8 9 without any accountability and ability to

So we did that, and we now 12 have, one, more transparency, but we're able to make those -- we're able to plan better. 13

14 So we're providing the same 15 services, and we're doing so for less money. 16 DELEGATE FRICH: Did you make

drug court funding changes? 17 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Well,

19 that's what I was talking --DELEGATE FRICH: So that was 20

21 part of the day report, okay. 22 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: With

23 the drug courts, the Court was spending - I believe last year or the year before - about do not have any comments on that today.

2 DELEGATE FRICH: Okay, thank

3 you.

4 CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank you, Delegate.

FINANCE CHAIR NELSON:

7 Delegate Rowe? Last one. 8

DELEGATE ROWE: Thank you

9 very much for coming, sir. 10

I agree -- I share your 11 concern about control of one branch by another - I think that's something we should

13 all resist - but I do also appreciate your 14

concerns about transparency, and I'm 15 wondering from several questions --

I hear from you that the

17 Court would be willing to look at the

procedures that are used in other branches of 18

State government and the reporting 19

20 requirements, that the Court would look at

21 those and perhaps adopt those as its own in

22 order to make sure that you have the

transparency that citizens can maybe go 23 online and find out what their expenditures

1097-1100

Page 1101

```
are and where they're going.
1
2
            And for my purposes, I would
3
  be happy to know what category of spending
4
  there is as to the programs that you're
```

5 supporting.

6

7

8

9

10

13

15

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

1

2

3

4

5 6

7

8

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

But -- and is that -- is that a fair statement, that the Court is looking at its procedures and reporting requirements to -- to do that.

CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Oh, 11 there's no question about it. I mean, we're 12 looking at everything. And as we continue, we're gonna be able to get so far down into the weeds throughout this next year --14

And I think people deserve 16 that. You know, I said to somebody, I said, "I'm looking forward to going over and talking with Finance."

And they laughed and they said, "No, you're not."

I said, "No, I really am, I really am." I'm proud of the work that we've 22 done in the last year.

Do I enjoy these stories and

Page 1102

the things that have occurred? No. But I'm not going to stand before you and say that it's improper to ask these questions and for people to be outraged by such spending. because they should be outraged by it. DELEGATE ROWE: Thank you. Thank you. CHIEF JUSTICE LOUGHRY: Thank

9 you. 10 DELEGATE ROWE: Thank you, 11 Mr. Chairman.

> FINANCE CHAIR NELSON: Well, again, Chief Justice, we greatly appreciate you coming over and giving the report. I appreciate the moves that you and the Court have made to become more efficient, but this body's --

> > (Tape was ended.)

19 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I think that concludes Justice Loughry's testimony before Finance. A few 21 comments about our visit to the Supreme Court. Those 22 of you know that we requested that visit as a result of 23 a request that was made at the conclusion of, I think, 24 our meeting last week, our last meeting.

The Court has agreed -- it was a

2 request made on behalf of the members of our Committee

3 who wished to actually view the areas in the -- in the

4 Supreme Court that were affected by the renovations,

5 and we did some research to be sure that we're not

6 overstepping our bounds and violating the Open Meetings

7 law, and if you look at that section of the Code, under

8 6-9A-2, there are a series of definitions.

No. (5) defines the meeting that is 10 subject to the Open Meetings Act, and there are some

11 exceptions. The second exception is -- reads as

12 follows: "Any on-site inspection of any project or

13 program."

14 And because there's been a number of 15 concerns raised by the renovations that occurred during

16 the period that coincided with the reduction in the

17 reserve fund in the Court from 29 million plus or minus

18 to less than \$400,000 over about four or five years, I

19 think it is relevant that we view those renovations.

20 And that will be the scope of what 21 we're doing. The Court has asked us for efficiency,

22 that we divide into two groups, instead of one large

23 group, assuming that there's gonna be more than ten or

24 twelve that want to go.

Page 1104 This will not be a continuation of the

2 meeting: it will be a separate tour that's been

3 arranged for those of you who want to go.

4 So if you don't want to go, you don't

5 have to go. It won't -- won't matter. We'll divide

6 just alphabetically, I would think would be the

7 simplest thing --

8 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Point of 9 inquiry?

10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes, what is your 11 point of inquiry?

12 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: As to 13 the -- could I get miked, my mic -- as to the

14 procedure, you just mentioned Section -- I believe it's

15 Section 6-9A-2(5)(B) which is the exception that is

16 being cited by the Supreme Court. Now, that's being

cited by them, not by our Committee, correct? Are you

18 testifying --

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: No, we are relying on 19 20 that exception. They haven't raised the issue.

21 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: So it is

22 the ruling of the Chair that we are -- we are

23 inspecting a project or program? Could you just 24 describe to me what the project or program is under

Page 1105

1 that exception?

2 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. The renovations 3 that occurred during the period of the reduction in the 4 reserve fund of the Court.

MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Well, I believe the project or program under that Code is citing work product of an agency. I don't believe that renovations qualify as some sort of work product of an agency.

And it's funny that you brought up the
Open Meetings potential violation. As you know, any
member who knowingly goes over and now I heard that
we're going to separate into two groups, which I
believe is an attempt to - by the Court - to say that
we're not going to meet the quorum requirement of an
Open Meetings law violation.

If we would do so, it would be a
misdemeanor under the law. If you knowing violate an
Open Meetings law, that is a misdemeanor under law
which could be brought against every member of this
body.

22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, that's your 23 interpretation of the -- of the Act. We've conferred 24 with other counsel, at least three lawyers, about the Page 1107

1 statement saying that these exceptions apply, not that

2 the Committee did.

3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I did not discuss it 4 with the Supreme Court, and I did not see the release 5 that you're referring to.

5 that you're referring to.
 6 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Is it
 7 your opinion that by going over and visiting the
 8 Supreme Court that it's not part of our deliberative
 9 process in these impeachment proceedings?

10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: It's -- it's not part 11 -- no, there will be no decisions made, there will be

12 no ma -- motions taken up, there won't be any testimony13 taken. It's just a simple viewing that's been

14 requested by a member of your caucus, and that's what 15 we'll -- we --

16 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: But the 17 information received by going over and visiting the

18 Supreme Court would certainly play into the

19 intellectual capacity of this Committee to reach a20 decision.

21 Notes can be taken -- I don't believe 22 that you've restricted any video to this point --23 And we can certainly --

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, let me stop you

Page 1106

1 issue. They're all of the opinion - unanimously - that

2 this provision would exempt this from a -- a meeting.

3 However, it's voluntary.

4 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Who did 5 you confer with?

6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Any -- any member of 7 the Committee who does not want to go does not have to 8 go. That's -- and so if you -- if you're concerned 9 about that, I would suggest to you if you -- you not

10 go. And anyone else who is concerned about that --11 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Who did

12 you confer with in reaching that understanding?

13 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, we conferred 14 with the chief of staff here; we conferred with our own 15 counsel; and we conferred with the vice chair of our --

16 of our Committee, is also an attorney. So we have at 17 least --

18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Did you 19 discuss --

20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: -- at least four 21 attorneys that have reached the same opinion.

22 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Did you

23 discuss it with the Supreme Court? Because it's my24 understanding that the Supreme Court released a

1 there.

24

2 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: --

3 receive that information --

4 CHAIRMAN-SHOTT: They have said there 5 won't be any photography other than what they're

6 willing to work with our legislative photographer to 7 take any photos that the Committee wants.

B MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: So

9 members of the body are not allowed to take photos --

10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: That's correct.

11 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: -- of -- 12 of the furnishings and renovations paid for by the

13 taxpayers of West Virginia?

14 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: The -- the decision of 15 the Supreme Court is that they will take photos using 16 our legislative photographer, but they will not allow

17 individual photos taken by members.

MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: So this 19 is a decision by the Supreme Court, not a decision by 20 this Committee.

21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: That's correct.

22 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: So we

23 are allowing them to dictate our open meeting?

24 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Once again, this is a

1

7

- 1 voluntary visit arranged -- just like anybody else
- 2 could ask for a visit to the Supreme Court. We've
- 3 asked, as a group, for members who wish to visit to be
- 4 permitted to visit. It's a public building, but it's
- 5 subject to certain controls, as we've had testimony
- 6 that would indicate, for various reasons, and anyone
- 7 here could make an individual request, if you wish, to
- 8 visit that building, but we have made a request based
- 9 on a member's -- a request by a member of our Committee
- 10 that those who want to visit the Supreme Court and
- 11 those areas of the Supreme Court affected by those
- 12 projects will be permitted to do so this morning, if
- 13 we're finished with this discussion in time to do so.
- 14 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Well,
- 15 I'll wrap up here shortly. I understand time is of the
- 16 essence. But it hasn't been for the past few days.
- 17 Now, you mention this project or program. My reading
- 18 and interpretation of this law is that it is an ongoing
- 19 project or program, the renovations to the Supreme
- 20 Court, that is a completed project.
- 21 Or completed program, whatever
- 22 definition you want to use. Butt it is already done.
- 23 I don't understand how we are violating this provision
- 24 if those renovations have already been to completion.
 - Page 1110
 - CHAIRMAN SHOTT: And I do not read the
 - 2 word "completed" anywhere in that sentence. Do you see
 - 3 the word "completed" in there?
 - 4 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: It is
 - 5 not. I think it's easily interpreted that way.
 - 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, --
 - 7 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Neither
 - 8 is "project" defined; neither is "program" defined,
 - 9 based upon my reading of the Code.
 - 10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: If the legislature had
 - 11 wished to limit that to completed projects, it could
 - 12 have put the word "completed" in that sentence. It is
 - 13 not there.
 - 14 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: It could
 - 15 also have defined "project or program" which it did
 - 16 not.
 - 17 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: It could have. It
 - 18 didn't.
 - 19 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Okay.
- 20 So I would move, Mr. Chairman -- we don't have -- first
- 21 off, let me ask: We don't have an actual ruling by any
- 22 Court saying that this is not an Open Meetings
- 23 violation: correct?
- 24 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: That is correct.

- Page 1111 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: We only
- 2 have opinions by attorneys that you consulted.
- 3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Correct.
- 4 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: And we
- 5 have an opinion by the Supreme Court that this
- 6 exception applies.
 - CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I'll take your word
- 8 for it. I haven't seen that opinion.
- 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Okav.
- 10 Well, I would move that -- we know that we're going to
- 11 be here next week. I would move that we delay visiting
- 12 the Supreme Court because of the potential Open
- 13 Meetings violation and the crimes that could be
- 14 committed by doing so by members of this body; or in
- 15 the at -- or in the alternative, we choose which we
- 16 are allowed to do within our confines of the rules of
- 17 the Committee that we take the media with us to the
- 18 Supreme Court and put it on the Supreme Court to say
- 19 that they're not allowed to be there and not have the
- 20 decision be made by this Committee.
- 21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: And we'll -- we'll
- 22 entertain your motion. Is there a second to the
- 23 gentleman's motion?
- 24 There is a second.

- Page 1112
- e 1 Is there discussion? Is there any
 - 2 discussion?
 - 3 Gentlelady from the 52nd.
 - 4 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: 51st.
 - 5 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: 51st, pardon me.
 - 6 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Thank you,
 - 7 Mr. Chairman.
 - 8 I do -- I think there's a balancing
 - 9 here. I think that most of us want to proceed quickly,
 - 10 but we already have a truncated day here. I don't
 - 11 think there's any harm of delaying and double-checking.
 - 12 I'm not sure that it would -- and this is something we
 - 13 could probably fit in.
 - 14 They only are having court two days a
 - 15 week. I personally am available Monday, Tuesday and
 - 16 Wednesday next week and wouldn't mind coming in on a --
 - 17 on another day if it's consecutive if we can work that
 - 18 out. I don't -- so I support the gentleman's motion.
 - 19 I don't see any reason not to be careful about this and
 - 20 make sure we're not trampling on the First Amendment
 - 21 and the rights of the press to accompany us.
 - 22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. Del -- Delegate
 - 23 Summers?
 - 24 DELEGATE SUMMERS: Chairman, did I

Page 1113

1 misunderstand the motion? I thought the motion was not 2 -- I mean, I thought he made that suggestion, but then 3 he made a motion that we go upstairs with the press and 4 have them deny their entry. Did I -- could he restate 5 the motion?

6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: The motion is somewhat 7 contorted. The motion is either we -- we delay or we go armed with the press.

MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I made 10 it clear that my concern is that we'd be committing an Open Meetings violation. So I believe the motion was pretty clear in that we should delay it. We're gonna be here next week. We don't believe it's gonna take a 14 lot of time.

15 We could come in at 8:00 a.m., if 16 necessary, if we want to start at 9:00 a.m. here, just because I would like to have clarification that we're not committing an Open Meetings violation.

19 My motion was clear that we would --20 should delay it, first, or in the alternative, bring 21 the media with us, as I believe we have the discretion 22 to do so. So if the media is with us, it's clearly not

24 possibility that it is.

an Open Meetings violation, so then we're bypassing the

Page 1114

24

1 If we don't have the media with us and 2 we go over there and there's a guorum present - which there would be, even if we go in two separate groups then I believe it could be an Open Meetings violation. 5 So obviously, step one, delay until we 6 have clarification or an agreement is reached to bring 7 the media; and step two, if that delay does not take place, in the alternative take the media with us. 9 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: So two --10 two motions?

MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Well, 11 12 you could separate them out if you'd like, but it's 13 just delay, or in the alternative, take the motion 14 {sic} with us.

15 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Okay. MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: We could 16

-- we could separate them out if you'd like. 18 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: So just to clarify,

19 the delay is to establish in what form, whether or not 20 we're violating --

21 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'll 22 make a motion to delay.

23 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right.

24 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: And then 1 if that fails --

2 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: What are you asking us 3 to do if that mo -- I don't have a problem with that, 4 but if that motion passes, what are you asking us to do 5 that would avoid this same conversation coming up again 6 next week if we -- if our -- if our request is granted 7 and we schedule a second -- or another tour? 8 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Well, I 9 believe, Mr. Chairman, that the media would be able to play a role in trying to reach an agreement with the Supreme Court and this Committee in saying that, okay,

12 select individuals may be able to participate. 13 And I believe we have the power as a 14 Committee -- we're allowed to say, "Okay, media, you 15 sit in the back row, you sit here." In the committee process, we're allowed to dictate that.

17 This is part of the committee process. 18 This is a deliberative process in trying to reach an agreement. We're allowed to dictate to the media as well in the confines of that subject material. 21 In other words, we could say certain

22 media members are allowed to accompany us to the 23 Supreme Court. That's my understanding of the law.

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Okay, I think I

Page 1116

1 understand your point.

2 Delegate -- yes.

3 -- whose name escapes me at the moment.

4 Robinson -- Delegate Robinson. I

5 should never forget that one. Go ahead.

6 DELEGATE ROBINSON: How could you --7 Mr. Chairman, what -- could you just clarify the

section that you're speaking of about projects and --

9 projects and -- what are we able to look at without it

10 being a Committee meeting?

11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. The Code Section 12 is Section 6-9A-2, the definitional section, Subsection

13 (5) that defines the word "meeting," and the exception

that we believe would apply would be Subsection (B),

"any onsite inspection of any project or program."

16 DELEGATE ROBINSON: Mr. Chairman, is

17 this tour or visit as the result of my request last

18 Friday?

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: It is. 19

20 DELEGATE ROBINSON: Mr. Chairman, I 21 believe my request was to go look for framing in

certain items that were hung or not hung or removed

23 that weren't a part of renovation; it was just to look

24 for items.

1 So I don't know if we're actually 2 looking at a project. It's actually just, we're

3 looking for property that may have been converted to

4 personal property.

5 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: My understanding of 6 your request was that the office in which this alleged 7 photos or framing exists is one of those that were

8 affected by the renovations.

And your request was the trigger for
this, but there were other individuals who, when you
made your request, indicated other areas that they
would like to see. So we asked for more exposure than
just to pho -- the pictures.

14 DELEGATE ROBINSON: Okay, Mr. Chairman.

15 I'd also ask for the ayes and nays, please.

16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Okay. We have --

17 Yes, Delegate Foster.

18 DELEGATE FOSTER: On the motion, the

19 motion's just to delay the meeting, correct?

20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: That's correct.

21 DELEGATE FOSTER: And on this delay, I

22 would also ask that if we do delay -- if this motion is

23 successful, that we explore the fact of whether the

24 press should be allowed or not.

Page 1118

1 I think that is something that's a very 2 important question, given that it is basic public 3 dollars that has been expended.

4 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: It's my understanding 5 that the press did make a request, but it hasn't been

6 acted on yet. So perhaps a delay will give the Court

7 time to deal with that. So may not be a bad idea. And

8 if view of the hour, we -- it may be more -- less

9 convenient for us to go now than it was before. So

10 whatever the Committee wishes to do. I'm not gonna

11 take a strong position one way or the other.

12 DELEGATE FOSTER: All right. Thank

13 you.

14 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: This was basically an

15 accommodation.

16 Delegate Moore?

17 DELEGATE MOORE: Thank you,

18 Mr. Chairman.

19 I'd certainly support the gentleman's 20 motion, particularly in regards to what you just

21 touched on. I think that we want to accommodate,

22 certainly, members of the press, given how important

23 this issue is that we're looking at, and you know,

24 let's not rush this and get into a situation where the

Page 1119
1 First Amendment is not being fully recognized here, and

2 so I think what -- I think what's probably prudent is

3 to - as the gentleman's motion on the table right now -

4 is to delay and ensure that the media does have some

5 level of access and giving us more time to do so.

6 I think this perhaps might be a little

7 rushed at this point. Thank you.

8 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Further discussion?

9 Delegate Lane.

10 DELEGATE LANE: Well, I'm going to vote

11 no on the motion. I'm a little annoyed that we are

12 having a delay motion from members of our Committee who

13 have been trying to get this done before August the

14 14th, and has been complaining about all efforts to

15 delay and stall, and I think that we have heard our

16 chairman say that it is not a violation of the Open

17 Meetings law.

18 I've been looking forward to this site

19 visit for a couple days, and I think that today is a

20 good day to do it, and we can go ahead and get this

21 over with. Thank you.

22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Further discussion?

23 Delegate Fleischauer, followed by Delegate Fast and

24 then Delegate Overington.

Page 1120

MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Thank you,
 Mr. Chairman. I do agree with the lady from Kanawha

3 that it is -- we have been asking to proceed. But I

4 think there are a couple of things that militate

5 against this one decision. One is, it's gonna subject

6 the legislature to a lawsuit.

7 There will be the -- the Court -- the

8 media will file a lawsuit, and I don't -- I don't think

9 this is worthy of a lawsuit and worthy of the time of

10 our staff. I also think that this is analogous to

11 inspection that is done during a trial, when they go

12 see the scene of the crime, and this is -- this is like

13 a trial.

We are trying impeachment, so I think

15 that we have been open to the media and that we should

16 continue to do that. So because we're not certain -

17 we're on uncharted territory here - I think we should

18 just be careful.

