WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE Legislative Post Audit Division

Building 1, Room W-329 1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0610 (304) 347-4880 (304) 347-4889 FAX



Denny Rhodes Director

February 7, 2017

The Honorable Mitch Carmichael, President West Virginia State Senate Post Audits Sub-Committee, Co-Chair Room 229 M, Building 1 State Capitol Complex Charleston, WV 25305

The Honorable Tim Armstead, Speaker West Virginia House of Delegates Post Audits Sub-Committee, Co-Chair Room 228 M, Building 1 State Capitol Complex Charleston, WV 25305

Mr. President and Mr. Speaker:

At the January 3, 2017 Post Audits Subcommittee meeting the Post Audit Division released a study regarding the vehicle fleet at the Division of Corrections (DOC). This study requested that the DOC justify the 309 vehicles in its fleet, its use of commuting vehicles and its method of taxing commuters using state vehicles. The Legislative Auditor also requested DOC to evaluate the need for 115 vehicles identified in the study as underutilized

As requested, the Division of Corrections supplied the Legislative Auditor with information regarding the primary and secondary uses for all state-owned vehicles currently in the DOC fleet. The material provided by DOC was analyzed to determine if all fleet vehicles were justifiable and cost effective to maintain as part of the DOC fleet. DOC officials performed their own analysis of the agency fleet as well.

Vehicle Justification: After these analyses were conducted, both the Legislative Auditor and DOC independently came to the conclusion that 45 vehicles can be eliminated from the fleet. The Legislative Auditor's list of 45 vehicles to be eliminated from the DOC totaled \$209,216 (See attached). The DOC's analysis totals approximately \$60,000. While the specific vehicles and potential cost savings of the vehicles identified differ, the Legislative Auditor commends the DOC

Joint Committee on Government and Finance

for finding 45 vehicles to eliminate. DOC is seeking exemptions for each of the remaining 70 vehicles that the Legislative Auditor previously identified as underutilized. DOC has indicated in their attached response that they will evaluate chronically underutilized vehicles and vehicles that are denied exemptions for possible retirement or reassignment. The Legislative Auditor recommends that the Division of Corrections give additional consideration to the Legislative Auditor's vehicle analysis of eliminating vehicles which would provide more cost savings to the agency.

Future Fleet Additions: The Legislative Auditor questioned the 2016 purchase of new vehicles. The DOC stated that all new vehicles purchased replaced aging vehicles. For future purchase considerations, the DOC states that it has implemented more stringent standards, and will use a 5 year/120,000 miles standard for vehicle replacement.

Commuting vehicles: The Legislative Auditor and DOC reviewed the 19 employees assigned a take-home vehicle. Again, both the Legislative Auditor and DOC concluded that there are five employees that were assigned a vehicle and do not require its use for commuting. While the DOC and the Legislative Auditor differ on two of the individuals identified, the Legislative Auditor accepts the individuals identified by DOC as no longer requiring a commuting vehicle, which includes the:

- 1. Commissioner,
- 2. Deputy Commissioner,
- 3. Assistant Commissioner of Operations,
- 4. Director of Safety, and
- 5. Director of Investigations

The Legislative Auditor was unable to determine the cost effectiveness of the remaining 14 vehicles assigned to individual employees at DOC. This is due to DOC providing no justification for the vehicle other than it is assigned to the individual and a lack of commuting logs for the vehicle. Without a commuting log for each of these vehicles, it is not possible to determine how many of the miles traveled in the vehicles were for business or personal use; thus, the comparison of cost of maintaining the state-owned vehicle to cost of mileage reimbursement is not possible. The DOC has stated that employees assigned a commuting vehicle will now be required to accurately document after-hours callouts for response to public safety or emergency situations in addition to documenting trips and mileage.

Taxable Fringe Benefits: The January DOC fleet study again raised the issue regarding the improper application of taxable fringe benefits to 41 employees that were commuting in a state vehicle. The Legislative Auditor previously concluded DOC was not properly applying the appropriate taxable fringe benefit for all commuting employees. DOC had previously determined many of the commuters were exempt due to the vehicle type and the employee job duties. After consultation between the Commissioner and the Cabinet Secretary of DMAPS they have concurred with the Legislative Auditor.

DOC will issue amended W-2s to all staff assigned a take home vehicle for the appropriate tax year. Additionally, current staff assigned a take home vehicle for commuting will complete the

Fleet Statement of Commuting Value and calculate the taxable fringe benefit using the correct IRS valuation method.

In conclusion, the Legislative Auditor commends the Division of Corrections for developing its plan to eliminate 45 vehicles, discontinue the assignment of 5 commuter vehicles, and correctly apply taxable fringe benefits to commuters. Based on the plan, the Legislative Auditor recommends the following:

- 1. The Legislative Auditor recommends that the Division of Corrections consider the Legislative Auditor's vehicle analysis of eliminating vehicles which would provide more cost savings to the agency.
- 2. The Legislative Auditor recommends that the Division of Corrections provide a status update to its vehicle plan by March 15, 2017.

The Legislative Auditor will update the Legislature and interested committees regarding the status of the Division of Corrections' plan.