19 Oh, and the third reason is, I think

20 it's kind of strange that we would allow our

21 legislative photographer, but we wouldn't allow the

22 media in. And also that we wouldn't allow the members

23 to take pictures.

24 So I support the gentleman's motion. I

Page 1121

1 realize there are arguments both ways, but I think it

2 makes sense to delay.

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Capito, 3 4 followed by Delegate Fast, and Delegate Overington.

5 DELEGATE CAPITO: Thank you,

6 Mr. Chairman. I, too, support the gentleman's motion

7 and would encourage other members of the Committee to

8 do so. We are here looking -- in the context of what

9 we're doing here, we're talking about transparency.

10 which is tremendously important in restoring the

11 confidence that the citizens of West Virginia not only

12 have in the judicial body, but the government of the

State, you know, which we are a part of.

14 So again, I'll support the gentleman's

15 motion and would encourage the body to do the same.

16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Fast?

17 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you,

18 Mr. Chairman. Given that this meeting has been

scheduled now for quite some time, I do have a

question. Are there any prohibitions for members of

the media or members of the public, for all that

22 matters, to contact the Supreme Court at any time and

23 request a tour of the facility?

24

Or does the Supreme Court have a

Page 1122

1 standing rule that those persons are not allowed in 2 ever?

3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I'll answer to the

4 best of my understanding. I think any member of the

5 public could request the opportunity, but I think

6 subject to security issues, as well as confidentiality

7 issues regarding the matters that are before the Court,

8 I think the Court would have the discretion to control

9 the number of people and that -- the degree of access.

10 But I think that -- I'm not aware of

11 any prohibition against someone requesting it and being

allowed access subject to, you know, reasonable

13 limitations. That's my understanding. I don't know if

14 -- I haven't researched that issue.

15 I will say this to the Committee: It

16 certainly wasn't our intention to -- to expose any

member of the Committee to any potential misdemeanor

18 offenses. It is our opinion we could do this subject

19 to that ex -- based on that exception, but if there's

20 -- if there is significant concern, I personally have

21 no problem with the delay and trying to resolve these

22 issues, and certainly have no problem with the -- with

23 the press resolving its issue with the Court in the

24 time frame that would be allowed between now and next

1 week.

7

2 So -- we were trying to expedite it.

3 We had some time left on our schedule today, but I

4 don't think it's a matter that's worthy of splitting

5 the Committee. We've managed to work really well

6 together so far, so --

However you wish to vote on this, do --

8 just vote the way your conscience directs you.

9 Delegate Overington.

10 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you,

11 Mr. Chairman. First of all, if this is delayed. I

12 would request that we not have a separate meeting

Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday apart from our

14 regularly-scheduled meetings just because some of us

15 have five-hour drives, ten hours in round trips,

16 whether it's a five or four or three hour drive or some

17 other time frame.

18 Do we know if the media is included,

19 there would be additional restrictions on where we

could go? I would think that would be a consideration.

21 It's nice if the media could attend, but I would also

22 wonder whether the media could make its own separate

23 request and -- apart from ours, that -- and I would be

24 a little concerned that if the media is present, it's a

great feature, but at the same time, the Court may put

2 additional restrictions on where we could go, which

3 means we may not be able to get the full scope of the

4 renovations and the changes that were made at the

5 Supreme Court.

6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I understand --

7 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you,

8 Mr. Chairman.

9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: -- your concern. I

10 can't speak for the Court, so I don't know whether

there would be any additional restrictions or not. But 12 that's something that could be worked out with the

13 media and the Court -- Court personnel.

14 Any other discussion? Delegate Miller?

15 DELEGATE MILLER: Thank you,

16 Mr. Chairman.

17 I would support the gentleman's

18 amendment. I find it ironic -- well, before I get to

19 that, in light of not being an attorney and the

20 concerns of Open Meeting -- potential Open Meeting

violations, I would advocate that we proceed with

22 caution on this.

23

Rather than make a mistake, we need to

24 be sure as to what we are doing. But as far as having

07/20/2018 Page 1125 Page 1127

- 1 people of West Virginia. Those offices do not belong 2 to the justices; they belong to the people of West
- 3 Virginia. When those justices leave, somebody else
- 4 ironic that back during some of the visits that we have
- 5 made in the off session in consideration of potential

1 access -- and I'm not necessarily advocating for the

3 just to allow the media to come with us. But I find it

2 media itself or -- I don't think this is an argument

- 6 legislation dealing with our corrections system that
- 7 ultimately passed, that members of the media were
- 8 actually allowed to go with us into our State's maximum
- 9 security prison and be on the front line with us.
- 10 They didn't take cameras or anything
- 11 like that, but they were able to go see for themselves.
- 12 They were able to accompany us into the maximum
- 13 security prison, but they're not able to go along into
- 14 the public's domain of public-owned facility here in
- 15 the Capitol of the State of West Virginia. So I find
- 16 that ironic.

3

- 17 But I would support the gentleman's
- 18 motion. Thank you.
- 19 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Further discussion?
- 20 Delegate Pushkin.
- 21 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you,
- 22 Mr. Chairman. While I agree with the sentiments from
- 23 the gentlelady from the 35th, said that she'd been
- 24 waiting to go on this little excursion for a while, so
- 2 to speed up these proceedings. 2 THE CLERK: Delegate Lovejoy. The -- they have been, you know, moving

11

24

- 4 quite slowly so far. However, do I believe that we're
- 5 gonna uncover any new and enlightening evidence from
- 6 taking a walk-through that has been arranged by the
- 7 Supreme Court? I find that -- I find that highly
- 8 unlikely, especially since the gentleman from the 36th
- 9 made this request on Friday because he was specifically
- 10 interested in knowing if some items that were framed,
- pictures that were framed and paid for by the citizens
- 12 and, you know, the taxpayers of West Virginia, if they
- 13 were still in the building.
- 14 Since then, there has been ample time
- 15 to either remove those items or put them back in the
- 16 office that we wanted to -- to look at. So while I
- 17 feel that yes, time is of the essence and I've -- and
- 18 I've wanted to get these proceedings moving more
- 19 quickly, I think what's more important is the First
- 20 Amendment of the United States, the Constitution of the
- 21 United States of America, and I -- I'm less concerned
- 22 about the Open Meetings part as I am that I -- I
- 23 personally will not go over there without the media.
- 24 That -- this building belongs to the

- 4 will take that office.
- 5 So the people deserve to see that
- 6 ornate floor; they deserve to see the couch, and the
- 7 media has a right to be there. So I'll support the
- 8 motion and hopefully we can work something out that
- 9 will allow the freedom of the press to enter the
- 10 building owned by the people of West Virginia.
- 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Further -- excuse me.
- 12 Further discussion? Further discussion? The yeas and
- 13 the navs have been demanded. Is the demand sustained?
- 14 Demand is sustained. The clerk will call the roll.
- 15 If you're in favor of the gentleman's
- 16 motion, you'll say "aye" or "yea"; if you're opposed
- "no" or "nay." 17
- 18 Please call the roll.
- 19 THE CLERK: Delegate Hanshaw.
- 20 Delegate Capito.
- 21 DELEGATE CAPITO: Yes.
- 22 THE CLERK: Delegate Queen.
- 23 DELEGATE QUEEN: Yes.
 - THE CLERK: Delegate Zatezalo.
- 1 have all of us. And I've also been saying that we need 1 DELEGATE ZATEZALO: Yes.
 - 3 Delegate Lane.
 - 4 DELEGATE LANE: No.
 - 5 THE CLERK: Delegate Canestraro.
 - 6 DELEGATE CANESTRARO: Yes.
 - 7 THE CLERK: Delegate Hollen.
 - 8 DELEGATE HOLLEN: Yea.
 - 9
 - THE CLERK: Delegate Sobonya. Delegate
 - 10 Deem. Delegate Pushkin.
 - DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Yes.
 - 12 THE CLERK: Delegate Foster.
 - 13 DELEGATE FOSTER: Yes.
 - 14 THE CLERK: Delegate Summers.
 - 15 DELEGATE SUMMERS: Yes.
 - 16 THE CLERK: Delegate Miller.
 - 17 DELEGATE MILLER: Yes.
 - 18 THE CLERK: Delegate Isner.
 - 19 DELEGATE ISNER: Yes.
 - 20 THE CLERK: Delegate Moore.
 - 21 DELEGATE MOORE: Yes.
 - 22 THE CLERK: Delegate Kessinger.
 - 23 Delegate Robinson.
 - DELEGATE ROBINSON: Yes. 24

	07/20/2018
Page 1129	Page 1131
1 THE CLERK: Delegate Fast.	1 or is there some limitation on the get the group of
2 DELEGATE FAST: No.	2 the press that comes along?
3 THE CLERK: Delegate Fluharty.	3 Because we could have
4 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes.	4 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Well,
5 THE CLERK: Delegate Overington.	5
6 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Yes.	6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: 40 people that say
7 THE CLERK: Delegate Byrd.	7 they
8 DELEGATE BYRD: Yes.	8 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: brush
9 THE CLERK: Delegate Harshbarger.	9 off my old j-school days, but my understanding is - and
10 DELEGATE HARSHBARGER: Yes.	10 I think we're gonna have a agreement from the back row
11 THE CLERK: Delegate Fleischauer.	11 - is that they could probably reach an agreement on who
12 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Yes.	12 could be representative of the media.
13 THE CLERK: Mr. Chairman.	13 I don't believe that I think we have
14 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes.	14 the discretion as a Committee, with that limitation, as
Are there any further motions to be	15 to how many and how they would proceed forward, just
16 made? All right.	16 like we do over how they would sit in our Committee
Well, let's talk about how we're gonna	17 meetings. We're allowed to say, "Sit in the back row,"
18 coordinate this so we don't go through this again next	18 we're allowed to say, "X amount of individuals are
19 week. We will reissue our Committee's request for some	19 allowed in."
20 time next week, understanding that we have a witness	20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Let me
21 set Thursday by concurrence of his counsel - that's	21 stop you a minute. I've been informed that the request
22 Mr. Canterbury - who will likely consume the whole day,	22 of the media was for a pool of one broadcaster and one
23 so I would we'll probably be looking at Friday,	23 journalist. And I'll just look for nods of the head.
24 whenever we can work this out excuse me with the	24 Yes.
Page 1130	Page 1132
1 Court.	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We	Okay. So if the gentlemen would like to make the motion that we condition our our visit on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is	Okay. So if the gentlemen would like to make the motion that we condition our our visit on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from print media and one person from
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some	Okay. So if the gentlemen would like to make the motion that we condition our our visit on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from print media and one person from MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well,	Okay. So if the gentlemen would like to make the motion that we condition our our visit on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from print media and one person from MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so move, Mr. Chairman.
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute.	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that	Okay. So if the gentlemen would like to make the motion that we condition our our visit on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from print media and one person from MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so move, Mr. Chairman. CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it.
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing	Okay. So if the gentlemen would like to make the motion that we condition our our visit on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from print media and one person from MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so move, Mr. Chairman. CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY:
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move.
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I 11 don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media,
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I 11 don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have 12 to have some understanding here as to whether it's	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that.
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I 11 don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have 12 to have some understanding here as to whether it's 13 gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful.	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I 11 don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have 12 to have some understanding here as to whether it's 13 gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. 14 Since it's it was the gentleman from	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume?
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I 11 don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have 12 to have some understanding here as to whether it's 13 gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. 14 Since it's it was the gentleman from 15 the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes.
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. Is it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was field the 3rd or the 4th.	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. ls it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from from from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was the 3rd or the 4th.	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now?
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. lis it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from since it's it was the gentleman from the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was the 3rd or the 4th. the 3rd, who made the request, what si your suggestion as to how we do that?	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now? 18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes,
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. Is it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from from the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was the 3rd or the 4th. Hinch ard, who made the request, what minutes are requested by the single properties. MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now? 18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes, 19 Mr. Chairman.
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. Is it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was the 3rd or the 4th. the 3rd, who made the request, what si your suggestion as to how we do that? MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now? 18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes, 19 Mr. Chairman. 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Thank you.
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. Is it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was the 3rd or the 4th. the 3rd, who made the request, what si your suggestion as to how we do that? MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm sorry. Could you repeat the question, Mr. Chairman?	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now? 18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes, 19 Mr. Chairman. 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Thank you. 21 Is there a second to that motion? There's a second and
1 Court. 2 Now, I don't know who speaks for the 3 press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We 4 certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is 5 gonna have to be made either individually or by some 6 representative of the request to acc the well, 7 let me let me back up a minute. 8 Is it the sentiment of this group that 9 we couple our request and condition it upon allowing 10 the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I 11 don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have 12 to have some understanding here as to whether it's 13 gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. 14 Since it's it was the gentleman from 15 the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was 16 the 3rd or the 4th. 17 the 3rd, who made the request, what 18 is your suggestion as to how we do that? 19 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm 20 sorry. Could you repeat the question, Mr. Chairman? 21 How we should move forward? 22 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: The question is	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now? 18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes, 19 Mr. Chairman. 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Thank you. 21 Is there a second to that motion? There's a second and 22 a second to the second. All right.
Now, I don't know who speaks for the press, if they speak with a with a single voice. We certainly will cooperate, but I think that request is gonna have to be made either individually or by some representative of the request to acc the well, let me let me back up a minute. Is it the sentiment of this group that we couple our request and condition it upon allowing the accompaniment of some members of the press? And I don't think that could be unlimited. I think we have to have some understanding here as to whether it's gonna be 25 more people or it's gonna be a handful. Since it's it was the gentleman from the from the 3rd I'm groping for whether it was the 3rd or the 4th. the 3rd, who made the request, what si your suggestion as to how we do that? MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I'm sorry. Could you repeat the question, Mr. Chairman?	1 Okay. So if the gentlemen would like 2 to make the motion that we condition our our visit 3 on a pool of the broadcast media of a one person from 4 print media and one person from 5 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I so 6 move, Mr. Chairman. 7 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: telecommunications 8 media. I hope that's the right way to to phrase it. 9 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: 10 Broadcast media. I so move. 11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: broadcast media, 12 let me say that. 13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That 14 means video I assume? 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes. 16 Is that is that the gentleman's motion 17 now? 18 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yes, 19 Mr. Chairman. 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Thank you. 21 Is there a second to that motion? There's a second and

Page 1135 Page 1133 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I 1 Yes, Delegate Queen. 2 DELEGATE QUEEN: So are we allowing two 2 believe -- I mean, I don't have a problem with that. I members of the media to go with us? 3 think that's -- that covers all the bases. That's 3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I think that --4 three different areas. 4 5 5 DELEGATE QUEEN: I support that. DELEGATE QUEEN: Sorry. 6 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Well, I 6 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: That --CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Okay. So that 7 7 believe there's one broadcast and one -- was it one print? Was that how we clarified it? Radio, TV and 8 clarifies the motion. And let me restate the 9 print. gentleman's motion and make sure I understand it. The 10 motion is that we -- we request, next Friday, a tour of 10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right, it's your motion. Why don't you take a minute and clarify it. 11 the facility, as a Committee, accompanied by three MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Okay. 12 12 members of the press: One broadcast, one print, one 13 So radio, TV and print. So three total. One from still photographer -- is that it? Radio? Radio in 14 each. addition to broadcast? Is that covered? 15 DELEGATE QUEEN: Any cameras? 15 Just a moment. I want to be sure we've MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I bel -got the motion right. 16 16 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: We're 17 ves, broadcast media would --17 18 DELEGATE QUEEN: Are we asking for one 18 gonna have three. video and one still? That's usually how a court --19 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Just --19 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: You're 20 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Yeah, I 20 21 the trained photographer. So now you're getting into 21 mean, their ability to what they do with it -- I mean, 22 an area --22 we don't want three with a bunch of cameras -- I 23 23 suppose the goal of the chair here is to make it clear DELEGATE QUEEN: Well, that's what I 24 think usually in a court proceeding, they do allow one 24 to the Court that we're not gonna bombard them with a Page 1134 Page 1136 video camera, one still camera and the willingness and 1 bunch of equipment. So if we limit it to --2 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: -- three --2 the -- and the mandatory action to share within the other media outlets. 3 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: -- one MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: If my 4 4 broadcast; that's one person going in with a video. We 5 motion was not clear on that, I would so amend the 5 limit it to, I guess, one photographer, which the motion to be reflective of your changes. 6 delegate brought up, and then one print media -- which DELEGATE QUEEN: And I'll ask one more 7 I assume would -- could include radio, they could 7 general question to the fact, will you allow -- never 8 record things. mind. I'll stay quiet. All right, thanks. 9 I suppose they could -- they absolutely 10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Do we 10 have the ability to record what's being said in there. 11 have clarity on the motion now? 11 So I think we've covered it. MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: I 12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yeah, I'm not in the 12 13 believe so. We have one media, one print, one 13 debate stage. I just want to be sure I understand your photograph -- still photography -- correct? Is that motion. Okay. how you wanted it? Radio --15 15 The motion has been made, and is the CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Gentlemen, gentlemen 16 second accepting the clarified motion? Okay. 16 17 -- Delegate Queen, do you yield for that question? 17 Now, Delegate Robinson, followed by 18 DELEGATE QUEEN: The cameras, I think, Delegate Pushkin for discussion, and Delegate Zatezalo. 18 DELEGATE ROBINSON: Mr. Chair, being as 19 are gonna be the issue. 20 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Sure. 20 we're 50 yards away, could we amend that to say "earliest possible?" I mean, we're 50 yards away. I'm DELEGATE QUEEN: If you do one still, 21 22 one video, and then that third member of the media will 22 sure they're watching. If they could say they're okay 23 just be able to walk, take notes and then write a story 23 with that, we could go there immediately like we 24 later. 24 planned.

07/20/2018 Page 1139

1 I mean, we're putting it off a week,

2 but if they would just --

3 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I think we've already

4 voted to delay -- delay the tour.

5 Delegate Pushkin.

6 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you,

7 Mr. Chairman.

8 Would the gentleman from the 3rd be

9 willing to amend his motion to state that there would

10 be one broadcast, one TV, one member of the media from

11 the radio and then that the print media also be able to

12 take a still -- be able to take still pictures?

13 It's not included. The radio wasn't

14 included. This would include radio but keep it at

15 three people, while the print media would be able to

16 take the still pictures.

17 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: But

18 we're keep -- we're keeping it to three people, so --

19 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Yeah, three people,

20 but I'm including radio.

21 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: They can

22 decide what -- who are we allowing to decide the three?

23 I assume we'd let them decide it and move on. So sure,

24 I mean, we can include radio in that just as long as

Page 1138

24

11

1 they're not coming in with a bunch of cameras.

2 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: No, it should be one

3 sti -- what I was getting at is one still photographer

4 would be --would be -- also be the representative of

5 print media.

6 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Okav.

7 No, I think that was already covered. How is that not

8 covered?