Sincerely, Semy Rhodes Denny Rhodes

| <u>Reasoning For Return to FMO</u> | VIN+A:P | <u>Facility</u> <u>Assignment</u> | <u>Total</u> Yearly Cost |
|--|-------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Received new vehicle for staff travel with no secondary purpose. Three other vehicles for | | | |
| the same purpose; however, DOC noted employee travel ceased due to budget reductions. | | | |
| Since this is not changing there is no need to maintain the fleet for staff. | 1C4RJFAG5EC556832 | 2 ACC | \$7,269.60 |
| Reason for purpose is same as another vehicle both underutilized. Secondary purpose same | <u>)</u> | | |
| as primary for 4 other vehicles | 1FAHP2MK5FG10774 | 49 BCC | \$8,340.96 |
| Primary purpose and secondary purpose filled by other vehicles. Can shift mileage to | | | |
| underutilized SUV that was noted was needed for 4x4 capability. | 1FADP3F2XDL13947 | 3 CCC | \$5,132.52 |
| Primay purpose is inividuals use | 1GC2KUEG4GZ28064 | 2 Central Office | \$8,810.04 |
| Admin travel primary use. 3 SUVs of the same make and model remain. Could fulfill needs o | f | | |
| underutilized vehicle. In the event personal vehcile is needed for travel it is more cost | | | |
| effective to pay mileage | 1FM5K8ARXGGA203 | 7 (DCC | \$8,845.20 |
| Slightly above minimum. Primary and secondary roles filled by other vehicles | 2G1WA5E39E117446 | 56 HCC | \$5,710.56 |
| Primary and secondary roles filled by other vehicles | 3GNCJNSB2GL15793 | 0 HCC | \$5,619.00 |
| Vehicle underutilized. Other vehicles available to fill needs | 1GD02ZCG0DZ13415 | 5 HCC | \$5,793.96 |
| Bought to replace an underutilized van when there are still 3 more vans underutilized. One | | | |
| of which showed no use in FY16. | 2C4RDGBG8GR39719 | 95 HCC | NEW ? |
| Bought to replace an underutilized van when there are still 3 more vans underutilized. One | | | |
| of which showed no use in FY16. | 2C4RDGBGXGR39719 | 96 HCC | NEW ? |
| Bought to replace an underutilized van when there are still 3 more vans underutilized. One | | | |
| of which showed no use in FY16. | 1GAWGEFF9H11018 | 6(HCC | NEW ? |
| Primary function can be performed by trucks that have this as their secondary and received | | | |
| little use. | 2C4RDGBG7DR68882 | | \$5,583.48 |
| Not operable | 1GCFP22J3E3331779 | | \$0.00 |
| Not operable | 1FDKE30M6LHA612 | | \$0.00 |
| Inadequate reason for primary purpose with no secondary | 1FADP3E24DL32645 | | \$4,059.24 |
| Inadequate reason for primary purpose with no secondary | 1C4NJRBB7CD71745 | | \$5,238.72 |
| Primary purpose filled by other vehicles. No secondary use | 1FAHP2MK7FG17352 | | \$7,628.64 |
| Primary and secondary roles filled by other vehicles | 1FM5K8B80GGC9292 | 26 LCC | \$7,700.28 |
| Primary use met by other similary underutilized van with no secondary purpose. | | | |
| Additionally DOC noted a drop in the need to perform large transports | 1FBNE3BLXDDB297 | 54 MCC | \$7,117.56 |
| Reason for primary use is the same as 4 other vehicles and is the secondary use for 5 | | | |
| vehicles. Additionally there is no secondary use for the vehicle. | 1C4SDJFT4EC510748 | B MOCC | \$7,866.84 |
| Ordered new van to replace an underutilized van with 3 other vans underutilized for the | | | |
| same primary purpose. Primary purpose can be filled by the secondary of other vehicles | 1GJZ7ZFF5F1118656 | MOCC | \$10,483.08 |
| Primary purpose same as 4 other vehicles all of which are underutilized. Secondary reason | | | |
| same as primary. | 3FAHP0GA7BR19121 | 3 NCC | \$1,394.40 |
| Primary and secondary uses can be performed by other vehicles | 3FAHP0GA8BR33774 | 7 PBCC | \$1,203.48 |
| | | | |