9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: To the gentleman from

10 the 3rd, does that modify your amendment, or do you

11 just want to let the press decide among themselves who

12 the three representatives would be?

13 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Let's --

14 let's let the press decide on that.

15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. So the

16 motion now is -- this is --

17 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: We're

18 limited to three - the press decides - one broadcast,

19 one -- I mean, I think -- feel like print is an

20 umbrella, could be -- include radio.

21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Let's just let the

22 press decide which three.

23 MINORITY VICE CHAIR FLUHARTY: Perfect.

24 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. Delegate

1 Zatezalo.

Page 1137

2 DELEGATE ZATEZALO: Thank you,

3 Mr. Chairman.

4 I just have one question for -- for the

5 Committee. Is there a -- some way to guarantee that

6 the criteria for Open Meetings is met by the media?

7 Does the media have a plan for distribution, you know,

8 to make sure that everybody who might want to see gets

9 the -- the information that -- that they're gonna

10 collect?

11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, if I understand

12 your question, we would not be going as an effort to be

13 an exception to the Open Meetings Act. This would be a

14 continuation of a meeting. We would have a quorum

15 present.

16 It would be open to representatives of

17 the public in the form of the media, but I don't -- I

18 don't think that it's gonna create a problem, but we'll

19 certainly seek further opinions on that as to whether

20 it has to be totally open to the public, in which case

21 that could create a problem, and we may have to figure

22 out a way to fit within the scope of the rule, the

23 exception, and that's probably doable.

We can do that. I think we can figure

Page 1140

1 that out. But we'll -- we'll focus on that in the --

2 in the time period between now and then.

We have a motion and a second -- excuse

4 me, and a second. Is there further discussion?

5 Delegate Overington, followed by Delegate Hollen.

6 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you,

7 Mr. Chair. Could the chair -- if you could explain

8 that in arranging the meeting that had been planned for

9 today, that we would have to be broken up into two or

10 more groups to accommodate the touring?

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, from a -- just

12 from a logistical standpoint, the more people we have

13 crowded into a particular person's office, it may be

14 difficult for those who are -- want us to look -- to

15 even see anything. So I suspect the Court will ask us,

16 just for logistical purposes, to somehow break down

17 into a manageable units that would allow, you know, a

18 meaningful tour. That would be my impression.

That would be sort of up to them. But

20 as long as we're all there and relatively close

21 together, I think we would still be considered part of

22 the meeting. Now, how the press divides up their

23 representatives would be up to them, if we're divided

24 into groups. That's my opinion, but I think the Court

Page 1141

4

1 will be making that call as to how they want to take us2 through the facility.

DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you.CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Hollen?

5 DELEGATE HOLLEN: Thank you,

6 Mr. Chairman.

7 Just a point of clarification. If the

8 Court does not get back with us on this request, then

9 the group tour is no longer on at that point?

10 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Well, it's no longer

11 on at the moment, and we'll see how the Court responds

12 to our request. If they have an alternative

13 suggestion, we'll certainly bring that up to our

14 members, but I think we ought to assume that they're --

15 it's a reasonable request and they'll figure out some

16 way to grant it.

17 That's -- they've been relatively

18 cooperative so far. I think they would work with us.

DELEGATE HOLLEN: All right, thank you.CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Further discussion?

21 Then the question before the Committee is the

22 gentleman's motion. All in favor will say "aye".

23 DELEGATES: Aye.

24 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Opposed, "no."

Page 1142

1 The ayes appear to have it; the ayes do

2 have it. The motion is granted.

3 One housekeeping issue before we

4 recess. We've been informed -- if you received the

5 memo -- the e-mail memo from the clerk, you know that

6 the normal entrance down here on this end of the

7 building is under renovation, so the clerk has arranged

8 parking next week on the front Boulevard, on Kanawha

9 Boulevard, and you can probably enter through the lower

10 entrance on the ground floor.

11 (Inaudible)

12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I assume that won't

13 affect the East Wing. You could still come through the

4 East Wing or through the security other -- but the

15 entrance that many of us that park on California Avenue

16 out here is gonna be under construction, so you won't

17 be able to come in that way.

18 So the -- the parking that's designated

19 for us - which is usually by the blue bag over the

20 meter - will all be along Kanawha, Kanawha Boulevard.

Other questions? Delegate Fleischauer.

22 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Thank you,

23 Mr. Chairman. I like the suggestion of the delegate

24 from Kanawha that we check with the Court and see if

1 they're available today. It is 20 minutes -- or till

2 lunchtime. We've all come all the way down here. We

3 have some really intense meetings next week.

I don't -- I'll go with the will of the

5 Committee, but it seemed to me that it would be

6 worthwhile since it's right before lunch to check with

7 them and see if they would go along -- they're - as

8 someone said - probably listening to this. I think it

9 would be good to get this done, but I'll go along with

10 the will of the Committee and I'll make a motion to

1 that effect if -- unless there's a huge hue and crv.

12 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Why don't we be at

13 ease for a moment and just have counsel call over

14 there, and then we can rescind our delay motion, and if

15 they're able to accommodate us, we can do so today.

MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER:

17 Mr. Chairman, I don't think we said delay until a date

18 certain. We are delaying at this point. We could

19 delay until later this afternoon if they would go along

20 with it.

16

21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I'll just have to

22 check the terms of the motion.

23 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: I'd

24 appreciate that, Mr. Chairman.

Page 1144

1 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. I think it

2 was -- the clerk tells me it was a motion to delay

3 until next week, so the proper motion would be to

4 rescind that motion and -- but let's just check first

5 before we --

6 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Thank you,

7 Mr. Chairman, I appreciate that.

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Members, please stand

9 at ease for a minute while we make the Inquiry.

10 (The Committee stood at ease.)

11 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: They said they need to

12 get the Court back together to -- please take your

13 seats.

14 To the members of the Committee, we did

15 communicate to the Court. We were informed that

16 because of the change and the nature of the so-called

17 tour, that they needed to gather their -- the Court

18 back together again to discuss it, and so it's not

19 gonna happen this afternoon.

20 I also understand that maybe the media

21 might need a little more time to get their

22 representatives together. So we will communicate that

23 request. It was confirmed by the Committee to the

24 Court for next Friday, and as soon as we get a

Page 1145

1 response, we'll share it with everyone, and hopefully

2 we'll be able to go forward at that time.

And we'll just have to deal with the

4 testimony to conform to the time that we're given by

5 the Court. There's some concern that Mr. Canterbury's

6 testimony may take more than a day. Who knows?

I certainly hope not. But that's a

8 possibility. But we'll -- we'll make sure that if they

9 give us a time, we will -- we'll be there.

10 Is there any further business to come

11 before our meeting before we recess?

Delegate Byrd, do you have a question

13 or an inquiry?

7

14

DELEGATE BYRD: Just an inquiry,

15 Mr. Chairman.

16 Given this possible tour next week and

17 Canterbury's -- does the Chair have any idea of like

18 maybe a proposed schedule? I know we'll have to

9 probably fluctuate given the response from the Court,

20 but any proposals?

21 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I can tell you what

22 we'll be looking at to try to work into the schedule.

23 We'll have a -- we're gonna -- there's been a request

24 by one of our managers for a subpoena for Justice

Page 1146

- 1 Loughry's wife to testify about certain factual issues.
- 2 We will issue that subpoena.
- 3 There have been -- there's been an
- 4 inquiry about the so-called missing computer. We're
- 5 gonna try to find out who would be able to confirm or
- 6 -- well, confirm one way or the other whether those
- 7 facts are correct.
- 8 We've got some additional -- we
- 9 gathered just this week some additional information
- 10 regarding the renovation expenses. Staff will be
- 11 organizing that, determining how we're gonna present --
- 12 what, if any, of that we're going to present and by
- 13 whom.
- 14 My understanding is that the Auditor's
- 15 Office has some information regarding the issue that
- 16 was raised about the employment of Mr. Pritt as a
- 17 consultant, and we'll be determining whether that
- 18 information is -- is going to be -- is relevant and
- 19 needs to be presented.
- 20 Our -- some of our managers are doing
- 21 some additional work on the issue of the Tucker County
- 22 Magistrate Court case, and also the Greenbrier book
- 23 signing trips with State vehicles. So all of those
- 24 things, to the extent we develop documents or testimony

- Page 1147

 1 or in some cases, perhaps affidavits, we'll be blending
- 2 into next week's schedule.

3 So hopefully we'll have a full schedule

4 and no holes in it. But it all depends on how that

comes together.

6 DELEGATE BYRD: Thank you,

7 Mr. Chairman.

8 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Yes, sir?

9 Delegate Pushkins -- Pushkin.

DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Thank you,

11 Mr. Chairman.

10

12 Just a point of inquiry. In light of

13 the Affidavit that we received at the beginning of the

14 -- of the hearing today from Ms. Ellis, specifically

15 Points 11 through 16 that I would say validates the --

16 some of the other evidence that has not yet been

17 entered in - specifically e-mails from Justice Loughry

18 concerning some of the spending in his office, invoices

19 that he had signed and a sketch of his floor - I was

20 gonna ask if -- if this Affidavit validates those

21 items, and they could be entered in as evidence as

22 well.

23 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: The plan was -- and I

24 think I introduced this -- I mentioned this earlier,

1 but maybe I wasn't very clear.

We're gonna ask Ms. Ellis to supplement

3 her Affidavit by verifying or authenticating copies of

4 the sketch and the e-mails that she either authored or

5 received, and we'll do that by a supplemental

6 Affidavit. We were in the process of trying to get the

7 basic facts in an Affidavit. There were some time

8 constraints on doing that.

9 But we will -- and some of that

10 evidence could probably be authenticated by

11 Mr. Canterbury. I think he can identify the sketch.

12 There'll be some -- I'm sure there's some e-mails that

13 he was copied on or authored that went to Ms. Ellis.

14 But we'll -- we'll -- we're gonna try to get that

15 information back in time to be submitted as -- as

16 exhibits, as a supplement to her Affidavit.

17 But in all likelihood, some of that can 18 be authenticated by Mr. Canterbury.

19 DELEGATE PUSHKIN: Okay, thank you.

CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Delegate Overington,

21 question?

20

24

22 DELEGATE OVERINGTON: Thank you,

23 Mr. Chairman.

Do you anticipate that we will be

Page 1149 Page 1151 MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Thank you, 1 meeting Saturday, and also the following week, Thursday 2 and Friday? And -- for long-term planning sake? 2 Mr. Chairman. I just wanted to clarify about that week CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I -- first of all, I 3 of the 30th, Thursday, Friday and Saturday. Is that up 3 4 in the air? 4 would plan on Saturday, because it looks like if all 5 5 this comes together, we could very well spill over into CHAIRMAN SHOTT: It is. 6 6 Saturday. MINORITY CHAIR FLEISCHAUER: Okay, But as we had plans to go into Saturday 7 thanks. 7 8 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Further questions? If 8 of this week and we had some issues with availability 9 not, the chair recognizes our acting vice chair, of witnesses and other issues that are abundantly clear delegate -- Delegate Capito. 10 at the moment. So I can't be sure about that. 11 The following week, we have some real 11 DELEGATE CAPITO: Thank you, 12 issues with staffing, staff vacations. So as soon as 12 Mr. Chairman. I move that the Committee stand in recess we determine whether we would be able to cover the until 9:00 a.m. on July 26th, which is a Thursday, next 14 following week with staff, I'll let everybody know. 14 Thursday. 15 But at this point, that may be a problem, the week of 15 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: You've heard the 16 the 30th. gentleman's motion. All in favor will say "aye". 16 17 17 Delegate Fast. DELEGATES: Aye. 18 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you. Ms. Ellis, 18 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: Opposed "no." 19 I understand she submitted this Affidavit, and I just 19 The ayes have it. We are in recess until Thursday, next 20 want to clarify. Was that in lieu of testimony or just to get us along right now until such time as she can 21 Thursday, at 9:00 a.m. come and appear before this Committee? 22 23 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: At the --23 ---oOo---24 24 DELEGATE FAST: Because I --Page 1150 Page 1152 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: At the moment, it's in STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, COUNTY OF JACKSON, to wit: 2 lieu of testimony. DELEGATE FAST: Okay. I -- I would 3 I, Teresa Evans, Registered Merit 3 4 Reporter and a Notary Public within and for the certainly like her to appear before this Committee for 5 County and State aforesaid, duly commissioned and 5 questions. I think that --6 qualified, do hereby certify that the foregoing 6 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: We'll take that up -proceedings were duly transcribed by me from an 7 DELEGATE FAST: -- that's very 8 audio recording to the best of my skill and 8 important. 9 ability. 9 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: I will say that both 10 I do further certify that the said 10 the JIC representatives and indirectly from the U.S. proceedings were correctly taken by me in Attorney's office, they've asked us not to bring her, 12 shorthand notes, and that the same were accurately so -- for what it's worth. But the Committee can do written out in full and reduced to typewriting by whatever the Committee wishes to do about that. 13 14 means of computer-aided transcription. 14 DELEGATE FAST: I'm specifically Given under my hand this 8th day of 15 15 requesting a subpoena for her appearance. 16 August, 2018. 16 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: All right. 17 17 DELEGATE FAST: Thank you. 18 18 CHAIRMAN SHOTT: We'll take that up TERESA EVANS, RMR, CRR with our managers. We're gonna have -- and that brings 19 up -- I'm glad you raised that. I'd like to meet with 20 the managers shortly after we recess today so we can 21 22 discuss the plans for next week and what still needs to 22 23 be gathered. 23 24 Delegate Fleischauer. 24

8th 1152:15

30th 1019:13 1149:16

\$				
\$100,000 1045:13 1046:12				
\$134,000,000 1090:16 1091:20				
\$135,000 1087:18				
\$139,000,000 1072:18 1078:22 1082:16				
\$139,759,670 1033:5				
\$150,000 1052:13				
\$180,000,000 1078:23				
\$2,000,000 1033:8,10 1083:1,3,18				
\$20,000,000 1051:7				
\$200,000 1044:9 1087:16				
\$400,000 1087:17 1103:18				
\$7,000,000 1043:2				
\$876,000 1036:7,10				
\$876,156 1035:22 1036:15				
(
(5) 1103:9 1116:13				
(B) 1116:14				
-				
ooo 1151:23 would 1138:4				
			1	
1 1021:2,15 1072:19				
1.1 1033:6 1072:20				

1.2 1041:20

1.6 1085:21

1.4 1046:15 1088:2,3, 20 1097:17,20

1.7 1052:3

10 1022:23

100 1099:11
10:00 1030:19
10:30 1080:21
11 1023:4 1147:15
12 1023:7 1030:9
13 1023:13 1050:9

14 1023:19 141 1082:20 1459 1040:7 14th 1119:14 15 1024:3 15,000 1064:1 1500 1039:8

158 1039:4 1086:10 **16** 1021:12 1024:8 1083:22 1147:15 **1600** 1051:23 **17** 1024:11 1070:6

1757 1085:18 1086:6,

1759 1085:18 1086:7,

18 1021:3 1024:17

19 1025:6 1027:17 1028:19 1029:3 1030:14

1917 1056:4 1080:2,4, 13,15 1081:10 **1928** 1070:17 **1960s** 1080:7

1974 1038:3 1056:8

2 1021:4

2

1083:22

12

16

1027:11 **1816** 1055:6

10,000 1064:1 1071:7

2.6 1099:1
20 1025:11 1061:21 1063:20 1064:17 1143:1
2008 1035:19 1064:21 1069:9
2012 1051:24
2013 1021:12 1022:2 1064:22 1067:9
2014 1064:21
2015 1021:15
2016 1041:19
2017 1026:9 1027:11, 17 1028:19 1029:3 1041:10,22 1042:5 1043:1 1052:17 1061:14 1067:13,17, 22,24 1087:13 1090:16 1092:16
2018 1087:14 1152:16
2019 1032:6 1033:4
21 1025:16
22 1026:2
23 1026:7
24 1026:21
244 1087:22
245 1087:23 1088:2
25 1027:10 1130:13
25,000 1063:22
26 1027:16
26th 1151:13
27 1028:18,19 1061:22 1062:2,4,5
279 1039:1
280 1051:4
29 1103:17
3
3 1021:9
3.7 1036:8
300 1039:9

1151:3	8th 1152:15
35th 1125:23	9
36 1029:9	9 1022:18
36th 1126:8	9.7 1083:23
3rd 1130:15,16,17	
1137:8 1138:10	90 1040:4,6 1077:16
4	9:00 1113:16 1151:13, 21
4 1026:9	Α
40 1131:6	a m 1112:15 16
47 1039:3	a.m. 1113:15,16 1151:13,21
4th 1130:16	ability 1045:2 1057:16 1095:17
5	1096:10 1098:9
	1135:21 1136:10 1152:9
50 1136:20,21	absent 1046:20
50.6 1040:11	absolutely 1063:5
51st 1112:4,5	1065:19 1072:24
52nd 1112:3	1092:10 1136:9
55 1021:20 1038:22 1063:22 1076:23	abundantly 1046:24 1149:9
6	acc 1130:6
	accepting 1136:16
6 1021:24	access 1089:2,3,6 1119:5 1122:9,12
6-9A-2 1103:8	1125:1
1116:12	accommodate
6-9A-2(5)(B) 1104:15	1118:21 1140:10 1143:15
663 1040:10	accommodation
7	1118:15
7 1022:3 1048:1	accompanied 1130:24 1135:11
70s 1080:11	accompaniment
74 1039:2	1130:10
	accompany 1112:21 1115:22 1125:12
8	accomplish 1087:5
8 1022:13	accord 1019:15
8.5 1041:22 1084:7	account 1058:11
1085:10	1083:21 1085:17
8:00 1113:15	1087:11 1088:18,22, 23 1089:4,14

accountability

1035:13 1041:13 1045:17 1047:12 1057:18 1097:2 1098:9

accounting 1039:15

accounts 1084:6,22 1085:17 1086:5,21 1089:2

accumulated 1084:11

accumulating 1087:4

accurate 1046:6

accurately 1152:12

act 1034:16,18 1057:17 1103:10 1105:23 1139:13

acted 1118:6

acting 1151:9

action 1034:11 1053:21 1134:2

actions 1044:5

acts 1058:4

actual 1084:23 1090:16 1110:21

ad 1043:13.16 1098:2

add 1042:21

added 1049:24

addition 1039:5 1041:5 1099:13 1135:14

additional 1123:19 1124:2,11 1146:8,9, 21

address 1033:15

addressed 1059:2

adequate 1048:9,16 1049:12

adequately 1048:20

administer 1031:1

administered 1048:6

administering

1048:12

administration

1060:5 1095:10,18,24

administrative 1021:7,11,14 1027:18,23 1028:23 1029:1,2 1032:3 1034:12 1039:14 1042:4,14 1045:3