| Primary and secondary roles filled by other vehicles. More cost effective to pay mileage for the FY16 mieage All truck LD are underutilized at facility. Role can be filled by other vehicles Vehicle was not used. Other vehicles able to fill primary and secondary needs Vehicle was not used. Other vehicles able to fill primary and secondary needs | 1FADP3E22DL326451 PCC 1GTHK24K78E211781 PCC 1GDJK34J1XF032509 SCC 1GDJK34J7XF032126 SCC | \$4,094.04 \$627.96 \$15.12 \$244.20 |
|---|--|---|
| New vehicle primary use can be filled by underutilized vehicle only used by single employee | e 1FA6P0G71G5110695 Special Services | \$5,652.96 |
| New vehicle primary use can be filled by underutilized vehicle only used by single employee Inadequate reason for primary use | e 1FA6P0G73G5110696 Special Services 2GNFLEEK4E6344624 Special Services | \$5,682.00 \$8,438.76 |
| More cost effective to pay mileage based on FY 16 usage. Leaves 1 SUV to split duties | 1C4RJFAG3EC556862 WVCI | \$7,486.20 |
| <u>Reasoning for transfer and then return of vehicles to FMO</u> | <u>VIN+A:P</u> <u>Assignment</u> | |
| All truck LD but 1 are underutilized at facility. Role can be filled by other vehicles Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | FROM MOCC TO 1FTMF1EW8AFC7915: ACC. Replace ST41 | \$61.92 |
| Net savings to the agency | 3C6TR5CTXEG281658 SEND TO FMO FROM HCC TO LCC. | \$1,778.64 |
| Vehicle was not used. Other vehicles able to fulfil primary and secondary needs Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | 1FTHF26H9TEA62871 Replace 57601 | \$99.48 |
| Net savings to the agency | 1FTRF3B61GED01169 SEND TO FMO FROM HCC TO | \$0.00 |
| Three underutilized vehicles peforming same primary function. Two other vans that are underutilized have the primary function as their secondary | MOCC. Replace 1GJGG25K981235401 ST3996 | \$808.56 |
| Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. Net savings to the agency | 2C4RDGBG7ER432404 SEND TO FMO FROM SPECIAL SERVICES TO BCC. | \$433.68 |
| Reason for use Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | 2GNFLCEK0C6396947 Replace ST4132. | \$1,036.80 |
| Net savings to the agency | 1FM5K8AR6FGA22107 SEND TO FMO FROM Special | \$1,372.56 |
| Reason for primary use is the same as 5 other vehicles at the facility all of which were under utilized, no secondary use designated to justify Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | 1C4NJRBB9CD717452 Replace ST4640. | \$1,345.92 |
| Net savings to the agency | 1FM5K8AR1GGA2037; SEND TO FMO FROM MOCC TO | \$924.72 |
| Reason for use is the same as 9 other vehicles and the secondary is the same as 5 other cars. Exhanging this vehicle for the one at HCC allows the vehicle with the lowest cost to be | Ford Fusion | |
| utilized. | 3FAHP0GA2CR239041 ST4896 | \$104.64 |

| Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | | |
|--|----------------------------------|------------|
| Net savings to the agency | 1FA6P0G7XG5110694 SEND TO FMO | \$755.28 |
| Reason for purpose is the same as 4 other vehicle secondary is the same as another | FROM BCC TO MCC. | |
| available vehicle | 1FMJU1G52CEF57236 Replace ST5494 | \$2,581.68 |
| Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | | |
| Net savings to the agency | 1C4NJRBB8GD766745 SEND TO FMO | \$1,969.68 |
| | FROM LCC TO PCC. | |
| Primary and secondary functions can be fulfilled by other underutilized vehicles | 2D4RN4DG9BR778901Replace ST3586 | \$746.28 |
| | FROM NCC TO PCC. | |
| Primary and secondary functions can be fulfilled by 6 other underutilized vehicles | 1FBNE3BL8CDB25586 Replace ST3995 | \$1,631.76 |
| Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | | |
| Net savings to the agency | 2C4RDGBG1ER432401 SEND TO FMO | \$511.92 |
| Transfer vehicle meets the primary use of the returned vehicle without any lease payments. | | |
| Net savings to the agency | 1FBNE3BL4DDB29751SEND TO FMO | \$1,315.32 |

Unnecessary Commuting Vehicles- Based on utilization and cost comparison of FY16 Total Cost vs. Mileage Reimbursement

| | | | <u>FT TO Mileage</u> |
|--|------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| <u>Title</u> | | <u>FY 16 Total Cost</u> | <u>Reimbursment</u> |
| Special Operations Threat Assessment | | \$8,915.04 | \$4,377.37 |
| | Estimated FY16 Savings | \$4,5 | 37.67 |
| Director of Corrections Investigation Division | | \$9,021.36 | \$6,885.45 |
| | Estimated FY16 Savings | \$2,1 | 35.91 |
| Assistant Commissioner - Operations | | \$10,072.80 | \$8,623.13 |
| | Estimated FY16 Savings | \$1,4 | 49.67 |
| Deputy Commissioner | | \$9,375.12 | \$8,449.26 |
| | Estimated FY16 Savings | \$92 | 25.86 |
| Director of Security | | \$10,008.72 | \$9,773.92 |
| | Estimated FY16 Savings | \$23 | 34.80 |
| Approximate Savings Identified by returning | vehicles identified by | Legislative Auditor t | hat differ from DOC |

| Vehicles returned to FMO | \$144,644.40 |
|--|--------------|
| Vehicles transferred to replace additional vehicles to return to FMO-Net savings | \$55,287.84 |
| Savings from Commuter Vehicles | \$9,283.92 |
| | \$209,216.16 |



STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA DEPARTMENT OF MILITARY AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC SAFETY DIVISION OF CORRECTIONS



JIM JUSTICE GOVERNOR JIM RUBENSTEIN COMMISSIONER JEFF S. SANDY, CAMS, CFE SECRETARY

Office of the Commissioner 1409 Greenbrier Street Charleston, WV 25311 (304) 558-2036 Telephone - (304) 558-5934 Fax

Honorable Mitch Carmichael, President Honorable Tim Armstead, Speaker Post Audits Subcommittee Building 1, Room 228M 1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East Charleston, West Virginia 25305-0610

Mr. President & Mr. Speaker:

Please find attached the West Virginia Division of Correction's Fleet Reorganization Plan, January 2017. This plan was developed in response to the recommendations included in the report "Study of the Division of Corrections Fleet," published on January 3, 2017 by the Legislative Auditor's Post Audit Division. I hope this report provides the information you need, please let me know if there is anything else we can do to be of assistance.