1054:14 1061:16,21, 24 1062:11 1068:2 1074:3 1094:12

administrator 1067:17 1068:8

adopt 1100:21

adults 1049:21

advanced 1038:6

advocate 1124:21

advocating 1125:1

affect 1142:13

affected 1103:4 1109:11 1117:8

affection 1060:8

affects 1056:13.14

affidavit 1019:11,17 1020:9,13,19,21,22 1029:8,13,18 1147:13,20 1148:3,6, 7.16 1149:19

affidavits 1147:1

aforesaid 1152:5

afraid 1079:15

afternoon 1143:19 1144:19

age 1021:3

agencies 1089:22 1095:20

agency 1092:3 1105:7,9

agree 1066:17 1100:10 1120:2 1125:22

agreed 1103:1

agreement 1035:8 1114:6 1115:10,19 1131:10,11 **ahead** 1019:17 1030:6 1081:1 1093:14 1116:5 1119:20

Aid 1089:10

air 1151:4

alert 1080:17

Alexander 1060:4

alleged 1117:6

Allen 1031:17

allowed 1045:12 1046:21 1058:7 1072:22 1108:9 1111:16,19 1115:14, 16,19,22 1117:24 1122:1,12,24 1125:8 1131:17,18,19

allowing 1024:13 1051:13 1059:19 1108:23 1130:9 1133:2 1137:22

alluded 1090:6

alphabetically 1104:6

alternative 1111:15 1113:20 1114:8,13 1141:12

amend 1134:5 1136:20 1137:9

amended 1038:4

amendment 1032:14 1053:2,4,11 1056:6,7 1057:12 1058:19 1068:16 1073:16 1075:3 1078:5 1079:2 1080:1,4,7,13 1081:10 1112:20 1119:1 1124:18 1126:20 1138:10

America 1126:21

amount 1033:4,9 1050:14 1083:24 1084:10 1087:3 1131:18

amounts 1035:3 1042:20,21 1046:3

ample 1126:14

analogous 1120:10

analysis 1090:15

and/or 1085:20

announced 1091:3

annoyed 1119:11

annual 1048:18

answering 1060:11 1072:9

answers 1082:7

anticipate 1148:24

antique 1022:11

anybody's 1086:10

apologize 1086:7

Apparently 1080:18

appeals 1021:5,10 1023:1 1032:3 1039:20

appearance 1150:15

appeared 1030:2

appears 1061:5

applaud 1060:15

apples 1077:11,12

application 1077:22

applies 1074:11 1096:18 1111:6

apply 1096:11 1107:1 1116:14

appointed 1045:5

appointment

1043:11 1044:10 1080:21

appoints 1044:13

appreciation 1087:1

approval 1045:22

approved 1038:10 1065:24 1094:9 1096:13

approximately

1020:8 1033:6 1040:3 1041:20,22 1045:13 1077:16

area 1043:18 1069:22

1133:22

areas 1070:1 1071:1 1103:3 1109:11 1117:11 1135:4

argument 1125:2

arguments 1121:1

armed 1113:8

arranged 1104:3 1109:1 1126:6 1142:7

arranging 1140:8

arrived 1019:17 1027:21

arriving 1019:8

Article 1048:1

ascertain 1019:5

aspect 1076:12

assistant 1026:23

assistants 1039:12 1040:17

Associates 1022:7,

assume 1083:24 1085:16 1132:14 1136:7 1137:23

1141:14 1142:12 **assuming** 1103:23

assurances 1065:16

assure 1059:24

attempt 1051:8 1054:23 1105:14

attend 1123:21

attorney 1019:12 1106:16 1124:19

Attorney's 1150:11

attorneys 1106:21 1111:2

audio 1152:8

auditor 1091:4

Auditor's 1146:14

August 1020:8 1119:13 1152:16

authenticate 1029:13,18 authenticated 1148:10.18

authenticating 1148:3

authored 1148:4,13

authority 1055:10 1057:13

availability 1149:8

Avenue 1022:17 1142:15

average 1065:12

avoid 1046:21 1115:5

aware 1024:18 1032:17 1041:11 1076:13 1080:23 1086:23 1093:23 1094:20 1122:10

awareness 1047:23

aye 1127:16 1141:22, 23 1151:16,17

ayes 1117:15 1142:1 1151:19

В

back 1066:3 1069:5 1072:11 1076:1 1084:12 1085:1 1088:22 1089:14 1095:21 1096:12 1098:8 1115:15 1125:4 1126:15 1130:7 1131:10,17 1141:8 1144:12,18 1148:15

bad 1118:7

bag 1142:19

balance 1041:19

balances 1053:19 1085:20

balancing 1112:8

ballooned 1036:7

based 1026:24 1053:7 1109:8 1110:9 1122:19

bases 1135:3

basic 1118:2 1148:7

basically 1091:20 1118:14

basis 1045:21

Bates 1090:4,5,9,22 1091:16 1092:12,19, 23 1093:3

bathroom 1024:6

began 1021:9 1022:1, 24 1023:12 1028:2 1035:19 1036:20 1042:5,6 1054:3 1069:24

begin 1019:10 1069:3,9

beginning 1023:2 1043:5 1069:6 1147:13

begs 1061:2

begun 1042:22

behalf 1103:2

bel 1133:16

belief 1027:1

believed 1027:5

belong 1127:1,2

belongs 1126:24

benefit 1058:24

bids 1035:21

big 1053:12 1064:14 1072:10

bigger 1074:1

bill 1054:11,17,20,22 1083:14 1084:21 1095:16

bit 1030:16 1080:20

blending 1147:1

blue 1142:19

Board 1039:21,23 1081:7

body 1032:20 1046:7 1055:20 1061:4 1065:9 1074:16 1086:22 1092:9 1105:21 1108:9 1111:14 1121:12,15

body's 1057:11 1102:17

Boggs 1075:17,18 1076:1 1079:4,23 1080:5,10 1081:4,12, 19 1082:1 1089:12, 13,20

bombard 1135:24

book 1146:22

books 1091:19,21,22, 23 1092:1.2

bothers 1068:17

Boulevard 1142:8,9, 20

bounce 1073:13 1074:24 1095:13

bounds 1103:6

branch 1032:4,21,24 1034:13 1042:23 1047:3,11 1048:9 1050:10,14 1051:6 1055:3 1057:13,19 1058:20 1059:5,17,20 1060:1 1073:1,17,20 1078:1,3 1081:7 1097:3 1100:11

branches 1048:13 1049:10 1054:5 1056:17 1057:6 1059:22 1068:24 1074:14 1100:18

Braxton 1078:14

break 1140:16

breakdown 1090:15

briefly 1053:1

bring 1113:20 1114:6 1141:13 1150:11

brings 1150:19

broadcast 1132:3,10, 11 1133:7,17 1135:12,14 1136:4 1137:10 1138:18

broadcaster 1131:22

broke 1034:22

broken 1045:15 1140:9

brought 1052:18 1061:17 1105:10,20 1136:6

brush 1131:8

budget 1030:13,14 1032:5,8,12 1033:4,7, 8 1038:2,19,20,21 1040:1,3,20 1047:20 1049:13 1050:1,15,23 1053:5 1056:5 1059:21 1072:14,21 1076:4,5,14,22 1077:4 1078:7,20 1079:18 1080:1,6,13, 15 1081:8,16,18 1082:16,20 1083:14 1084:21,24 1094:8,16 1099:6

budgetary 1041:6,13 1055:10

budgeting 1045:16

budgets 1055:5 1076:16,18 1077:5

build 1034:18

building 1037:21 1042:22 1070:23 1074:15 1109:4,8 1126:13,24 1127:10 1142:7

bunch 1135:22 1136:1 1138:1

business 1027:3 1091:20 1145:10

busy 1071:5

Butt 1109:22

bypassing 1113:23

Byrd 1019:8 1129:7,8 1145:12,14 1147:6

C

California 1142:15

call 1019:3 1024:19, 24 1025:7 1026:8 1127:14,18 1141:1 1143:13

called 1025:20 1026:10 1035:6 1055:15 1086:12,16 1089:3

camera 1134:1

cameras 1125:10 1133:15 1134:18 1135:22 1138:1

campus 1073:23

Canestraro 1128:5,6

Canterbury 1026:10, 14,17 1027:7 1129:22 1148:11,18

Canterbury's 1145:5.17

capacity 1064:24 1107:19

Capito 1121:3,5 1127:20,21 1151:10, 11

Capitol 1035:21 1036:13 1037:17 1038:18 1069:11 1070:16 1125:15

captured 1085:24

cards 1064:2

care 1037:21 1051:14 1070:23 1071:17

careful 1112:19 1120:18

carefully 1053:13

carry 1083:24

carryover 1041:19, 23 1083:22

case 1040:14 1079:16 1139:20 1146:22

cases 1043:17 1044:12,15 1049:5 1147:1

cash 1084:3 1085:5

Cass 1022:12,22 1025:2,8 1071:12

category 1101:3

caucus 1107:14

caught 1056:11

causing 1049:5

caution 1124:22

07/20/2018 Index: cell..completion

cell 1026:11

center 1043:4 1046:11 1061:17 1062:7

Centers 1094:7 1098:5

certify 1152:6,10

chair 1030:11,24 1031:4,14,21 1060:13,20 1062:24 1063:6 1065:7 1066:7.10 1071:19 1073:12.15 1074:21 1075:12,16,18,24 1079:4,23 1080:5,10 1081:4,12,19 1082:1, 5,10 1083:6 1086:9 1088:5,9 1089:11 1090:3,5,9,22 1091:16 1092:12,19, 23 1093:3,4,5,9,13 1095:4,8 1100:6 1102:12 1104:8,12, 21,22 1105:5 1106:4, 11,15,18,22 1107:6, 16 1108:2,8,11,18,22 1109:14 1110:4,7,14, 19 1111:1,4,9 1112:4, 6 1113:9 1114:9,11, 15,16,21,24 1115:8 1120:1 1129:4.12 1130:19 1131:4,8 1132:5,9,13,18 1133:6,12,16,20 1134:4,12 1135:1,6, 17,20,23 1136:3,19 1137:17,21 1138:6, 13,17,23 1140:7 1142:22 1143:16,23 1144:6 1145:17 1151:1,6,9

chairman 1019:2,7 1020:1,19 1029:7 1060:19,21 1066:9,13 1073:6 1075:19 1080:17 1082:13 1083:4 1087:21 1093:8 1096:8 1097:9,14 1102:11,19 1104:10,19 1105:2,22 1106:6,13,20 1107:3, 10,24 1108:10,14,21, 24 1110:1,6,10,17,20, 24 1111:3,7,21 1112:5,7,22,24 1113:6 1114:18,23 1115:2,9,24 1116:7, 11,16,19,20 1117:5, 14,16,20 1118:4,14, 18 1119:8.16.22 1120:2 1121:3,6,16, 18 1122:3 1123:11 1124:6,8,9,16 1125:19,22 1127:11 1129:13,14 1130:20, 22 1131:6,20 1132:6, 7,11,15,19,20 1133:4, 10 1134:10,16,20 1135:7,19 1136:2,12 1137:3,7 1138:9,15, 21,24 1139:3,11 1140:11 1141:4,6,10, 20,24 1142:12,23 1143:12,17,21,24 1144:1,7,8,11 1145:15,21 1147:7,8, 11,23 1148:20,23 1149:3,23 1150:1,6,9, 16,18 1151:2,5,8,12, 15,18

CHAIRMAN-SHOTT

1108:4

challenges 1041:2, 11 1047:13

chambers 1037:7

change 1042:21 1044:1,3,22 1045:3, 12 1046:20 1058:20 1064:16 1066:3 1068:8 1070:7 1094:14 1144:16

changed 1037:11

Changing 1043:21

charges 1030:2

charging 1085:22 1087:7

Charleston 1038:17, 23

check 1078:2 1142:24 1143:6,22 1144:4

checks 1053:19

chief 1030:16,20,23 1031:6,10,17,24 1032:2 1039:19 1041:10 1044:12,23, 24 1048:19 1049:7 1060:14,22 1061:12 1063:4,8 1064:12,16 1065:1,18 1066:13,15 1067:8,10,12,14,18, 23 1068:4,21 1069:12 1071:2,23 1073:14 1074:5 1075:1,14,19, 22 1076:6 1079:9,10, 11 1080:3,8,12 1081:9,17,21,23 1082:3,8,17,22 1083:8,15 1084:5,13, 18 1085:2,7 1086:2, 11 1087:12 1088:1,7, 10.12.16 1089:16 1090:8,20,24 1092:6, 17,22 1093:1,12,21 1095:2 1096:2,20 1097:19 1098:18,22 1099:24 1100:4 1101:10 1102:8,13 1106:14

child 1086:18

children 1043:20

choose 1111:15

circuit 1039:3,12 1040:13 1052:19 1077:7 1093:17 1094:5,6

circuits 1044:14

circumstance 1060:7

circumstances 1057:11 1077:12

cited 1104:16,17

citing 1105:7

citizen 1034:22

citizens 1038:4 1050:2 1052:21 1056:1 1057:9 1059:24 1100:23

1121:11 1126:11

civil 1034:3 1049:5 1060:6

claims 1065:12

clarification 1043:15 1113:17 1114:6 1141:7

clarified 1133:8 1136:16

clarifies 1135:8

clarify 1114:18 1116:7 1133:11 1149:20 1151:2

clarity 1134:11

classes 1086:15

clause 1054:18

clear 1029:22 1035:16 1042:14 1047:1 1048:8,12 1049:8 1061:19 1113:10,12,19 1134:5 1135:23 1148:1 1149:9

clerk 1019:4,6 1031:1,8,12 1127:14, 19,22,24 1128:2,5,7, 9,12,14,16,18,20,22 1129:1,3,5,7,9,11,13 1142:5,7 1144:2

clerk's 1037:3 1039:19 1071:3,5

clerks 1039:13 1040:15,16

close 1140:20

closely 1043:9

clouds 1034:9

co-equal 1056:17 1068:24

Code 1103:7 1105:6 1110:9 1116:11

coerce 1028:17

coincided 1103:16

collect 1139:10

collected 1089:8

comment 1073:7 1096:10

comments 1066:18 1079:15 1081:23 1094:15 1099:19 1100:1 1102:21

commercial 1049:5

Commission

1020:11,13 1039:22

1073:21

commissioned 1152:5

commissions

commitment 1042:1 1092:13

committed 1094:13, 24 1111:14

committee 1019:3 1020:7,18 1029:24 1080:18 1092:14 1103:2 1104:17 1106:7,16 1107:2,19 1108:7,20 1109:9 1111:17,20 1115:11, 14,15,17 1116:10 1118:10 1119:12 1121:7 1122:15,17 1123:5 1131:14,16 1135:11 1139:5 1141:21 1143:5,10 1144:10,14,23 1149:22 1150:4.12.13 1151:12

Committee's

committing 1113:10, 18

communicate 1144:15.22

communication 1062:20

communications 1073:6

compared 1084:24

Compensation 1039:20

complaining

complete 1035:8 1061:15 1080:22

completed 1023:15 1070:17 1072:3 1109:20,21 1110:2,3, 11,12

completion 1036:18 1067:7 1109:24

07/20/2018 Index: complexities..courts

complexities 1047:19

computer 1077:21 1146:4

computer-aided 1152:14

concern 1065:20 1100:11 1113:10 1122:20 1124:9 1145:5

concerned 1058:14 1106:8,10 1123:24 1126:21

concerns 1032:10 1100:14 1103:15 1124:20

conclude 1029:19

concludes 1102:19

conclusion 1102:23

concurrence 1129:21

condition 1130:9,23 1132:2

confer 1106:5,12

conference 1029:21 1037:6,10 1072:4,5 1079:10

conferred 1105:23 1106:13,14,15

confidence 1049:10 1121:11

confidentiality 1122:6

confines 1111:16 1115:20

confirm 1146:5.6

confirmed 1029:10 1144:23

conform 1145:4

Congress 1081:15

conscience 1123:8

consecutive 1112:17

consideration

1029:24 1033:2 1123:20 1125:5 considered 1140:21

consistent 1029:12 1078:19

constantly 1078:9

Constitution 1038:5, 9 1042:11 1048:2 1056:18 1126:20

Constitutional

1032:14 1048:11,13 1050:6 1052:5 1053:2,4,13,14 1057:12 1058:19 1068:16 1073:16 1075:3 1078:4 1079:2

Constitutionally 1049:1

constitutions 1055:22

constraints 1148:8

construction

1021:24 1023:3,7,12 1142:16

consultant 1146:17

consultation/ facilitation 1021:21

consulted 1111:2

consume 1129:22

contact 1020:2 1121:22

contacted 1027:17

contacts 1062:12

contained 1040:20 1054:18

context 1037:23 1061:8 1121:8

continuance 1094:2

continuation 1104:1 1139:14

continue 1055:8 1059:13,22 1060:1 1081:1 1101:12 1120:16

continued 1037:2 1081:2

continuing 1043:23

contorted 1113:7

contract 1035:22 1036:7,15 1037:12 1069:19

contractor 1023:12

contracts 1045:11,14 1046:18

contributes 1060:6

control 1036:8 1040:21 1045:4 1081:15,18 1094:16 1100:11 1122:8

controlled 1073:18

controls 1076:4 1109:5

controversies 1055:8

controversy 1054:3

convenient 1118:9

conversation

1026:12 1028:15 1035:11 1047:23 1115:5

conversations

1079:13

converted 1117:3

cooling 1037:18

cooperate 1130:4

cooperative 1141:18

coordinate 1129:18

coordinators 1040:14

copied 1148:13

copier 1045:14

copies 1148:3

copy 1092:16

core 1042:9,18 1048:15

cornerstone 1055:13

correct 1067:11,15, 19 1076:12 1082:18 1083:16 1085:3 1104:17 1108:10,21 1110:23,24 1111:3

1117:19,20 1134:14 1146:7

corrections 1125:6

correctly 1152:11

cost 1023:10 1028:6, 13 1036:16 1046:10 1050:24 1051:3,20

cost-effective 1044:20

costing 1050:17

costs 1023:8 1028:3 1049:24 1050:14

couch 1022:16 1023:14 1024:18,23 1025:4,13,17 1026:3, 5 1127:6

coun 1071:2

counsel 1019:16,23 1020:2,15 1027:23 1029:2,7,10,22 1037:6 1105:24 1106:15 1129:21 1143:13

counsel's 1036:17, 21 1039:19 1069:13 1071:2

counterparts 1059:9

counties 1021:21 1038:22 1050:18 1063:22 1076:23

country 1059:9 1062:9 1076:10 1077:1 1079:12

county 1024:4,7 1038:13 1046:2 1073:21 1077:9 1078:14 1099:21 1146:21 1152:2,5

couple 1033:22 1076:1 1082:6 1085:17 1093:10 1119:19 1120:4 1130:9

court 1021:5,10,23 1022:6 1023:1 1024:14,20 1025:9 1026:20 1027:3,8 1030:15 1032:2,11 1033:9,17,20 1035:19 1036:6,19 1038:5,16 1039:3,12,13,18 1040:9,12,13,14,23 1041:15 1042:9,18,22 1043:17 1044:4 1046:15 1047:6 1048:16,20 1049:1,4, 16 1051:23 1052:10, 19,23 1053:22,24 1054:10,20,23 1055:5,11 1058:22 1059:1,7 1061:2 1062:8,17 1063:13, 18,21,23 1064:22 1066:2,20 1067:3,9 1068:1 1069:9,14,15, 16,24 1070:1,12 1071:15 1072:2,11,15 1073:18 1074:2,7 1076:24 1077:4,5,13 1078:12,18,20 1080:20,23 1081:16 1089:9 1091:10 1092:2,10 1093:17,23 1094:3,10,21,22 1097:5 1098:17,23 1100:17,20 1101:7 1102:15,21 1103:1,4, 17,21 1104:16 1105:4,14 1106:23,24 1107:4.8.18 1108:15. 19 1109:2,10,11,20 1110:22 1111:5,12,18 1112:14 1115:11,23 1118:6 1120:7 1121:22,24 1122:7,8, 23 1124:1,5,10,13 1126:7 1130:1 1133:19,24 1135:24 1140:15,24 1141:8,11 1142:24 1144:12,15, 17,24 1145:5,19 1146:22

Court's 1028:22,24 1029:2 1037:23 1038:20 1054:6,14,21 1058:18 1061:9 1073:22 1076:14 1099:5

courthouse 1073:22

courtroom 1037:4 1052:12 1071:10,11, 18 1078:13

courts 1021:20 1038:3,22 1039:2 1041:5 1043:4,22

07/20/2018 Index: cover..discuss

1048:2,22 1049:20 1050:7 1051:11,17 1054:15 1061:16,18 1076:22 1077:7 1093:16,24 1094:4,18 1097:15 1098:23

cover 1036:16 1149:13

coverage 1041:24

covered 1035:23 1135:14 1136:11 1138:7,8

covers 1038:21 1076:23 1135:3

Cowles 1066:11,12, 17 1067:12,16,20 1068:6 1095:14

Cowles' 1096:24

create 1038:5 1056:2 1080:24 1139:18,21

created 1041:18 1047:4 1071:8 1086:22

creates 1045:17 1065:2

crime 1120:12

crimes 1111:13

criminal 1060:6

criteria 1139:6

critical 1042:17 1052:16

crowded 1140:13

CRR 1152:18

crucially 1057:2

cry 1143:11

curiosity 1081:14

current 1022:9 1051:2 1053:14 1069:14 1087:13,14

custody 1086:18

custom 1023:16

cut 1032:12 1043:17 1079:18

cuts 1050:15

cynicism 1034:6,9

D

damage 1033:24 1034:19

damaged 1059:11

date 1027:15 1143:17

Davis 1024:12,15

Davis's 1027:13

day 1025:19,22 1026:9 1027:17 1035:12 1046:10 1068:4 1094:7 1097:15 1098:5,21 1112:10,17 1119:20 1129:22 1145:6 1152:15

days 1026:2 1109:16 1112:14 1119:19 1131:9

deal 1051:12 1118:7 1145:3

dealing 1054:7 1125:6

dealt 1081:5,6

death 1079:17

debate 1136:13

decades 1059:2 1065:23

December 1051:24 1070:17

decide 1058:17 1137:22,23 1138:11, 14.22

decided 1023:16 1069:9,16 1073:19,20 1082:24

decides 1138:18

decision 1054:10,24 1107:20 1108:14,19 1111:20 1120:5

decisions 1023:5 1032:19 1054:6,7 1062:6 1107:11

declaring 1055:19

decreased 1053:16

dedicated 1037:22

Deem 1128:10

deeply 1055:16

defined 1110:8,15

defines 1103:9

definition 1109:22

definitional 1116:12

definitions 1103:8

degree 1122:9

Del 1112:22

delay 1048:7 1111:11 1113:7,12,20 1114:5, 7,13,19,22 1117:19, 21,22 1118:6 1119:4, 12,15 1121:2 1122:21 1137:4 1143:14,17,19 1144:2

delayed 1049:17 1123:11

delaying 1112:11 1143:18

delays 1049:4,16

delegate 1019:8 1066:11,12,17 1067:12,16,20 1068:6 1075:17 1082:11,12, 19 1083:2,13,17 1084:8,17,20 1085:4, 12,14 1086:5,6,7,24 1087:19,23 1088:3,14 1089:12,13,20 1090:4 1093:6,7,15 1095:1,5, 6,9,13 1096:6,24 1097:8,12,13 1098:16,20 1099:18 1100:2,5,7,8 1102:6, 10 1112:22,24 1116:2,4,6,16,20 1117:14,17,18,21 1118:12,16,17 1119:9,10,23,24 1121:3,4,5,16,17 1123:9,10 1124:7,14, 15 1125:20.21 1127:19,20,21,22,23, 24 1128:1,2,3,4,5,6,7, 8,9,10,11,12,13,14, 15,16,17,18,19,20,21,

22,23,24 1129:1,2,3, 5,6,7,8,9,10,11 1133:1,2,5,15,18,23 1134:7,17,18,21 1135:5 1136:6,17,18, 19 1137:5,6,19 1138:2,24 1139:2 1140:5,6 1141:3,4,5, 19 1142:21,23 1145:12,14 1147:6,9, 10 1148:19,20,22 1149:17,18,24 1150:3,7,14,17,24 1151:10,11

DELEGATES

1141:23 1151:17

deliberative 1107:8 1115:18

deliver 1044:19

delivered 1026:3

demand 1127:13,14

demanded 1127:13

demands 1041:6

democracy 1055:14 1057:4

denial 1048:7

denied 1049:18

deny 1113:4

denying 1060:23

department 1039:10, 15 1095:10,18,24

dependency 1051:13

depends 1147:4

depose 1020:24

deputy 1021:11 1040:16

describe 1104:24

deserve 1064:8 1072:16 1101:15 1127:5,6

designated 1142:18

designed 1071:12

desk 1022:10,11,21, 22 1025:2,8,18,21 1026:3,6

detail 1038:2 detailed 1023:10 1090:15

destiny 1056:13

determine 1149:13

determining 1146:11,17

develop 1146:24

dictate 1108:23 1115:16,19

diem 1098:6 1099:9

difference 1082:21, 23

differently 1038:16

difficult 1032:19 1047:20 1140:14

dig 1091:10

diminish 1032:14

direct 1041:3 1054:22

directed 1053:4

direction 1041:8

directly 1056:14 1061:23 1062:3 1089:9

director 1021:6,11,14 1034:12 1061:21 1062:11 1068:2

directors 1045:19 1061:24

directs 1123:8

disappointment 1057:8

disbursements 1085:19

Disciplinary 1039:23

discontinuance 1094:2

discretion 1113:21 1122:8 1131:14

discretionary 1048:23 1077:19,24

discuss 1022:4,14,19 1033:14 1053:1,10 1096:11 1106:19,23

1107:3 1144:18 1150:22

discussed 1023:9 1035:7 1047:15 1053:5 1097:4 1099:22

discussion 1029:23 1089:24 1109:13 1112:1.2 1119:8.22 1124:14 1125:19 1127:12 1132:23 1136:18 1140:4 1141:20

disgruntled 1067:21 dispute 1065:11 1099:20

disputes 1055:14 disrepair 1036:1 distributed 1045:18

distribution 1139:7 district 1077:7

divide 1103:22 1104:5

divided 1140:23

divides 1140:22

division 1024:21 1043:7 1044:3 1045:19 1046:17 1062:14 1096:16 1098:3

Division's 1095:11 **divisions** 1045:10

divorce 1086:14

doable 1139:23

document 1056:19 1082:20 1083:9,10

documents 1029:14 1146:24

dollar 1097:17.21

dollars 1032:12 1036:8 1040:11 1041:20 1043:8,12, 18.23 1044:16 1046:16 1050:19 1051:4,21 1052:3 1061:11 1077:20 1083:23 1084:24

1085:11,21 1087:9 1099:1.11 1118:3

domain 1125:14 door 1027:5

double-checking 1112:11

doubt 1053:6

drafted 1020:14 1024:15

dramatically 1037:11

drastic 1058:19 drastically 1069:22

drive 1123:16

drives 1123:15

drop 1082:24

drug 1041:5 1043:22 1046:15 1051:11,23 1093:16,17,24 1094:4,10,17,21 1098:17,23 1099:1,3

due 1041:1 1048:5 1052:20 1094:22 1097:17

duly 1020:24 1152:5, 7

durable 1057:2 duties 1021:16

Ε

e-filing 1046:1

e-mail 1142:5

e-mails 1029:16 1147:17 1148:4,12

earlier 1147:24

earliest 1136:21

ease 1143:13 1144:9. 10

easily 1110:5

East 1037:17 1069:11 1070:16 1142:13,14

easy 1042:22

educate 1052:23

Educating 1052:15

education 1044:19. 21 1047:6 1052:15 1062:16 1086:13.17

educational 1039:15 1044:18

effect 1143:11

effective 1042:23 1045:3 1047:9

effectiveness

1038:7

efficiency 1103:21

efficient 1042:23 1047:9 1102:16

effort 1139:12

efforts 1032:11 1060:15 1119:14

elaborate 1068:10

elected 1041:9 1045:5

election 1038:11

electrical 1037:18 1070:19

elements 1047:24

eliminate 1048:24

eliminated 1042:19 1049:20

eliminating 1043:2 1044:8

Ellis 1019:11 1020:1. 10,16,23 1021:3 1029:5,10,11 1147:14 1148:2,13 1149:18

emerge 1034:8 1049:15

emergency 1045:21

employ 1039:8

employed 1021:5

employee 1022:6,7 1024:20 1034:13 1045:6 1067:21

employee-driven

1040:1 1091:15

employees 1040:7,8, 22 1052:16 1059:6,11

employment

1022:24 1026:20 1146:16

enabled 1043:17

enacted 1054:11

encourage 1121:7, 15

end 1030:17 1041:18, 21 1049:15 1142:6

ended 1102:18

enjoy 1101:24

enlightening 1126:5

enormous 1035:3

ensure 1047:8 1119:4 enter 1127:9 1142:9

entered 1147:17,21

entertain 1111:22

entire 1033:7.24 1039:16 1057:13 1062:9 1063:21 1091:14 1097:5

entirety 1030:1,4

entrance 1142:6,10, 15

entry 1113:4

environment 1071:9

equipment 1021:23 1136:1

escapes 1116:3

essence 1109:16 1126:17

essential 1048:16 1049:9

essentially 1046:4

establish 1095:19 1114:19

establishing

1096:17

estate 1099:20

esteem 1060:8

estimate 1023:10 1036:11 1080:18

evaluate 1042:16

Evans 1152:3,18

evening 1026:8

evidence 1019:21 1126:5 1147:16,21 1148:10

examples 1046:23 1050:5 1079:6

exceeds 1087:4

excellent 1043:19

exception 1103:11 1104:15,20 1105:1 1111:6 1116:13 1122:19 1139:13,23

exceptions 1103:11 1107:1

excerpt 1030:2

excessive 1033:16 1053:8

excursion 1125:24

excuse 1127:11 1129:24 1140:3

executed 1020:16

executive 1050:13 1054:4 1073:17.20 1074:12 1081:6

exempt 1095:15 1106:2

exhibit 1019:18

exhibits 1029:9 1148:16

exist 1092:5

exists 1117:7

expanded 1046:16

expedite 1123:2

expended 1118:3

expenditures

1032:11 1033:17,18, 24 1034:4 1037:14,24 1075:6 1087:5,10 1090:16 1092:16 1093:19 1100:24

07/20/2018 Index: expenses..future

expenses 1146:10 **experience** 1049:14

expert 1043:14

explain 1019:16,23 1058:1 1072:18 1140:7

explained 1048:22 1049:3

explore 1075:11 1117:23

exploring 1044:18

expose 1122:16

exposure 1117:12

extensive 1037:18

extent 1058:11 1146:24

extracting 1029:16

extravagant 1033:24 1061:1

extremely 1085:19

F

fabrics 1023:18

facilities 1021:19 1073:22

facility 1121:23 1125:14 1135:11 1141:2

facing 1041:11

fact 1040:18 1094:9 1117:23 1134:8

facts 1146:7 1148:7

factual 1146:1

failed 1061:6

failing 1048:20 1049:8

fails 1115:1

failure 1066:2

failures 1058:6

fair 1055:13 1084:12 1091:1 1096:22 1101:7 fairly 1055:14 1068:7

faith 1034:2

families 1051:14

family 1039:3,12 1040:13,14 1043:17 1052:19 1078:13

fashion 1058:8

Fast 1119:23 1121:4, 16,17 1129:1,2 1149:17,18,24 1150:3,7,14,17

faster 1093:23

favor 1127:15 1141:22 1151:16

feared 1026:19

feature 1091:8 1124:1

federal 1046:15 1081:15

feeds 1034:8

feel 1126:17 1138:19

fees 1046:22 1085:23 1089:8 1098:2

felon 1051:19

felt 1026:18 1028:16

fewer 1039:8 1050:2

figure 1036:10 1040:7 1139:21,24 1141:15

file 1120:8

files 1027:12,14 1029:16

final 1081:13

finalize 1094:11

finance 1029:23 1030:11,24 1031:4, 14,21 1044:3 1047:7 1060:13,20 1062:15, 24 1063:6 1065:7 1066:7,10 1071:19 1073:12,15 1074:21 1075:12,16,18,24 1079:4,23 1080:5,10 1081:4,12,19 1082:1, 5,10 1083:6 1086:9 1087:21 1088:5,9 1089:11,17 1090:3 1093:5,9,13 1095:4,8 1097:9 1100:6 1101:18 1102:12,20

finances 1057:24 1058:18 1082:24

financial 1032:17,19 1035:13 1042:2,24 1045:4,18 1047:2,16 1055:24

find 1051:14 1089:13 1090:14,23 1091:23 1092:4 1100:24 1124:18 1125:3,15 1126:7 1146:5

fine 1059:10 1092:18

finished 1047:17 1109:13

fired 1026:10,13

firm 1056:21

firmly 1035:15

fiscal 1030:14 1032:5 1033:3,4 1041:11,19, 21

fiscally- 1056:23

fit 1112:13 1139:22

five-hour 1123:15

fleet 1021:17

Fleischauer 1112:4, 6 1114:9,15 1119:23 1120:1 1129:11,12 1142:21,22 1143:16, 23 1144:6 1150:24 1151:1,6

flexible 1056:21

floor 1023:20,23 1024:6 1035:20,24 1036:17,23,24 1037:3,9 1069:11 1070:14 1072:6 1127:6 1142:10 1147:19

floor's 1031:23

floors 1036:13 1037:17

fluctuate 1145:19

Fluharty 1104:8,12, 21 1105:5 1106:4,11,

18,22 1107:6,16 1108:2,8,11,18,22 1109:14 1110:4,7,14, 19 1111:1,4,9 1113:9 1114:11,16,21,24 1115:8 1129:3,4 1130:19 1131:4,8 1132:5,9,13,18 1133:6,12,16,20 1134:4,12 1135:1,6, 17,20 1136:3 1137:17,21 1138:6, 13,17,23

fluid 1056:21

focus 1034:9 1047:19 1053:7 1140:1

folks 1087:8

follow 1083:7

foolish 1037:23

foregoing 1152:6

forever 1044:4 1058:21

forget 1116:5

form 1114:19 1139:17

formulated 1074:23

forward 1029:17 1060:11 1066:4 1068:12 1070:8 1101:17 1119:18 1130:21 1131:15 1145:2

Foster 1117:17,18,21 1118:12 1128:12,13

found 1027:7 1035:7

foundation 1056:22 1057:1

foundational 1056:19,22

four-year 1045:1

fourth 1035:20,23 1036:13,17,23,24 1037:16 1069:10 1070:14

fox 1063:2

fragmented 1038:12

frame 1032:8 1122:24 1123:17

framed 1126:10,11

framing 1116:21 1117:7

frankly 1087:8

freedom 1127:9

frequently 1038:19

Frich 1097:12,13 1098:16,20 1099:18 1100:2

Friday 1116:18 1126:9 1129:23 1135:10 1144:24 1149:2 1151:3

front 1058:16 1074:17 1091:8 1125:9 1142:8

frustrated 1054:5

frustration 1057:8

full 1033:2 1124:3 1147:3 1152:13

fully 1072:1 1119:1

function 1045:8 1048:15 1050:14 1087:1 1095:12

functions 1039:7 1042:9 1049:1

fund 1048:20 1086:13,17 1103:17 1105:4

funding 1043:21 1048:9,17 1049:12, 19,23 1054:8,11,19 1055:2 1077:17 1091:12 1094:22 1097:15 1098:17

funds 1041:23 1087:2,3,6

funny 1105:10

furnishings 1023:6, 23 1108:12

furniture 1021:23 1024:14 1025:9 1033:16 1037:14,24 1053:8

future 1041:9 1045:24 1047:11,14 1057:18 1059:15 1061:11 G

garment 1056:13

Gary 1042:4 1068:1

gather 1144:17

gathered 1146:9 1150:23

gathering 1029:15

gave 1084:10

Gearheart 1082:11, 12,19 1083:2,13,17 1084:8,17,20 1085:4, 12 1086:6,24 1087:19,23 1088:3,14

general 1050:1 1090:1 1134:8

gentlelady 1112:3 1125:23

gentleman 1071:20 1126:8 1130:14 1137:8 1138:9

gentleman's

1111:23 1112:18 1118:19 1119:3 1120:24 1121:6.14 1124:17 1125:17 1127:15 1132:16,24 1135:9 1141:22 1151:16

gentlemen 1132:1 1134:16

genuine 1048:21

Gilbert 1022:12.22 1025:2,8 1071:12

Gilmore 1026:24

aive 1076:18 1078:12 1088:12 1096:16 1118:6 1145:9

giving 1102:14 1119:5

glad 1031:22 1150:20

goal 1135:23

good 1019:2 1031:5 1058:8 1075:20,22 1076:7 1081:22 1085:13 1089:21

1091:1 1096:21 1119:20 1143:9

qotcha 1085:13

government 1032:4, 10,24 1034:7 1035:14 1042:24 1047:3 1048:14 1049:11 1050:11 1056:18 1057:7,14 1058:21 1059:5,20,22 1060:9 1069:1 1073:2 1078:3 1100:19 1121:12