Sincerely,

Jim Rubenstein Commissioner West Virginia Division of Corrections

Fleet Reorganization Plan

West Virginia Division of Corrections, January 2017

Jim Rubenstein, Commissioner



Introduction

On January 3, 2017, the Legislative Auditor's Post Audit Division released a report entitled "Study of the Division of Corrections Fleet." The report was the result of a lengthy audit of the West Virginia Division of Corrections (WVDOC) and our current fleet assignments and practices. The report concluded with the following recommendations:

- The Legislative Auditor recommends DOC and Fleet Management review DOC vehicle fleet, determine the most efficient use of state resources, and determine whether 107 DOC vehicles defined as underutilized should be reassigned to other state agencies. DOC should report back to the Post Audits Subcommittee at the first interim meeting following the 2017 Legislative Session.
- The Legislative Auditor recommends DOC appropriately seek exemptions from Fleet Management for any vehicles that do not meet the minimum mileage requirements of Legislative Rule Title 148 Series 3 but are determined to be needed. DOC should report back to the Post Audits Subcommittee at the first interim meeting following the 2017 Legislative Session.
- 3. The Legislative Auditor recommends DOC evaluate its vehicle allocation before procuring additional vehicles.
- 4. The Legislative Auditor recommends DOC evaluate the need for 19 vehicles assigned to employees for take-home use. The DOC should report back to the Post Audits Subcommittee at the first interim meeting following the 2017 Legislative Session.
- 5. The Legislative Auditor recommends DOC require all employees who commute in a state vehicle to fill out a Fleet Statement of Commuting Value and calculate the taxable fringe benefits of commuting using the appropriate IRS valuation method. Amended tax returns should be filed for any employees that had their taxable fringe benefit incorrectly calculated. DOC should report back to the Post Audits Subcommittee at the first interim meeting following the 2017 Legislative Session.

Subsequent to the release of the report, the Post Audits Subcommittee asked that the WVDOC report on its progress by February 1, 2017 rather than at the first interim meeting following the 2017 Legislative Session. The plan that follows is in response to the Post Audit Division's recommendations.

Underutilization

In their analysis, the Post Audit Division found that 107 of the WVDOC's vehicles were "underutilized" according to the minimum mileage requirements of Legislative Rule Title 148 Series 3. The rule states that vehicles must be driven a minimum of 1,100 miles per month unless the agency receives an exemption from the Fleet Management Office. However, in their analysis the Post Audit Division used FY 2016 mileage figures to make their determination while the Fleet Management Office uses more recent figures to alert agencies of underutilization. The Fleet Management Office began sending monthly alerts to agencies, in October 2016, requesting the proper exemption requests for underutilization.

Actions Taken

- 1. The WVDOC met with the Fleet Management Office (FMO) and reviewed all vehicles determined to be underutilized according to FY 2016 mileage figures. The FMO provided guidance on the filing of exemption requests using the appropriate categories and procedure.
- During this process the WVDOC identified <u>45</u> vehicles that were either underutilized or could be retired without significant impact on daily operations. The WVDOC has made arrangements to retire these vehicles following the appropriate procedures. The list of vehicles being retired is provided in Appendix A.

Future Steps

- 1. The WVDOC will monitor the alerts provided by the FMO and will file the proper underutilization exemption requests as a matter of routine procedure.
- 2. The WVDOC will evaluate any chronically underutilized vehicles, or vehicles where exemption requests may be denied, for possible retirement or reassignment.
- 3. The Commissioner's designee will meet with the Fleet Management Office on an annual basis to conduct a full utilization review and provide recommendations to the Commissioner.

Future Fleet Additions/Replacements

The Post Audit Division recommended that the WVDOC evaluate its vehicle allocation before procuring additional vehicles. The WVDOC has always strived to critically evaluate additions or replacements to its fleet and will continue to do so. In the calendar year 2016 vehicle order, all vehicles acquired were replacements to aging vehicles and those aged vehicles were subsequently retired. However, due to increasingly tight budgets, the WVDOC has taken additional steps to generate additional cost savings without jeopardizing the safety of our staff or the public.

Actions Taken

 The WVDOC has implemented more stringent standards for the replacement of vehicles. Instead of the 4 year/100,000 miles standard required by the Fleet Management Office, we will use a 5 year/120,000 miles standard for the replacement of vehicles not equipped for the secure transport of inmates.