governmental 1092:3

Governor 1032:21

graduates 1051:23

granite 1024:5

grant 1046:15 1097:17,21 1141:16

granted 1115:6 1142:2

great 1059:5 1124:1

greatly 1038:6 1102:13

green 1022:15 1024:23

Greenbrier 1146:22

groping 1130:15

ground 1142:10

group 1039:9 1103:23 1109:3 1130:8 1131:1 1141:9

groups 1103:22 1105:13 1114:3 1140:10,24

grown 1040:24

growth 1041:3

guarantee 1048:10 1139:5

guard 1057:24

guardian 1043:13 1098:2

quardians 1043:16

guarding 1063:2 guess 1067:20

1068:5 1136:5

Н

half 1035:23 1040:22

hall 1028:22

hallway 1037:4,7 1072:3.4

Hamilton 1060:4

hand 1023:21 1031:9. 11 1076:11 1152:15

handful 1130:13

handle 1044:14

hands 1045:4

handwritten 1023:24

Hanshaw 1127:19

happen 1049:16 1055:5,6 1064:10 1065:17 1078:5 1079:1 1144:19

happened 1066:3 1075:7 1079:3 1097:21

happening 1054:1 1055:7 1061:1

happy 1101:3

hard 1056:2 1059:14 1099:15

hard-earned 1035:3

harm 1112:11

harmful 1066:20

Harshbarger 1129:9,

Hartman 1093:6,7,15 1095:1

head 1032:3 1131:23

headlines 1032:23

healthy 1085:20

hear 1084:15,16 1100:16

heard 1081:22

1094:15 1105:12 1119:15 1151:15

hearing 1019:19 1029:23 1147:14

hearings 1030:13 1096:9

heart 1031:9.11

heating 1037:18 1070:20

held 1021:13

helping 1051:11,12

hen 1063:2

highly 1126:7

hired 1062:21.23 1068:1

hiring 1042:3

history 1041:17 1057:7

hold 1030:17

holes 1147:4

Hollen 1128:7,8 1140:5 1141:4,5,19

home 1024:13

honor 1032:1 1067:24

hope 1132:8 1145:7

horribles 1050:4

hour 1118:8 1123:16

hours 1123:15

house 1024:19,22 1025:2 1030:11 1050:19 1056:20 1063:3

Householder

1060:19,21 1063:1,7 1065:8 1066:8

housekeeping 1142:3

hue 1143:11

huge 1064:16 1143:11

human 1039:14

humbly 1034:17

hundred 1072:17

hundreds 1043:12, 22 1044:15

hung 1116:22

hybrids 1077:3

hygiene 1043:13 1098:2

ı

idea 1073:13 1075:10 1077:14 1118:7 1145:17

identify 1148:11

III 1048:1

immediately 1027:20 1045:12 1136:23

impartiality 1060:3

impeachment 1107:9 1120:14

implement 1046:19

implementation 1045:24

implemented 1045:8 1046:9 1057:22

important 1033:15 1035:10 1040:2 1047:16 1057:3 1093:19 1118:2,22 1121:10 1126:19 1150:8

impossibility 1065:3

impressing 1060:7

impression 1036:9 1140:18

improper 1102:3

improved 1045:7 1068:14 1069:21

improvement 1047:2

inaccurate 1036:14

inappropriate 1033:23

inaudible 1088:15 1142:11

incarcerate 1051:22

incarcerated 1051:3, 19

incarceration 1052:1

include 1021:16 1136:7 1137:14,24 1138:20

included 1023:24 1043:1 1054:12 1081:10 1123:18 1137:13,14

includes 1032:9 1043:13

including 1036:21 1037:3 1039:2 1044:20 1137:20

incorrect 1085:10

increase 1078:7

increased 1041:6

increasing 1033:13

incredible 1037:21

indefensible 1034:4 1066:19

independence

1032:15 1038:7 1055:24

independent 1055:6 1056:23

Indigent 1052:2

indirectly 1056:14 1150:10

individual 1037:7 1050:18 1062:3,13 1074:13 1090:18 1108:17 1109:7

individually 1130:5

individuals 1040:10 1050:20 1051:9,12,22 1057:17 1062:19,23 1063:14 1064:24 1065:4 1115:12 1117:10 1131:18

inescapable 1056:12

influx 1052:18 1085:20

information 1020:12 1025:12,14 1026:24 1060:14 1073:4 1089:18 1092:8,11 1107:17 1108:3 1139:9 1146:9,15,18 1148:15

informed 1025:1 1026:13 1131:21 1142:4 1144:15

informing 1024:21

initial 1022:3,8,13,18

injury 1048:4

Injustice 1056:10

input 1095:22 1096:4

inquiry 1104:9,11 1144:9 1145:13,14 1146:4 1147:12

insensitive 1034:5 1066:19

inserts 1023:18

inspecting 1104:23

inspection 1029:17 1103:12 1116:15 1120:11

instances 1057:6 1058:14

instantaneously 1034:14

institute 1057:15

institutions 1034:3

instructed 1024:22 1027:3

Insufficient 1049:19, 23

integrity 1060:2

intellectual 1107:19

intense 1143:3

intention 1122:16

interested 1126:10

interests 1059:23

interference 1053:18

internal 1045:16

interpretation

1105:23 1109:18

interpreted 1110:5

interpreters 1052:7,

interrupt 1069:4 1091:17

intimidate 1028:17

introduced 1147:24

Investigation

1020:11,13 1039:22

invoice 1044:5 1063:11,13,17

invoices 1043:14 1063:9,10,23 1147:18

invoicing 1043:11 1098:8

involved 1023:5 1030:5 1071:21

ironic 1124:18 1125:4,16

irrelevant 1061:23

Isner 1128:18,19

isolated 1033:16,22 1037:13 1053:8 1058:5

issue 1033:1,16 1035:7 1053:2 1074:22 1094:7 1097:5 1104:20 1106:1 1118:23 1122:14,23 1134:19 1142:3 1146:2,15,21

issues 1051:13 1055:17 1068:14 1070:19,20 1086:19 1122:6,7,22 1146:1 1149:8,9,12

item 1029:20 1053:15

items 1024:1 1061:7 1083:20 1084:22 1090:1,2 1116:22,24 1126:10,15 1147:21

J

j-school 1131:9 JACKSON 1152:2 jail 1050:16 1088:19 jails 1050:20

January 1026:9 1030:9 1041:10 1042:5 1068:3 1082:23

jealously 1057:23

JIC 1029:16,22 1150:10

Joan 1027:18

job 1027:7 1047:8 1051:14 1053:24 1068:3 1071:13,14

John 1048:19

Johnson 1027:19 1028:1 1042:5 1068:1

Johnson's 1027:21 1028:20

joint 1074:16

iournalist 1131:23

judge 1027:19,21 1028:1,20 1034:12 1039:12 1042:4 1058:4,9 1067:8,13

judges 1035:1 1039:3 1040:13 1044:11,13 1052:10,19,21 1059:6 1079:14

judicial 1020:11,12 1032:20,24 1034:13, 20 1038:7 1039:1,5, 22 1044:11 1047:3,24 1048:9 1049:13 1050:10,23 1051:6 1052:16 1055:3,24 1056:7 1057:19 1059:10,17,20 1076:4,17 1077:22 1078:2,6 1097:3 1121:12

judiciary 1019:3 1032:16 1034:1 1038:11 1039:6 1053:15,18 1054:12 1055:13 1056:24 1088:24 1090:17

judiciary's 1032:5,9, 15 1034:10 1038:2,19 1049:8 1053:5 1080:15 judicious 1058:8

July 1151:13

jump 1091:9

June 1022:1,2

juries 1052:9

justice 1022:1,4,9,14, 19,20 1023:3,4,9,10, 11,14,16,19,21 1024:3,8,12,15,18,22 1025:1,10,20,23 1026:8,10,22 1027:3, 13.21 1028:2.4.7.10. 13 1030:1,5,23 1031:6,10,16,17,19, 24 1032:2 1034:10,11 1041:10 1044:13,23, 24 1048:6,12,19 1049:7,17 1056:11 1060:6,16,22 1061:12 1063:4,8 1064:16 1065:1,18 1066:14,15 1067:10,14,18,23 1068:21 1071:23 1073:14 1074:5 1075:1,14,19,22 1076:6 1079:9,10 1080:3,8,12 1081:9, 17,21,24 1082:3,8,17, 22 1083:8,15 1084:5, 13,18 1085:2,7 1086:2,11 1087:12 1088:1,7,12,16 1089:3,6,16 1090:8, 20,24 1092:6,17,22 1093:1,12,21 1095:2 1096:2.20 1097:19 1098:18,22 1099:24 1100:4 1101:10 1102:8.13.20 1145:24 1147:17

justices 1024:13 1036:19 1038:17 1039:1 1040:13 1058:15 1063:17 1070:24 1072:5 1077:7 1079:11,15 1127:2,3

justices' 1037:8 justification 1035:9 juveniles 1049:21

07/20/2018 Index: Kanawha..manner

Κ

Kanawha 1120:2 1142:8,20,24

Kansas 1054:2,9,23, 24 1079:5,8,22

KAUFFMAN 1019:24

keeping 1035:15 1137:18

Kessinger 1128:22

Ketchum 1028:7,13 1060:16

Kim 1019:11

Kimberly 1020:23 1021:2 1029:5

kind 1083:21 1089:4 1120:20

King 1056:9

knowing 1099:2 1105:18 1126:10

knowingly 1105:12

L

lack 1049:14

lady 1120:2

Lane 1119:9,10 1128:3.4

Language 1052:7

large 1042:7,21 1046:21 1072:8 1103:22

largely 1041:1

larger 1032:8

largest 1039:9 1040:6 1046:14

late 1085:15

laughed 1101:19

law 1039:13,20,21 1044:8 1048:6 1052:21 1055:19 1103:7 1105:16,18,19 1109:18 1115:23 1119:17 laws 1042:11

lawsuit 1120:6,8,9

Lawyer 1039:22

lawyers 1105:24

lead 1032:23

leadership 1042:4

leather 1022:16 1024:23

leave 1127:3

leaves 1036:9

led 1057:8

left 1022:23 1025:24 1037:15 1123:3

legal 1046:17,22 1047:5 1062:14 1089:10

legislation 1094:1 1125:6

legislative 1032:20 1046:7 1053:18 1054:4 1073:17 1074:16 1086:22 1108:6,16 1120:21

legislators 1056:1 1058:4

legislature 1040:9, 17,21 1041:4 1053:21 1054:10,24 1058:13 1064:12 1068:18 1071:21 1074:17 1076:4,13 1077:9 1079:17 1086:1 1090:13 1091:24 1092:15 1096:13 1110:10 1120:6

legislature's

1032:13

legislatures 1055:9

legitimate 1065:19 1074:9

letter 1034:22

level 1038:13 1043:24 1077:10 1081:15 1087:13 1119:5

levels 1087:15

libraries 1044:9

library 1036:22 1039:21 1044:7 1070:13

licensing 1077:21

lie 1028:17

lieu 1149:20 1150:2

life 1051:18

light 1085:19 1124:19 1147:12

likelihood 1148:17

limit 1110:11 1136:1, 5

limitation 1131:1,14

limitations 1122:13

limited 1021:17 1138:18

Limiting 1044:10

lines 1051:10 1062:22

listening 1020:20 1143:8

litem 1043:14,16 1098:2

litigants 1046:2 1052:9

live 1019:20 1034:6

lives 1044:1 1094:15

load 1033:12

local 1099:22

locate 1086:3

located 1025:9 1028:21,24 1069:13

locations 1024:2

logistical 1140:12,16

long 1028:18 1137:24 1140:20

long-term 1059:23 1065:5 1149:2

longer 1141:9,10

looked 1070:12 1097:23

looming 1078:4

lost 1049:6

lot 1065:3,8,12 1077:20 1079:19 1099:4 1113:14

Lottery 1030:18

Loughry 1022:4,14, 19,20 1023:4,10,11, 16,19,21 1024:3,8 1025:2,20,23 1026:8, 10,22 1027:3,22 1028:2,4,10 1030:5, 23 1031:6,10,17,18, 19,24 1060:22 1061:12 1063:4,8 1065:18 1066:15 1067:10,14,18,23 1068:21 1071:23 1073:14 1074:5 1075:1,14,22 1076:6 1079:9 1080:3,8,12 1081:9,17,21 1082:3, 8,17,22 1083:8,15 1084:5,13,18 1085:2, 7 1086:2,11 1087:12 1088:1,7,12,16 1089:16 1090:8,20,24 1092:6,17,22 1093:1, 12.21 1095:2 1096:2. 20 1097:19 1098:18, 22 1099:24 1100:4 1101:10 1102:8 1147:17

Loughry's 1022:1,9 1023:3,9,14 1024:18, 22 1025:10 1027:13 1030:1 1102:20 1146:1

Lovejoy 1128:2

lower 1021:20 1142:9

loyal 1026:16

lunch 1143:6

lunchtime 1143:2

Luther 1056:9

M

ma 1107:12

made 1024:17 1026:22 1035:18 1041:12 1042:14 1044:22 1049:7 1057:20 1067:2 1102:16,23 1103:2 1107:11 1109:8 1111:20 1113:2,3,9 1117:11 1124:4 1125:5 1126:9 1129:16 1130:5,17 1136:15

magistrate 1034:12 1039:11 1040:15,16 1146:22

magistrates 1039:4 1040:15 1052:20 1059:6 1077:8

magnificent 1071:11

main 1028:22,24

majority 1050:12

make 1033:11 1046:24 1065:15 1066:5 1086:8 1093:20 1096:8 1098:13,16 1099:21 1100:22 1109:7 1112:20 1114:22 1118:5 1123:22 1124:23 1132:2 1135:9,23 1139:8 1143:10 1144:9

makes 1062:4 1121:2

making 1042:5 1046:13 1057:1 1058:23 1059:16 1062:6 1067:3 1073:9 1079:15 1141:1

manageable 1140:17

managed 1058:17 1123:5

management 1042:2 1047:5

managers 1145:24 1146:20 1150:19,21

managing 1021:17, 18

mandate 1048:13

mandated 1093:18, 24

mandates 1041:4

mandatory 1134:2

manner 1047:9

VOLUME IV

07/20/2018 Index: map..network

map 1023:20,22 1024:4.10

mark 1019:8

Martin 1056:9

material 1115:20

math 1051:9

matter 1064:11 1104:5 1123:4

matters 1121:22 1122:7

maximum 1125:8.12

meaningful 1140:18

means 1040:18 1050:16 1087:6 1124:3 1132:14 1152:14

measure 1058:19

measured 1057:14 1058:8

media 1025:15 1026:1 1034:15 1067:1 1111:17 1113:21,22 1114:1,7, 8 1115:9,14,19,22 1119:4 1120:8,15,22 1121:21 1123:18,21, 22,24 1124:13 1125:2,3,7 1126:23 1127:7 1131:12,22 1132:3,4,8,10,11 1133:3,17 1134:3,13, 22 1136:6 1137:10, 11,15 1138:5 1139:6, 7,17 1144:20

mediation 1086:17, 18

Medicaid 1099:16

meet 1047:13 1049:8 1062:19 1079:11 1105:15 1150:20

meeting 1019:3 1022:3,8,14,19 1028:5,9,19 1029:4 1066:14 1083:5 1102:24 1103:9 1104:2 1106:2 1108:23 1116:10,13 1117:19 1121:18 1123:12 1124:20

1139:14 1140:8,22 1145:11 1149:1

meetings 1079:11 1103:6,10 1105:11, 16.19 1110:22 1111:13 1113:11,18, 23 1114:4 1119:17 1123:14 1126:22 1131:17 1139:6,13 1143:3

member 1090:13,14 1091:24 1105:12.20 1106:6 1107:14 1109:9 1122:4,17 1134:22 1137:10

member's 1109:9

members 1051:15 1069:14,15,23 1080:18 1092:14 1103:2 1108:9,17 1109:3 1111:14 1115:22 1118:22 1119:12 1120:22 1121:7,20,21 1125:7 1130:10 1133:3 1135:12 1141:14 1144:8,14

memo 1024:15 1142:5

memory 1076:3

Mendez 1024:20 1025:1,7,12,20

mental 1043:13 1098:1

mention 1022:21 1083:21 1094:11 1097:14 1109:17

mentioned 1029:21 1079:5,24 1104:14 1147:24

Merit 1152:3

met 1082:23 1139:6

meter 1142:20

method 1020:17

mic 1104:13

miked 1104:13

militate 1120:4

Miller 1124:14,15

1128:16,17

million 1036:8 1040:11 1041:20,22 1046:16 1051:4 1052:3 1083:23 1084:7 1085:11,21 1088:2,20 1097:17,20 1099:1 1103:17

millions 1032:12 1043:7,18 1050:19 1051:21 1077:20

mind 1031:1 1035:16 1040:8 1063:20 1112:16 1134:9

minds 1060:8

minimize 1057:16

minor 1061:18

MINORITY 1075:18, 24 1079:4,23 1080:5, 10 1081:4,12,19 1082:1 1090:5,9,22 1091:16 1092:12,19, 23 1093:3 1104:8,12, 21 1105:5 1106:4,11, 18,22 1107:6,16 1108:2,8,11,18,22 1109:14 1110:4,7,14, 19 1111:1,4,9 1112:4, 6 1113:9 1114:9,11, 15,16,21,24 1115:8 1120:1 1129:4,12 1130:19 1131:4,8 1132:5,9,13,18 1133:6,12,16,20 1134:4,12 1135:1,6, 17,20 1136:3 1137:17,21 1138:6, 13,17,23 1142:22 1143:16,23 1144:6 1151:1,6

minus 1103:17

minute 1130:7 1131:21 1133:11 1144:9

minutes 1047:19 1094:12 1143:1

misappropriation 1061:10

misdemeanor 1105:18,19 1122:17 misleading 1036:5 1089:4

missing 1146:4

mission 1034:10 1041:14 1042:18

mistake 1088:18,22 1124:23

misunderstand 1113:1

mo 1115:3

modeled 1071:15

modern 1056:5 1080:1,6

modify 1138:10

moment 1053:3,12 1116:3 1135:15 1141:11 1143:13 1149:10 1150:1

Monday 1025:18 1112:15 1123:13

money 1035:4 1042:20,21 1046:3 1050:22 1072:23 1077:19 1078:12,13 1085:6,24 1088:15, 17,19,20,21,23 1089:8,9 1090:19 1094:17 1098:15

monitor 1045:19

Monongalia 1099:21

Monthly 1045:17

months 1033:22

Moore 1118:16,17 1128:20,21

morning 1019:2 1109:12

motion 1111:22,23 1112:18 1113:1,3,5,6, 7,11,19 1114:13,22 1115:4 1117:18,22 1118:20 1119:3,11,12 1120:24 1121:6,15 1125:18 1127:8,16 1132:2,16,21,24 1133:11 1134:5,6,11 1135:8.9.10.16 1136:14,15,16 1137:9 1138:16 1140:3