Vehicles Assigned for Commuting Purposes

The WVDOC had reported to the Post Audit Division that a total of 41 employees were required to utilize a state vehicle to commute. We stated that the Commissioner was assigned a take-home state vehicle due to the nature of the official duties and responsibilities of the Commissioner under state law. The other 40 employees were assigned take-home state vehicles because of the duties and responsibilities the Commissioner has assigned to each employee. These duties included: the enforcement of state law, maintenance and restoration of order, management of emergency response operations, investigation of crimes and the apprehension of escapees and parole absconders for the DOC that require them to be capable of immediately responding to an emergency situation anywhere in the State.

In reaching their conclusion that the WVDOC should evaluate the need for 19 vehicles assigned to employees for take-home use, the Post Audit Division concluded that "no DOC employees received an emergency call-out to respond to any situation to enforce state law, maintain or restore order, manage an emergency response, investigate a crime, or apprehend escapees or parole absconders other than the 22 K-9 Officers." This is incorrect, many of the 19 staff mentioned responded to numerous emergency situations during FY 2016. WVDOC enhanced parole officers are commonly called out after hours for various public safety tasks, in fact, 4 of those staff are sworn Special Deputy U. S. Marshalls on a multi-agency task force. However, other than K-9 Officer call-outs, the WVDOC did not keep adequate records of these after-hours emergency responses.

Actions Taken

- 1. The WVDOC has evaluated the list of 19 staff assigned a take-home vehicle. The following staff have discontinued using a state vehicle for commuting purposes and made arrangements to return their vehicles to the motor pool:
 - a. The Commissioner
 - b. The Deputy Commissioner
 - c. The Assistant Commissioner of Operations
 - d. The Director of Safety
 - e. The Director of Investigations
- Staff who continue to use a state vehicle for commuting purposes will be required to accurately
 document after-hours callouts for response to public safety or emergency situations, over and
 above the existing requirement to document trips and mileage.

Taxable Fringe Benefit Reporting

The Post Audit Division concluded in its report that the WVDOC was not properly applying the appropriate taxable fringe benefit for all employees commuting in a state vehicle. The WVDOC had previously determined that a number of the staff in question were exempt from these rules because they met the IRS definition of law enforcement. Additionally, the WVDOC had concluded that not all of those vehicles were required to be clearly marked for emergency response because they fell under the

IRS exemptions for "unmarked law enforcement vehicles." However, upon consultation between the Commissioner and the Secretary of DMAPs it has been determined that these exemptions do not apply to the WVDOC.

Actions Taken

 Staff who are assigned a vehicle for commuting purposes are being informed that they are required to fill out a Fleet Statement of Commuting Value and calculate the taxable fringe benefit of commuting using the appropriate IRS valuation method.

Future Steps

 WVDOC staff will gather the data necessary to issue amended W-2s to staff assigned a takehome vehicle for the appropriate tax years.

Conclusion

The WVDOC's mission is to enhance public safety by providing safe, secure, and humane correctional facilities, operating an effective system of offender re-entry and community supervision, reducing offender recidivism, and assisting victims of crime. In order to fulfill this mission, we must ensure that we have the vehicles needed to perform inmate transports in accordance with court orders, to ensure that inmates have access to constitutionally appropriate medical care, and to maintain continuity of operations in the event of an emergency or natural disaster. We will continue to perform our mission to enhance public safety in the most fiscally responsible manner possible. The action steps we have outlined in this report will allow us to reduce the size of our fleet and will generate cost savings for the people of West Virginia without significantly impacting our ability to perform daily operational tasks or respond to emergency situations.

| xxx consist yxx xxx xx xxx xx </th <th>Facility Assigned to</th> <th>Make</th> <th>Model</th> <th>Year</th> <th># NIA</th> <th>Plate #</th> <th>Lease / Own / Military</th> <th>What Vasr Lasca</th> <th>Number of lease</th> <th>Monthly Lease</th> <th>Monthly Fuel</th> <th>Monthly Maintenance</th> <th>Monthly Average</th> <th>Yearly Average</th> | Facility Assigned to | Make | Model | Year | # NIA | Plate # | Lease / Own / Military | What Vasr Lasca | Number of lease | Monthly Lease | Monthly Fuel | Monthly Maintenance | Monthly Average | Yearly Average |
|--|----------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|--------------|---------------------------|--------------|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|---------------|--------------|---------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| (IC) (IC) <th< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Impala</td><td>2012</td><td>2G1WF5E36C1330008</td><td>ST2706</td><td>Lease</td><td>48 month</td><td>0</td><td>\$12.00</td><td>\$40.30</td><td>\$39.41</td><td>401 71</td><td>\$1 100 50</td></th<> | | | Impala | 2012 | 2G1WF5E36C1330008 | ST2706 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$40.30 | \$39.41 | 401 71 | \$1 100 50 |
| UR Units Un | | Dodge | Grand Caravan | 2016 | 2C4RDGBG6GR377592 | ST5587 | Lease | 48 month | 43 | \$482.44 | \$366.64 | \$15.10 | \$864.18 | \$10.370.16 |
| Cutation Description Description Description Station Station <td></td> <td>Ford</td> <td>Focus</td> <td>2009</td> <td>1FAHP34N49W116291</td> <td>78100</td> <td>Lease</td> <td>48 month</td> <td>0</td> <td>\$12.00</td> <td>\$59.91</td> <td>\$31.90</td> <td>\$103.81</td> <td>\$1.245.72</td> | | Ford | Focus | 2009 | 1FAHP34N49W116291 | 78100 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$59.91 | \$31.90 | \$103.81 | \$1.245.72 |
| Custoffice bee per solution of the constraint of the constra | | Chevrolet | Impala | 2012 | 2G1WF5E37C1333466 | ST3782 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$75.93 | \$46.20 | \$134.13 | \$1,609.56 |
| Curtactifie bugie bugie from the constrained of the constrained | | Jeep | Patriot | 2012 | 1C4NJRBB9CD717452 | ST2812 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$75.17 | \$38.38 | \$125.55 | \$1,506.60 |
| Current free Diract Diract <thdiract< th=""> <thdiract< th=""> <thdira< td=""><td></td><td>Dodge</td><td>Caravan</td><td>2006</td><td>1D4GP25R86B680713</td><td>76266</td><td>Lease</td><td>48 month</td><td>0</td><td>\$12.00</td><td>\$76.12</td><td>\$68.59</td><td>\$156.71</td><td>\$1,880.52</td></thdira<></thdiract<></thdiract<> | | Dodge | Caravan | 2006 | 1D4GP25R86B680713 | 76266 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$76.12 | \$68.59 | \$156.71 | \$1,880.52 |
| (if) (if) <th< td=""><td></td><td>Ford</td><td>Taurus</td><td>2015</td><td>1FAHP2MK3FG107748</td><td>4VJ893</td><td>Lease</td><td>48 month</td><td>19</td><td>\$598.22</td><td>\$165.69</td><td>\$27.78</td><td>\$791.69</td><td>\$9,500.28</td></th<> | | Ford | Taurus | 2015 | 1FAHP2MK3FG107748 | 4VJ893 | Lease | 48 month | 19 | \$598.22 | \$165.69 | \$27.78 | \$791.69 | \$9,500.28 |
| If Denotion Diration Diration <thdiration< th=""> Diration Di</thdiration<> | | Ford | Dump Truck | 1977 | F37SC089720 | B19876 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| If Method Prof State Method State S | | Chevrolet | R30 Pick Up | 1988 | 1GBHR34J2JJ12539B | ST4449 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HIC Otherede Stayle Stayle </td <td></td> <td>Workhorse Custom Chassis</td> <td>P42</td> <td>2001</td> <td>5B4KP42Y213337676</td> <td>ST3691</td> <td>Own/Military</td> <td></td> <td>0</td> <td>\$0.00</td> <td>\$1.13</td> <td>\$0.00</td> <td>\$1.13</td> <td>\$13.56</td> | | Workhorse Custom Chassis | P42 | 2001 | 5B4KP42Y213337676 | ST3691 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$1.13 | \$0.00 | \$1.13 | \$13.56 |
| HG Ford Evention 2950 HUME Total State HUME State State HUME State Stat | | Chevrolet | Step Van | 1984 | 1GCFP22J3E3331779 | 73594 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HC Decise Rowner 200 Statute Statute< | | Ford | Econoline | 1989 | 1FDKE30M6LHA61272 | ST897 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HIC Math J 1/1 Bit SIG 12000005 S 5432 Own Math S 100 S 000 | | Dodge | Ram Wagon | 2001 | 2B5WB25Y11K548211 | 48079 | Lease | 12 month | 0 | \$6.00 | \$31.39 | \$152.68 | \$190.07 | \$2.280.84 |