1141:22 1142:2 1143:10,14,22 1144:2,3,4 1151:16

motion's 1117:19

motions 1107:12 1114:10 1129:15

move 1038:14 1046:3 1110:20 1111:10.11 1130:21 1132:6,10 1137:23 1151:12

moved 1070:24

moves 1102:15

moving 1070:8 1126:3,18

Mullins 1027:18

multiple 1090:7

mutuality 1056:12

Ν

nation 1046:15

National 1043:4 1061:17 1062:7

nature 1039:24 1144:16

nay 1127:17

nays 1117:15 1127:13

necessarily 1040:1 1125:1

needed 1037:15.17 1061:8 1098:7 1144:17

negative 1033:21

neighbor 1025:24

NELSON 1030:11,24 1031:4,14,21 1060:13 1066:10 1071:19 1073:12,15 1074:21 1075:12,16 1082:5,10 1083:6 1086:9 1087:21 1088:5,9 1089:11 1090:3 1093:5,9,13 1095:4,8 1097:10 1100:6 1102:12

network 1056:12

news 1053:7

newspapers 1079:21

nice 1123:21

night 1026:11

nods 1131:23

nondiscretionary 1040:5,19 1052:6,14

1077:17

nonessential 1043:3

nonetheless

1050:24 1070:4,10 1071:16

nonnegotiable 1047:24

nonseverability 1054:18

nonviolent 1050:17

normal 1142:6

notarized 1029:6

Notary 1152:4

notebook 1019:19

notes 1024:1 1069:18 1070:2 1107:21 1134:23 1152:12

notice 1031:15

notified 1080:20

November 1021:15

number 1051:2 1052:8,18 1062:19 1077:15 1082:15 1083:1 1103:14 1122:9

numbers 1051:5 1087:13,15

0

oath 1020:24 1031:2 obligation 1052:23 obligations 1040:20 observed 1026:5

obtain 1020:7 1069:19

obtained 1035:21

occur 1079:20 1093:24

occurred 1022:5,8 1036:12 1043:1 1058:6 1063:16 1064:21 1069:7 1070:11 1071:4 1091:5 1102:1 1103:15 1105:3

occurring 1094:14

October 1027:10,17 1028:19 1029:3

offender 1098:3

offenders 1043:9 1050:17

offenses 1122:18

office 1022:1,5,9,10, 15,16,20,22 1023:3,6, 9,21,24 1024:2,14 1027:2,4,11,13,14,18, 20,21 1028:4,7,12,14, 20,21,23 1029:1 1036:18,21 1037:3 1039:19 1061:16 1069:13 1071:3,4,5 1074:4 1089:17 1117:6 1126:16 1127:4 1140:13 1146:15 1147:18 1150:11

officer 1078:15

officers 1039:1,6 1044:11 1050:10,16 1052:16 1059:10 1098:4

offices 1021:8 1029:1 1035:20 1036:2,23 1037:5,8 1072:4 1127:1

official 1045:5

on-site 1103:12

one-year 1044:24 1064:24

ongoing 1109:18

online 1100:24

onsite 1116:15

open 1019:19 1048:3

1060:17 1096:9 1103:6,10 1105:11, 16,19 1108:23 1110:22 1111:12 1113:11,18,23 1114:4 1119:16 1120:15 1124:20 1126:22 1139:6,13,16,20

operate 1060:1

operation 1038:21

opinion 1106:1,21 1107:7 1111:5,8 1122:18 1140:24

opinions 1111:2 1139:19

opportunities 1049:6 1050:2

opportunity 1096:17 1122:5

opposed 1030:1 1087:10 1097:7 1127:16 1141:24 1151:18

oral 1024:12

order 1019:4 1034:3 1100:22

ordered 1023:14 1086:15,18

orders 1070:7 1071:7

ordinary 1060:5

organizing 1146:11

oriented 1082:15

origin 1067:7

original 1035:22 1036:10 1037:12

ornate 1127:6

outlets 1134:3

outraged 1065:13,21 1102:4,5

outrageous 1035:9 1065:11

Overington 1119:24 1121:4 1123:9,10 1124:7 1129:5,6 1140:5,6 1141:3 1148:20,22 **oversee** 1076:3

overseeing 1021:18, 19

oversight 1046:18 1058:7 1061:3 1066:2 1068:14

overstepping 1103:6

overwhelmingly 1038:10

owned 1127:10

Р

P-CARDS 1045:20

paid 1063:10 1108:12 1126:11

painfully 1032:17

paper 1028:6

paperless 1046:4

parade 1050:4

pardon 1112:5

Parental 1086:12,16

Parents 1086:17

park 1142:15

parking 1142:8,18

part 1029:8 1033:19 1034:23 1040:6 1070:13 1072:10 1096:2 1097:15 1098:21 1107:8,10 1115:17 1116:23 1121:13 1126:22 1140:21

participate 1094:21 1115:12

participating 1052:10

parts 1036:21

pass 1079:3

passage 1056:5

passed 1041:4 1055:1 1125:7

passes 1078:6 1115:4

past 1033:21 1063:9 1099:23 1109:16

Paul 1024:19 1025:19,22

paused 1080:16

pay 1099:8

payroll 1039:16

peace 1077:8

pendulum 1079:7

people 1034:2,17,20 1035:2 1037:22 1039:7,8,9 1044:1,19 1051:2 1052:4 1059:1,8 1060:8 1061:22 1062:2,5 1064:7 1065:22 1076:9 1078:10 1086:14 1091:9 1094:14 1099:3 1101:15 1102:4 1122:9 1127:1,2,5,10 1130:13 1131:6 1137:15,18,19

percent 1033:7 1040:4,7 1072:20 1077:16

1140:12

Perfect 1138:23

perform 1042:10

period 1038:15 1064:20,23 1095:20 1103:16 1105:3 1140:2

periods 1096:10

permit 1020:6

permitted 1109:4,12

person 1048:3,4 1132:3,4 1136:4

person's 1140:13

personal 1026:11 1028:20 1117:4

personally 1023:17 1074:19 1097:6 1112:15 1122:20 1126:23

personnel 1124:13

persons 1122:1

perspective 1068:15 1076:2

pho 1117:13

phone 1024:24 1025:7 1026:7.11

photograph 1134:14

photographed 1026:5

photographer

1108:6,16 1120:21 1133:21 1135:13 1136:5 1138:3

photography 1108:5 1134:14

photos 1108:7,9,15, 17 1117:7

phrase 1132:8

picked 1025:17

picture 1053:12

pictures 1025:24 1117:13 1120:23 1126:11 1137:12,16

piece 1028:6

pillows 1023:13,17, 18

place 1033:18 1044:2 1064:10 1075:4 1077:3 1097:23 1114:8

placement 1023:22

places 1045:3

plan 1023:23 1061:9 1098:10,13 1099:8 1139:7 1147:23 1149:4

planned 1136:24 1140:8

planning 1021:19 1149:2

plans 1149:7 1150:22

play 1030:3,6 1074:1 1087:9 1107:18 1115:10

played 1030:9 1081:2

playing 1080:16

plumbing 1037:19 1070:20

point 1035:15 1072:19 1104:8,11 1107:22 1116:1 1119:7 1141:7,9 1143:18 1147:12 1149:15

points 1040:2 1147:15

policies 1046:19 1057:15,23

policy 1024:12

politically-divisive 1055:16

pool 1131:22 1132:3

popular 1055:18

portion 1056:24

poses 1048:21

position 1021:13 1027:8 1064:12.16 1068:3 1118:11

positions 1043:3

positive 1059:16

possession 1020:18

possibility 1113:24 1145:8

posted 1026:1

postpone 1048:23

potential 1105:11 1111:12 1122:17 1124:20 1125:5

power 1054:14,21 1115:13

present 1019:5,7,9 1028:2 1029:3 1033:3 1114:2 1123:24 1139:15 1146:11,12

presented 1146:19

preserve 1056:3

preserves 1053:19

presiding 1039:2

press 1033:21 1041:24 1090:14 1092:1 1112:21

1113:3,8 1117:24 1118:5,22 1122:23 1127:9 1130:3,10,24 1131:2 1135:12 1138:11.14.18.22 1140:22

pressure 1065:3,9

pressured 1078:9

pretty 1029:22 1113:12

prevent 1061:10

preventing 1094:9

prevents 1053:17

primarily 1038:13

primary 1041:14

principle 1056:23

principles 1057:3

print 1132:4 1133:8,9, 13 1134:13 1135:12 1136:6 1137:11,15 1138:5,19

prior 1023:2 1038:8 1045:21 1056:1

prison 1051:12 1125:9,13

prisons 1050:21

Pritt 1146:16

privilege 1032:1

probation 1039:10 1043:7 1047:6 1050:8,9,13,14,16 1051:2 1062:15 1078:15 1098:3,4

problem 1059:2 1074:20 1115:3 1122:21,22 1135:2 1139:18,21 1149:15

problems 1049:14 1080:24

procedure 1030:21 1104:14

procedures 1044:2 1046:19 1057:16.23 1064:4,6 1068:9 1097:22 1100:18 1101:8

proceed 1112:9 1120:3 1124:21 1131:15

proceeded 1070:9

proceeding 1133:24

proceedings 1020:3 1029:19 1052:11 1107:9 1126:2.18 1152:7,11

process 1019:23 1029:15 1041:13 1044:6 1046:4 1052:20 1071:6.22 1096:7 1107:9 1115:16,17,18 1148:6

processes 1043:11 1045:9 1068:8

procurement 1021:22 1045:8 1062:23

product 1105:7,8

productive 1051:15

professional 1043:10

program 1046:11 1103:13 1104:23,24 1105:6 1109:17,19,21 1110:8,15 1116:15

programs 1044:18 1048:23 1101:4

prohibition 1122:11

prohibitions 1121:20

project 1024:9 1033:19 1035:17,21, 23 1036:4 1037:2 1065:5 1067:7 1069:17,20 1070:24 1072:8 1103:12 1104:23,24 1105:6 1109:17,19,20 1110:8,15 1116:15 1117:2

projects 1109:12 1110:11 1116:8,9

promise 1095:7

promote 1035:13

proper 1057:14 1088:23 1144:3

property 1048:4 1117:3.4

proposals 1145:20

proposed 1145:18

protect 1068:20

protecting 1053:20

protections 1055:22

protocols 1064:5,6 1068:9 1097:23

proud 1059:4 1101:22

provide 1019:14 1035:16 1043:24 1046:6,8 1047:12 1048:10 1052:4,17,20 1072:13 1073:3 1089:18 1092:10,13, 15 1098:6,7 1099:9

provided 1020:10,12, 15 1023:11 1024:14 1027:14 1054:19 1080:14 1092:8

providers 1099:14

providing 1043:19 1094:22 1098:14

provision 1036:3 1053:14,17 1054:16 1055:2 1106:2 1109:23

provisions 1054:12

prudent 1119:2

public 1036:22 1037:5 1048:21 1065:9 1081:7 1090:14 1092:1 1109:4 1118:2 1121:21 1122:5 1139:17,20 1152:4

public's 1049:10 1125:14

public-owned 1125:14

punish 1053:24 1054:23

punishment 1075:8

purchases 1033:23 1035:9,18 1061:1

1065:21

purchasing 1064:2 1095:11,16,21 1096:1,15,19

purpose 1087:2,5

purposes 1020:19 1101:2 1140:16

push 1032:13

Pushkin 1125:20,21 1128:10,11 1136:18 1137:5,6,19 1138:2 1147:9,10 1148:19

Pushkins 1147:9

put 1059:8 1064:9 1071:7 1087:9 1088:22 1094:17 1110:12 1111:18 1124:1 1126:15

puts 1065:3

putting 1044:2 1081:8 1097:22 1137:1

Q

qualified 1152:6

qualify 1105:8

quarter 1046:12 1099:10

Queen 1127:22,23 1133:1,2,5,15,18,23 1134:7,17,18,21 1135:5

question 1061:13 1065:20 1072:9 1074:10 1076:7 1081:13 1083:19 1084:2,14 1085:5,14 1087:2 1088:17 1091:1,2,19 1095:12 1096:9,14,21,22,23, 24 1101:11 1118:2 1121:20 1130:20,22 1134:8,17 1139:4,12 1141:21 1145:12 1148:21

questioned 1094:6 questioning 1028:3

questions 1030:17 1060:12,18 1069:5 1081:22 1082:14 1089:22 1093:10 1100:15 1102:3 1142:21 1150:5 1151:8

quick 1082:14 1090:6 1093:10 1095:7 1097:10 1099:19

quickly 1112:9 1126:19

quiet 1134:9

quorum 1019:5,7 1105:15 1114:2 1139:14

R

radio 1133:8,13 1134:15 1135:13 1136:7 1137:11,13, 14,20,24 1138:20

raise 1031:8

raised 1103:15 1104:20 1146:16 1150:20

rapid 1042:6

rapidly 1079:3

reach 1079:21 1107:19 1115:10,18 1131:11

reached 1106:21 1114:6

reaching 1106:12

read 1019:17,21 1020:20 1081:23 1110:1

reading 1109:17 1110:9

reads 1103:11

ready 1030:6

real 1041:18 1090:6 1099:19.20 1149:11

realities 1033:3

reality 1050:4

realize 1045:12 1121:1

realized 1046:11 1099:11

reappropriated 1083:20 1084:6,23 1085:6

reappropriation 1086:1

reappropriations 1084:4

reason 1112:19 1120:19

reasonable 1122:12 1141:15

reasons 1109:6

recall 1024:10 1057:11

recalled 1028:5,15

receive 1108:3

received 1019:11 1024:19 1026:7 1033:20 1034:22 1046:14 1107:17 1142:4 1147:13 1148:5

recent 1032:10,18,22 1041:17 1059:12,21 1081:6

recess 1142:4 1145:11 1150:21 1151:12,20

recognize 1066:24 1067:1

recognized 1066:24 1119:1

recognizes 1151:9

record 1019:22 1020:21 1026:13 1136:8,10

recording 1152:8

recused 1044:12

Redesigning 1043:10

reduce 1047:21 1057:13 1076:14 1077:15 reduced 1042:19 1152:13

Reducing 1043:1 1044:7

reduction 1033:8 1103:16 1105:3

reductions 1033:12 1049:3

reference 1032:8 1060:9

referenced 1025:7

referred 1038:19

referring 1107:5

reflected 1060:5

reflective 1134:6

reformulate 1096:1

Refresh 1076:2

regain 1059:14

regard 1019:21 1034:17 1040:22 1058:23 1080:14 1094:7

regional 1044:8 1050:20 1088:19

Registered 1152:3

regularly-scheduled 1123:14

regulations 1095:19 1096:18

rehabilitate 1051:8

reimbursement 1099:16

reissue 1129:19

reject 1056:22

relating 1053:15

relationships

1056:16

release 1107:4

released 1106:24

relevant 1103:19 1146:18

relocated 1028:21

relying 1104:19

remedied 1058:12

remedy 1048:5

remember 1038:21

reminded 1035:11

removal 1025:21

remove 1024:23 1025:3 1037:13 1056:24 1126:15

removed 1025:19 1054:13,21 1055:2 1116:22

rename 1089:5

renegotiation 1046:18

renovated 1037:10

renovating 1035:20 1036:21 1070:13

renovation 1036:2, 16 1061:7 1064:20 1069:10 1116:23 1142:7 1146:10

renovations 1022:5, 15,20 1023:6,8,15 1027:12 1036:12 1037:15,19 1064:20 1072:3 1073:19 1103:4,15,19 1105:2, 8 1108:12 1109:19,24 1117:8 1124:4

rent 1099:20

reorganization

1043:5 1047:4 1056:7 1057:22 1061:15 1066:22 1067:4 1068:7

reorganizing 1043:6 repackage 1096:16

repeat 1130:20

replete 1057:22

report 1046:10 1048:19 1094:7 1098:5,21 1102:14

reported 1036:6 1065:14 1070:18

Reporter 1152:4

07/20/2018 Index: reporters..SHOTT

reporters 1039:13 reporting 1036:4 1061:22 1062:3 1100:19 1101:8

reports 1045:18

representative 1130:6 1131:12

1138:4

representatives

1138:12 1139:16 1140:23 1144:22 1150:10

represented 1020:1

represents 1033:8

reputation 1048:5

request 1024:16 1092:20 1102:23 1103:2 1109:7,8,9 1115:6 1116:17,21 1117:6,9,11 1118:5 1121:23 1122:5 1123:12,23 1126:9 1129:19 1130:4,6,9, 17,23 1131:21 1135:10 1141:8,12,15 1144:23 1145:23

requested 1027:12 1033:9 1102:22 1107:14

requesting 1122:11 1150:15

require 1032:19

required 1049:2 1085:23

requirement 1105:15

requirements

1049:9 1100:20 1101:8

rescind 1143:14 1144:4

research 1045:10 1103:5

researched 1122:14

reserve 1103:17

1105:4

residence 1025:10 resigned 1027:8

resist 1100:13

resolve 1055:14,15 1122:21

resolving 1122:23

resource 1094:23

resources 1039:14

respect 1068:23 1069:1

responds 1141:11

response 1024:16 1041:3,24 1054:9 1057:12,15 1145:1,19

responsibilities 1039:7

responsibility

1037:20 1070:23 1071:17 1072:11 1092:21

responsibly 1034:16

restate 1113:4 1135:8

restoration 1036:11, 17,20 1069:10 1071:3

restoring 1069:24 1121:10

restricted 1107:22

restrictions 1123:19 1124:2,11

restrooms 1037:5

result 1020:14 1035:10 1041:1 1042:1 1102:22 1116:17

results 1055:17

retribution 1053:20

returned 1025:13

revenue 1085:17 1086:21 1087:3 1090:1,2

review 1039:21 1046:17 1063:14

reviewed 1082:24

reviewing 1045:13 1069:18 1070:2

revisions 1038:9

rewrite 1096:15

rewriting 1095:11

rights 1048:11 1049:6 1055:21 1112:21

ring 1056:16

RMR 1152:18

road 1064:18

Roberts 1048:19 1049:7 1081:24

Robinson 1116:4,6, 16,20 1117:14 1128:23,24 1136:17, 19

role 1019:4 1030:12 1032:9 1068:19,22,23 1074:1 1115:10

roll 1019:6 1127:14, 18

rolling 1091:4

room 1037:6,10 1065:22 1072:4,5

rotation 1044:24

roughly 1030:19

round 1123:15

route 1020:9

row 1115:15 1131:10,

Rowe 1100:7,8 1102:6,10

rule 1079:16 1122:1 1139:22

rule-making 1096:7

rules 1043:16 1095:19 1096:11,12, 17 1111:16

ruling 1104:22 1110:21

run 1038:12

rush 1118:24

rushed 1119:7

S

saddened 1059:10

safe 1057:2 1071:8

safeguards 1061:6 1065:16

safety 1036:2 1048:21

sake 1149:2

salaries 1040:10

salary 1035:5

sale 1048:7

Saturday 1149:1,4,6, 7 1151:3

save 1043:22 1046:2

saving 1043:7,12 1044:15

savings 1041:18,23 1044:9 1045:13 1046:10 1051:21,24 1087:11 1097:16 1099:12

scared 1079:17

scary 1051:5

scene 1120:12

schedule 1115:7 1123:3 1145:18,22 1147:2,3

scheduled 1121:19

scheduling 1020:4,6

school 1054:7

scope 1037:11 1103:20 1124:3 1139:22

seats 1144:13

secretaries 1039:13 1040:15

section 1048:1 1054:20 1103:7 1104:14,15 1116:8, 11,12

security 1021:18 1122:6 1125:9,13 1142:14

seek 1139:19

seismic 1042:6

select 1115:12

selected 1023:17 1024:5 1045:1

selection 1021:22

Senate 1029:12

senior 1044:11

sense 1062:4 1121:2

sentence 1110:2,12

sentiment 1130:8

sentiments 1125:22

separate 1036:20 1038:24 1040:18 1070:7 1077:5 1104:2 1105:13 1114:3,12,17 1123:12,22