| HC Checket S10 198 10000 10000 2000 < | | AMC | 2 1/2 Ton | 1986 | 86K1299094010955 | B53942 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HC Freed Passenge fits Total Passenge fits Total Passenge fits Total Passenge fits Total Passenge fits Passenge Passenge fits P | | Chevrolet | S10 | 1988 | 1GCCS14R3J2158389 | 73596 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| 1CC Hummer 210er 396 00335 94277 Om/Mility C 900 | | Ford | Passenger Bus | 1987 | 1FDXB70H0HVA04390 | 48431 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HC Humen 2 box 198 0.0031 8.273 OwnMikting T 0 9.000< | | Hummer | 4 Door | 1986 | 003165 | 842277 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HCC Hummet 20or 396 00343 82.391 OwnMultory 500 5000 | | Hummer | 2 Door | 1986 | 003221 | 842279 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HCC Human 20oc 1360 0.0530 82.94 OwnMiltery T 0 93000 93000 | | Hummer | 2 Door | 1986 | 001934 | B42-297 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| HMIC Ford Ford Total Ford Ford State Stat | | Hummer | 2 Door | 1986 | 035630 | B42-294 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| ICC Field F | | Ford | Focus | 2008 | 1FAHP34N28W284882 | 77989 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$56.88 | \$21.69 | \$90.57 | \$1 086 R4 |
| ICC Chynkie Tewn & County 202 AddSeL37784002 5714 Lease 36 moth 0 52.00 55.291 55.114 1 ICC Chynkie Tewn & County 200 JackSeL3754002 5711 Lease 36 moth 0 51.03 55.13 58.14 58.1 | | Ford | Focus | 2010 | 1FAHP3EN6AW172414 | ST1025 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$30.45 | \$26.00 | \$68.45 | \$821.40 |
| UCC Chyclie Townik Country 2001 MacFinal Mission Signal | | Chrysler | Town & Country | 2007 | 2A4GP54L57R294002 | ST716 | Lease | 36 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$36.50 | \$62.91 | \$111.41 | \$1 336 92 |
| MMCC Fred Fred Fred Fred Fred S13.00 S13.00 S13.00 S13.00 S54.03 S54.03 < | | Chrysler | Town & Country | 2007 | 2A4GP54L47R317267 | ST717 | Lease | 36 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$51.03 | \$48.33 | \$111.36 | \$1.336.32 |
| MCC Jeep Iberty 2.008 IbertySex56v75001 Nonc 5400 54027 54735 51972 51972 MCC Imendio 4700 1953 ImcVucteRev113 5932 0000 56.12 517.18 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 55.13 5100 50.00 < | | Ford | Focus | 2008 | 1FAHP34N18W284887 | 78050 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$19.88 | \$13.20 | \$45.08 | \$540 96 |
| MOCC Ford Ecode 20.0 HMCUOMMAGE 559.1 550.1 510.2 < | | Jeep | Liberty | · 2008 | 1J8GN28K58W250031 | None | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$142.37 | \$57.35 | \$199.72 | \$2.396.64 |
| MOCC Internatio 4700 1995 INTSCARRENATED 53938 0mm 6 50.00 | | Ford | Escape | 2010 | 1FMCU9D79AKA93017 | ST942 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$26.12 | \$12.18 | \$50.30 | \$603.60 |
| MOCC India F/00 193 INDX/AGFWA1415 B52.88 OW/Millary 0 50.00 | | Internatio | 4700 | 1995 | 1HTSCAAR6SH674812 | 853998 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$8.23 | \$0.00 | \$8.23 | \$98.76 |
| MOCC Internation Road Tractor 1385 IHRONTR/IRE12476 633369 Own/Miltary 0 5,000 < | | Ford | F700 | 1993 | 1FDXK74C6PVA14161 | B53268 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| MOCC GMC Savara 2010 JGIZGPOG8A117213 S11879 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 S96.01 510.01 510.2.1 510.2.5 Parole Services Dorde Fusion 2011 261/VGSCP1156501 517.623 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 584.17 580.25 513.65.01 | | Internatio | Road Tractor | 1985 | 1HSRDL7R2FHB22476 | B53269 | Own/Military | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| NCC Fundion 2011 31AHDGGA7RH192131 51529 Lease 48 month 0 51200 594.01 530.25 513.55 Parole Services Dodge Impalia 2012 23GAK063CH135501 577471 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 598.50 543.61 543.13 513.52 Parole Services Chervolet Impalia 2012 2GMK563CH13550 577.63 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 588.53 513.63 513.63 513.63 Parole Services Leep Partiot 2012 2GMK88C0717455 572.63 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 58.63 53.63 53.63 53.66 51.66 | | GMC | Savana | 2010 | 1GJZGPDG8A1172512 | ST1879 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$50.60 | \$39.61 | \$102.21 | \$1,226.52 |
| Parole Services Obdge Ondge Ondge S12.0 S15.1 | | Ford | Fusion | 2011 | 3FAHP0GA7BR191213 | ST1629 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$94.41 | \$30.25 | \$136.66 | \$1,639.92 |
| Parolo Services Cherrolet Impala 2012 ZGIMF5EX71334501 SZ762 Lease 48 month 0 51.00 568.17 558.53 51.33.70 51.33.70 Parolo Services Cherrolet Impala 2012 ZGIMF5EX7133550 \$17.63 Lease 48 month 0 51.00 568.17 559.51 513.61 5145.13 Parolo Services Leep Patriot 2012 ICANIRB8C/71458 \$17.808 Lease 48 month 0 51.00 58.917 516.63 518.68 516.63 526.24 536.66 50.00 <t< td=""><td></td><td>Dodge</td><td>Charger</td><td>2012</td><td>2C3CDXBG2CH126501</td><td>ST2471</td><td>Lease</td><td>48 month</td><td>0</td><td>\$12.00</td><td>\$98.50</td><td>\$41.02</td><td>\$151.52</td><td>\$1,818.24</td></t<> | | Dodge | Charger | 2012 | 2C3CDXBG2CH126501 | ST2471 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$98.50 | \$41.02 | \$151.52 | \$1,818.24 |
| Parolo Envince Devolut Parolo Sand Sand </td <td></td> <td>Chevrolet</td> <td>Impala</td> <td>2012</td> <td>2G1WF5E3XC1334501</td> <td>St2762</td> <td>Lease</td> <td>48 month</td> <td>0</td> <td>\$12.00</td> <td>\$68.17</td> <td>\$58.53</td> <td>\$138.70</td> <td>\$1,664.40</td> | | Chevrolet | Impala | 2012 | 2G1WF5E3XC1334501 | St2762 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$68.17 | \$58.53 | \$138.70 | \$1,664.40 |
| Parole services Dep Protot 2012 LGM/RBBR/D71455 S17200 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 518.47 576.22 516.89 516.89 Parole services Leep Partiot 2012 1CAMIRBBR/D71458 S12966 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 51.177 559.91 518.86 Parole Services Leep Partiot 2012 1CAMIRBBR/D71458 S12966 Lease 48 month 0 51.00 54.61 55.63 55.73 57.78 55.63 55.64 55.64 55.64 56.66 57.78 55.66 55.73 57.78 55.66 55.64 56.66 57.78 55.66 55.66 56.66 56.66 </td <td></td> <td>Chevrolet</td> <td>Impala</td> <td>2012</td> <td>2G1WF5E37C1335850</td> <td>ST2763</td> <td>Lease</td> <td>48 month</td> <td>0</td> <td>\$12.00</td> <td>\$89.52</td> <td>\$43.61</td> <td>\$145.13</td> <td>\$1,741.56</td> | | Chevrolet | Impala | 2012 | 2G1WF5E37C1335850 | ST2763 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$89.52 | \$43.61 | \$145.13 | \$1,741.56 |
| Fanole services Dep Particit 2012 LGANRBRACD/1345 ST3956 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 511.17 559.91 5183.68 Parole Services Jeep Particit 2012 LGANRBRACD/1345 ST3966 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 510.00 5 | | deer | Patriot | 2012 | 1C4NJRBB8CD717457 | ST2808 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$78.47 | \$76.42 | \$166.89 | \$2,002.68 |
| Parole Services Jeep Patriot 2012 ICANIRBBID:17459 57307 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 54.42 526.24 584.66 784.66 < | | Jeep | Patriot | 2012 | 1C4NJRBBXCD717458 | ST2966 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$111.77 | \$59.91 | \$183.68 | \$2,204.16 |
| PCC Jeep 2.51 6K6 ARW/TIR 1970 0402347105/2513349 833715 Own 0 50.00 </td <td></td> <td>Jeep</td> <td>Patriot</td> <td>2012</td> <td>1C4NJRBB1CD717459</td> <td>ST2807</td> <td>Lease</td> <td>48 month</td> <td>0</td> <td>\$12.00</td> <td>\$46.42</td> <td>\$26.24</td> <td>\$84.66</td> <td>\$1,015.92</td> | | Jeep | Patriot | 2012 | 1C4NJRBB1CD717459 | ST2807 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$46.42 | \$26.24 | \$84.66 | \$1,015.92 |
| SMCC Dodge Ntro 2008 ILIGG25883124730734 77734 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 514.729 56.82.7 527.81 577.81 SMCC GMC Savana 2008 ILIGG25883124733 87138 Lease 48 month 0 512.00 50.47.29 56.82.7 555.650 555.650 SMCC GMC Bucket Truck 1988 1/17DRAV81284 843054 Own 0 50.00 | | Jeep | 2.51 6X6 ARMY TRK | 1970 | 04D23471052519349 | 833715 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| SMCC GMC Savana 2008 IGIGG2588133473 7818 Lease 48 month 0 \$12,00 \$203.18 \$141.42 \$356.60 SMCC GMC Bump Tuck 1980 11770BAV6123443 84 a069 0wn 0 0 \$0.00 | | Dodge | Nitro | 2008 | 1D8GU28K18W250734 | 77734 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$147.29 | \$68.52 | \$227.81 | \$2,733.72 |
| SMCC Edited Bucket Truck 1980 17/1DBAV21364 B54054 Own 0 50.00 | | GMC | Savana | 2008 | 1GJGG25K881234773 | 78138 | Lease | 48 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$203.18 | \$141.42 | \$356.60 | \$4,279.20 |
| MCC Dump Truck 1988 1FDRR2XAIA64464 B1069 Own 0 50.00 | | GMC | Bucket Truck | 1980 | T17DBAV612364 | B54054 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| SMLC Ford E350 Econoline Van 1385 IF1S3412WH65/107 73930 Own 0 \$0.00 </td <td></td> <td>Ford</td> <td>Dump Truck</td> <td>4</td> <td>1FDXR82A5JA34654</td> <td>B41069</td> <td>Own</td> <td></td> <td>0</td> <td>\$0.00</td> <td>\$0.00</td> <td>\$0.00</td> <td>\$0.00</td> <td>\$0.00</td> | | Ford | Dump Truck | 4 | 1FDXR82A5JA34654 | B41069 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| WVCI Dodge Ram Van 2000 ZB/HB11/39K180216 46462 Lease 12 month 0 \$12.00 \$59.17 \$37.35 \$108.52 * Vehicles with \$50.00 Monthly Fuel Average are typically used solely on facility grounds * | | Ford | E350 Econoline Van | _ | 1FTSS34L2WHB67107 | 73930 | Own | | 0 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 | \$0.00 |
| Year 1 Cost Savings | | Dodge | | 2000 | 2B7HB11X9YK180216 | 46462 | Lease | 12 month | 0 | \$12.00 | \$59.17 | \$37.35 | \$108.52 | \$1,302.24 |
| | | | > | ehicles with | \$0.00 Monthly Fuel Avera | ge are typic | ally used solely on facility | y grounds | | | | Year 1 Cost | Savings | \$59,357.76 |