series 1103:8

serve 1045:2

served 1064:24

service 1043:19

services 1021:7,11, 14 1043:11,24 1047:7 1049:14,16 1052:17 1062:17 1099:9

serving 1039:16

session 1125:5

set 1040:17 1077:8,9 1083:20 1091:21 1129:21

sets 1040:9

setting 1043:8

sexual 1043:8 1098:3

shape 1047:10

share 1100:10 1134:2 1145:1

she'd 1125:23

shell 1023:23

short 1068:15 1073:15

shorthand 1152:12

shortly 1027:9 1034:21 1109:15 1150:21

SHOTT 1019:2,7

07/20/2018 Index: shut..subsequent

1029:7 1080:17 1102:19 1104:10,19 1105:2,22 1106:6,13, 20 1107:3,10,24 1108:10,14,21,24 1110:1,6,10,17,24 1111:3,7,21 1112:5, 22 1113:6 1114:18,23 1115:2,24 1116:11,19 1117:5,16,20 1118:4, 14 1119:8,22 1121:3, 16 1122:3 1124:6,9 1125:19 1127:11 1129:14 1130:22 1131:6,20 1132:7,11, 15,20 1133:4,10 1134:10.16.20 1135:7,19 1136:2,12 1137:3 1138:9,15,21, 24 1139:11 1140:11 1141:4,10,20,24 1142:12 1143:12,21 1144:1,8,11 1145:21 1147:8,23 1148:20 1149:3,23 1150:1,6,9, 16,18 1151:5,8,15,18

shut 1027:4

sic 1114:14

sides 1027:23

sign 1063:17

signed 1029:5 1147:19

significant 1033:21 1040:21 1043:5 1046:3,10 1047:2 1049:24 1050:24 1051:24 1052:18 1055:10 1057:21 1058:23 1072:7

significantly 1047:21 1058:20

1094:23 1122:20

signing 1146:23

silent 1030:12

Silling 1022:7,24

silos 1062:4

similar 1026:23 1055:8

simple 1076:8 1107:13

simplest 1044:5 1104:7

simply 1035:8 1042:1 1055:21 1095:12 1096:14

sincerely 1059:18

single 1035:12 1056:13 1063:11,12, 24 1130:3

sir 1090:2 1100:9 1147:8

sit 1079:12 1115:15 1131:16,17

site 1119:18

sitting 1027:22,23 1042:13 1044:13 1064:3 1084:3 1085:6 1087:10

situation 1061:20 1076:10 1079:5,22 1080:14 1118:24

situations 1079:20

six-year 1064:23

sixth 1050:15

sizable 1068:7

sketch 1147:19 1148:4.11

sketched 1023:21

skill 1152:8

slowly 1126:4

small 1042:7,20

smaller 1028:23 1087:16

so-called 1077:19 1144:16 1146:4

Sobonya 1128:9

social 1025:15 1026:1 1034:14

socially 1055:16

society 1051:15

socioeconomic 1041:2

solidified 1056:4

sort 1055:4 1105:8 1140:19

sound 1042:1 1050:3 1076:8

sounds 1067:3

space 1036:3 1071:8 1073:18

speak 1032:4 1093:22 1124:10 1130:3

speaking 1030:22 1074:6.8 1116:8

speaks 1130:2

special 1085:17 1086:4,21 1089:1 1090:1

specialty 1049:20

specifically 1028:10 1080:13 1126:9 1147:14,17 1150:14

specifics 1033:14

speed 1126:2

speeds 1042:6

spend 1052:3,13 1072:19 1084:23

spending 1034:8 1040:4 1043:2,18 1045:16,19 1047:21 1049:4 1053:9 1058:5,15 1060:24 1091:14 1098:23 1101:3 1102:4 1147:18

spends 1051:7

spent 1028:12 1035:2 1090:17.19

spies 1027:6

spill 1149:5

spite 1032:22

splitting 1123:4

spot 1067:22

-p---

spy 1026:16

stable 1056:21 1057:1

staff 1039:14 1044:7

1106:14 1120:10 1146:10 1149:12,14

staffing 1057:21 1149:12

stage 1136:13

stall 1119:15

stand 1024:4 1031:5 1058:16 1102:2 1144:8 1151:12

standards 1045:9 1046:20

standby 1025:22

standing 1074:8 1122:1

standpoint 1140:12

start 1076:15 1077:18 1091:10 1094:10 1113:16

started 1036:6 1042:8 1061:14,15 1067:21,22 1097:22 1098:4

starting 1030:14

state 1031:12 1034:23 1038:4 1039:16,20 1042:12 1043:4 1045:14 1048:3 1050:17 1051:1,3 1054:2 1056:2,18,20 1058:16 1059:7 1061:17 1076:13,16 1094:23 1100:19 1121:13 1125:15 1137:9 1146:23 1152:1,5

State's 1032:17 1033:7 1036:22 1056:24 1125:8

state-wide 1039:10 1045:11 1046:1

statement 1026:23 1101:7 1107:1

states 1020:22 1042:10 1050:9,13 1055:9 1076:3,18 1077:3 1126:20,21

statistics 1046:6

status 1044:11

statutorily 1049:2

statutorily-required 1050:6

stay 1134:9

step 1114:5,7

Steve 1026:9,14,17 1027:6

sti 1138:3

stood 1144:10

stop 1069:4 1075:9 1107:24 1131:21

stopped 1075:5

stories 1034:7 1059:12 1101:24

story 1034:21,24 1134:23

strange 1120:20

stream 1019:20

streamlined 1047:4

streamlining 1044:17 1097:16

strengthened 1056:6

strikes 1073:24

strong 1118:11

struck 1054:20

structural 1037:19 1047:16 1070:20

structure 1043:22 1053:13 1062:1

structures 1062:8

stuff 1070:15

subject 1103:10 1109:5 1115:20 1120:5 1122:6,12,18

submitted 1148:15 1149:19

subpoena 1145:24 1146:2 1150:15

Subsection 1116:12,

subsequent 1038:11 1045:2

07/20/2018 Index: substantial..trips

substantial 1059:16 substantially

succeed 1051:18

1042:19

success 1071:2

successful 1032:11 1069:21 1117:23

Sue 1027:11 1028:1

suggest 1106:9

suggestion 1113:2 1130:18 1141:13 1142:23

suite 1028:21

summary 1058:22 1082:7

Summers 1112:23, 24 1128:14,15

supervise 1051:8

supervision 1049:22

supplement 1148:2, 16

supplemental 1054:11 1148:5

supplying 1035:4

support 1051:17 1112:18 1118:19 1120:24 1121:6,14 1124:17 1125:17 1127:7 1135:5

supporting 1101:5

suppose 1135:23 1136:9

supposed 1025:18 1035:1 1071:13

Supreme 1021:5,10 1023:1 1030:15 1032:2,10 1033:9,17 1038:20 1039:18 1040:12 1054:6,10, 13,21,23 1071:15 1073:22 1077:4,13 1078:12 1081:16 1089:9 1091:10 1092:2,9 1102:21 1103:4 1104:16 1106:23,24 1107:4,8, 18 1108:15,19

1109:2,10,11,19 1111:5,12,18 1115:11,23 1121:22, 24 1124:5 1126:7

Supremes 1030:18

surprises 1024:10

surrounding 1040:3

suspect 1140:15

sustained 1127:13,

sweeping 1038:8

swinging 1079:7

sworn 1020:24 1031:19

system 1034:20 1038:3,6 1040:23 1042:9,18 1043:8 1046:1 1047:5 1048:1,20 1051:17 1052:23 1059:7 1063:13,18,21,23 1070:1 1072:15 1076:22,24 1077:21 1125:6

systems 1021:19 1055:11 1062:8 1077:6

Т

table 1027:22 1042:15 1119:3

takes 1033:1

taking 1029:24 1099:3 1126:6

talk 1032:7 1038:1 1041:7 1053:3 1059:19 1093:15 1129:17

talked 1066:23 1077:16

talking 1061:24 1063:21 1064:17 1076:16 1098:19 1101:18 1121:9

Tamerra 1026:24 1027:4,5,7

tantamount 1049:17

tape 1030:7,9 1080:16 1081:1,2 1102:18

taxpayer 1065:13

taxpayers 1068:20 1108:13 1126:12

taxpayers' 1035:3 1061:10

team 1042:14 1047:5

technology 1045:20 1047:6 1062:16

telecommunication

s 1132:7

telling 1079:14

tells 1144:2

ten 1103:23 1123:15

Teresa 1152:3.18

term 1044:23 1045:1

terms 1045:2 1143:22

territory 1120:17

testify 1029:12 1146:1

testifying 1104:18

testimony 1020:7,10 1030:1,4 1080:19,23 1102:20 1107:12 1109:5 1145:4,6 1146:24 1149:20 1150:2

tests 1099:1,4

There'll 1148:12

thing 1055:1,4 1062:22 1064:14 1091:2 1094:19 1104:7

things 1042:17 1057:20 1058:24 1061:14 1064:9 1065:24 1066:3 1067:5 1071:6 1072:8 1074:15 1076:2 1081:10 1086:20,21 1091:11 1102:1 1120:4 1136:8 1146:24 thinking 1080:6

thought 1034:24 1053:13 1080:1 1113:1,2

thoughts 1074:22

thousand 1099:11

thousands 1043:12, 23 1044:15

threat 1026:19 1048:21 1056:10 1078:2

throw 1075:2

Thursday 1129:21 1149:1 1151:3,13,14, 20,21

tie 1096:23

tied 1056:12

till 1143:1

time 1019:14 1022:10 1025:5.6 1034:6 1036:19 1038:14 1041:15,17 1050:16 1059:19 1060:10 1069:16,24 1072:3 1079:20 1080:18 1086:5 1091:18 1095:20 1109:13,15 1113:14 1118:7 1119:5 1120:9 1121:19,22 1122:24 1123:3.17 1124:1 1126:14,17 1129:20 1140:2 1144:21 1145:2,4,9 1148:7,15 1149:21

timeline 1067:7 1068:11 1069:6 1091:18

times 1063:16 1090:7

today 1019:10 1029:21 1031:23 1032:4 1038:15 1041:8 1059:19 1060:11 1066:14 1089:19 1091:5 1092:7 1093:20 1100:1 1119:19 1123:3 1140:9 1143:1,15 1147:14 1150:21 today's 1030:12

told 1025:20,22 1027:5,19 1028:11

top 1063:24

total 1072:20 1084:3, 10 1085:5 1133:13

totaling 1040:11

totally 1139:20

touched 1064:15 1118:21

tour 1104:2 1115:7 1116:17 1121:23 1135:10 1137:4 1140:18 1141:9 1144:17 1145:16

touring 1140:10

trained 1133:21

training 1039:15

trampling 1112:20

transactions 1064:1

transcribed 1152:7

transcription 1152:14

transcripts 1052:2,4

transgressions 1058:12

transmitted 1034:14

transparency

1035:14 1041:12 1044:4 1047:12 1057:17 1060:2 1061:3,9 1062:20 1073:8 1089:23 1090:7 1097:2 1098:12 1100:14,23 1121:9

transparent 1072:14 1073:2 1090:11

travel 1044:14

tremendously 1121:10

trial 1029:12 1120:11, 13

trigger 1117:9

trips 1123:15 1146:23

VOLUME IV 07/20/2018 Index: troubled..wife

warehouse 1022:17

troubled 1049:21 1136:13 1139:11 1039:17 1041:12 ٧ 1144:20 1149:19 **Troy** 1027:11 1028:1 1051:1,4 1058:2 understanding true 1056:16 1059:1 1064:8 vacations 1149:12 1020:5 1025:17 1076:21 1108:13 truncated 1112:10 1026:16,22 1063:12 validates 1147:15,20 1121:11 1125:15 1069:8 1070:14 trust 1034:18.19 vast 1050:12 1081:11 1083:10 1152:1 1059:14 1084:7 1085:8,10 vehicles 1021:17 truth 1031:20 1106:12,24 1115:23 Virginia's 1050:1 1146:23 1117:5 1118:4 Virginians 1034:5 **Tucker** 1024:4,6 Venable 1022:17 1122:4,13 1129:20 1049:13 1059:15 1146:21 1130:12 1131:9 verifying 1148:3 1146:14 virtually 1038:12 **Tuesday** 1112:15 versus 1081:7 1098:8 1048:24 1123:13 undertake 1069:16 vice 1060:19,20 visit 1102:21,22 turned 1084:12 undertaking 1061:18 1062:24 1063:6 1109:1,2,3,4,8,10 **TV** 1034:24 1133:8.13 1065:7 1066:7 underutilized 1044:8 1116:17 1119:19 1137:10 1090:5,9,22 1091:16 1132:2 unified 1038:3,5 1092:12,19,23 1093:3 twelve 1103:24 1076:22 visiting 1107:7,17 1104:8,12,21 1105:5 1111:11 two-person 1044:6 uniform 1077:22 1106:4,11,15,18,22 1107:6,16 1108:2,8, visits 1125:4 **type** 1029:13 Unintelligible 1031:3 11,18,22 1109:14 voice 1130:3 types 1075:5 1110:4,7,14,19 **United** 1042:10 1111:1,4,9 1113:9 1126:20.21 void 1054:19 typewriting 1152:13 1114:11,16,21,24 volume 1030:8 **units** 1045:16 1115:8 1129:4 U 1140:17 1130:19 1131:4,8 voluntary 1106:3 1132:5,9,13,18 unjustifiable 1109:1 1133:6,12,16,20 **U.S.** 1071:14 1081:16 1037:14 1134:4,12 1135:1,6, 1150:10 unlimited 1130:11,24 R 17.20 1136:3 **ultimate** 1078:2 1137:17,21 1138:6, unpredictability voted 1137:4 13,17,23 1151:9 ultimately 1125:7 1099:5 voters 1038:10 video 1107:22 umbrella 1138:20 unsupervised 1058:1,16 1132:14 1133:19 1038:12 unable 1046:7 1134:1,22 1136:4 untouchable W unanimously 1106:1 view 1035:17 1103:3, 1042:16 19 1118:8 unavoidable 1041:1 wait 1025:23 unvindicated 1049:6 viewed 1037:24 uncertainty 1049:5 waiting 1125:24 **updated** 1024:9 viewing 1019:20 uncharted 1120:17 **updates** 1099:20 1107:13 unconstitutional **upgrades** 1073:19 violate 1105:18 1054:17 1055:20 walnut 1022:11 uphold 1055:21 violating 1103:6 uncover 1126:5 1109:23 1114:20 **Walters** 1085:15 upkeep 1021:20 underestimated 1086:7 1095:5.6.9 violation 1105:11,16 1080:19 **upstairs** 1113:3 1096:6 1097:8 1110:23 1111:13 undermines 1049:9 utilization 1070:6 1113:11,18,23 1114:4 wanted 1023:16,20 1119:16 understand 1052:11 utilize 1045:10

violations 1124:21

Virginia 1021:6,10

1023:2,20,22 1035:2

1058:13 1067:6

1068:23 1084:14

1124:6 1135:9

1109:15,23 1116:1

1025:14 1026:4 1042:11 1050:8,18 warehouses 1021:18 1126:12 1127:1,3,10 vote 1119:10 1123:7, walk 1051:16 1134:23 walk-through 1126:6

waste 1072:22 wasted 1088:15 wasteful 1034:8 1058:5,14 1060:24 watched 1043:9 watching 1136:22 ways 1044:18,20 1047:11 1076:17 1121:1 web 1091:4 web-based 1044:20 Wednesday 1112:16 1123:13 weeds 1101:14 week 1019:13 1020:8 1094:10 1102:24 1111:11 1112:15,16 1113:13 1115:6 1123:1 1129:19,20 1137:1 1142:8 1143:3 1144:3 1145:16 1146:9 1149:1,8,11, 14,15 1150:22 1151:2 week's 1147:2 weekly 1062:19 weight 1019:14 West 1021:6,10 1023:2,20,22 1034:5 1035:2 1039:17 1041:11 1042:10 1049:13 1050:1,8,18 1051:1,4 1058:1 1059:1.14 1064:7 1076:21 1108:13 1121:11 1125:15 1126:12 1127:1,2,10 1152:1 whatsoever 1062:5 1074:20 wholly 1036:20 1024:1,4,5 1025:3,23 widely 1036:5 1027:19 1074:24 widespread 1049:4 1126:16,18 1134:15 1151:2 wife 1146:1

07/20/2018 Index: willingness..Zatezalo

willingness 1134:1

wind 1071:24 1072:1

Wing 1037:17 1069:11 1070:16 1142:13,14

wished 1103:3 1110:11

wishes 1118:10 1150:13

wit 1152:2

witnesses 1020:3 1149:9

wonderful 1061:13 1062:21 1068:3 1071:6 1074:14 1088:17

wondering 1100:15

word 1090:6 1110:2, 3,12 1111:7 1116:13

words 1056:15 1115:21

work 1020:4 1033:12 1035:12 1036:3 1037:11,22 1039:24 1047:7 1050:6 1059:4,13,23 1062:12 1071:8,9 1078:17 1082:9 1095:17 1096:17 1097:22 1099:15 1101:22 1105:7,8 1108:6 1112:17 1123:5 1127:8 1129:24 1141:18 1145:22 1146:21

worked 1056:2 1091:7 1098:5 1099:7 1124:12

Workers' 1039:20

working 1021:9 1023:1 1045:24 1050:10 1062:7 1095:24

Workman's 1028:7, 14

works 1024:20 1081:7

world 1034:15

worries 1032:18

worry 1026:17 1080:20

worth 1150:12

worthwhile 1143:6

worthy 1120:9 1123:4

wrap 1109:15

write 1134:23

written 1024:12 1028:6 1055:20 1064:4,5 1068:9 1152:13

wrote 1034:23 1056:10

Υ

yards 1136:20,21

yea 1127:16 1128:8

year 1032:6,13,18 1033:4,10,11 1041:19,21 1044:16 1047:1 1051:5 1052:3,14,17 1053:6, 7 1055:1 1063:24 1071:7 1072:13 1073:8 1075:8 1078:21 1079:2 1084:1 1098:24 1101:14,23

years 1032:18 1037:2 1040:24 1048:18 1054:4 1055:8 1058:6 1060:16 1064:18 1083:23 1084:12 1103:18

yeas 1127:12

yesterday 1029:21 1083:11

yield 1089:12 1134:17

Ζ

Zatezalo 1127:24 1128:1 1136:18 1139:1,2